

Responding to the Misgivings

Velayat Universal Network/ 1389/10/26

Note: Most of the sources are taken from the software of Maktab Ah-al-Beit

Viewers` text messages:

Question no 1 (The age of Aisha)

How old was Aisha?

Answer for question no 1:

Before answering our viewers` text messages, I`d like to say something: Plenty from abroad, particularly from America sent us a message and asked me to read a moral tradition; I`ve told them: there are many others to read for you, but they demand me to read.

A Moral Tradition

I read a tradition from Imam Sadegh as a gift for our viewers. Hesham-ibn-Salem, Imam Sadegh`s companion, quotes from Imam:

ليس من عرق يضرب ولا نكبة ولا صداع ولا مرض إلا بذنب وذلك قول الله عز وجل في كتابه: «وَمَا أَصَابَكُمْ مِنْ مُصِيبَةٍ فَبِمَا كَسَبَتْ أَيْدِيكُمْ وَيَعْفُو عَنْ كَثِيرٍ (شوري/30)». قال: ثم قال: وما يعفو الله أكثر مما يؤخذ به!¹

“No vein will be cut, no feet will be hit by a stone, no one will have headache unless we commit sin, that`s why Almighty says in his book: All the problems you are suffering is because of the things you have done in the past, even though God forgives many of your sins. Then Imams said: What God forgives is much more than he asks about”

This tradition is really useful for those who are complaining about their problems. Some people wonder why they are suffering many problems. It is really clear, when God loves someone and if commits sin, God create some problems for him. For example, when he counts the money, he sees that it`s 99 Tomans not 100, he gets unhappy, he counts again but this time it`s 100 Tomans, this unhappiness is because of the sin he has formerly committed. God loves these kinds of people; He

¹ -Alkafi-al-Sheikh Koleini, v 2 p269 / Vasaal-al-Shia (published by Al al-Beit)Lelhar Ameli v 15 p 299

likes to purify them by these concerns and problems so he may enter hereafter neatly. When God does not like someone, He gives him too much blessing when he or she commits sins; Then «أَخَذْنَاَهُمْ بِعُنَّةٍ²» He takes his soul, and punish him hereafter. Dear viewers, there is a tradition from Imam Bagher:

«أَخَذْنَاَهُمْ بِعُنَّةٍ³»

“As soon as someone commits sin, God deprive him from his blessings”

It is also said that if someone repents, he will be more blessed, and Quran says:

فَقُلْتُ اسْتَغْفِرُوا رَبَّكُمْ إِنَّهُ كَانَ غَفَّارًا / يُرْسِلِ السَّمَاءَ عَلَيْكُمْ مِدْرَارًا⁴

“And I have said: Seek pardon of your Lord. Lo! He was ever Forgiving. He will let loose the sky for you in plenteous rain”

So it is always recommended not to forget about repenting while he is standing, walking, waking up or working. Prophet Muhammad says:

ليغان علي قلبي و إني لاستغفر الله في كل يوم سبعين مرة⁵.

“ I repent 70 days a day, because our hearts always get dirty”

So, repenting is one of the ways that eradicates the sins.

التائب من الذنب، كمن لا ذنب له⁶.

“The who repents, it is as if he has not committed any sin”

Repenting increases the blessings. Imam Hussein quotes: “While I was talking to my father, an Arab man came and said: “ Oh Ali, I have a big family, I can` t afford the high cost of living, I can` t even buy bread for my family. Imam Ali said: “Why don` t you repent? Repenting increases the blessings”

Then Imam Ali read this verse:

² -Surah Anam, verse 44

³ -Surah Anam, verse 44

⁴ -Surah Nuh, verse 10-11

⁵ -Sahih-Moslem v 8 p 72 / Al-Mostadrak Al-al-Sahihein Hakim Neishaburi v 1 p 511 / Mosnad Ahmad Hanbal v4 p 211 / Mostadrak Vasaal Mirza Nuri v 5 p 320 / Jame Ahadith Shia Sayyed Borujerdi v 15 p 497

⁶ -Al-Kafi Shiekh Koleini v 2 p 435 / Vasaal Shia (published by Al-al-Beit) Lehar Ameli v 16 p 74

فَقُلْتُ اسْتَغْفِرُوا رَبَّكُمْ إِنَّهُ كَانَ غَفَّارًا / يُرْسِلِ السَّمَاءَ عَلَيْكُمْ مِدْرَارًا / وَيُمْدِدْكُمْ بِأَمْوَالٍ وَبَنِينَ وَيَجْعَلْ لَكُمْ جَنَّاتٍ وَيَجْعَلْ لَكُمْ أَنْهَارًا⁷

“He will let loose the sky for you in plenteous rain, And will help you with wealth and sons, and will assign unto you Gardens and will assign unto you rivers.”

Repenting increases the blessings, children and properties. That Arab man said: “ I repent but it didn’t help me” Imam said: “ Repent the way I tell you: Read this with tears every night before you go to bed”

Imam Hussain said: “ That Arab man went and he came back after a year and said: “ Oh Ali, I did what you told me, I read that supplication every night, and now I am that rich that I can’t count and record the amount of my properties”

If God willing, we are going to read that supplication for you. Whomever I have given this supplication has now have a very great life. The supplication is available in Valiasr Research Institute`s website: www.valiasr-aj.com and Velayat Network`s website: www.velayattv.com .

But now let`s deal with the text messages. I have to tell you that during these couple of days, we have been received plenty of text messages, some appreciated us, some criticized us and some had suggestions; we thank them all.

Aisha`s age, the daughter of Abu-Bakr

I can`t answer this question briefly. We have uploaded a 50-page article in Valiasr`s website, and Sunnis have lot to say about it.

Mr.Zahabi, a considerable Sunni scholar, in Seir Alam-al-Nobala v2 p289, about Asma, the daughter of Abubakr and the mother of Obeidolah-ibn-Zobair , says: “Asma was 10 years older than Aisha”

There are more than 50 sources about this:

ولدت أسماء قبل هجرة رسول الله بسبع و عشرين سنة⁸.

⁷ -Surah Nuh verse 10-12

⁸ -Tahzib al-Asma Va Al-Loghat LelNavavi, v 2 p 597 / Al-Esabe Fi Tamiz al-Sahabe Ibn-Hajar Asghalani v 8 p 14 / Osd-al-Ghabe Fi Marefat-al-Sahave Ibn-Asir Jazari v 5 p 392 / Tarikh Medina Damascus ibn-Asaker v69 p 9 / Al-Mojam Al-Kabir Tabarani v 24 p 77 / Omdat-al-Ghari Sharh Sahih Bokhari Eini v 2 p 93

“Asma, the daughter of Abubakr, was born 27 years before Prophet Muhammad’s immigration” So comparing these two traditions, we conclude that Asma was 27 in the time Prophet’s immigration and she was 10 years older than Aisha. So we conclude that Aisha was 17 in the time Prophet’s immigration. And Prophet married her in second year of Hejira which means she was a 19-year-old girl. For further elaboration, you can refer to the Valiasr website.

Question no 2: Imploring to someone except God.

_ I demand you to explain comprehensively about asking help from someone except God and also imploring Imams. Sunnis consider us as polytheists.

Answer for Question no 2:

It takes about ten sessions, each 2 hours, to talk comprehensively about imploration, particularly about the verses of imploration, the verses about which Wahhabis refer to, about the traditions about in the practice of Prophet about imploring Imams to Prophet and imploring companions to Prophet after his demise. But I try to explain something within couple of minutes and I demand viewers to pay a very close attention to our tonight’s discussion because we may have not talked about it before. In Quran, verse 97 Surah Joseph, we have repeatedly read that the brothers of Joseph came to their father, Jacob, and said:

يَا أَبَانَا اسْتَغْفِرْ لَنَا ذُنُوبَنَا إِنَّا كُنَّا خَاطِئِينَ

“They said: O our father! Ask forgiveness of our sins for us, for lo! We were sinful.”

