

Is Hadrat "Mahdi" [AS] from the descendent of imam "Hassan Mujtaba" [AS]?

Description:

One of the main differences in the matter of "Mahdawiyyat" is that if imam "Mahdi" [AS] is from the descendent of imam "Hassan Mujtaba" [AS] or imam "Husain" [AS]?

Unlike Shias, Sunnis believe that he's from the descendent of imam "Hassan" [AS] not imam "Husain" [AS].

"Ibn Taymiyyah Harani" writes in "Minhaj al-Sunnah" book:

فالمهدي الذي أخبر به النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم اسمه محمد بن عبد الله لا محمد بن الحسن وقد روي عن علي رضي الله عنه أنه قال هو من ولد الحسن بن علي لا من ولد الحسين بن علي.

"Mahdi" whom messenger of god has talked about him, his name is "Muhammad ibn Abdullah" not "Muhammad ibn al-Hassan". "Ali ibn abi talib" [AS] has been quoted that "Mhadi" is from the descendent of "Hassan ibn Ali" not "Husain ibn Ali".

"Ibn Taymiyah" – Minhaj al-Sunnah al-Nabawiyah – vol. 4, p 95

"Ibn Taymiyah" means the narrative that "Abu Dawood Sajestani" has quoted:

قال أبو داود حَدَّثْتُ عَنْ هَارُونَ بْنِ الْمُغِيرَةِ قَالَ ثنا عَمْرُو بْنُ أَبِي قَيْسٍ عَنْ شُعَيْبِ بْنِ خَالِدٍ عَنْ أَبِي إِسْحَاقَ قَالَ قَالَ عَلِيٌّ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ وَتَوَضَّعَ إِلَيَّ ابْنُهُ الْحَسَنُ فَقَالَ إِنَّ ابْنِي هَذَا سَيِّدٌ كَمَا سَمَّاهُ النَّبِيُّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ وَسَيَخْرُجُ مِنْ صُلْبِهِ رَجُلٌ يُسَمَّى بِاسْمِ نَبِيِّكُمْ يُشْبِهُهُ فِي الْخُلُقِ وَلَا يُشْبِهُهُ فِي الْخُلُقِ ثُمَّ ذَكَرَ قِصَّةَ يَمَلَأُ الْأَرْضَ عَدْلًا....

“Abu Ishaq” says: while “Ali ibn abi Talib” [AS] was looking at his son “Hassan”, he said: “he’s master; as messenger of god called him by this name, there will be a child from his descendent whose name is the same as your Prophet and his behavior is like him as well but their appearance isn’t alike.” Then he quoted that he’ll fill this world with justice.

“Sajistani” –Sunan Abi Dawood – vol. 4, p 108

Reviewing:

The only reason of Sunnis to prove this fateful belief is this narrative and no other valuable reason is found in their hadith resources in this regard; of course, this narrative has fundamental problems:

The narrative quoted by “Abu Dawud” is “Mursal” {a narrative that doesn’t have document or the name of all narrators isn’t written in its document} because:

1: the person who has quoted this narrative from commander of the faithful [AS] is "Abu Ishaq Amr ibn Abdullah al-Sabi'i" died in 129 AH, who was 7 when commander of the faithful Ali [AS] died. That's true that he met hadrat "Ali" [AS] once but it's not been proved that he's quoted narrative from him.

"Mubafakuri" says:

قال المنذري هذا منقطع أبو إسحاق السبيعي رأي عليا عليه السلام رؤية.

"Munzari" says: this narrative is "Muqati'" {some of its narrators are unknown}; because

"Abu Ishaq Sabi'i" has seen commander of the faithful [AS] only once.

"Al-Mubarfakuri" – Tuhfat al-Ahozi – vol. 6, p 403

2: "Abu Dawud" says in the beginning of hadith document:

"خَدِّثْتُ عَنْ هَارُونَ بْنِ الْمُغِيرَةَ"

I was quoted from "Harun".

