

## Did Aeshe refuse to bury the dead body of Imam Mojtaba (peace be upon him) in the house of the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants)?

The group of the ideas of Shias

Did Aeshe refuse to bury the dead body of Imam Mojtaba (peace be upon him) in the house of the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants)?

This question has been come up by: Shokri Nejad

### Answer

A lot of narrations in the Shiite and Sunni sources prove that Aeshe prevented from burying Sabt Akbar, Imam Mojtaba ( peace be upon him),and she did not allow to bury Hazrat Mojtaba ( peace be upon him) beside his grandfather, the messenger of God ( peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants).

There are a lot of narrations about this matter in the Shiite sources and we narrate only a narration from the book " Kafi" without commenting about its text :

وَبِهَذَا الْإِسْنَادِ عَنْ سَهْلِ عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ سُلَيْمَانَ عَنْ هَارُونَ بْنِ الْجَهْمِ عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ مُسْلِمٍ قَالَ  
سَمِعْتُ أَبَا جَعْفَرٍ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ يَقُولُ لَمَّا احْتَضَرَ الْحَسَنُ بْنُ عَلِيٍّ عَلَيْهِمَا السَّلَامُ قَالَ لِلْحُسَيْنِ يَا أَخِي  
أَوْصِيكَ بِوَصِيَّةٍ فَاحْفَظْهَا فَلَمَّا أَنَا مِتُّ فَهَيَّبْنِي ثُمَّ وَجَّهْنِي إِلَى رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ لِأُحَدِّثَ بِهِ عَهْدًا  
ثُمَّ اصْرَفْنِي إِلَى أُمِّي فَاطِمَةَ عَلَيْهَا السَّلَامُ ثُمَّ رَدَّنِي فَادْفَنْنِي بِالْبَقِيعِ وَاعْلَمْ أَنَّهُ سَيُصِيبُنِي مَنَ الْحُمَيْرَاءِ مَا يَعْلَمُ  
النَّاسُ مِنْ صَنِيعِهَا وَعَدَاوَتِهَا لِلَّهِ وَلِرَسُولِهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَعَدَاوَتِهَا لَنَا أَهْلَ الْبَيْتِ  
فَلَمَّا فُيِّضَ الْحَسَنُ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ وَوُضِعَ عَلَى سَرِيرِهِ فَانْطَلَقُوا بِهِ إِلَى مُصَلَّى رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ  
عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ الَّذِي كَانَ يُصَلِّي فِيهِ عَلَى الْجَنَائِزِ فَصَلَّى عَلَى الْحَسَنِ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ فَلَمَّا أَنْ صَلَّى عَلَيْهِ حُمِلَ  
فَأَدْخَلَ الْمَسْجِدَ.