If imploration is polytheism, so Jacob should have told his sons “Why do you ask me to help? Go and ask God” God in Quran says:

فَإِنِّي قَرِيبٌ أَجِيبُ دَعْوَةَ الدَّاعِ إِذَا دَعَانِ فَلْيَسْتَجِيبُوا لِي⁹

“And when my servants question thee concerning me, then surely I am nigh. I answer the prayer of the suppliant when he crieth unto Me. So let them hear My call and let them trust in Me, in order that they may be led aright.”

ادْعُونِي أَسْتَجِبْ لَكُمْ¹⁰

⁹ -Surah Baghare Verse 186

“And your Lord hath said: Pray unto Me and I will hear your prayer.”

All Prophets have been sent based on monotheism. But Jacob says:

قَالَ سَوْفَ أَسْتَغْفِرُ لَكُمْ

“I ask God for forgiveness for you?”

If imploring to someone except God is polytheism, God must have forbid people to do so. But God, about Surah Joseph, says:

نَحْنُ نَقُصُّ عَلَيْكَ أَحْسَنَ الْقَصَصِ بِمَا أَوْحَيْنَا إِلَيْكَ هَذَا الْقُرْآنَ¹¹

“We have inspired in thee this Qur'an, though aforetime thou wast of the heedless.”

Of course, when God, in Surah Nesa verse 64, about prophet says:

وَلَوْ أَنَّهُمْ إِذْ ظَلَمُوا أَنفُسَهُمْ جَاءُوكَ فَاسْتَغْفَرُوا اللَّهَ وَاسْتَغْفَرَ لَهُمُ الرَّسُولُ لَوَجَدُوا اللَّهَ تَوَّابًا رَحِيمًا

“And if, when they had wronged themselves, they had but come unto thee and asked forgiveness of Allah, and asked forgiveness of the messenger, they would have found Allah Forgiving, Merciful”

It's also clear and there's no problem with it. They consider any type of implorations is polytheism and when we read them these verses, they say they belong to the time of Prophet. Oh you, those who say: “Any type of imploration is polytheism” so what differences does it make if prophet is alive or dead? If imploration is polytheism, it is considered polytheism either in the life time of prophet or after his demise. They consider both any type of imploration or imploring prophet as the mediator, as polytheism and when we read them the verses, they say they belong to the time of prophet. So you believe that in the time of prophet imploration was not polytheism. And if something was legal and halal, it changed to something like polytheism? Did prophet's demise change something like worshiping to something like polytheism? What kind of demise was that?!!!!

I said the same thing to the grand Saudi Mufti, in the discussion I had with him in 1383 or 1384, that if imploration was something halal and legal, what made it change to something illegal like polytheism?

¹⁰ -Surah Ghafer verse 60

¹¹ -Surah Joseph verse 3

They say: “ When prophets or the righteous people die, they will have no more connection with this world”

Even as Ibn-Teimie said: “ The stick I now have in my hand is more precious than a dead prophet. Because I can kill a snake or an scorpion with it , but he can` t”

First of all, Quran considers martyrs as people who are alive. In Quran, there are some verses about those who have gone to battles by the order of prophet and were martyred.

وَلَا تَحْسَبَنَّ الَّذِينَ قُتِلُوا فِي سَبِيلِ اللَّهِ أَمْواتًا بَلْ أحياءٌ عِنْدَ رَبِّهِمْ يُرْزَقُونَ¹²

“Think not of those, who are slain in the way of Allah, as dead. Nay, they are living. With their Lord they have provision.”

But about عِنْدَ رَبِّهِمْ يُرْزَقُونَ some might say that “ Does Satan give our provision?” We have to say that we are all at the presence of Almighty and he gives our provision and he is watching all over us. So عِنْدَ رَبِّهِمْ يُرْزَقُونَ does not mean that our provision , God forbidden, is given by someone except God.

Second of all, Quran considers the dead bodies of the believers or nonbelievers as people who are now alive in hereafter. This issue has been proved in Quran. About Habib –ibn-Najar, the one who believed the prophet of his time , the one who later on was killed, in the verses 26 and 27 Surah Yasin, it is said:

قِيلَ ادْخُلِ الْجَنَّةَ قَالَ يَا لَيْتَ قَوْمِي يَعْلَمُونَ / بِمَا غَفَرَ لِي رَبِّي وَجَعَلَنِي مِنَ الْمُكْرَمِينَ

“It was said (unto him): Enter paradise. He said: Would that my people knew (26) With what (munificence) my Lord hath pardoned me and made me of the honored ones!”

When he was told : ادْخُلِ الْجَنَّةَ . What heaven did they mean? If it is a heaven after hereafter it will be meaningless. So it is the same heaven in hereafter, the one which is connected to the grave. But about the evildoers, whether they are now alive in hereafter or not, in the verse 45 Surah Ghafer, it is said that:

وَحَاقَ بِآلِ فِرْعَوْنَ سُوءُ الْعَذَابِ / النَّارُ يُعْرَضُونَ عَلَيْهَا غُدُوًّا وَعَشِيًّا وَ يَوْمَ تَقُومُ السَّاعَةُ أَدْخِلُوا آلَ فِرْعَوْنَ أَشَدَّ الْعَذَابِ

¹² -Surah al-emran verse 169

“So Allah warded off from him the evils which they plotted, while a dreadful doom encompassed Pharaoh's folk, (45) The Fire; they are exposed to it morning and evening; and on the day when the Hour upriseth (it is said): Cause Pharaoh's folk to enter the most awful doom.”

Pharaoh was punished by a dreadful doom every day and night. There is no such thing as day or night, and there:

إِذَا الشَّمْسُ كُوِّرَتْ / وَإِذَا النُّجُومُ انْكَدَرَتْ¹³

So, it is referring to the days and nights of the hereafter.

Third of all, Sunnis` scholars all believe that Imams are now alive in their graves. Sunnis, except Wahhabis, believe that Imams are now alive in their graves and they are fully connected to this world.

1. Sobki

Sobki, a contemporary considerable Sunni scholar lived in the time ibn-Teimie, has written some refusal about ibn-Teimie:

و قد أجمع أهل السنة علي إثبات الحياة في القبور، قال إمام الحرمين في (الشامل): إتفق سلف الأمة علي إثبات عذاب القبر و إحياء الموتى في قبورهم و ردّ الأرواح في أجسادهم

“Sunnis all believe that dead people are alive in their graves. Imam-al-Haramain in his book, Ketab-al-Shamel, says: “Companions and Tabein all believe that there is punishment in the graves and dead people are alive in their graves and their souls will back to them in their graves.”

So how could not they consider them as Sunnis but heretics?

2. Abubakr Bin-Arabi

و قال الفقيه أبو بكر بن العربي في (الأمد الأقصى في تفسير أسماء الله الحسني): إن إحياء المكلفين في القبر و سؤالهم جميعا، لا خلاف فيه بين أهل السنة¹⁴.

Abubakr Bin-Arabi, in the book called Omad-al Aghsa Fi Tafsir Asma-al-Hosna, says: “There is no dispute among Sunnis that dead people are alive in their graves and they are going to be asked some questions.” Then he quotes the same thing from Amedi, a considerable Sunni scholar.

