

## Why did Hadrat “Fatimah” [AS] go to open the door despite the presence of Ali [AS]?

Description:

How can we believe that Hadrat “Fatimah” [AS] went to open the door despite of Hadrat “Ali” [AS] was at home! Why did Hadrat “Ali” [AS] not go to open the door?

### Reviewing:

Firstly: what can we understand from some narratives is that Hadrat “Fatimah” [AS] was sitting near front door and closed the door after seeing “Umar” and his companions.

Late “Ayyashi” and Shaikh “Mufid” and .... Have written in their books:

قال: قال عمر قوموا بنا إليه فقام أبو بكر وعمر وعثمان وخالد بن الوليد و المغيرة بن شعبة وأبو عبيدة بن الجراح وسالم مولي أبي حذيفة وقتفد وقمت معهم فلما انتهينا إلي الباب فرأتهم فاطمة صلوات الله عليها أغلقت الباب في وجوههم وهي لا تشك أن لا يدخل عليها إلا باذنها، فضرب عمر الباب برجله فكسره، وكان من سعف، ثم دخلوا فأخرجوا عليا ( عليه السلام ) ملبيا....

“Umar” said: let’s go to him {Ali}, then “Abu-Bakr”, “Umar”, “Uthman”, “Khalid bin al-Walid”, “Mughirahibn Shu’ba”, “Abu Ubaidahibn al-Jarah, “Salim Mawla Abu Hudayfa” and “Ghunfuz” and i moved along with him, when we got close to the house, Fatimah [AS] saw them and closed the door and had no doubt that they won’t enter without permission, “Umar” broke the door kicking then they entered, dragged “Ali” out of home while tying their own bak.

Al-Smarghandi Known as “Ayyashi”- tafsir al-Ayyashi- v2, p 67/// “al-Shaikh Mufid”- al-Ekhtesas, p 168/// “al-Majlisi”- Bihar al-Anvar v28,p 227

And “Salim bin Qeis” says:

“ثُمَّ أَقْبَلَ حَتَّى انْتَهَى إِلَى بَابِ عَلِيٍّ وَفَاطِمَةَ عَلَيْهِمَا السَّلَامَ فَاعِدَّةً خَلْفَ الْبَابِ قَدْ عَصَبَتْ رَأْسَهَا وَنَحَلَ جِسْمَهَا فِي وَقَاةِ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ فَأَقْبَلَ عُمَرُ حَتَّى ضَرَبَ الْبَابَ ثُمَّ نَادَى يَا ابْنَ أَبِي طَالِبٍ [افْتَحِ الْبَابَ] فَقَالَتْ فَاطِمَةُ يَا عُمَرُ مَا لَنَا وَلَكَ لَا تَدْعُنَا وَمَا نَحْنُ فِيهِ قَالَ افْتَحِي الْبَابَ وَإِلَّا أَحْرَقْنَاكَ عَلَيْكُمْ فَقَالَتْ يَا عُمَرُ أَمَا تَتَّقِي اللَّهَ عَزَّ وَجَلَّ تَدْخُلُ عَلَيَّ بَيْتِي وَتَهْجُمُ عَلَيَّ دَارِي فَأَبِي أَنْ يَنْصَرِفَ ثُمَّ دَعَا عُمَرُ بِالنَّارِ فَأَضْرَمَهَا فِي الْبَابِ فَأَحْرَقَ الْبَابَ”

When “Umar” arrived home, “Fatimah” [AS] was behind the door ----- “Umar” knocked the door and said: O the son of “Abu-Talib”! open the door, “Fatimah” [AS] said: O “Umar! what do you want from us? Leave us alone, we’re grieving. “Umar” said: open the door or else I’ll

burn it. “Fatimah” [AS] said: don’t you fear god entering our house {by force}, “Umar” didn’t return but burned the door.