فَلَمَّا أُوقِفَ عَلَى قَبْرِ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ بَلَغَ عَائِشَةُ الْخَبْرُ وَقِيلَ لَهَا إِنَّهُمْ قَدْ أَقْبَلُوا  
 بِالْحَسَنِ بْنِ عَلِيٍّ لِيُدْفَنَ مَعَ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ فَخَرَجَتْ مُبَادِرَةً عَلَى بَعْلِ بِسْرَجٍ فَكَانَتْ أَوَّلَ امْرَأَةٍ رَكِبَتْ فِي الْإِسْلَامِ  
 سَرَجًا فَوَقَفَتْ وَقَالَتْ نَحُوا ابْنَكُمْ عَنْ بَيْتِي فَإِنَّ لِي يُدْفَنُ فِيهِ شَيْءٌ وَلَا يُهْتَكُ عَلَى رَسُولِ اللَّهِ حِجَابُهُ.  
 فَقَالَ لَهَا الْحُسَيْنُ بْنُ عَلِيٍّ صَلَوَاتُ اللَّهِ عَلَيْهِمَا قَدِيمًا هَتَكْتَ أَنْتِ وَأَبُوكِ حِجَابَ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ وَأَدْخَلْتِ  
 بَيْتَهُ مَنْ لَا يُحِبُّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ هُ فُرْبُهُ وَإِنَّ اللَّهَ سَأَلَكَ عَنْ ذَلِكَ يَا عَائِشَةُ إِنَّ أَخِي أَمَرَنِي أَنْ أَقْرِبَهُ مِنْ أَبِيهِ  
 رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ لِيُحَدِّثَ بِهِ عَهْدًا وَعِلْمِي أَنَّ أَخِي أَعْلَمُ النَّاسَ بِاللَّهِ وَرَسُولِهِ وَأَنَّ عِلْمُ بِنَاوِيلِ  
 كِتَابِهِ مِنْ أَنْ يَهْتَكُ عَلَى رَسُولِ اللَّهِ سِرَّهُ لِأَنَّ اللَّهَ تَبَارَكَ وَتَعَالَى يَقُولُ: «يَا أَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا لَا تَدْخُلُوا بُيُوتَ  
 النَّبِيِّ إِلَّا أَنْ يُؤْذَنَ لَكُمْ» وَقَدْ أَدْخَلْتِ أَنْتِ بَيْتَ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ الرَّجَالَ بِغَيْرِ إِذْنِهِ وَقَدْ قَالَ اللَّهُ  
 عَزَّ وَجَلَّ «يَا أَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا لَا تَرْفَعُوا أَصْوَاتَكُمْ فَوْقَ صَوْتِ النَّبِيِّ» وَلَعَمْرِي لَقَدْ ضَرَبْتِ أَنْتِ لِأَيِّكَ  
 وَقَارُوقِهِ عِنْدَ أُنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ الْمَعَاوِلَ وَقَالَ اللَّهُ عَزَّ وَجَلَّ «إِنَّ الَّذِينَ يَعْضُونَ  
 أَصْوَاتَهُمْ عِنْدَ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ أُولَئِكَ الَّذِينَ امْتَحَنَ اللَّهُ قُلُوبَهُمْ لِلتَّقْوَى» وَلَعَمْرِي لَقَدْ أَدْخَلَ أَبُوكِ وَقَارُوقُهُ عَلَى  
 رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ بِفُرْبِهِمَا مِنْهُ الْأَذَى وَمَا رَعِيَا مِنْ حَقِّهِ مَا أَمَرَهُمَا اللَّهُ بِهِ عَلَى لِسَانِ رَسُولِ  
 اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ إِنَّ اللَّهَ حَرَّمَ مِنَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ أَمْوَانًا مَا حَرَّمَ مِنْهُمْ أَحْيَاءً وَتَالَلَّهِ يَا عَائِشَةُ لَوْ كَانَ هَذَا  
 الَّذِي كَرِهْتِيهِ مِنْ دَفْنِ الْحَسَنِ عِنْدَ أَبِيهِ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ جَائِزًا فِيمَا بَيْنَنَا وَبَيْنَ اللَّهِ لَعَلِمْتَ أَنَّهُ  
 سَيُدْفَنُ وَإِنْ رَغِمَ مَعْطُوكِ.

قَالَ ثُمَّ تَكَلَّمَ مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ الْحَنَفِيَّةِ وَقَالَ يَا عَائِشَةُ يَوْمًا عَلَى بَعْلِ وَيَوْمًا عَلَى جَمَلٍ فَمَا تَمْلِكِينَ نَفْسَكَ وَلَا  
 تَمْلِكِينَ الْأَرْضَ عَدَاوَةَ لِبَنِي هَاشِمٍ.

قَالَ فَأَقْبَلَتْ عَلَيْهِ فَقَالَتْ يَا ابْنَ الْحَنَفِيَّةِ هَوْلَاءِ الْفَوَاطِمُ يَنْكَلَهُونَ فَمَا كَلَامُكَ؟