¹³ -Surah Takvir verse 3

¹⁴ -Shafa Al-Segham Taghi-al-Din Sobki p349

3. Ghortobi

Then, he quotes from Ghortobi and says:

وقال القرطبي: إن الإيمان به مذهب أهل السنة¹⁵.

Ghortobi says: “Sunnis all believe that dead people are alive in their graves.”

4. Shokani

Mr.Shokani talks about prophets and says:

إن الله عز وجل حرم علي الأرض أن تأكل أجساد الأنبياء. رواه الخمسة إلا الترمذي¹⁶.

“God has forbidden earth to rot the bodies of the prophets. This tradition has also been stated in 5 other authentic books, besides Termezi”

Ibn-Ghedame Maghdesi, a considerable Hanafi scholar whom Wahhabis believe him, in his book Al-Maghni, V 2 p 208, says the same thing. Hakim Neishaburi as well, says:

هذا حديث صحيح علي شرط الشيخين و لم يخرجاه¹⁷.

“This hadith has met the conditions of Sahih-Bokhari and Sahih-Moslem but they didn’t talk about it”

5. Moslem

In Sahih-Moslem, v 7 p 102, the book of Fazael, the chapter of Fazael-al-Musa, prophet says:

مررت علي موسى و هو يصلي في قبره.

“ I was passing by Moses` grave, he was praying in his grave”

How could he say prayers if he were not alive?

6. Heisami

¹⁵ -Shafa Al-Segham Tagh-al-Din Sobki p 350

¹⁶ -Nil-al-Otar Shokani v 3 p 304 / Mosnad Ahmad Hanbal v 4 p 8 Sonan ibn-Maje v 1 p 345 / Sonan al-Nesae v 3 p 92 / Sonan al-Kobra Beihaghi v 3 p 249 / Sonan al-Kobra Nesae v 1 p 519 / Sahih -ibn-Khazime v 3 p 118 / Sonan Abi Davood v 1 p 236 / Al-Mojam Kabir Tabrani v 1 p 217 / Sonan Daremi v 1 p 369

¹⁷ -Almostadrak Hakim Neyshaburi V 4 p 560

Mr. Heisami quotes from Abdullah-ibn-Masoud that prophet said:

حياتي خير لكم، تحدثون و تحدث لكم و وفاتي خير لكم، تعرض علي أعمالكم، فما رأيت من خير حمدت الله عليه و ما رأيت من شر إستغفرت الله لكم.
رواه البزار و رجاله رجال الصحيح¹⁸.

“I will be useful for you either I'm alive or not. They will teach you my deeds. Whatever good deeds you do, I thank Almighty, whatever bad deeds you do, I will ask God for your forgiveness.

This tradition is also said by Mr.Bazar in his Mosnad the book whose narrators are all accurate”

7. Ibn-Hajar Asghalani

Ibn-Hajar Asghalani (died in 852 AH), a considerable Sunni scholar, the one who is among the four greatest Sunni figures, says:

و قد جمع البيهقي كتابا لطيفا في حياة الأنبياء في قبورهم، أورد فيه حديث أنس : «الأنبياء أحياء في قبورهم يصلون». أخرجه من طريق يحيى بن أبي كثير و هو من رجال الصحيح عن المستلم بن سعيد و قد وثقه أحمد و ابن حبان عن الحجاج الأسود و هو ابن أبي زياد البصري و قد وثق ه أحمد و ابن معين عن ثابت عنه و أخرجه أيضا أبو يعلى في مسنده من هذا الوجه ...¹⁹.

“Mr. Beihaghi has written a very brilliant book that all prophets are alive in their graves. He quotes form Anas : “Prophets pray in their graves”.

Then he talks about the narrators of this traditions and he also considers this tradition as an authentic one”

8. Ghastalani

Mr.Ghastalani, the commentator of Sahih-Bokhari, says:

لا شك أن حياة الأنبياء β ثابتة معلومة مستمرة و نبينا أفضلهم، فإذا كان كذلك، فينبغي أن تكون حياتة أكمل من حياة سايرهم²⁰.

“ There is no doubt and it is an undeniable fact that Prophets are alive in their graves after their demise. Our prophet is superior to any other prophets. So, he is undoubtedly alive in his grave” It does not mean that they are alive for years and they die again; no they stay alive forever in their graves after their death.

¹⁸ -Majma al-Zavaed Manba-alFavaed Heisami , v 9 p 24

¹⁹ -Fath-al-Bari Fi Sharh Sahih-Bokhari Ibn-Hajar Asghalani v 6 p 352

²⁰ -Al-Mavaheb Doni Asghalani v 3 p 413

9. Shokani

Mr. Shokani interprets this way:

وقد ذهب جماعة من المحققين إلي أن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم حي بعد وفاته وأنه يسر بطاعات أمته وأن الأنبياء لا يبلون، مع أن مطلق الإدراك كالعلم والسمع ثابت لسائر الموتى²¹.
ما من أحد يمر علي قبر أخيه المؤمن (و في رواية: بقبر الرجل) كان يعرفه في الدنيا، فيسلم عليه، إلا عرفه وردّ عليه... و إذا مر بقبر لا يعرفه، ردّ عليه السلام.

“If a believer passes by someone’s grave whom he know about and says hello, the grave owner says hello to him as well. And also if he passes by someone’s grave whom he doesn’t know about and says hello, the grave owners also says hello to him in return”

So this being alive does not merely belong to Prophet.

Then he says:

وقد ثبت في الحديث: أن الأنبياء أحياء في قبورهم. رواه المنذري و صححه البيهقي.
“In a hadith, it’s been proved that all prophets are alive in their graves. This is what Mr.Manzeri narrated and Beihaghi corrected.”

10. Samhudi

Samhudi, a very famous scholar, says:

و لا شك في حياته بعد وفاته و كذا ساير الأنبياء أحياء في قبورهم حياة أكمل من حياة الشهداء التي أخبر الله تعالى بها في كتابه العزيز و نبيا صلى الله عليه و سلم سيد الشهداء و أعمال الشهداء في ميزانه²².

“There is no doubt that Prophet Muhammad and the other prophets as well are alive after their demise, and this type of life is greater than the life of martyrs the one about which Allah talked about in his book. Our prophet is the chief of the martyrs and everything martyrs do, he will observe it”

Samhudi also narrates plenty of other traditions and say:

أما أدله حياة الأنبياء فمقتضاها حياة الأبدان كحياة الدنيا مع الإستغناء عن الغذاء و مع قوة النفوذ في العالم و قد أوضحنا المسئلة في كتابنا المسمي بالوفاء بما يجب لحضرة المصطفى²³.

²¹ -Nil Otar Shokani v 3 p 305

²² -Vafa al-Vafa Samhudi v 4 p 1349

²³ -Vafa al-Vafa Samhudi v 4 p 1349

“There are some specific reasons that prophets are alive. Their life is like the one in the world but without any worldly food, they have more access to the world than time they lived in the world. We have explained this issue in the book called Alvafa BemaYajeba Lehazrat-al-Mostafa.”

Then he quotes from Abu Mansur Baghdadi, a Sunni speaker:

قال المتكلمون المحققون من اصحابنا: إن نبينا (صلي الله عليه وآله وسلم) حي بعد وفاته.

“Our researchers quoted from our companions that prophets are alive after their demise”

So those who say that these verses are for the lifetime of the prophet, their ideas contradict with these scholars.

Fourth of all, Omar-ibn-Khatib`s imploration

What is interesting is that Sahih-Bokhari quotes from Anas:

أن عمر بن الخطاب رضي الله عنه كان إذا قحطوا استسقى بالعباس بن عبد المطلب فقال : اللهم إنا كنا نتوسل إليك بنبينا صلي الله عليه وسلم فتسقيننا وإنا نتوسل إليك بعم نبينا فاسقنا²⁴.