But he doesn't mention that who's quoted it from "Harun". "Harun ibn al-Mughirah" is on the ninth floor of Sunni narrators and "Abu Dawud Sajistani" is on the eleventh floor, so this narrative is "Mursal".

"Ibn Khaldun" says in this regard:

وأما أبو اسحاق الشيعي وإن خرج عنه في الصحيحين فقد ثبت أنه اختلط آخر عمره وروايته عن علي منقطعة وكذلك رواية أبي داود عن هارون بن المغيرة.

Though, narrative has been quoted from "Abu Ishaq Shi'i" in "Sahih Muslim" and "Sahih Bukhari", but he'd ascribe Sunni narratives to Shia at the end of his life and his narrative from "Ali" [AS] is "Munqati'", the same goes for Abu Dawud's narrative from "Harun ibn Al-Muqirah".

"Ibn Khaldun" – Al-Muqadimah – vol. 1, p 314

"Albani" Wahhabi has said that this narrative is not valid. He writes in "Al-Silsilah al-Za'ifah" book:

«هذا، وقبل إنهاء الكتابة حول حديث الترجمة لا بد لي من أن أذكر له شاهداً وجدته في "سنن أبي داود" في إسناده انقطاع وجهالة؛ فلم تطمئن النفس إليه، فقال أبو داود (٢٢٩٠): حَدَّثْتُ عَنْ هَارُونَ بْنِ الْمُغِيرَةِ...

هكذا ساقه أبو داود. فقال الخطابي عقبه في "المعالم" (١٤٢/٤): «هذا منقطع؛ أبو إسحاق السبيعي رأي علياً رضي الله عنه رؤية، وقال فيه أبو داود: حدثت عن هارون بن المغيرة».

قلت: يعني أن شيخ أبي داود فيه لم يسم؛ فهو مجهول.

وأيضاً؛ فأبو إسحاق كان اختلط، وشعيب بن خالد ليس مذكوراً فيمن روي

عنه قبل الاختلاط”

Before finishing my writing about this narrative, I have to mention to a witness for this narrative found in “Sunan abu Dawud”. Document of this narrative is “Munqati” {some narrators are unknown} so, my heart can’t trust it; “Abu Dawud” has said: “I was quoted from “Al-Mughirah”... after quoting this narrative in “Al-Ma’lim” book, “Khitabi” has said: this narrative is “Munqati”. “Abu Ishaq Sami’i” has met Hadrat “Ali ibn Talib” [AS] only once and “Abu Dawud” has also said that he was quoted from “Harun”.

I say: the name of Abu Dawud’s master isn’t written in this narrative; so he’s unknown and “Abu Ishaq” would ascribe Sunni narratives to Shia.

“Albani” – al-Silsilah al-Za’ifah – vol. 13, p 1097

This narrative is quoted with the title of “نظر إلي ابنه الحسين” in another place:

Secondly: this narrative has been quoted in other Sunni sources but this sentence

“ نظر إلي ابنه الحسين ”

is written there not

“نظر إلي ابنه الحسن ”

“Shams al-Din Jazari Shafi’i” writes:

والأصحّ أنّه من ذرية الحسين بن علي لنصّ أمير المؤمنين علي ذلك، فيما أخبرنا به شيخنا المسند رحلة زمانه عمر بن الحسن الرقي قراءة عليه، قال: أنبأنا أبو الحسن بن البخاري، أنبأنا عمر بن محمد الدارقزي، أنبأنا أبو البدر الكرخي، أنبأنا أبو بكر الخطيب، أنبأنا أبو عمر الهاشمي، أنبأنا أبو علي اللؤلؤي، أنبأنا أبو داود الحافظ قال: حدثت عن هارون بن المغيرة، قال: حدثنا عمر بن أبي قيس، عن شعيب بن خالد، عن أبي اسحاق قال: قال علي عليه السلام - ونظر إلي ابنه الحسين - فقال: إن ابني هذا سيد كما سماه النبي صلي الله عليه وسلم، وسيخرج من صلبه رجل يسمي باسم نبيكم، يشبهه في الخلق، ولا يشبهه في الخلق. ثم ذكر قصة يملأ الارض عدلا. هكذا رواه أبو داود في سننه وسكت عنه.

