

Is that true that "Uthman" got married with two daughters of Prophet Muhammad [PBUH]?

Response:

One of virtues quoted for "Uthman ibn Afan" is that he got married with two daughters of Prophet Muhammad [PBUH] named "Ruqayyah" and "Umm Kulthum". There are different ideas in this regard, Sunnis persist on it decisively; but some Shia researchers believe that neither of Uthman's wives were Prophet's daughter but they were Prophet's Rabiyyah {Wife's daughter from ex-husband} and daughters of Hadrat Khadijah's sisters and they've said reasons for this possibility that we quote these reasons and leave judgment to dear readers.

There wasn't intimate relationship between Prophet Muhammad and his other daughters:

After referring to Prophet Muhammad's Sira and focusing on it, we'll realize that many narratives show Prophet's very intimate relationship with his daughter hadrat Fatimah [A.S] for instance; when Islamic Prophet wanted to take a trip to another place, hadrat "Fatimah" [A.S] was the last person who'd bid farewell and after returning from trip, he'd go visiting "Fatimah" [AS] before doing any work. Numerous narratives in Shia and Sunni books prove this very intimate relationship; and many Shia and Sunni scholars have quoted that one of her titles is "Umm Abiha". "Ibn Hajar Asqalani" and "Dhahabi" write:

فاطمة الزهراء ... كانت تكني أم أبيها .

"Ibn Hajar Asqalani" - Al-Isabah – vol. 8, p 262 /// Al-Dhahabi – Siyar al-A'lam al-Nubala- vol. 2, p 118 – 119 /// "Al-Mizi" – Tahzib al-Kamal – vol. 35, p 247 /// "Ibn Athir" , Asad al-Ghabbah – vol. 5, p 520 // "Ibn 'Abd al-Barr" – al-Isti'ab – vol. 4, p 1899

We don't have even one invalid narrative in both Shia and Sunni books in which messenger of Allah [PBUH] has knocked on Ruqayyah and Umm Kulthum's door even once. Why didn't messenger of Allah have such close relationship with his other daughters neither in "Medina" nor even in "Mecca"? Weren't they – according to Sunni - daughters of "Khadijah"?

Though, Hadrat "Fatimah" [A.S] has been perfect in every way and different than all women of the world; but if Prophet had a daughter other than "Fatimah", such intimate relationship would exist between them.

Or when "Quraysh" unbelievers would annoy Prophet Muhammad, where were other daughters of messenger of Allah to support their father? "Bukhari" and "Muslim ibn Hajjaj" have written in their books:

عَنْ ابْنِ مَسْعُودٍ قَالَ بَيْنَمَا رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ يُصَلِّي عِنْدَ الْبَيْتِ وَأَبُو جَهْلٍ وَأَصْحَابٌ لَهُ جُلُوسٌ وَقَدْ نُجِرَتْ جَزُورٌ بِالْأَمْسِ فَقَالَ أَبُو جَهْلٍ أَيُّكُمْ يَقُومُ إِلَيَّ سَلَا جَزُورِ بَنِي فُلَانٍ فَيَأْخُذُهُ فَيَضَعُهُ فِي كَتِفِي مُحَمَّدٍ إِذَا سَجَدَ فَأَنْبَعَتْ أَشَقِي الْقَوْمِ فَأَخَذَهُ فَلَمَّا سَجَدَ النَّبِيُّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ وَضَعَهُ بَيْنَ كَتِفَيْهِ قَالَ فَاسْتَضْحَكُوا وَحَعَلَ بَعْضُهُمْ يَمِيلُ عَلَيَّ بَعْضٌ وَأَنَا قَائِمٌ أَنْظُرُ لَوْ كَانَتْ لِي مَنَعَةٌ طَرَحْتُهُ عَنْ ظَهْرِ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ وَالنَّبِيُّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ سَاجِدٌ مَا يَرْفَعُ رَأْسَهُ حَتَّى انْطَلَقَ إِنْسَانٌ فَأَخْبَرَ فَاطِمَةَ فَجَاءَتْ وَهِيَ جُوبِرِيَةٌ فَطَرَحْتُهُ عَنْهُ ثُمَّ أَقْبَلَتْ عَلَيْهِمْ تَشْتِمُهُمْ.