فَقَالَ لَهَا الْحُسَيْنُ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ وَأَنْتِ تُبْعِدِينَ مُحَمَّدًا مِنَ الْفَوَاطِمِ فَوَ اللَّهُ لَقَدْ وَلَدْتُهُ ثَلَاثًا فَوَاطِمٌ ؛  
 فَاطِمَةُ بِنْتُ عِمْرَانَ بْنِ عَائِذِ بْنِ عَمْرٍو بْنِ مَخْرُومٍ وَفَاطِمَةُ بِنْتُ أُسْدِ بْنِ هَاشِمٍ وَفَاطِمَةُ بِنْتُ زَائِدَةَ بْنِ الْأَصَمِّ  
 ابْنِ رَوَاحَةَ بْنِ حُجْرِ بْنِ عَبْدِ مَعِيصِ بْنِ عَامِرٍ قَالَ فَقَالَتْ عَائِشَةُ لِلْحُسَيْنِ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ نَحُوا ابْنَكُمْ وَأَذْهَبُوا بِهِ  
 فَإِنَّكُمْ قَوْمٌ خَصِمُونَ قَالَ فَمَضَى الْحُسَيْنُ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ إِلَى قَبْرِ أُمِّهِ ثُمَّ أَخْرَجَهُ فَدَفَنَهُ بِالْبُقْعِ.

Muhammad Bin Moslem says " Imam Bagher (peace be upon him) said " Hassan Bin Ali (peace be upon him) was about to die, he said to his brother, Imam Hussein (peace be upon him)

O' my brother! Act to what I will you. When I passed away, bury my dead body. Then take me to the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) in order to renovate my treaty. Then bring me back to my mother, Hazrat Fateme (peace be upon her) and bury me in Baghie. You should know that Aeshe that people know about her ugly deeds and her animosity with God, prophet and our dynasty will hurt you.

When Imam Hassan (peace be upon him) passed away and they put him into his coffin and took him to a place that the prophet (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) prayed for dead bodies. Imam Hussein (peace e upon him) prayed for the dead body and when his prayer finished, they took the dead body into the mosque. When they put it on the grave of the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants), they informed Aeshe and said to her " the people of Bani Hashem Tribe have brought the dead body of Hassan Bin Ali (peace be upon him) to bury beside the grave of the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants). Aeshe rode a saddled mule and arrived there as soon as possible. She was the first woman that rode a saddled mule after the Islam. She stood and said " take your child out of this house. No one should be buried here and the rank of the prophet (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) should not be spoilt.

Hussein Bin Ali (peace be upon him) said " you and your father spoilt the rank of the prophet (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) and you brought some persons (Umar and Abubakr) in the house of the prophet that did not like to be buried around the grave of the prophet and God will summon you because of this action. My brother ordered me to bury his dead body near the grave of his father, the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) in order to renovate his treaty with him. And you should know that my brother was wiser than all of people about God, his messenger and the meaning of the Quran and he was wise enough to break the honor of the prophet (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) because exalted and great God said " people that have believed in God have not been allowed to enter into the house". You allowed some persons to enter his house without his permission. Great God said " do not raise you voice higher than the voice of the prophet". However, I swear God that you dug beside the grave of the prophet (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) with your shovels because of your father and his Farugh although great God said " persons that do not raise their voice in the presence of the messenger of God are the same as persons that

God has purified their hearts for devout". I swear God that your father and his Farugh ( Umar) hurt the prophet ( peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) because their grave was near the grave of the prophet and they did not act to the order that said through the tongue of his prophet because whatever God has destined is haram, when the Muslims are alive, will be haram too when they are not alive. O' Aeshe! I swear God that God has allowed to bury Imam Hassan (peace be upon him) beside the grave of his grandfather, the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) even although you would not like us to bury him beside the grave of the prophet. But you should know that he will be buried in spite of your disagreement (unfortunately, it is not allowed to dig with shovels beside the ear of the prophet).

Then Muhammad Bin Hanife continued and said " O' Aeshe! One day you ride a mule and the other day, you ride acamel (in the War of Jamal). Because of animosity with the Bani Hashem Tribe, you cannot control your soul and you cannot live on the earth.

Aeshe looked at me and said " O' the son of Hanife! These are my children that are saying. What are you saying?

