

Why don't you (the Shiites) forgive and forget the same as Imam Ali (peace be upon him) did ?

The group of Imam Ali (peace be upon him)

Doubt

If Imam Ali (peace be upon him) had been right, why would he have ignored his right? Why don't you let up the same as Imam Ali (peace be upon him)?

The criticism and analysis

This question and this doubt can be analyzed from two points of view:

1. Ignorance of Imam Ali (peace be upon him) from his right;
2. The followers of Imam Ali (peace be upon him) and the supporters of the School of Ahle Beit should not react and they do not defend their religion and beliefs.

Imam Ali (peace be upon him) and the caliphate of the caliphs

The stance of Amir Momenan (peace be upon him) against caliphs is one of clear discussions although some try to addle statements and to distort the historical realities with their manipulations because some narrative and historical examples is the witness of screams and objections of Imam Ali (peace be upon him) toward the selected persons of Saghife . The following text is the best attest for this claim

فَلَمَّا تُوقِيَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ -صلى الله عليه وسلم- قَالَ أَبُو بَكْرٍ أَنَا وَلِيُّ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ (ص) فَجِئْتُمَا تَطْلُبُ
مِيرَاتِكَ مِنْ ابْنِ أَخِيكَ وَيَطْلُبُ هَذَا مِيرَاتِ امْرَأَتِهِ مِنْ أَبِيهَا فَقَالَ أَبُو بَكْرٍ قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ (ص) « مَا نُورَتْ
مَا تَرَكْنَا صَدَقَةً ». فَرَأَيْتُمَاهُ كَاذِبًا آثِمًا غَادِرًا خَائِنًا وَاللَّهِ يَعْلَمُ إِنَّهُ لَصَادِقٌ بَارٌّ رَاشِدٌ تَابِعٌ لِلْحَقِّ ثُمَّ تُوقِيَ أَبُو
بَكْرٍ وَأَنَا وَلِيُّ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ -صلى الله عليه وسلم- وَوَلِيُّ أَبِي بَكْرٍ فَرَأَيْتُمَانِي كَاذِبًا آثِمًا غَادِرًا خَائِنًا.

Imam Ali (peace be upon him) and Abbas talked about some matters with Abu-Bakr. One of the most important matters was about the inheritance of the prophet. The narrator of this conversation, Umar Bin Khatab, says

Abubakr said " I am the successor of the messenger of God. Then both of you (Ali and Abbas) came to him in order to ask for their inheritance. And you (O' Abbas! Abbas asked for the inheritance of his nephew and the inheritance of his wife from her father. Abubakr said " the messenger of God stated " we leave nothing as inheritance and whatever is left is as charity. Then you considered both of them a liar, an evildoer, a cheater and a betrayer. But God knows that he is an honest person, the follower of the right path. Then he passed away and I became the successor of the messenger of God and the successor of Abubakr. You consider me a liar, an evildoer, a cheater and a betrayer. But God knows that I am an honest and benevolent person and the follower of the right path.

In this narration, according to the confession of Umar, Imam Ali (peace be upon him) considers the first caliph and the second caliph a liar, the usurper of caliphate and betrayer.

Hence, is it possible to claim that Imam Ali (peace be upon him) did not object and disagree?

Can we find disagreement and objection clearer than this? He refuses to accept all conditions of caliphate that was the way of Sheikhin and he considers their way false and abolished.

Taftazani has said in the book " the explanation of purposes"

ثم جعلوا الاختيار إلى عبدالرحمن بن عوف فأخذ بيد علي رضي الله تعالى عنه وقال تبايعني على كتاب الله وسنة رسول الله وسيرة الشيخين فقال على كتاب الله وسنة رسول الله وأجتهد برأيي ثم قال مثل ذلك لعثمان فأجابه إلى ما دعاه وكرر عليهما ثلاث مرات فأجابا بالجواب الأول فبايع عثمان وبايعه الناس ورضوا بإمامته

He left responsibility to Abd Al-Rahman Bin Uf , took the hand of Imam Ali and said " do you want to swear allegiance provided that you act to the book of God and the tradition of the prophet and the way of Sheikhin? He answered " I will accept it according to the book of God, the tradition of the messenger of God and my vote and Ijthead". Then he said this condition to Usman and he accepted it. He repeated this matter three times and he gave the first answer.

Consequently, he swore allegiance with Usman and the people swore allegiance with him and accepted his Imamate.

Tabari has written in the book " Tarikh"

ولما خرجت الخوارج من الكوفة أتى عليا أصحابه وشيعته فبايعوه وقالوا نحن أولياء من واليت وأعداء من عاديت فشرط لهم فيه سنة رسول الله فجاءه ربيعة بن أبي شداد الخثعمي وكان شهد معه الجمل وصفين ومعه راية خثعم فقال له بايع علي كتاب الله وسنة رسول الله فقال ربيعة على سنة أبي بكر وعمر قال له علي ويلك لو أن أبا بكر وعمر عملا بغير كتاب الله وسنة رسول الله لم يكونا على شيء من الحق فبايعه فنظر إليه علي وقال أما والله لكأنني بك وقد نفرت مع هذه الخوارج فقتلت وكأني بك وقد وطئت الخيل بحوافرها فقتل يوم النهر مع خوارج البصرة.

When Khavarej left Kufe, Imam Ali (peace be upon him) came to the companions and his Shias. They swore allegiance with him and said " we are friend with everyone that you consider as friend and we are enemy with everyone that you consider as enemy. Imam Ali (peace be upon him) betted that they acted to the tradition of the messenger of God. when Rabie Bin Abushedad had the flag of the tribe of Khasam, he came to Imam Ali (peace be upon him). he attended in the wars of Jamal and Sefin. Amir Momenan (peace be upon him) said to him " swear allegiance with the book of God and the tradition of the messenger of God". He said " I will swear allegiance with the tradition of Abubakr and Umar". Imam Ali said to him " woe you! If Umar and Abubakr act except the tradition of the messenger of God, they will have no right". He swore allegiance with Imam Ali (peace be upon him). Imam Ali (peace be upon him) looked at him and said " I can expect that you and Khavarej will take part at the war and you will be killed. I can expect that you will be killed by horse". Finally he was killed at the Nahravan War with the Khavarej of Basra

Whereas Amir Momenan does not believe in Abubakr and Umar, how do you claim that he swore allegiance with them by all means and he considered them the caliphs of the messenger of God?

The second part of this doubt related to the laxity of the Shias in defending their beliefs and their religious inspirations does not need detailed answer, but we only express " have the opponents of the religion of Ahle Beit let up and they have given up their impudence, threats, murders, distort and damage so that they will not face to any invasions in return?

Conclusion

Neither did Imam Ali (peace be upon him) ignore his right and nor did the enemies stop invading against the Shias. Hence, it is a meaningless expectation request the Shias not to react.

The group in charge of answering doubts

Research centre of Hazrat Valiasr

the Pdf file includes the English translation of this text.