"Ibn Masud" has been quoted: when messenger of Allah [PBUH] was praying before "Kaaba", "Abu Jahl" and his followers were sitting near the house and one day before that they'd sacrificed a camel, "Abu Jahl" said to his companions: which one of you accept to go and bring rumen of that camel to put it on Muhammad's [PBUH] shoulder when his performing "Sajdah"? Their worst one accepted and fulfilled Abu Jahl's order, when Prophet Muhammad [PBUH] was performing "Sajdah", he put that dirty rumen on Prophet's shoulder. "Abu Jahl" and his companions laughed a lot after seeing this scene.

"Ibn Masud" says: I was seeing this event but I didn't dare to remove rumen from Prophet's shoulder. Messenger of Allah was still prostrating to god and wouldn't raise his head until a man went to Hadrat "Fatimah" [A.S] and notified her, after hearing about it, Hadrat "Fatimah" got so angry, went to the mosque and removed it from Prophet's shoulder and reproached them.

In all problems that messenger of Allah [PBUH] would face, hadrat "Fatimah" [A.S] was the only one who would sympathize with him and cure his wounds. If they were Prophet

Muhammad's [PBUH] daughter as well, they'd have better supported "Fatimah" [A.S] defending their father.

Where were "Ruqayyah" and "Umm Kulthum" to take care of father's wound like hadrat "Fatimah" when messenger of Allah [PBUH] was injured in the battle of "Uhud"?

If – according to Sunni - "Ruqayyah" and "Umm Kulthum" were Prophet Muhammad's [PBUH] daughter, so why no relationship has been quoted between Islamic Prophet and them?

2: in the story of "Mubahila" in which Prophet Muhammad [PBUH] invited all his first-degree relatives, why didn't he take his other daughters and amongst his "Womenfolk" he just selected "Fatimah" [A.S]?

"Muslim ibn Hajjaj" writes:

عَنْ عَامِرِ بْنِ سَعْدِ بْنِ أَبِي وَقَّاصٍ عَنْ أَبِيهِ قَالَ أَمَرَ مُعَاوِيَةَ بْنَ أَبِي سُفْيَانَ سَعْدًا فَقَالَ مَا مَنَعَكَ أَنْ تَسُبَّ أَبَا الثَّرَابِ فَقَالَ أَمَا مَا ذَكَرْتُ نَلَأًا قَالَتْ لَهٗ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ فَلَنْ أَسُبَّهُ لَأَنْ تَكُونَ لِي وَاحِدَةً مِنْهُنَّ أَحَبُّ إِلَيَّ مِنْ حُمْرِ النَّعَمِ ... وَلَمَّا نَزَلَتْ هَذِهِ الْآيَةُ { فَقُلْ تَعَالَوْا نَدْعُ أَبْنَاءَنَا وَأَبْنَاءَكُمْ } دَعَا رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ عَلِيًّا وَقَاطِمَةَ وَحَسَنًا وَحُسَيْنًا فَقَالَ اللَّهُمَّ هَؤُلَاءِ أَهْلِي "

"Amer ibn Sa'd ibn abi Waqqas" has quoted from his father {Sa'd ibn abi Waqqas} that "Umar" called upon him and said: why don't you swear at "Abu Turab" {Ali ibn abi Talib}? "Sa'd" said: I have three of his virtues in my mind that messenger of Allah [PBUH] has said about him, I never swear at him. If I had one of these virtues, it'd be better to me than red-haired camels... when this verse was sent down:

{ ... فَقُلْ تَعَالَوْا نَدْعُ أَبْنَاءَنَا وَأَبْنَاءَكُمْ وَنِسَاءَنَا وَنِسَاءَكُمْ وَأَنْفُسَنَا وَأَنْفُسَكُمْ ... }

Those who dispute with you concerning him after the knowledge has come to you, say: 'Come, let us gather our sons and your sons, our womenfolk and your womenfolk, ourselves and yourselves. Then let us humbly pray, so lay the curse of Allah upon the ones who lie.

Sura Al-E-Imran – verse 61

Messenger of Allah [PBUH] called upon – Ali ibn abi Talib- Fatimah- Hassan and Husayn [A.S] and said: "God, these are my "Ahl al-Bayt" {people of the house}.

Didn't "our womenfolk" include other daughters of Prophet, or Prophet didn't have any daughter except hadrat "Fatimah"?

3: why didn't anyone propose to other daughters of Prophet Muhammad [PBUH]?

Another thing that voids this matter is that it's written in no place of history that any of "Muhajirin" or "Ansar" proposed to "Umm Kulthum", while they'd outpace each other proposing to hadrat "Fatimah" [A.S] becoming Prophet's son-in-law. Wasn't "Umm Kulthum" daughter of Prophet or such daughter didn't exist at all?