Imam Hussein said to him " where are you taking Muhammad from Bani Fateme? I swear God that he has given to three daughters with the name " Fateme": 1. Fateme( the daughter of Umaran Bin Aez Bein Umarv Bin Makhzum ( the mother of Abu Taleb); 2. Fateme (the daughter of Asad Bin Hashem and the mother of Amir Al-Momenin (peace be upon him); Fateme ( the daughter of Zaede Bin Asem Bin Ravahe Bin Hajar Bin Abd Mais Bin Amer and the mother of Abd Al-Motaleb).

Aeshe said to Imam Hussein " take your son away and you always look for animosity with others".

Then Imam Hussein ( peace be upon him) came to the grave of his mother, took her dead body out of the grave and buried her in Baghie.

Al-Kolini Al-Razi, Abu Jafar Muhammad Ben Yaghub Ben Eshagh (died in 328 hejira), Al-Osul Min Al-Kafi, v 1 p 303, Published by: Eslamiye, Tehran, Second Edition, 1362 hejira

The Sunni scientists have narrated that Aeshe came with her and she did not allow Imam Mojtaba (peace be upon him) to be buried beside the grave of the prophet (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants)

Ibn Abd Al-Ber Ghortebi, the Sunni famous scientist, has written in the book " Behje Al-Majales"

لما مات الحسن أرادوا أن يدفنوه في بيت رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم، فأبى ذلك عائشة

وركبت بغلة وجمعت الناس، فقال لها ابن عباس: كأنك أردت أن يقال: يوم البغلة كما قيل يوم الجمل؟!..

When Imam Hassan (peace be upon him) passed away, they wanted to bury him in the house of the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants), but Aeshe prevented from such action. She rode her mule and summoned all of people. Ibn Abbas said to him " (you want to do the same action that you did in the Jamal War) so that people say " is the day of the same as the day of camel?

Ibn Abd Al-Ber Al-Nomari Al-Ghartabi Al-Maleki, Abu Omar Yusef Ben Abdullah Ben Abd Al-Ber (died in 463 hejira), Behjat Al-Majales Ans Al-Majales, v 1 Min Ghasam Al-Aval, p 100, chapter Min Al-Ajaviye Al-Maskanat Hasan Al-Badihat, Researched by: Muhammad Morsi Al-Khui, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut, Second Edition, 1981

Balazeri in the book " Ansab Al-Ashraf" and Ibn Abi Al-Hadid in the book " the explanation of Nahj Al-Balaghe" have written

وتوفي فلما أرادوا دفنه أبى ذلك مروان وقال : لا، يدفن عثمان في حش كوكب ويدفن الحسن

ههنا. فاجتمع بنو هاشم وبنو أمية فأع ان هؤلاء قوم وهؤلاء قوم، وجاؤوا بالسلاح فقال أبو هريرة

لمروان: يا مروان أتمنع الحسن أن يدفن في هذا الموضع وقد سمعت رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم يقول

له ولأخيه حسين: هما سيديا شباب أهل الجنة. فقال مروان: دعنا عنك، لقد ضاع حديث رسول الله ان كان

لا يحفظه غيرك وغير أبي سعيد الخدري إنما أسلمت أيام خيبر، قال : صدقت، أسلمت أيام خيبر، إنما

لزمت رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم فلم أكن أفارقه، وكنت أسأله وعانيت بذلك حتى علمت وعرفت من

أحب ومن أبغض ومن قرب ومن أبعد، ومن أقر ومن نفى، ومن دعا له ومن لعنه.

فلما رأت عائشة السلاح والرجال، وخافت أن يعظم الشر بينهم وتسفك الدماء قالت : البيت بيتي ولا أذن أن يدفن فيه أحد.