“When drought came, Omar visited Abas-ibn-Abdul Motaleb and said: “ Oh God, we used to implore to Prophet when he was alive and you blessed us with rain, and now we implore to his uncle, so bless us with rain”

Not only did they implore to prophet but also they implored to his uncle because he was close to him. They might say that why didn`t they implored to prophet Muhammad`s grave? And about that I have to say that they couldn`t say the prayer of Esteghsa behind prophet, since he was in the grave.

Alavi Maleki, a great scholar of Mecca, talked about this issue brilliantly in his book called MafahimYajeba An-Tasahoh.

Fifth of all: Abubakr`s imploration

If imploring to Prophet Muhammad after his demise is polytheism, the first polytheist is considered to be the first caliph.

In Sahih-Bokhari, v 2 p70, is said that: “When Prophet Muhammad passed away, Abubakr was in his house somewhere outside of Mecca. Omar-ibn-Khatib stood

²⁴ -Sahih-Bokhari v 2 p 16 and v 4 p 209

“When prophet passed away, Omar-ibn-Khatlab stood and said: “Some hypocrites think that prophet is dead; Prophet won’t pass away”

Abubakr was among people who proved that prophet passed away. How do Sunnis responde this? Abbas, prophet`s uncle also said that prophet passed away. And also Ibn-am-Maktum, the one who prayed on behalf of prophet for 12 times and the one who was prophet`s deputy, said that prophet passed away. So, from the view point of Omar, they are all hyocrites!!!! So if imploring to prophet is polytheism the first one who was polytheist is the first caliph because he was the first one who implored prophet as soon as prophet passed away.

Mr.Zeini Dahlan (died in 1304 AH), a renowned Sunni scholar, in the book written about Halabie v 2 p391, says that Abubakr came and kissed prophet`s face and said:

أذكرنا يا محمد عند ربك و لنكن علي بالك.

“Oh Muhammad, remember us while you are with God” This is also an imploration.

Amir-al-Momeneen, in Nahjolbalaghe oration no 235, says:

بأبي أنت و أمي! أذكرنا عند ربك و اجعلنا من بالك.

“May God sacrifice my parents for you; remember me while you are with God”

This is nothing but intercession. Zeini Dahlan, the Mufti from Mecca, says:

و من تتبع أذكار السلف و الخلف و أدعيتهم و أورادهم، وجد فيها شيا كثيرا في التوسل و لم ينكر عليهم أحد في ذلك حتي جاء هؤلاء المنكرون و لو تتبعنا ما وقع من أكابر الأمة في التوسل لامتلأت بذلك
الصفحة²⁸.

“If you study the life style of Khalaf and Salaf, you find plenty cases about imploration. There will be plenty of books if we want to write down the stories of our great people imploring to our Imams or prophets”

Sobki (died in 756 AH) who lived in the time of Ibn-Teimie said:

Sire Nabavie Ibn-Hesham Homeiri v 4 p 1070 / Sire Halabie v 3 p 474 / Tafsir Abi Saud v 2 p 93

²⁸ -Al-Dorar Sonie Fi Rad Wahhabi Ahmad Zeini Dahlan p 29

إعلم: أنه يجوز و يحسن ا لتوسل و الاستغاثة و التشفع بالنبي صلي الله عليه و آله و سلم إلى ربه سبحانه و تعالي و جواز ذلك و حسنه من الأمور المعلومة لكل ذي دين، المعروفة من فعل الأنبياء و المرسلين و سير السلف الصالحين و العلماء و العوام من المسلمين و لم ينكر أحد ذلك من أهل الأديان و لا سمع به في زمن من الأزمان، حتي جاء ابن تيمية، فتكلم في ذلك بكلام يلبس فيه علي الضعفاء الأغمار و ابتدع ما لم يسبق إليه في سائر الأعصار²⁹.

“Be sure that imploration, asking for forgiveness and intercession from Prophet Muhammad are all recommended and considered as something approved; everyone believer knows this, and these were in the life style of Prophets, messengers, the righteous Salaf, scholars and majority of Muslims. No one from other denominations denies the appropriateness of imploration, asking for forgiveness or intercession. And Ibn-Teimie said that just some unwise people would follow such a thing.”

Mr.Monavi quotes the same issue in Feiz al-Ghadir Sharh Al-Jame Al-Saghir v 2 p 170.

Sixth of all, the issue of imploring other scholars from other denominations to our Imams

Our dear viewers must know that not only us but also plenty of other scholars implored to our Imams and prophets.

1. Abu Ali Khalal

Mr.Khatib Baghadi, in his book The History of Baghdad v 1 p 133, quotes from the Sheikh of Hanablis and also the scholars of Hanbalis, Hassan-ibn-Ebrahim-Abu-Ali-al-Khalal:

ما همّتي أمر فقصدت قبر موسى بن جعفر، فتوسلت به لإسهل الله تعالى لي ما أحب.

“I had a problem and I visited the tombstone of Imam Musa-ibn-Jafar and I implored to him the way I liked it and God solved my problem”

How beautiful it is. He was the famous Hanbali Sheikh and Wahhabis are also considered themselves as Hanbalis.

2. Abubakr Muhammad –ibn-Momel

Mr.Abubakr Muhammad –ibn-Momel quotes that:

²⁹ -Shafa Segha Taghi Din Sobki p 293

خرجنا مع امام أهل الحديث أبي بكر بن خزيمة و عديله أبي علي الثقفي مع جماعة من مشائخنا و هم إذ ذاك متوافرون إلي زيارة قبر علي بن موسى الرضي بطوس، قال: فرأيت من تعظيمه يعني ابن خزيمة لتلك البقعة و تواضعه لها و تضرعه عندها ما تحيرنا³⁰.

“ We alongside Ibn-Khazime, a hadith expert, our scholars went to tombstone of Ali-ibn-Musa-al-Reza` tomb stone and we saw that Ibn-Khazime bowed down in a way we were quite surprised”

3. Ibn-Heban

He says:

و ما حلت بي شدة في وقت مقامي بطوس، فزرت قبر علي بن موسى الرضا (صلوات الله علي جده و عليه) و دعوت الله إزالتها عني إلا أستجيب لي و زالت عني تلك الشدة و هذا شئ جربته مرارا فوجدته كذلك، أماتنا الله علي محبة المصطفى و أهل بيته صلي الله عليه و سلم الله عليه و عليهم أجمعين³¹.

“When I was in Tus, whenever I had problems, I tried to visit the tombstone of Ali-ibn-Musa-al-Reza and implored to him and I prayed and God solved my problem, I have done it on and on”

Oh dear viewers, Wahhabis, Sunnis those who have been deceived by Wahhabis, those who were told that imploration and asking for forgiveness is polytheism, will they be considering imploration as polytheism anymore, considering the issues and sources we`ve talked about from Sunni books?

I talk about these issues from Sunni books by giving you the accurate sources with their volumes and pages and if find any mistake, I`m ready to confess my mistake and I`ll give 100 thousand tomans as a gift and if it is necessary I will show the books to the cameras to show the whole world that Sunnis believe in imploration and asking for forgiveness but Wahhabis don`t.

Question no 3: (Prophet Muhammad`s praying)

_ Sunnis say that the way we pray is wrong. They don`t consider us as the follower of the prophet since we don`t pray the way they do. Should we pray the way Sunnis pray?