True opinion is that hadrat “Mahdi” is from descendent of “Husain ibn Ali” [AS] because commander of the faithful [AS] has restated on this issue; my instructor “Umar ibn Hasan” has quoted for me from “Abu Ishaq” that hadrat “Ali” [AS] said while he was looking at his son “Husain”: “He’s master; as messenger of Allah [PBUH] called him so, a child from his descendent will come to this world whose name and behavior are the same as your Prophet’s but their appearance is different.” Then he quoted the story of

filling the earth with justice. "Abu Dawud" has quoted this narrative in "Sunan" book this way without judging about it.

"Shams al-Din Shafi'i" – Asna al-Matalib fi Manaqib Ali ibn abi Talib – p 130

Contradictory with narratives that prove that hadrat "Mahdi" [AS] is from the descendent of imam "Husain" [AS]

Thirdly: these narratives are in contradictory with other narratives quoted in Sunni resources and emphasize that imam "Mahdi" [AS] is from the descendent of imam "Husain" [AS]:

وعن حذيفة رضي الله عنه قال: خطبنا رسول الله (ص) فذكرنا رسول الله (ص) بما هو كائن، ثم قال: «لو لم يبق من الدنيا إلا يوم واحد لطول الله عز وجل ذلك اليوم، حتي يبعث في رجلاً من ولدي اسمه اسمي».

فقام سلمان الفارسي رضي الله عنه فقال: يا رسول الله، من أي ولدك ؟ قال: «هو من ولدي هذا»، وضرب بيده علي الحسين عليه السلام.

أخرجه الحافظ أبو نعيم، في صفة المهدي.

"Huzaifah" has been quoted that messenger of Allah [PBUH] was delivering sermon that it came to the fate of the universe; then he said: if only one day is left from the world,

god will make it too long until a man from my descendent arises whose name is the same as mine.

“Salman” rose and said: O messenger of Allah! Which one of your children? Prophet said: “From the descendent of this child of mine, while he was hitting on Husain’s [AS] shoulder.

“Al-Maqdasi Shafi’i” – Al-Aqd al-Durar fi Akhbar al-Muntazar – vol. 1, p 83 /// “Al-Tabari”- Zakhi’ir al-Uqba – vol. 1, p 137

“Nai’im ibn Himad Marvaai”, “Maqdasi Shiafi’i” and “Jalal al-Din Suyuti” have written” in their books:

حدثنا الوليد ورشدين عن ابن لهيعة عن أبي قبيل عن عبد الله بن عمرو رضي الله عنهما قال يخرج رجل من ولد الحسين من قبل المشرق ولو استقبلته الجبال لهدمها واتخذ فيها طُرُقاً.

It’s been quoted from “Abdullah ibn Amr” that messenger of Allah [PBUH] said: a man from the descendent of “Husain” [AS] will arise from east. If even mountains stand against him, he’ll demolish them and make his way through them.

“Al-Marvazi” – Al-Fitan – vol. 1, p 371 /// “Al-Maqdasi Shafi’i” – Aqd al-Durar fi Akhbar al-Muntazar – vol. 1, p 195 /// “Al-Suyuti” – Al-Havi li al-Fatawa – vol. 2, p 62

“Ibn Sabbagh” quotes that Prophet Muhammad [PBUH] put his hand on Husain’s [AS] shoulder and said: “Mhadi is from his descendent”:

... يا فاطمة إنا أهل بيت أعطينا ست خصال لم يعطها أحد من الأولين ولا يدركها أحد من الآخرين غيرنا، فنبينا خير الأنبياء [وهو أبوك]، ووصينا خير الأوصياء وهو بعك، وشهيدنا خير الشهداء وهو عم أبيك [حمزة]، ومنا من له جناحان يطير بهما في الجنة حيث يشاء وهو جعفر، ومنا سبطا هذه الأمة وهما ابناك، ومنا مهدي [هذه] الأمة الذي يصلي خلفه عيسى بن مريم. ثم ضرب علي منكب الحسين (عليه السلام) وقال: من هذا مهدي هذه الأمة. هكذا أخرجه الدار قطني صاحب الجرح والتعديل.