To find fault with commander of the faithful [A.S] Sunni Scholars and hadith narrators have quoted that when hadrat "Ali" [A.S] was married to hadrat "Fatimah" [A.S], he proposed to daughter of "Abu Jahl", it caused hadrat "Fatimah" [A.S] to get angry and complained of him to Prophet Muhammad!!! After hearing this incident, Messenger of Allah [PBUH] went to mosque angrily and said:

«وَإِنَّ فَاطِمَةَ بَضْعَةٌ مِنِّي وَإِنِّي أَكْرَهُ أَنْ يَسُوءَهَا وَاللَّهِ لَا تَجْتَمِعُ بِنْتُ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ وَبِنْتُ عَدُوِّ اللَّهِ عِنْدَ رَجُلٍ وَاحِدٍ»

"Fatimah" is part of me and I don't like someone to upset her, swear to god, the daughter of messenger of Allah [PBUH] and daughter of the enemy of god shouldn't be married to one person. {simultaneously}

"Sahih Bukhari" – vol. 4, p 212 – 213

And it's written in another narrative that Prophet Muhammad said:

«إِلَّا أَنْ يُرِيدَ ابْنُ أَبِي طَالِبٍ أَنْ يُطَلِّقَ ابْنَتِي وَيَنْكِحَ ابْنَتَهُمْ فَإِنَّمَا هِيَ بَضْعَةٌ مِنِّي يُرِيدُنِي مَا أَرَابَهَا وَيُؤْذِينِي مَا آذَاهَا»

If "Ali ibn abi talib" [A.S] wants to marry daughter of "Abu Jahl", he should divorce my daughter. Fatimah is part of me, what makes her upset, makes me sad as well.

“Sahih Buhari” – vol. 6 , p 158 /// “Sahih Muslim” – vol. 7 , p 141

Since this matter is about ascribing fault to hadrat “Ali ibn abi talib” [A.S], Sunni scholars have quoted it eagerly, as if they don’t know that “Uthman ibn Afan” got married with daughters of enemies of god while he was married to daughter of messenger of Allah [PBUH] not even once but several times:

“Ramlah bint Shaybah” was one Uthman’s wives who married him in “Mecca” and was amongst those who emigrated to “Medina” with “Uthman”. “Ibn abd al-Barr” writes in this regard:

“رملة بنت شيبه بن ربيعة كانت من المهاجرات هاجرت مع زوجها عثمان بن عفان”

“Ramlah”, daughter of “Shaybah” was one of those who emigrated to “Medina” with his spouse.

Al-Isti’ab – vol. 4, p 1846

And “Shaybah” was one of the enemies of messenger of Allah [PBUH] who was perished in the battle of “Badr”, as “Ibn Hajar” writes:

“رملة بنت شيبه بن ربيعة بن عبد شمس العيشمية قتل أبوها يوم بدر كافرا”

“Ramlah” daughter of “Shaybah” Her father was killed in the battle of “Badr”, while he was unbeliever.

Al-Isabah – vol. 8, p 142 and 143

It’s written that in that time “Ruqayyah” daughter of messenger of Allah [PBUH] was married to “Uthman” as well. “Ibn Athir” writes in “Usud al-Ghabah”:

“ولما أسلم عثمان زوجته رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم بابنته رقية وهاجرا كلاهما إلي أرض الحبشة الهجرتين ثم عاد إلي مكة وهاجر إلي المدينة”

When "Uthman" converted to Islam, messenger of Allah married his daughter off to him, both of them emigrated to "Habasha", then when they returned from there, they emigrated to "Medina".

Moreover, "Uthman" got married with "Umm al-Banin bint Ayinah" and "Fatimah bint Walid ibn Abd Shams"; while their fathers were the enemies of god in that time.

If marrying daughter of messenger of Allah and daughter of the enemy of god was "Haram", why did "Uthman" do this haram act over and over? And if it wasn't "Haram", why didn't messenger of Allah [PBUH] – according to Sunnis- didn't let commander of the faithful [A.S] to do so? So, we realize that either the matter of proposing daughter of "Abu Jahl" is amongst created things by "Banu Umayyah" to undermine the position of commander of the faithful [A.S] or Islamic Prophet hasn't had any daughter except hadrat "Fatimah".