Response to Question no 3:

³⁰ -Thazib-al- Tahzib Ibn-Hajar Asghalni v 7 p 339

³¹ -Seghat Ibn-Heban v 8 p 457

Another viewer also asked the same question and we have promised him to talk about all prays of Prophet Muhammad in his lifestyle and practice. I demand people particularly Sunni to search about prophet Muhammad`s prays in their own books. Even Ibn-Ghedame Majlesi , a considerable Hanbali scholar, and tens of other scholars like Abu Hamid Saedi, prophet`s companion, said:

فقال أبو حميد : أنا أعلمكم بصلاة رسول الله صلي الله عليه و سلم قالوا : فأعرض، قال: كان رسول الله صلي الله عليه و سلم إذا قام إلي الصلاة، يرفع يديه حتي يحاذي بهما منكبيه، ثم يكبر حتي يقر كل عظم في موضعه معتدلاً، ثم يقرأ، ثم يكبر، فيرفع يديه حتي يحاذي بهما منكبيه، ثم يركع و يضع راحتيه علي ركبتيه، ثم يعتدل، فلا يصوب رأسه و لا يقنعه، ثم يرفع رأسه و يقول : سمع الله لمن حمده، ثم يرفع يديه حتي يحاذي منكبيه معتدلاً، ثم يقول : الله أكبر، ثم يهوي إلي الأرض، فيجافي يديه عن جنبيه، ثم يرفع رأسه و يثني رجله اليسري، فيقعد عليها و يفتح أصابع رجله إذا سجد و يسجد، ثم يقول: الله أكبر و يرفع و يثني رجله اليسري، فيقعد عليها حتي يرجع كل عظم إلي موضعه، ثم يصنع في الأخرى مثل ذلك ، ثم إذا قام من الركعة كبر، فرفع يديه حتي يحاذي بهما منكبيه كما كبر عند افتتاح الصلاة، ثم يفعل ذلك في بقية صلاته، حتي إذا كانت السجدة التي فيها التسليم أخر رجله اليسري و قعد متوركا علي شقة الأيسر . قالوا: صدقت هكذا كان يصلي صلي الله عليه و سلم.

رواه مالك في الموطأ و أبو داود و الترمذي و قال: حديث حسن صحيح.

و في لفظ رواه البخاري قال : فإذا ركع أمكن يديه من ركبتيه، ثم هصر ظهره، فإذا رفع رأسه استوي قائماً حتي يعود كل فقار مكانه و إذا سجد سجد غير مفترش و لا قابضهما و استقبل بأطراف أصابع رجله القبلة، فإذا جلس في الركعتين جلس علي اليسري و نصب الأخرى، فإذا كانت السجدة التي فيها التسليم أخر رجله اليسري و جلس متوركا علي شقه الأيسر و قعد علي مقعدته³².

“There were 10 companions and Abu Hamid Saedi says: “I`m going to teach you the way prophet pray.” They said: “Teach us the way he prays”. He said: “When prophet wanted to pray, he raised his hands close to his ears to say “Allahu Akbar”. Malik Dor Mota, Abu Davood and Termezi also quoted and consider it as an authentic tradition. And it is also stated the same in Sahih-Bokhari”

It is really strange. What has happened among people that made them unaware of prophet`s pray that Abu Hamid Saedi wanted to teach people about prophet`s pray?

He explained all the details in prophet`s pray and there were no folding the arms and saying “Amen”. He even talked about the recommendatory ritual of praying. But nothing like the things they have added to the ritual of praying was taught by

³² -Al-Moghani Ibn-Ghedame v 1 p 502 / Al-Mahali Ibn-Hazm v 4 p 91 / Mosnad Ahmad Hanbal v5 p 424 / Sonan Ibn-Maje v 1 p 280 / Sonan Abi Davood v 1 p 107/ Sonan Termezi v 1 p 187 / Sonan Daremi v 1 p 299 / Sonan Kobra Beihaghi v 2 p 72/ Omdat-alGhari Sharh Sahih Bokhari Eini v 6 p 104 / Tohfat Huzi Mobar Kufi v 2 p 101 / Sahih-ibn-Khozaima v 1 p 317 / Sahih -ibn Heban v 5 p 178

Abu Hamid Saedi for the 10 companions. If Takatof (folding the arms) is an obligatory ritual of praying, why didn't he talk about it? If saying "Amen" is obligatory, why Abu Hamid Saedi didn't talk about it? And also tens of other added rituals. This was prophet's pray that Sunni scholars talked about.

Question no 4

Uttering Salavat for companions

_In the last part of supplication of Ganj-al-Arsh , there is a supplication for prophet and companions. Is saying Salavat (saluting) to companions problematic?

Well, there is no document for the supplication of Ganj-al-Arsh and its statements are contradictory with wisdom, our Imams' traditions and it is not authentic; and it would be problematic if someone wants to read it for worshiping since some its statements are contradictory with our Imams'. But about saying Salavat (saluting) to companions there's no doubt Sunnis have talked about how to say Salavat to prophet Muhammad. In Sahih-Bokhari, it is stated that:

حدثنا قيس بن حفص و موسى بن إسماعيل قالا : حدثنا عبد الواحد بن زياد حدثنا أبو فروة مسلم بن سالم الهمداني قال: حدثني عبد الله بن عيسى سمع عبد الرحم ن بن أبي ليلى قال : لقيني كعب بن عجرة فقال : ألا أهدي لك هدية سمعتها من النبي صلي الله عليه و سلم؟ فقلت : بلي فأهدها لي، فقال: سألنا رسول الله صلي الله عليه و سلم فقلنا: يا رسول الله! كيف الصلاة عليكم أهل البيت؟ فإن الله قد علمنا كيف نسلم، قال: قولوا: «اللهم صلي علي محمد و علي آل محمد كما صليت علي إبراهيم و علي آل إبراهيم إنك حميد مجيد، اللهم بارك علي محمد و علي آل محمد كما باركت علي إبراهيم و آل إبراهيم إنك حميد مجيد»³³.

"Don't you want me to tell you about the gift I've heard from prophet? I said: "yes. Give it to me as a gift" he said: "I asked prophet that how we shall salute you" He said: "God taught me how to salute, say:

«اللهم صلي علي محمد و علي آل محمد ...».

There's also another tradition from Abu Saeed Khodri under this verse:

إِنَّ اللَّهَ وَمَلَائِكَتَهُ يُصَلُّونَ عَلَى النَّبِيِّ يَا أَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا صَلُّوا عَلَيْهِ وَسَلِّمُوا تَسْلِيمًا³⁴

It is interpreted that:

³³ -Sahih-Bokhari v 4 p 119 / Kitab Ahadith anbia chapter 10 v 7 p 156 / Kitab Davat Chapter Sala alalnabi/ Sahih Moslem v 2 p 16

³⁴ -Surah Ahzab Verse 56

يا رسول الله ! هذا التسليم، فكيف نصلي عليك؟ قال : قولوا: اللهم صل علي محمد عبدك و رسولك كما صليت علي آل إبراهيم و بارك علي محمد و علي آل محمد كما باركت علي إبراهيم (علي آل إبراهيم)³⁵

There are also other traditions as well. I have a complaint. Sahih-Moslem and Sahih-Bokhari repeatedly talked about saluting prophet: “Whenever you want to salute me say: “اللهم صلي علي محمد و علي آل محمد ...”

In the same tradition, Bokhari says:

رسول الله

In the same tradition in which prophet says: “If you want to salute me, salute my household as well”, Bokhari and Moslem said: «صلي الله عليه و سلم»!

I don't know what are going to say in hereafter. In saluting they have named prophet without saying «و آله», even though prophet said:

لا تصلوا علي الصلاة البتراء . فقالوا: و ما الصلاة البتراء يا رسول الله؟ قال : تقولون: اللهم صل علي محمد و تسكتون، بل قولوا: اللهم صل علي محمد و علي آل محمد.