O Fatimah! God has given us “Ahl al-Bayt” [AS] six qualities that not of ancients could and posterity can reach them except us, our Prophet is the best prophet and he’s your father, and our successor is the best successor and he’s your husband, our martyr is the best martyr and he’s your uncle “Hamza” and the person who has two wings and can fly in the paradise is from us and he’s “Ja’far” and two grandchildren of this nation are from us and they’re your children and “Mahdi” of this nation is from us the same

person whom "Jesus" will say prayer behind him then he put his hand on Husain's shoulder and said: "Mahdi is from his descendent".

"Dar al-Qutni" the author of "Jarh wa Ta'dil" book has quoted this narrative like this.

"Ibn Sabbagh Maliki" – Al-Fusoul al-Muhimmah fi Ma'rifah Al-A'imah – vol. 2, p 1114

"Qanduzi Hanafi" has also quoted this narrative from "Jarh wa Ta'dil" book written by

"Dar al-Qutni":

ومنها: أخرج الدارقطني في كتابه الجرح والتعديل: عن أبي سعيد الخدري: أن...

"Dar Qutni" has quoted from "Abu Sa'id Khederi" in "Jarh wa Ta'dil" book that...

"Qanduzi Hanafi" – Yanabi' al-Mawaddah – vol. 3, p 349

"Maqdisi Shafi'i" quotes from imam "Baqir" [AS] that he said: "Mahdi" is amongst imam

Husain's [AS] children:

وعن جابر بن يزيد الجعفي، قال: قال أبو جعفر عليه السلام: يا جابر... قال: فيجمع الله

تعالى للمهدي أصحابه، ثلاثمائة وثلاثة عشر رجلاً، يجمعهم الله تعالى علي غير ميعاد

وقزع كقزع الخريف، فيبايعونه بين الركن والمقام. قال: والمهدي، يا جابر، رجل من ولد

الحسين، يصلح الله له أمره في ليلة واحدة.

“Jabir ibn Ju’fi” has been quoted that imam “Baqir” [AS] said: O “Jabir”! God will gather up Mahdi’s companions who are 313 people without forecast date and they’ll swear allegiance with him in “Rukn” and “Maqam”. Then he said: O “Jabir”! He’s a man from the descendent of “Husain” [AS].

“Al-Maqdisi” – Aqd al-Durar fi Akhbar al-Muntazar – vol. 1, p 157

Thus, even if we ignore the invalidity of the narrative quoted by “Abu Dawud”, they’re in contradictory with these numerous narratives; so they can’t be authentic.

Hadrat “Mahdi”, from the descendent of imam Hassan and imam Husain [AS]:

Fourthly: even if we accept that the narrative quoted by “Abu Dawud” is faultless, it’s not in contradictory with Shia beliefs and narratives that prove that hadrat “Mahdi” [AS] is from the descendent of imam “Husain” [AS]; because he’s from the descendent of imam “Husain” [AS] through his father and is from the descendent of imam “Hassan” [AS] through his mother, because wife of imam “Ali ibn Husain” [AS], mother of imam “Baqir” [AS], was daughter of imam “Hassan” [AS]; so hadrat “Mahdi” [AS] is from the descendent of both imams, imam “Hassan” and imam “Husain” [AS].

