

Did calendars use the word " demise" about Hazrat Zahra (peace be upon her) before 71 A.H.?

The group of Shiite beliefs

Doubt

Maybe, it was in 71A.H that some specialists and researchers of the Islamic republic government in the parliament of Islamic council (they were considered as representatives) discovered an important secret after 1400 years research and analysis. They found out that Hazrat Fateme, the daughter of the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) did not pass away, but she was martyred. In such situation, the representatives of the parliament (May God never forgive them)announced " the word" martyrdom" should be written instead of the word" demise in calendars from now on". Hence, they imposed the greatest hit to the Islamic unity and created a deep discord.

The Sunni scientists say to us " why did they write the word " demise" in calendars before?"

Criticism and analysis

This question has targeted the Shias. In spite of the fact that some calendars have used the word " demise", does referring to such reasons are worth hearing? While there are enough reasons from Sunni and Shiite scientists about the martyrdom of Hazrat Zahra (peace be upon her).

To answer this doubt, two points should be taken into consideration:

First: " demise" is a general word and it includes natural death as well as martyrdom because the word " demise" has been used about the martyrdom of Imam Hussein, Amir Momenan, Jafar Tayar (peace be upon him), and the first caliph and the second caliph in a lot of cases even in valid books.

The demise of Imam Hussein (peace be upon him) in narrations

Tabarsi has written in the book " Al-Ehtejaj"

محمد بن الحنفية بعد وفاة أخيه الحسين صلوات الله عليه

Al-Tabarsi, Abi Mansur Ahmad Ben Ali Ben Abi Taleb (died in 548 hejira), Al-Ehtejaj, v 2 p 136, Researched by: Al-Seyed Muhammad Bagher Al-Khorasan, Published by: Dar Al-Naman lel Tabaat va Al-Nashr, Al-Najaf, 1386- 1966

Ibn Shahr Ashub has written " the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) has said about Imam Hussein (peace be upon him)

أما ان أمتي ستقتله فمن زاره بعد وفاته كتب الله له حجة من حججى.

You should know that my nation kills Hussein. Hence, God will write the reward of one of my Hajjs for everyone that visits him after his demise.

Ibn Shahr Ashub, Shir Al-Din, Abi Abdullah Muhammad Ben Ali Al-Mazandarani (died in 588 hejira), Managheb Ale Abi Taleb, v 3 p 272, Published by: Al-Maktabat va Al-Matbaat Al-Heidariye, Al-Najaf, 1345 hejira

The demise of Amir Momenin (peace be upon him) in the Shiite and Sunni narrations

There is also the interpretation " demise " about the martyrdom of Amir Momenin

وكان مع أخيه الحسن بعد وفاة أبيه عليهم السلام عشر سنين وبقي بعد وفاة أخيه الحسن عليه السلام إلى وقت مقتله عشر سنين

After the martyrdom of the grandfather Imam Hussein (peace be upon him), he lived with his brother for ten years and he lived ten years before him.

Al-Arbali, Abi Al-Hasan Ali Ben Isa Ben Abi Al-Fath (died in 693 hejira), Kashf Al-Ghamat Fi Marefat Al-Aeme, v 2 p 250, Published by: Dar Al-Azva, Beirut, Second Edition, 1405 hejira- 1985

Al-Majlesi, Bagher (died in 1111 hejira), Bahar Al-Anvar, v 44 p 200, Researched by: Muhammad Al-Bagher Al-Behbudi, Published by: Al-Vafa Institute, Beirut, Lebanon, Second Edition, Al-Mosahahat, 1403- 1983

The word " demise" has been used about Amir Momenan (peace be upon him) in the Sunni narrations.

عن عمرو بن حبشي قال خطبنا الحسن بن علي بعد **وفاة علي** فقال لقد فارقكم رجل بالأمس لم يسبقه الأولون بعلم...

Ibn Abi Sheibe Al-Kufi, Abubakr Abdullah Ben Muhammad (died in 235 hejira), Al-Ketab Al-Mosnef Fi Al-Ahadith Al-Athar, v 6 p 371, v 7 p 476, Researched by: Kamal Yusef Al-Howt, Published by: Maktab Al-Roshd, Riyadh, First Edition, 1409 hejira

Al-Sheibani, Ahmad Ben Hanbal Abu Abdullah (died in 241 hejira), Fazael Al-Sahabe, v 2 p 600, Researched by: D. Vasiollah Muhammad Abbas, Published by: Resalat Institute, Beirut, First Edition, 1403 hejira- 1983

وخرج عبيد الله بن العباس بن عبد المطلب إلى الناس **بعد وفاة علي** ودفنه فقال: إن أمير المؤمنين رحمه الله تعالى قد توفي براً تقياً، عدلاً مرضياً...

