

Isn't the martyrdom of Hadrat "Muhsen" [AS] in contradiction with what prophet [PBUH] said to Hadrat "Fatimah" [AS] that "you're the first one of my "Ahl al-Bayt" who will join me"?

According to successive narratives from Sunni and Shiite, "Fatimah" [AS] was the first member of "Ahl al-Bayt" who left the world after prophet [PBUH].

From another side based on Shia's claim, "Muhsen" is the brother of Imam Hassan and Imam "Hussein" [AS] and the son of Hadrat "Fatimah" [AS], it means he's from "Ahl al-Bayt" {people of the house}; but he died before his mother.

Did Prophet [PBUH]-refuge to god- lie or there wasn't "Muhsen" at all?

Reviewing :

It's definitive that Hadrat "Muhsen" [AS] was martyred, there are many narratives in Shia and Sunni books that prove this matter. And as you said this fact that Hadrat "Fatimah" [AS] is the first member of "Ahl al-Bayt" who joined prophet [PBUH] is certain either; but how can we remove the contradictory, the answer is that:

The word "Ahl al-Bayt" has been used in all narratives and prophet [PBUH] says: "you are the first member of my "Ahl al-Bayt" who will join me", and "Ahl al-Bayt" in prophet [PBUH]'s saying refers to those that god has cleaned them of any evil and dirtiness according to "Tathir" {cleanliness} verse. And in fact, by putting clock over Hadrat "Ali", "Fatimah" [AS], Imam Hassan [AS] and Imam Hussein [AS], prophet [PBUH] interpreted the word "Ahl al-Bayt" and limited it to these five persons.

This issue is provable by more than seventy narratives written in Sunni books. So the word "Ahl al-Bayt" only includes the companion of "Kasa" {cloak} who lived at the time of prophet [PBUH] and doesn't include others such as: Hadrat "Zeinab" [AS], Hadrat "Muhsen" [AS] and prophet [PBUH]'s wives or anyone else.

Thus, Hadrat "Fatimah" [AS] was the first member of prophet [PBUH]'s "Ahl al-Bayt" who got martyred by Umar bin Khattab's strike and joined his father.

The followings are some of narratives form Sunni and Shia books in which prophet [PBUH] gave such glad tiding to Hadrat "Fatimah:"

Late Sheikh "Tusi" says:

“فَجَاءَتِ الرَّوَايَةُ أَنَّهُ قِيلَ لِفَاطِمَةَ (عَلَيْهَا السَّلَامُ) مَا الَّذِي أَسْرَّ إِلَيْكَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ (صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ) فَسُرِّي عَنْكَ مَا كُنْتَ عَلَيْهِ مِنَ الْحُزَنِ وَالْقَلْقِ بِوَفَاتِهِ قَالَتْ إِنَّهُ خَبَّرَنِي أَنَّي أَوَّلُ أَهْلِ بَيْتِهِ لُحُوقًا بِهِ وَ أَنَّهُ لَنْ تَطُولَ الْمُدَّةُ بِي بَعْدَهُ حَتَّى أُدْرِكَهُ فَسُرِّي ذَلِكَ عَنِّي ”

Hadrat “Fatimah” [AS] was asked: what secret did Prophet [PBUH] tell you that sorrow of his demise left your heart and your concern was diminished? She answered: prophet [PBUH] told me:” you’ll be the first member of my “Ahl al-Bayt” who will join me and after me you won’t live long”. This news made me happy and removed my sorrow.

“Al-Sheikh al-Mufid”- Al-Ershad, v1, p 187// “al-Majlisi”- Bihar al-Anvar- v22- p 470

“Ibn Jari Shi’i” writes:

“عن أبي بصير، عن أبي عبد الله (عليه السلام)، قال: لما قبض رسول الله (صلى الله عليه وآله) ما ترك إلا الثقلين، كتاب الله وعترته أهل بيته، وكان قد أسر إلي فاطمة (صلوات الله عليها) أنها لاحقة به، وأنها أول أهل بيته لحوقا”

Imam “Sadiq” [AS] said: when prophet [PBUH] left the world, he left two precious things, God’s book {Quran} and his “Ahl al-Bayt” and said to Fatimah [AS]: you’ll join me and “Fatimah” [AS] was the first member of “Ahl al-Bayt” who joined prophet {PBUH}

“Al-Tabari”- reasons of Imamate- p131

This matter is in Sunni books as well:

“Muhmmad bin Ismael Bukhari” writes:

حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو نُعَيْمٍ حَدَّثَنَا زَكَرِيَاءُ عَنْ فِرَاسٍ عَنْ عَامِرِ الشَّعْبِيِّ عَنْ مَسْرُوقٍ عَنْ عَائِشَةَ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهَا قَالَتْ أَقْبَلْتُ فَاطِمَةَ تَمْشِي كَأَنَّ مَشْيَهَا مَشْيُ النَّبِيِّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ فَقَالَ النَّبِيُّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ مَرَحَبًا بِابْنَتِي ثُمَّ اجْلَسَهَا عَنْ يَمِينِهِ أَوْ عَنْ شِمَالِهِ ثُمَّ أَسْرَّ إِلَيْهَا حَدِيثًا فَبَكَتْ فَقُلْتُ لَهَا لِمَ تَبْكِينَ ثُمَّ أَسْرَّ إِلَيْهَا حَدِيثًا فَضَحِكْتُ فَقُلْتُ مَا رَأَيْتُ كَالْيَوْمِ فَرَحًا أَقْرَبَ مِنْ حُزْنٍ فَسَأَلْتُهَا عَمَّا قَالَ فَقَالَتْ مَا كُنْتُ لِأُفْشِي سِرَّ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ حَتَّى فُبِضَ النَّبِيُّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ فَسَأَلْتُهَا فَقَالَتْ أَسْرَّ إِلَيَّ إِنَّ جِبْرِيْلَ كَانَ يُعَارِضُنِي الْقُرْآنَ كُلَّ سَنَةٍ مَرَّةً وَإِنَّهُ عَارِضُنِي الْعَامَ مَرَّتَيْنِ وَلَا أَرَاهُ إِلَّا حَضَرَ أَجْلِي وَإِنَّكَ أَوَّلُ أَهْلِ بَيْتِي لِحَاقًا بِي فَبَكَيْتُ فَقَالَ أَمَا تَرْضَيْنِ أَنْ تَكُونِي سَيِّدَةَ نِسَاءِ أَهْلِ الْجَنَّةِ أَوْ نِسَاءِ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ فَضَحِكْتُ لِذَلِكَ.

“Ayesah” says: “Fatimah” who would walk like her father came to Prophet [PBUH], he said: welcome my daughter and sat her next to himself, then he talked slowly, “Fatimah” [AS] cried, I said: why are you crying? Then he talked to her slowly again, Fatimah got happy, I hadn’t seen happiness and sorrow so close to each other till that day, I asked “Fatimah”: what happened? She answered: I don’t reveal prophet [PBUH]’s secret. After prophet [PBUH]’s demise, I asked her again, she answered: my father said: “Gabriel” would offer “Quran” once a year but this year “Gabriel” has offered it twice, it seems like that I’m getting

close to death and you my daughter are the first person who will join me, so I cried, then prophet [PBUH] said: don't you like to be the leader of heavenly women or believer women?, that's why I laughed.

Al-Bukhari Ju'fi"- Sahih Bukhari- v3, p1326

And "Tabarani" writes in his book "Mu'jam al-Kabir:"

“عَنْ عَائِشَةَ قَالَتْ قُلْتُ لِغَاطِمَةَ بِنْتِ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ رَأَيْتُكَ أَكْبَبْتَ عَلِيَّ النَّبِيَّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ فِي مَرَضِهِ فَبَكَيتُ ثُمَّ أَكْبَبْتُ عَلَيْهِ تَابِيَةً فَضَحِكْتَ قَالَتْ أَكْبَبْتُ عَلَيْهِ فَأَخْبَرَنِي أَنَّهُ مَيِّتٌ فَبَكَيتُ ثُمَّ أَكْبَبْتُ عَلَيْهِ فَأَخْبَرَنِي أَنِّي أَوْلُ أَهْلِ بَيْتِهِ لِحُوقًا بِهِ وَأَنِّي سَيِّدَةُ نِسَاءِ أَهْلِ الْجَنَّةِ إِلَّا مَا كَانَ مِنْ مَرْيَمَ بِنْتِ عِمْرَانَ فَضَحِكْتُ”

“Al-Tabarani”- Al-Mu'jam al-Kabir, v22, p419

Conclusion:

There is no any contradiction between the martyrdom of Hadrat “Muhsen” [AS] and the narrative in which prophet [PBUH] gives Hadrat “Fatimah” [AS] glad tiding that you'll be the first of my “Ahl al-Bayt” who will join me; because “Ahl al-Bayt” in here includes five persons that Hadrat “Muhsen” [AS] is not amongst them.