Holy Quran has accepted this relationship and says that hadrat “Jesus” [AS] is from the descendent of previous Prophets, “Jacob”, “Ishaq” and “Abraham”:

وَوَهَبْنَا لَهُ إِسْحَاقَ وَيَعْقُوبَ كُلًّا هَدَيْنَا وَنُوحًا هَدَيْنَا مِنْ قَبْلُ وَمِنْ ذُرِّيَّتِهِ دَاوُدَ وَسُلَيْمَانَ
وَأَيُّوبَ وَيُوسُفَ وَمُوسَى وَهَارُونَ وَكَذَلِكَ نَجْزِي الْمُحْسِنِينَ. وَزَكَرِيَّا وَيَحْيَى وَعِيسَى
وَإِلْيَاسَ كُلٌّ مِنَ الصَّالِحِينَ.

We gave him Isaac and Jacob and guided both; and We guided Noah before them, among his descendants were David and Solomon, Job , Joseph, Moses and Aaron as such, We recompense the good doers {84} and (Prophets) Zachariah, John, Jesus and Elias, each was of the righteous {85}.

Surah Al-An'am – verses 84-85

When hadrat "Jesus" is related to "Isaac", "Jacob" and "Abraham" [AS] through his mother, there is no barrier that hadrat "Mahdi" [AS] is from the descendent of imam "Hassan" [AS] through his mother; as imam "Husain" and imam "Hassan" [AS], Prophet Muhammad's two grandchildren are related to him through their mother hadrat "Fatimah" [AS].

What interesting is that when Sunni scholars realized they can't deny or reject narratives prove that imam "Mahdi" [AS] is from the descendent of imam "Husain" [AS], they used weird justifications and said that he's from the descendent of imam "Husain"

[AS] through his mother and is from the descendent of imam "Hassan" [AS] through his father.

"Mulla Ali Qari" writes in this regard:

واختلف في أنه من بني الحسن أو من بني الحسين، ويمكن أن يكون جامعاً بين النسبتين الحسنين. والأظهر أنه من جهة الأب حسني ومن جانب الأم حسيني قياساً علي ما وقع في ولدي إبراهيم وهما إسماعيل وإسحاق عليهم [الصلاة] والسلام، حيث كان أنبياء بني إسرائيل كلهم من بني إسحاق، وإنما نبيء من ذرية إسماعيل نبينا وقام مقام الكل ونعم العوض وصار خاتم الأنبياء.

فكذلك لما ظهرت أكثر الأئمة وأكابر الأمة من أولاد الحسين فناسب أن ينجر الحسن بأن أعطي له ولد يكون خاتم الأولياء ويقوم مقام سائر الأصفياء... وسيأتي في حديث أبي إسحاق عن علي كرم الله الله تعالى وجهه ما هو صريح في هذا المعني والله [تعالي] أعلم.

There is difference amongst some that if imam "Mahdi" [AS] is from the descendent of imam "Hassan" [AS] or imam "Husain" [AS]. It's possible that we collect both of them and we'd better say that via his father, imam "Mahdi" is from the descendent of imam "Hassan" [AS] and through his mother, he's from the descendent of imam "Husain" [AS], so that it's compared between what happened amongst two children of

“Abraham”; “Isaac” and “Ismael” [AS]. Because Isaiah Prophets were from the descendent of “Isaac”; but our Prophet is from the descendent of “Ismael” [AS] instead of all those Prophets and is the last Prophet.

When all Shia imams [AS] and elders of nation are from the descendent of Imam “Husain” [AS], so it’s appropriate that we make it up for Imam “Hassan” [AS] saying that the last successor is from his descendent. We’ll quote a narrative from commander of the faithful [AS] quoted by “Abu Ishaq” that restates on this matter.

“Mulla Ali Qari” – Mirqat al-Mafatih – vol. 10, p 90

We say in his response:

Firstly: to prove this issue he’s not found any reason except analogy and a narrative quoted from “Abu Ishaq Sabi’i” and we proved that this narrative is “Mursal” and its document is worthless.