Al-Balazari, Ahmad Ben Yahya Ben Jaber (died in 279 hejira), Ansab Al-Ashraf, v 1 p 383

The demise of Hazrat Sayad Al-Shohada in narrations

Hazrat Hamze, the uncle of the messenger of God, has been known as " Sayad Al-Shohada" among Sunni and Shiite scientists. However, the word " demise" has been used

منها **بعد وفاة حمزة بن عبد المطلب** ورسول الله...

Al-Asemi Al-Maki, Abd Al-Malek Ben Hossein Ben Abd Al-Malek Al-Shafei (died in 1111 hejira), Samt Al-Nojum Al-Avali Fi Anba Al-Avail Al-Tavali, v 1 p 426, Researched by: Adel Ahmad Abd Al-Mojud, Ali Muhammad Moavez, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie

The demise of Jafar Bin Abi Taleb (peace be upon him) in narrations

The martyrdom of Jafar Bin Abu Taleb (peace be upon him) is certain from the point of view of Shiite and Sunni scientists. However, the word " demise" has been used about him

... عن عائشة قالت **لَمَّا أَتَتْ وَفَاةَ جَعْفَرٍ** عَرَقْنَا فِي وَجْهِ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ الْحُزْنَ

Ibn Abi Sheibe Al-Kufi, Abubakr Abdullah Ben Muhammad (died in 235 hejira), Al-Ketab Al-Mosnef Fi Al-Ahadith Al-Athar, v 3 p 62, v 7 p 414, Researched by: Kamal Yusef Al-Howt, Published by: Maktab Al-Roshd, Riyadh, First Edition, 1409 hejira

The demise of Umar Bin Al-Khatab in narrations

The Sunni scientists agree unanimously that the second caliph was martyred by Abulolo. However, as we see, they have used the word " demise" about Umar in their books. Can it be considered as a reason to say that it is a lie that Umar was killed by Lolo and Umar has never been killed? If someone searches the Sunni books, they can find over thousands cases. Briefly, we will mention several cases

Balazeri has written in the book " Ansab Al-Ashraf"

وخطب فاطمة بنت عمر الخطاب رضي الله تعالى عنه، بعد وفاة عمر، وأصدقها مائة ألف....

Al-Balazari, Ahmad Ben Yahya Ben Jaber (died in 279 hejira), Ansab Al-Ashraf, v 2 p 257

ويقال كان فتح الري قبل وفاة عمر بسنتين.

Al-Tabari, Abi Jafar Muhammad Ben Jarir (died in 310 hejira), Tarikh Al-Tabari, v 2 p 536, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut

ولا حجة له في بقاء الصحابة بلا خليفة في مدة التشاور يوم السقيفة وأيام الشورى بعد وفاة عمر رضي الله عنه لأنهم لم يكونوا تاركين لنصب الخليفة.

Al-Navavi, Abu Zakariya Yahya Ben Sharaf Ben Meri, sharh Al-Navavi Ali Sahih Moslem, v 12 p 205, Published by: Dar Ehya Al-Torath Al-Arabi, Beirut, Second Edition, 1392 hejira

وروى حماد بن النضر عن محمد بن المنكدر عن عطاء عنها نحوه وقال حدثتني بعد وفاة عمر.

Al-Zahabi, Shams Al-Din Muhammad Ben Ahmad Ben Osman (died in 748 hejira), Seir Alam Al-Nobala, v 5 p 132, Researched by: Shoaib Al-Arnawt, Muhammad Naeem Al-Araghsusi, Published by: Resalat Institute, Beirut, Ninth Edition, 1413 hejira

والصحيح أنه ولد لسنتين مضتا من خلافة عمر فيكون له وقت وفاة عمر ثمان سنين

Ibn Al-Gheim Al-Joziye, Muhammad Ben Abibakr Ayub Al-Zarai Abu Abdullah (died in 751 hejira), Hashiyat Ibn Al-Gheim Ala Sonan Abi Davood, v 13 p 244, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut, Second Edition, 1415 hejira- 1995

لأنه ولد يوم موت رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم وפטّم يوم وفاة أبي بكر وبلغ **يوم وفاة عمر بن الخطاب** وتزوج يوم مقتل عثمان بن عفان وولد له يوم مقتل علي بن أبي طالب

Al-Safdi, Salah Al-Din Khalil Ben Aibak (died in 764 hejira), Al-Vafi bel Vafiyat, v 16 p 287, Researched by: Ahmad Al-Arnawt and Torki Mostafa, Published by: Dar Ehya Al-Torath Al-Arabi, Beirut, 1420 hejira- 2000

Sefdi has used the word " demise" for the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants), Abubakr and Umar in this part, but he has used the word " murdered" for Amir Momenan (peace be upon him) and Usman. he must not have believed that Umar was killed.