“Don't salute me in a shortened way. They said: “Oh, prophet, what is a shortened Salutation?” He said: “To say: «اللهم صل علي محمد» and then say nothing. You have to say:

«اللهم صل علي محمد و علي آل محمد»

Al-Savaegh Al-Moharagha Li-ibn Hajar Heisami, v 2 p 430, published in institution of Resalat in Lebanon, in 1417 AH and 1997, Yanabi Almavadat Lazavi Al-Ghorba Lelghonduzi, v 1 p 37.

Mr.Ibn-Aghil Shafei in the book called Al-Otab Al-Jamil p 6, considers this tradition authentic. There are some other people who narrated this tradition. It is really interesting that Imam Shafei said a poem and all Shafeis recited this poem:

يا أهل بيت رسول الله حبكم
كفاكم من عظيم القدر إنكم
فرض من الله في القرآن أنزله
من لم يصل عليكم لا صلاة له

“Oh Ah-al-Beit, as Quran said, we have to be kind with you (pointing to the verse of friendship ³⁶ قل لا أسألكم عليه أجرًا إنا المودّة في القرّبي and if anyone does not salute you his praying is nullified”

³⁵ -Sahih Bokhari v 6 p 27

³⁶ -Surah Shora verse 23

Even Sunni scholars have said that if anyone does not salute prophet in his praying, his praying is nullified. Even Wahhabis believe the same. But when they want to salute prophet they the sentence without saying «و آله». There is no tradition in which prophet has said to salute my companions, and if we salute his companions it is nothing but heresy.

Mr.Mohseni:

Sometimes, when we were in Mecca or Medina, when the name of prophet was uttered in orations, no one from the crowd cared to salute him, but when we consider Shias, we see that as soon as the name of prophet is uttered, they salute him.

Dr.Ghazvini

It is interesting that they themselves quoted from prophet:

من عمل عملا ليس عليه أمرنا، فهو رد³⁷.

“If someone disobeys what we have ordered him to do, he will be failed.”

Also they have narrated a tradition from Aisha that prophet said:

من أحدث في أمرنا هذا ما ليس فيه، فهو رد³⁸.

“If anyone adds anything about which we didn’t talk about in religion, he will be no longer a Muslim and he’s failed”

How do they come with an idea that the words «أصحابه»or «صحابه»have been stated in saluting prophet? Do they have any tradition about that from prophet? Or they themselves added the word «أصحابه»assuming that Abubakr, Omar, Osman or Amir-al-Momeneen used this word when they wanted to salute prophet in their orations?

Question no 5: (Zolgharnein)

Please, let us know that who is Zolgharnein?

Answer to Question no 5:

³⁷ -Sahih Bokhari v 3 p 24 / Sahih Moslem v 5 p 132

³⁸ -Sahih Bokhari v 3 p 167 / Sahih Moslem v 5 p 132

We need at least 2 or 3 sessions to talk about Zolgharnein. There is an argument between Sunnis and Shias about Zolgharnein`s identity. Some have said that he was an angel which was sent by God to do something in the world. Mr. Ibn-Jozi Hanbali, the author of the book Al-Montazam, says:

و اختلف العلماء في إسم ذي القرنين علي أربعة أقوال:

“Sunni scholars argue that who is Zolgharnein. There are four ideas:

أحدها عبد الله قاله علي رضي عنه و قال ابن عباس : اسمه عبد الله بن الضحاک و الثاني الإسکندر قاله وهب و قيل هو الإسکندر بن قيصر قاله أبو الحسن المنادي و كان قيصر هذا أول القياصرة و أقدمهم و إنما سمي بذي القرنين بعد ذلك طویل و الثالث عياش قاله محمد بن علي بن الحسين و الرابع الصعب بن جائر بن القلمس ذكره أبو بكر بن أبي خيثمة³⁹.

“First idea; His name is Abdullahh as Ali said in the tradition, and also ibn-Abbas said: His name is Abdullah-ibn-Zahak. Second idea; He is the same Eskandar as Wahab said, and it is said that he is Eskandar-ibn-Gheis as Abu-al-Hussain Monadi said.... . Third idea; His name is Ayash as Muhammad-ibn-Ali-ibn-Hussain said so. Fourth idea; His name is Sab-ibn-Jaser-ibn-Ghalams as Abubakr-ibn-Abi-Kheisame said so.”

Mr.Ibn-Taher Maghdesi, in the book al-Beda al-Tarikh v 3 p 79, says: “His name was Marzban”

Mr. Zamakhshari says: “His name was Eskandar who owned the whole world as his properties. Two believers and two apostates occupied the whole world, the believers were Zolgharnein and Solomon, and two apostates were Namrud and Bakht-al-Nasr”

Late Sheikh Sadugh also quotes a tradition from Amir-al-Momeneen in the book Ellal-al-Sharaye:

لم يكن نبيا و لا ملکا و لم يكن قرناه من ذهب و لا فضة و لكنه كان عبدا أحب الله فأحبه الله و نصح لله فنصحه الله و إنما سمي ذا القرنين، لأنه دعا قومه إلى الله عز وجل، فضربوه علي قرنه، فغاب عنهم حيناً، ثم عاد إليهم، فضرب علي قرنه الآخر و فيكم مثله⁴⁰.

“Zolgharnein was neither a prophet nor an angel, he was a righteous man who loved God and was loved by God”

³⁹ -Montazam Ibn Jozi v 1 p 286 published by Dar Sader Beirut first edition 1358

⁴⁰ -Elal Sahraye Sheikh Sadugh v 1 p 40

Ayatollah Makarem Shirazi in his book, Tafsir Nemune, has some ideas, one of which is:

“1. Some believe that he was no one but Eskandar Maghduni. 2. Some historians believe that Zolgharnein was one of the king of Yemen. 3. Zolgharnein is the same Cyrus the great.”

Alame-Tabatabaee believes the third idea ⁴¹. Of course Ayatollah Makarem Shirzai and Alame Tabatabaee referred the comprehensive books written by Abu Kalam Azad, a considerable Indian scholar.

Viewers Questions:

Question 1

1. Please talk about the character of Abu Musa Ashari. Since, we`ve read that he was the commander of Islam, a hadith was quoted from him and he was also Ali. What kind of person he was?

2. The Sunni sources you mention, are they available in Farsi language?

Answer for Question no 1

Shias do not approve of Abu Musa Ashari`s character. Though he did some good stuff in the time of prophet, but they do not count, since Talhe and Zobeir did also some good stuff but they stood against Amir-al-Momeneen. Abu Musa Ashari also stood against Amir-al-Momeneen in the battle of Jamal and he was not approved by Amir-al-Momeneen. Amir-al-Momeneen had to send Ibn-Abbas to fire him and appoint someone else instead in Kufe where they talked against Ali.

2. No, most of them are in Arabic language, 90 percent of them are not translated, all the books I`m referring to are taken from the Maktab-ah-al-Beit software. Even if I have the book in my library, I don`t refer to it; I just refer to this software. This software is available everywhere, even Wahhabis use this software to talk against Shias. This is for the offices of Ayatollah Golpayegani and Sistani, and I think it is the best and fastest software which includes 5 thousand books about Sunnis and

⁴¹ -Almizan Fi Tafsir Quran Alame Tabatabaeev 13 p 391

Shias in every field of study. To get this software, you can call the office of Ayatollah Golpayegani.

Question no 2

1. Is the title ((سيد الشهداء)) attributed to two persons? I mean to Imam Hussain or Hamze, the prophet Muhammad`s uncle.