He said: imam “Mahdi” [AS] is better to be from the descendent of imam “Hassan” and compared it with the story of children of hadrat “Abraham”, we say in response: parentage can’t be proved by analogy and without correct reason and evidence, there must be clear evidence for this important matter.

Yes, we say that it's possible to collect narratives, but why don't you collect them this way saying that via his father, imam "Mahdi" [AS] from the descendent of imam "Husain" [AS] and through his mother, he's from the descendent of imam "Hassan" [AS] which is provable historically and has happened; because mother of imam "Baqir" [AS] is from the descendent of imam "Hassan Mujtaba" [AS].

His analogy is quite void; because it's true that Prophet Muhammad [PBUH] is the best Prophet of god; but no one has said that imam "Mahdi" [AS] who is the last successor is better than other Shia imams [AS] as well.

There isn't any reason to show that because most of Prophets are from the descendent of "Isaac" [AS], to make up this matter, god has placed the best Prophet from the descendent of "Ismael".

God doesn't select imam or Prophet due to such criteria; as god says in this regard:

"اللَّهُ أَعْلَمُ حَيْثُ يَجْعَلُ رِسَالَتَهُ"

But Allah knows best where to place His Message.

Surah Al-An'am – verse 124

Furthermore, Has "Mulla Ali Qari" accepted the imamate of rest of Shia imams who are from the descendent of imam "Husain" [AS] that he's made such analogy and said: to make up this matter, it's appropriate that god places the last imam from the descendent of imam "Hassan" [AS]?

Narratives about the parentage of hadrat "Mahdi" [AS] said by "Ahl al-Bayt"

On the other hand, there are authentic narratives from "Ahl al-Bayt" [AS] that imam "Mahdi" [AS] is from the descendent of imam "Husain" [AS] and since messenger of Allah [PBUH] has placed his "Ahl al-Bayt" [AS] next to Quran and has made obeying them compulsory to everyone, Shias practice their sayings and have gotten their belief from this pure source.

There are so many narratives in this regard that we just mention to one of them:

"حَدَّثَنَا أَبِي رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا سَعْدُ بْنُ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ أَبِي خَلْفٍ قَالَ حَدَّثَنِي
يَعْقُوبُ بْنُ يَزِيدَ عَنْ حَمَادِ بْنِ عَيْسَى عَنْ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ مُسْكَانَ عَنْ أَبَانَ بْنِ تَغْلِبَ عَنْ
سُلَيْمِ بْنِ قَيْسِ الْهَلَالِيِّ عَنْ سَلْمَانَ الْفَارِسِيِّ رَحِمَهُ اللَّهُ قَالَ دَخَلْتُ عَلَي النَّبِيِّ صَلَّى
اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَإِذَا الْحُسَيْنُ عَلَي فَخَذِيهِ وَهُوَ يُغَيِّلُ عَيْنَيْهِ وَيَلْتِمُ فَاهُ وَهُوَ يَقُولُ أَنْتَ سَيِّدُ
ابْنِ سَيِّدٍ أَنْتَ إِمَامٌ ابْنُ إِمَامٍ أَبُو الْأَيْمَةِ أَنْتَ حُجَّةٌ ابْنُ حُجَّةٍ أَبُو حُجَّةٍ تِسْعَةَ مِنْ صُلْبِكَ
تَأْسِعُهُمْ قَائِمُهُمْ"

“Salman Farsi” says: I went to messenger of Allah [AS] while imam “Husain” [AS] was there, messenger of Allah [PBUH] kissed his face and said: you’re master the son of master, you’re leader the son of leader and father of leaders, you’re proof, the son of proof and father of nine proofs who are from you descendent that ninth one is “Qa’im” {one of the titles of imam Mahdi}.

“Al-Saduq” – Al-Khisal – vol. 38, p 475

Conclusion:

The belief of Sunnis that hadrat “Mahdi” [AS] is from the descendent of imam “Hassan” [AS] has no authentic reason and is in contradictory with other narratives and the base of their belief is an unreliable narrative.

Good luck.