4: one of things that shows that this matter was crated is that many Sunni scholars such as "Ziya' al-Muqaddasi" have said:

عن قتادة ، قال : ولدت خديجة لرسول الله (صلي الله عليه وآله وسلم) : عبد مناف في الجاهلية ، وولدت له في الاسلام غلامين ، وأربع بنات : القاسم ، وبه كان يكنى : أبا القاسم ، فعاش حتي مشي ، ثم مات ، و عبد الله ، مات صغيرا . وأم كلثوم . وزينب . ورقية . وفاطمة ...

"Qitadah" has said: in the time of ignorance, "Khadijah" wife to Prophet Muhammad [PBUH] gave birth to "Abd Manaf" and after Islam, she gave birth to two sons and four daughters named: "Ghasim" – because of him, the nickname "Abu al-Ghasim" was selected for prophet- he could have walked and then he passed away- and "Abdullah" who died when he was minor and "Umm Kulthum" , "Ruqayyah", "Fatimah" and "Zaynab".

"Al-Bad' wa al-Tarikh" – vol. 5, p 16 and vol. 4, p 139

After quoting this saying of "Maghdasi", "Shahab al-Din Qastallani" writes:

"وقيل : ولد له ولد قبل المبعث ، يقال له : عبد مناف ، فيكونون علي هذا اثني عشر ، وكلهم سوي هذا ولد في الاسلام بعد المبعث"

It's been said that before prophetic mission "Khadija" gave birth to one baby for Prophet Muhammad and he was named "Abd al-Manaf", other than him, rest of Prophet's children were born after prophetic mission

"Al-Mawahib al-ladunniyyah" – vol. 1, p 196

On the other hand, it's been written that "Ruqayyah", was the youngest daughter of messenger of god and was even younger than hadrat "Fatimah" [A.S], "Ibn Kathir Damascene" writes:

"أكبر ولده عليه الصلاة والسلام القاسم ، ثم زينب ، ثم عبد الله ، ثم أم كلثوم ثم فاطمة ثم رقية ..."

The eldest child of messenger of Allah [PBUH] was "Ghasim" and then "Zaynab", "Abdullah", "Umm Kulthum", "Fatimah" and then "Ruqayyah".

So, how can we accept this saying of Sunni that "Ruqayyah" got married with "Uthman", then both of them emigrated to "Habasha" and even one of her child was aborted on the ship!!! While we know that the first migration to "Habasha" occurred in the fifth year after Prophetic mission.

And also many of Sunni have written that before marrying "Uthman", "Umm Kulthum" and "Ruqayyah" were engaged to sons of "Abu Lahab" and then Surah "al- Masad" was sent down about "Abu Lahab", he ordered his sons to divorce daughters of messenger of Allah [PBUH]. "Ibn Athir" writes in "Usud al-Ghabah" book:

قد زوج ابنته رقية من عتبة بن أبي لهب وزوج أختها أم كلثوم عتيبة بن أبي لهب فلما نزلت سورة تبت قال لهما أبوهما أبو لهب وأمهما أم جميل بنت حرب بن أمية حمالة الحطب فارقا ابنتي محمد ففارقاهما ...

Messenger of Allah married his daughter "Ruqayyah" off to "Atabah" son of "Abi Lahab" and "Umm Kulthum" off to "Utaybah another son of "Abu Lahab" when Surah "al-Masad" was sent down, "Abu Lahab" and his wife said to their sons divorcing daughters of messenger of Allah and they did so...

قد زوج ابنته رقية من عتبة بن أبي لهب وزوج أختها أم كلثوم عتيبة بن أبي لهب فلما نزلت سورة تبت قال لهما أبووهما أبو لهب وأمهما أم جميل بنت حرب بن أمية حمالة الحطب فارقا ابنتي محمد ففارقاهما ...

While we know that Sura "Al-Masad" was sent down when Muslims had been surrounded in "She'eb abi Talib", "Suyuti" writes in "Al-Durr al-Manthur":

وأخرج أبو نعيم في الدلائل عن ابن عباس قال ما كان أبو لهب الا من كفار قريش ما هو حتي خرج من الشعب حين تمالات قريش حتي حصرونا في الشعب وظاهرهم فلما خرج أبو لهب من الشعب لقي هنداً بنت عتبة ابن ربيعة حين فارق قومه فقال يا ابنت عتبة هل نصرت اللات والعزي قالت نعم فجزاك الله خيراً يا أبا عتبة قال إن محمداً يعدنا أشياء لا نراها كائنة يزعم أنها كائنة بعد الموت فما ذاك وصنع في يدي ثم نفخ في يديه ثم قال تبا لكما ما أري فيكما شيئا مما يقول محمد فنزلت تبت يدا أبي لهب قال ابن عباس فحصرنا في الشعب ثلاث سنين وقطعوا عنا الميرة حتي أن الرجل .