“Salim bin Qeis”, the book of “Salim bin Qeis”- p 864

Secondly: Hadrat “Fatimah” [AS] was sure that they don’t enter home by force, because it’s written in “Quran” that don’t enter someone’s house without permission:

‘يَا أَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ ءَامَنُوا لَا تَدْخُلُوا بُيُوتًا غَيْرَ بِيُوتِكُمْ حَتَّى تَسْتَأْذِنُوا وَتُسَلِّمُوا عَلَي أَهْلِهَا ذَٰلِكُمْ خَيْرٌ لَّكُمْ لَعَلَّكُمْ تَذَكَّرُونَ.  
فَإِن لَّمْ تَجِدُوا فِيهَا أَحَدًا فَلَا تَدْخُلُوهَا حَتَّى يُؤْذَنَ لَكُمْ وَإِن قِيلَ لَكُمْ ارْجِعُوا فَارْجِعُوا هُوَ أَزْكَى لَكُمْ وَاللَّهُ بِمَا تَعْمَلُونَ عَلِيمٌ’

Believers, do not enter houses other than your houses until you first ask permission and greet with peace the people thereof; that is better for you in order that you remember {27} And if you do not find anyone there, do not enter it until permission is given to you. And if you are told 'Return', so return, that is purer for you; and Allah knows the things you do {28}.

Sura AL-NOOR, verses 27-28

The house of “Fatimah” [AS], superior than prophets’ [PBUTH] house:

On the other hand, prophets’ [PBUTH] house has especial esteem and no one can enter without permission:

‘يَا أَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ ءَامَنُوا لَا تَدْخُلُوا بُيُوتَ النَّبِيِّ إِلَّا أَن يُؤْذَنَ لَكُمْ’

Believers, do not enter the houses of the Prophet for a meal without waiting for the proper time, unless you are given permission.

Sura AL-AHZAB- verse 53

And there is no doubt that “Fatima” [AS]’s house is prophet [PBUH]’s house.

‘فِي بُيُوتِ أَذْنِ اللَّهِ أَن تُرْفَعَ وَيُذْكَرَ فِيهَا اسْمُهُ وَيُسَبِّحُ لَهُ وَفِيهَا بِالْغُدُوِّ وَالْآصَالِ’

In houses which Allah has allowed to be raised up, and His Name to be remembered therein. In the morning and evening (36)

Sura AL-NOOR, verse 36

“Suyuti” and others have quoted from “Abu-Bakr” who quoted from prophet [PBUH] that the house of “Ali” [AS] and “Fatimah” [AS] is amongst most excellent houses:

“وأخرج ابن مردويه عن أنس بن مالك وبريدة قال: قرأ رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم هذه الآية ( في بيوت أذن الله أن ترفع ) فقام إليه رجل فقال: أي بيوت هذه يا رسول الله قال: بيوت الأنبياء. فقام إليه أبو بكر فقال: يا رسول الله هذا البيت منها - البيت علي وفاطمة - قال: نعم من أفاضلها”

Prophet [PBUH] recited this verse {above verse} someone asked: which home is that? He said: prophets' [PBUTH] house. “Abu-Bakr” said: is the house of “Ali” and “Fatimah” [AS] amongst these houses? Prophet [PBUH] said: yes, it's amongst the excellent ones.

Al-Suyuti- al-Durr al-Manthur- v 6, p 203// “al-Tha'labi”- al-Kashf and al-Bayan// “al-Tha'alebi”- al-Javahir al-Lesan- v 7- p107/// “al-'Alusi”- Rooh al-Ma'ani- v18, p 174.

Moreover, according to Fatima [AS]'s state and prophet [PBUH]'s esteem, it was expected that they feel ashamed after seeing Hadrat “Fatimah” [AS] as some returned after hearing her sound.