ثم دخلت سنة ثلاث وعشرين وفيها وفاة عمر بن الخطاب.

Al-Gharashi Al-Dameshghi, Esmaeel Ben Omar Ben Kathir Abu Al-Feda (died in 774 hejira), Al-Badayat Al-Nahayat, v 7 p 130, Researched by: Maktab Al-Maaref, Beirut

Even Heithami has devoted a chapter with the title

«باب وفاة عمر رضي الله عنه»

Al-Heithami, Ali Ben Abibakr (died in 807 hejira), Majma Al-Zavaed va Manba Al-Favaed, v 9 p 74, Published by: Dar Al-Riyan Lel Torath/ Dar Al-Kotob Al-Arabi, Cairo, Beirut,1407 hejira

The demise of Usman in the Sunni narrations

Usman Bin Afan was killed by the companions of the messenger of God and the Sunni scientists believe that he was martyred whereas they use the word " demise" about him

ذكر وفاة عثمان بن عفان رضي الله عنه (47 ق هـ 35هـ).

... أخبرنا إسماعيل بن أحمد قال أخبرنا محمد بن هبة الله الطبري قال أخبرنا أبو الحسين بن بشران قال أخبرنا أبو علي بن صفوان قال حدثنا أبو بكر القرشي قال حدثني الحارث بن محمد التميمي قال حدثني أبو الحسن علي بن محمد القرشي عن سعيد بن مسلم بن بانك عن أبيه أن عثم ان بن عفان قال متمثلا يوم دخل عليه فقتل
أرى الموت لا يبقي عزيزا ولم يدع لعاد ملاذا في البلاد

Ibn Al-Jozi, Abu Al-Faraj Abd Al-Rahman Ben Ali Ben Muhammad (died in 597 hejira), Al-Thobat End Al-Mamat, v 1 p 101, Researched by: Abdullah Al-Laithi Al-Ansari, Published by: Al-Kotob Al-Thaghafiye Institute, Beirut, First Edition, 1406 hejira

Sakhavi, one of Sunni dignitaries, uses about a matter about Amir Momenan (peace be upon him), Umar Bin Khatab and Usman uses the word " demise"

... وبالكاف والجيم أيضا: إلى أن وفاة عمر بن الخطاب كانت في سنة ثلاث وعشرين، وذلك في آخر يوم في ذى الحجة شهيدا.
وبالهاء واللام: إلى أن وفاة عثمان بن عفان كانت في سنة خمس وثلاثين وذلك في ذى الحجة أيضا شهيدا.
وباللام والتحتانية: إلى أن وفاة علي بن أبي طالب كانت في سنة أربعين، وذلك في رمضان شهيدا.

The demise of Umar demised in 23 A.H. and he was martyred at the end of Zia Al-Haje.

The demise of Usman was in 35 A.H.and he was martyred in Zi Al-Haj of the same year.

The demise of Ali Bin Abu Taleb was in 40 A.H. and she was martyred at Ramadan of same year.

Al-Sakhavi, Al-Emam Al-Hafez Shams Al-Din Muhammad Ben Abd Al-Rahman (died in 902 hejira), Al-Ghayat Fi Sharh Al-Hedayat Fi Elm Al-Ravayat, v 1 p 315, Researched by: Abu Aesh Abd Al-Monaem Ebrahim, First Edition, Published by: Maktab Aolad Al-Sheikh lel Torath, 2001

Second: It is a clear lie that the word " demise" has been used in calendars before year 1372 instead of the word " martyrdom". In fact, there was such a thing before the revolution.

Suppose that it is right, can a calendar be considered as a factor for rightness or falsity of events and events?

It is our sorry that some refer to such weak reasons in order to prove or reject the matter related to beliefs?

It has been said from the past

الغريق يتشبَّث بكل حشيش

A person that is drowning resorts to dry twigs and thorns.

According to narrations with valid document in the Sunni books related to the invasion of Abubakr and Umar to the house of Sedighe Shahide (peace be upon her), does referring to such reasons have any worth?

Conclusion

In spite of the fact that calendars have used the word " demise" instead of the word" martyrdom", it is not considered the reason of lack of martyrdom of Hazrat Zahra (peace be upon her) because the word " demise" includes death as well as martyrdom and even this word has been applied about Imam Hussein, Amir Momenan, Hamze Sayad Al-Shohada, Jafar Bin Abu Taleb (peace be upon him), Umar Bin Khatab and Usman Bin Afan.

Good luck

Research centre of Hazrat Valiasr