"Al-Suyuti" – Durr al-Manthur – vol. 6, p 408

The blockade of "She'eb abi Talib" occurred in the sixth year of prophetic mission and after emigration to "Habasha".

Nevertheless, how can we confirm that daughter of Prophet Muhammad was Uthman's wife?

5: "Muhammad Isma'il Bukhari" writes: someone came to "Abdullah ibn Umar" and asked him questions including his opinion about "Uthman" and Imam "Ali" [A.S], he says about comparing hadrat "Ali" [A.S] and "Uthman":

أَمَّا عُثْمَانُ فَكَانَ اللَّهُ عَفَا عَنْهُ وَأَمَّا أَنْتُمْ فَكَرِهْتُمْ أَنْ تَعْفُوا عَنْهُ وَأَمَّا عَلِيٌّ فَأَبْنُ عَمِّ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ وَخَتَنُهُ ...

But "Uthman", almighty god forgave his sin {fleeing from the battle of Uhud}; but you don't like to forgive him, but Imam "Ali ibn abi Talib" [A.S] is messenger of Allah's cousin and son-in-law.

Sahih Bukhari – vol. 5, p 157

As you see Abdullah ibn Umar's support from "Uthman" is just summarized in this sentence that god has forgiven his sin in the battle of "Uhud"; but Shaba who arose against him didn't forgive him and killed him; but he doesn't mention that "Uthman" is Prophet Muhammad's son-in-law, he says that hadrat "Ali" [A.S] is messenger of Allah's cousin and son-in-law.

If "Uthman" was Prophet's son-in-law, "Ibn Umar" must have relied on it; because he's left no stone unturned to fend any accusation from "Uthman" and it's meaningless that he relies on weak reason when there is stronger reason like being Prophet's son-in-law; because god's forgiveness only contains those who stopped fleeing and returned after they found out that Prophet is alive, not "Uthman" who returned after three days, and even if god's forgiveness includes "Uthman", it won't cause that god forgives sins that he committed later on as well, but it just contains his fleeing from the battlefield.

So, if "Uthman" were really Prophet's son-in-law, "Ibn Umar" must have relied on it.

6: Hadrat "Fatimah" [A.S] went to mosque after "Fadak" garden was usurped by "Abu-Bakr" and delivered great sermon that some of Sunni scholars have quoted it. In some parts of that sermon, hadrat "Fatimah" [A.S] says:

أنا فاطمة بنت محمد أقول عودة علي بدء ، وما أقول ذلك سرفا ولا شططا... فإن تعزوه تجدوه أبي دون نسائكم وأخا ابن عمي دون رجالكم ، فبلغ الرسالة صادعا بالرسالة ناكبا عن سنن مدرجة المشركين ، ضاربا لئجهم آخذا بأكظامهم ، داعيا إلي سبيل ربه بالحكمة والموعظة الحسنة"

O people! Be aware that I'm "Fatimah" and my father is "Muhammad", my saying is out of honesty and away from error... if you search, you'll realize that {Islamic Prophet} was my father not the father of your wives, and was in brotherhood treaty with my cousin not you.

If Uthman's wives were Prophet's daughters, why didn't "Fatimah" [A.S] mention it? On the other hand "Uthman" could have protested to this saying of hadrat "Fatimah" [A.S] that my wives were Prophet Muhammad's daughters as well

7: "Ibn al-Damashqi" and "Muhib al-Din Tabari" write:

“أن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم قال لعلي : أوتيت ثلاثا لم يؤتهن أحد ولا أنا ، أوتيت
صهرا مثلي ولم أوت أنا مثلي ، وأوتيت زوجة صديقة مثل بنتي ولم أوت مثلها زوجة ، وأوتيت
الحسن والحسين من صلبك ولم أوت من صلبي مثلهما ، ولكنكم مني وأنا منكم”

Messenger of Allah said to “Ali” [A.S]: O “Ali”! Almighty god has given you three privileges that
he’s neither given them to me nor any other person:

1: a father-in-law like me 2: honest wife.3: “Hassan” and “Husayn” [A.S].

In this narrative Prophet Muhammad says explicitly that god hasn’t given anyone a father-in-
law like me except “Ali ibn abi Talib”. So, it’s clarified that Prophet Muhammad [PBUH] didn’t
have another daughter otherwise he wouldn’t say such sentence.

Good luck.