“قام عمر فمشي ومعه جماعة حتي أتوا باب فاطمة فدقوا الباب، فلما سمعت أصواتهم نادى بأعلي صوتها باكياً: يا رسول الله ما ذا لقينا بعد أبي من ابن الخطاب وابن أبي قحافة! فلما سمع القوم صوتها وبكاءها انصرفوا باكين، فكادت قلوبهم تتصدع وأكبادهم تنفطر، وبقي عمر معه قوم”

“Umar” and some other guys came toward “Fatimah” [AS]'s house and knocked the door, after hearing the din of crowd, “Fatimah” [AS] shouted loudly while crying: O messenger of Allah! What adversities we're facing after your demise because of “Umar”. After hearing Fatimah [AS]'s crying, a group of them felt ashamed and left while shedding tear, but “Umar” and others stayed there.

Al-Dinvari- Imamate and policy- v1, p 16

So, Hadrat “Fatimah” [AS] closed the door after seeing “Umar” and his companions and stood near the door and she didn't think that they forced their way in and it was the shamelessness of invaders who didn't keep the esteem of house and people of the house.

Prophet [PBUH]'s wives and opening door for strangers:

Taking look at the manner of prophet [PBUH] in the topic of conversation is the best reason for condemning doubt makers because there are different cases in Sunni and Shia books that show this fact that prophet [PBUH] would let his wives to open the doors on strangers:

1: “Umm Salamah” and opening the door on “Ali” [AS]:

“عن علقمة عن عبد الله قال خرج رسول الله ( صلي الله عليه وسلم ) من بيت زينب بنت جحش وأتي بيت أم سلمة فكان يومها من رسول الله ( صلي الله عليه وسلم ) فلم يلبث أن جاء علي فدق الباب دقا خفيفا فانتبه النبي ( صلي الله عليه وسلم ) للدق وأنكرته أم سلمة فقال رسول الله ( صلي الله عليه وسلم ) قومي فأفتحي له”

Prophet [PBUH] came out the house of “Zeinab” the daughter of “Jahesh” and went to the house of “Umm Salamah” because it was her turn to welcome prophet [PBUH], after a while “Ali” [AS] knocked the door, prophet [PBUH] woke up, “Umm Salamah” didn’t answer the door, prophet [PBUH] said: get up and open the door...

“Ibn Asakir al-Damascene”- the history of Damascus- v 42, p 470

2: “Ayesha” opens the on “Ali” [AS] obeying prophet [PBUH]’s order:

وعن جعفر بن محمد الصادق عليه السلام عن أبيه عن آبائه عن علي عليه السلام قال: كنت أنا ورسول الله صلي الله عليه وآله في المسجد بعد أن صلي الفجر، ثم نهض ونهضت معه، وكان رسول الله صلي الله عليه وآله إذا أراد أن يتجه إلي موضع أعلمني بذلك، وكان إذا أبطأ في ذلك الموضع صرت إليه لأعرف خبره، لأنه لا يتصابر قلبي علي فراقه ساعة واحدة فقال لي: أنا متجه إلي بيت عائشة، فمضي صلي الله عليه وآله ومضيت إلي بيت فاطمة الزهراء عليها السلام فلم أزل مع الحسن والحسين فأنا وهي مسروران بهما، ثم إنني نهضت وسرت إلي باب عائشة، فطرقت الباب فقالت: من هذا؟ فقلت لها: أنا علي فقالت: إن النبي راقد، فأنصرفت، ثم قلت: النبي راقد وعائشة في الدار، فرجعت وطرقت الباب فقالت لي عائشة: من هذا؟ فقلت لها: أنا علي فقالت: إن النبي صلي الله عليه وآله علي حاجة فأنثيت مستحييا من دق الباب، ووجدت في صدري ما لا أستطيع عليه صبيرا، فرجعت مسرعا فدققت الباب دقا عنيقا، فقالت لي عائشة: من هذا؟ فقلت: أنا علي فسمعت رسول الله صلي الله عليه وآله يقول: يا عائشة افتحي له الباب، ففتحت ودخلت....