When Imam Hassan (peace be upon him) passed away, they wanted to bury him. Marvan did not allow it and said " Usman should be buried in Kokab (the Jewish cemetery beside Baghie) and Hassan should be buried here. The Bani Hashem Tribe and Bani Omayer Tribe joined their forces to help each other and they brought weapons. Abuharire said to Marvan " do you prevent from burying Marvan here? While you heard from the messenger of God that he said to his brother, Hussein, " these two commanders are two youths of heaven" Marvan said " leave me alone; the Hadith of the messenger of God has been spoilt. If no one, except you and Abu Saeid Khodri, had memorized it, you would have become Muslim in the time of the victory of Kheibar. Abu Harire said " you were right; we became Muslim in the time of the victory of Kheibar, but we always accompanied the prophet and we did not separate from him. I asked him and I was interested in this action until I knew and recognized who the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) loved, who he disliked, who is near him and who is far from him, who did he allow to stay in Medina, who did he exile, who did he pray and who did he curse?

When Ashe saw men and their weapons, she scared that riot came out among them and bloodshed happened. She said " this is my house and I allow no one to be buried".

Al-Balazari, Ahmad Ben Yahya Ben Jaber (died in 279 hejira), Ansab Al-Ashraf, v 1 p 389, according to the software of Jamat Al-Kabir

Ibn Abi Al-Hadid Al-Madaeni Al-Motazeli, Abu Hamed Ez Al-Din Ben Habatollah Ben Muhammad Ben Muhammad (died in 655 hejira), Sharh Nahj Al-Balaghe, v 16 p 8, Researched by: Muhammad Abd Al-Karim Al-Nomari, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut / Lebanon, First Edition, 1418 hejira- 1998

Yaghubi has written in the book " history"

وقيل أن عائشة ركبت بغلة شهباء وقالت بيتي لا آذن فيه لأحد فأتاها القاسم بن محمد بن أبي بكر

فقال لها يا عمة ما غسلنا رؤوسنا من يوم الجمل الأحمر أتريدين أن يقال يوم البغلة الشهباء فرجعت

As Aeshe was riding a gray mule, she said " this is my house and I never allow anyone to be buried. Ghasem Bin Muhammad Bin Abi Bakr came forward and said " O' my aunt! We have not washed our heads (because of disgrace) after the day of red camel. You want to say " the day of gray mule". Then Aeshe came back.

Al-Yaghubi , Ahmad Ben Abi Yaghub Ben Jafar Ben Vahab Ben Vazeh (died in 292 hejira), Tarikh Al-Yaghubi, v 2 p 225, Published by: Dar Sader, Beirut

Abu Al-Fada has written in the book " history"

وكان الحسن قد أوصى أن يدفن عند جده رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم ، فلما توفي أرادوا ذلك، وكان على المدينة مروان بن الحكم من قبل معاوية، فمنع من ذلك، وكاد يقع بين بني أمية وبين بني هاشم بسبب ذلك فتنة، فقالت عائشة رضي الله عنها : البيت بيتي ولا آذن أن يدفن فيه، فدفن بالبقيع، ولما بلغ معاوية موت الحسن خر ساجداً.

Imam Hassan (peace be upon him) willed to be buried beside his grandfather, the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants). When he passed away, they wanted to act to his will. In such time, Marwan from Moavie was the ruler of Medina. Because Aeshe prevented from such action, riot came out between Bani Omaye and Bani Hashem due to this matter. Then Aeshe said " this is my house and I do not allow his dead body to be buried here. Therefore, they buried him in Baghie. When Moavie informed of the death of Imam Hasan (peace be upon him), he prostrated from the happiness of hearing this news.

Abu Al-Feda Emad Al-Din Esmaeel Ben Ali (died in 732 hejira), Al-Mokhtasar Fi Akhbar Al-Bashar, v 1 p 127, according to the software of Jamat Al-Kabir

According to the mentioned documents, Aeshe refused to bury Imam Mojtaba (peace be upon him) in the house of the prophet. Hence, the following questions will be asked

Why did Aeshe refuse to bury the dead body of Imam Mojtaba (peace be upon him) beside his grandfather, the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants)?

Did Aeshe own this house? Who granted this house to him? If she had inherited it from the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants), why would the daughter of the prophet have deprived of this inheritance? If it had been the public property of the Muslims and as Beit Al-Mal, why wouldn't she have allowed to bury him?

Why did she allow Abubakr and Umar to bury there?

We hope the Sunni scientists answer it.

Good luck

The group in charge of answering doubts