2. Please talk about the virtues of Masjed-al-Aghsa. Did infallible Imams go to this mosque or did Imams talk about any virtues of this mosque? Does this mosque have any rituals which were approved of prophet like the great mosque, Masje-al-Haram, and Masjed-al-Nabi?

Answer for Question no 2

1.The title of ((سيد الشهداء)) in the battle of Ohod was attributed to Hamze, but in terms of all martyrs this title is only used for Imam Hussain. Also what is really common among Shia is that this title is used for Imam Hussain.

2. About Masjed-al-Aghsa, you can refer to the book called al-Amali written by Sheikh Tusi, p 369 Hadith no 788, he quotes from Amir-al-Momeneen:

أربعة من قصور الجنة في الدنيا: المسجد الحرام و مسجد الرسول و مسجد بيت المقدس و مسجد الكوفة

“There are four placed which are the palaces in heaven: Masjed-al-Haram, Masjed-al-Nabi, Masjed-al-Aghsa and Masjed Kufe”

And also in Kafi, v 3 p 491, it is stated that:

جاء رجل إلى أمير المؤمنين صلوات الله عليه و هو في مسجد الكوفة فقال : السلام عليك يا أمير المؤمنين و رحمة الله و بركاته فرد عليه، فقال: جعلت فداك إني أردت المسجد الأقصى، فأردت أن أسلم عليك و أودعك، فقال له : ... و صل في هذا المسجد، فإن الصلاة المكتوبة فيه حجة مبرورة و النافلة عمرة مبرورة و البركة فيه على إثني عشر ميلا، يمينه يمين و يساره مكر و في وسطه عين من دهن و عين من لبن و عين من ماء شراب للمؤمنين و عين من ماء طهر للمؤمنين منه سارت سفينة نوح و كان فيه نسر و يغوث و يعوق و صلى فيه سبعون نبيا و سبعون وصيا، أنا أحدهم و قال بيده في صدره : ما دعا فيه مكروب بمسألة في حاجة من الخوائج إلا أجابه الله و فرج عنه كربته.

“When Amir-al-Momeneen was in Masjed-al-Kufe, someone came and said: السلام عليك يا أمير المؤمنين و رحمة الله و بركاته . Amir-al-Momeneen replied him. The man said: I`m headed to Masjed-al-Aghsa, I thought I should stop by and say goodbye to you. Amir-al-Momeneen said: Pray in this mosque, because saying an obligatory pray

here is like doing the ritual of obligatory Haj, and saying the Nafele praying here is like doing the ritual of More Haj.”

There is also another tradition quoted from Amir-al-Momeneen:

صلاة في بيت المقدس تعدل ألف صلاة⁴².

“Saying one Rakat in Masjed-al-Aghsa is as blisssed as saying thousands Rakat”

There a lot of saying about this issue. You can also refer to the called Ighbal-al-Amal written by Sayyed-ibn-Tavus which is about the rituals of Masjed-al-Aghsa.

Question no 3:

How many times should we read the following hadith for a patient? We read it forty times for some nights.

ولاية علي بن أبي طالب حصني، فمن دخل حصني، أمن من عذابي.

Forty times suffice but you have to read it until you get result. Reading once is also enough if you read it whole-heartedly.

عن علي بن موسى الرضا عن موسى بن جعفر عن جعفر بن محمد عن محمد بن علي عن علي بن الحسين عن الحسن بن علي عن علي بن الحسين بن علي بن أبي طالب عليهم السلام عن النبي ﷺ عن جرثيل عن ميكائيل عن إسرافيل عن اللوح عن القلم قال : يقول الله عز وجل: ولاية علي بن أبي طالب حصني، فمن دخل حصني، أمن من عذابي⁴³.

Question no 4

I want to say something but I hope you don't misunderstand it because I'm an Iranian. It I related to Iranians from the view point of Quran. I have done a research for many years that why God selected Iranians to be Shias. I demand all Sunnis to pay attention to the following verses:

1. Surah Tobe verse 39
2. Surah Maede verse 54
3. Surah Muhammad verse 38
4. Surah Anam verse 89

⁴² -Vasael Shia (published Albeit) Her Ameli v 5 p 289

⁴³ -Oyoon Akhbar Al-Reza Sheikh Sadugh v1 p 146 / Al-Mali Sheikh Sadugh p 306

In these verses it is said that another group must do the Islamic issues since Arabs are not capable of doing so. Under these verses it is stated that Iranian is that group. Pay attention to the verse 16 Surah Fath which is about the battle between Iranians and Arabs and also the second caliph's attack to Iran. Amir-al-Momeneen, based on this verse, said the oration no 146 in Nahjol-balaghe and gave the second caliph some advice about the battle between Arabs and Iranians. If study this verse carefully this verse is about planning the battle between Iranians and Arabs. If God willing, I will send my research to you and I really like you to ponder about the verses. They know about the traditions you say much better but they don't like to accept the truth.

Answer the question no 4:

Today, while I was reviewing the text messages, I saw some messages from Zahedan in which some said "we talk about your discussions and during these days 4 or 5 Sunnis turned to be Shias". So I think you are somehow wrong, some of them believe the truth. We don't want Sunnis to be Shias; we just want to talk about the truth. It's also the same for Wahhabis. I, almost every week, talk to the prominent figures of Saudi Arabia, its universities and even with Shia children of the great figures of Saudi Arabia who were Sunnis before. I'm also in contact with their pray leaders and whenever I want to call them I try to call them with phone number outside of Iran and that's our problem. I have some cellphones from Saudi Arabia, Germany and Holland and whenever I want to call them I try to call them with these cellphones or through IP to avoid being identified otherwise Saudi Arabia government will punish them. There are a lot of Shias who were Wahhabis before and they are really harsh in words. Sometimes they attend our private sessions and they use some harsh words; the more we prove they're wrong the less they believe us. They say that we are being deceived. Once I had a discussion with one the top figure of Aljazeera who is now a Shia and I told him that being harsh in debates is not appropriate for Islam. Neither Amir-al-Momeneen nor Imam Sadegh likes us being harsh. Once Imam Sadegh was told:

إنا نرى في المسجد رجلا يعلن بسب أعدائكم و يسبهم فقال:

"One of the your Shia follower curses your enemies. Imam Sadegh said:

ما له؟ لعنه الله! تعرض بنا⁴⁴.

“What is wrong with him? May God curse him. People complain about him to me.”

It means the more you curse them the more they curse our Imams. But today it is not like that. The last 2 or 3 centuries must be named t as the century of tending Wahhabis, Sunnis or Christians to Shias. The whole world knows that the only sect which is capable of meeting the humans` thought needs is the sect of Ah-al-Beit. We have to confess that we have been ignorant in introducing the Ah-al-Beit`s culture. Imam Reza says:

فإن الناس لو علموا محاسن كلامنا لاتبعونا⁴⁵.

“If people know the virtues of our talks, they`ll follow us” There is no need to invite people to Shiism by cursing or insulting. If we let people know about the virtues of Amir-al-Momeneen and Fatima Zahra, her justice, his bravery, their status among Sunnis, any wise person would truly love them. George Jordagh the one who truly loved Ali, has written a book called “Ali, the voice of Human Justice” has used some statements that whenever I read them I start crying. There are also some other people like George Jordagh who has written books about Ahl-al-Beit and Imam Sadegh. Not all people are the same. We believe that some chosen to be Wahhabi or Sunni as their occupations and if they being stopped Sunni or Wahhabi, they will lose their jobs as pray leaders or the managers in the offices; and they are not that brave to do so. We always have these types of scholars.