I said morning prayer with prophet [PBUH] and left mosque with him, if he wanted to go somewhere he’d tell me and when he’d come back home late I’d go to him to find him because I couldn’t endure being apart from him. Prophet [PBUH] said: I’m going to “Ayesha” house and I went to “Fatimah” [AS] and were happy along being with “Hassan” and “Hussein”, then I went towards Ayesha’s house and knocked the door, she said: who is this? I said: it’s me “Ali”, she said: prophet [PBUH] is resting, I returned and went back again and knocked the door, she said: who is this? I said: it’s me “Ali”, she said: prophet is busy, I was worried and knocked the door for the third time, “Ayesha” said: who is this? I said: it’s me “Ali”, I heard the sound of prophet [PBUH] saying to her: O “Ayesha”! open the door, she did so and I went in...

“Al-Tabarsi”- al-Ehtejaj, v1, p 292/// “al-Majlisi”- Bihar al-Anvar- v38, p 248

we mentioned to one narrative from Shia books and one narrative from Sunni books in which prophet [PBUH] let his wives to open the door on strangers despite his presence at home and it shows this act is not prohibited.

“Ayesha” and “Umar” sat at the same table {ate with each other}:

According to valid narrative written in many of Sunni books prophet [PBUH] let “Umar” to eat food with him and “Ayesha” and it’s been quoted that when they would eat food from the same dish, their hands ran into each other:

“عن مجاهد قال مر عمر برسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم وهو وعائشة وهما يأكلان حيسا فدعاه فوضع يده مع أيديهما فأصابت يده يد عائشة فقال أوه لو أطاع في هذه ووصاحبها ما رأتهن أعين”

Prophet [PBUH] and “Ayesha” were eating, “Umar” entered, prophet invited him eating with them, he began eating and stuck his hand in food dish and it touched Ayesha’s hand, “Umar” said: if he would follow me about his wives’ “Hijab”, no eye would see them.

“Ibn Abi Hatam Muhammad bin Edris”- Tafsir ibn abi Hatam- v 10, p 3148/// Bukhari Ju’fi’- al-Adab al-Mufrad- v 1, p 362// “Yusuf ibn Abd al-Rahman al-Mizzi”- Tahzib al-Kamal- v 29, p 138// Al-Quraishi Damascene, Tafsir of Quran- v 3, p 506// Fath al-Bari- v 8, p 531

After quoting this narrative, “Heithami” says:

“رواه الطبراني في الأوسط ورجاله رجال الصحيح غير موسى بن أبي كثير وهو ثقة”

“Tabarani” has quoted this narrative in the book “Osat”, all its narratives are the narratives of “Sahih Bukhari” other than “Ibn Kathir” who is reliable as well.

“Al-Heithami”- Majma’ al-Zavaed- v 7, p 93

And “Suyuti” says:

“وأخرج الطبراني بسند صحيح عن عائشة قالت كنت أكل مع النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم في قعب فمر عمر فدعاه فأكل فأصابت أصبعه أصبعي فقال أوه لو أطاع فيكن ما رأتهن عيون”

“Tabarani” has quoted from “Ayesha” who said: Me and prophet [PBUH] were eating from the same dish that “Umar” passed by, prophet invited him, while eating his finger touched my finger and “Umar” said: if he’d follow me about you, no eye would see you.

When it’s Okay for prophet [PBUH]’s spouse to eat food with stranger, answering the door wouldn’t be big deal for his daughter as well.

## **Conclusion:**

**Firstly:** Hadrat “Fatimah” [AS] didn’t go to open the door but she was at the front door, went in and closed the door after seeing “Umar” and his companions, so she didn’t answer the door at all.

**Secondly:** even if it’s true that “Fatimah” [AS] went to open the door we can’t find fault with this act of her because prophet [PBUH] would sometimes order his wives to open the door on strangers.