Please email us your survey so we can use them and if they are useful, we are going to let people know about them.

Question no 5

Someone gave my friend a ring as a gift on which the signs of moon and stars were carved. Do these signs belong to Sunnis? Where are these signs come from?

⁴⁴ -Bahar al-Anvar Alame Majlesi v 71 p 217 / Tafsir Safi Feiz Kashani v 2 p 147

⁴⁵ -Oyoon Akhbar al-Reza Sheikh Sadugh v 2 p 257 / Vasaal Shia (published Al-Beit) Hor Ameli v 27 p 92

Can he, as a Shia, use this ring?

2. We Shias believe that Amir-al-Momeneen is superior to any other prophets except Prophet Muhammad. But in the book called "The nights of Pishavar" it is stated that Imam is inferior to great prophets but superior to other prophets. Of course this is what I've understood from this book because I've read the English version.

3. Sunnis have stated a tradition from the book called "Kafi" which is approved by Mr. Majlesi and Sheikh Sadugh; Imam Sadegh was asked:

"Are Imams superior or prophets?" Imam Sadegh said: "Prophets"

Please talk about this as well.

Answer to question no 5:

1. If it is gold, it is Haram. If it has a sign like star or moon which represents a movement like the Christian cross, it is not approved. But if it has the signs like the verses of Quran or the names of Allah, there is no problem. Of course, tell your friend that there is a ring called "Sharaf-al-Shams" which is also a name of a divine supplication which seems to be star but it is not.

2. There are a lot of questions whether Imams are superior or prophets. If God willing, we are going to talk about this. But according to the verse of Mubahele (Mutual Cursing) there are some traditions in which prophet said:

"Ali is like me and I am like Ali". He also said the same thing about Imams and Fatima. Shias believe that whatever Ali and Fatima Zahra had is because of Prophet Muhammad. Imam Ali said:

"I am the servant of Muhammad"

But about other prophets we have some authentic reasons that Imams are superior to any other prophets even the great prophets. As they say this is our belief and if we made a mistake, God will bless us for this mistake.

Question no 6:

1. We Shias believe that Amir-al-Momeneen, Fatima Zahra, Imam Hassan, Imam Husain and prophet Muhammad are the members of Ahl-al-Beit. The question is are prophet's wives are considered as the Ahl-al-Beit? Since, it is an undeniable fact that spouses are considered as the households.

2. When Quran was collected, were the old-fashioned verses written in the Quran? Give us some examples.

3. We've somehow heard and study about the detestable man, Ziad-ibn-Abie. In the time Amir-al-Momeneen, as Tabari says, he was designated as the governor of the Fars. The question is why Amir-al-Momeneen designated him as he governor of the Fars?

The answer for Question no 6

First of all the answer for the question whether the spouses of prophets are among Ahl-al-Beit or not is yes. Everyone's spouses are considered as his households. About Moses, it is stated that:

قَالَ يَا هَلِيهِ امْكُثُوا إِنِّي آنَسْتُ نَارًا⁴⁶

It is also stated about Abraham the prophet.

Second of all:

Our dispute with Sunnis is not the matter that whether the spouses of prophets are among Ahl-al-Beit or not; our dispute is about the verse of Tathir (purification):

إِنَّمَا يُرِيدُ اللَّهُ لِيُذْهِبَ عَنْكُمُ الرِّجْسَ أَهْلَ الْبَيْتِ وَيُطَهِّرَكُمْ تَطْهِيرًا⁴⁷

“Allah's wish is but to remove uncleanness far from you, O Folk of the Household, and cleanse you with a thorough cleansing.”

Does this verse, with these features, refer to the spouses of Prophet? That's what we are looking for. This is our dispute that whether this verse refers to the spouses of Prophet or not.

Third of all:

Mr.Alusi Wahhabi, a famous Sunni scholar says:

⁴⁶ -Surah Ghasas verse 29

⁴⁷ -Surah Ahzab verse 33

أن النساء المطهرات غير داخلات في أهل البيت الذين هم أحد الثقلين⁴⁸.
Mr. Tahavi, a prominent Sunni scholar, in the book called “Moshkel Asar” , v1 p 230 hadith no 782, says:

أن المراد بما فيها هم رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم و علي و فاطمة و الحسن و الحسين دون ما سواهم

“The verse of Tathir (purification) refers to Ali, Fatima, Hassan and Hussain and no one else.”

In page 231, he explicitly says that this verse only refers to Ahl-al-Beit. The same thing has been stated in Al-Mavaheb Al-Ladonie p 529, written by Ghastalani. Ibn-Hajar-Heisami also said the same thing in Al-Savaegh Moharaghe, p210. Mr.Samhudi in Javaher-al-Aghdin p 204 1st chapter states that the verse of Tathir does not refer to the spouses of prophet.

Fourth of all:

Let us assume that they have not said such a thing, the point is the spouses of prophet themselves didn't claim to be among Ahl-al-Beit. Show us a weak tradition that, for example, Aisha, Ome Salame, Hafse or Ome Habibe have said “we are also included in the verse Tathir”. This verse is what we have dispute over. This is really clear.

Fifth of all:

Besides, the verse itself is crystal clear. The word “Beit” has been stated once before and after the verse. And also the word بيوت has been stated in both.

وَ قَرْنَ فِي بُيُوتِكُنَّ⁴⁹
وَ اذْكُرْنَ مَا يُتْلَى فِي بُيُوتِكُنَّ مِنْ آيَاتِ اللَّهِ⁵⁰

Prophet Muhammad had more than on spouse. He had many wives that`s why the word بيوت has been stated. But in the verse Tathir, the word بيت has been stated.

إِنَّمَا يُرِيدُ اللَّهُ لِيُذْهِبَ عَنْكُمُ الرِّجْسَ أَهْلَ الْبَيْتِ وَ يُطَهِّرَكُمُ تَطْهِيرًا

This is really clear.

Sixth of all:

⁴⁸ -Tafsir Alusi v 22 p 16

⁴⁹ -Surah Ahzab verse 33

⁵⁰ -Surah Ahzab verse 34

The tone of speech which is used for prophet`s spouses is that of threatening one.

يَا أَيُّهَا النَّبِيُّ قَدْ لَأَزُوجِكَ إِنْ كُنْتُنْ تُرِدْنَ الْحَيَاةَ الدُّنْيَا وَ زِينَتَهَا فَتَعَالَيْنِ
 أُمْتَعُنْ وَ أَسْرَحْنَ سَرَاحًا جَمِيلًا⁵¹
 وَ إِنْ كُنْتُنْ تُرِدْنَ اللَّهَ وَ الدَّارَ الآخِرَةَ فَإِنَّ اللَّهَ أَعَدَّ لِلْمُحْسِنَاتِ مِنْكُنَّ
 أَجْرًا عَظِيمًا⁵²
 يَا نِسَاءَ النَّبِيِّ مَنْ يَأْتِ مِنْكُنَّ بِفَاحِشَةٍ مُبَيَّنَةٍ يُضَاعَفْ لَهَا العَذَابُ ضِعْفَيْنِ⁵³
 يَا نِسَاءَ النَّبِيِّ لَسْتُنَّ كَأَحَدٍ مِنَ النِّسَاءِ إِنْ أَتَقَيْتُنَّ فَلَا تَحْضَعْنَ بِالْقَوْلِ فَيَطْمَعَ
 الَّذِي فِي قَلْبِهِ مَرَضٌ وَ قُلْنَ قَوْلًا مَعْرُوفًا⁵⁴
 وَ قَرْنَ فِي بُيُوتِكُنَّ وَ لَا تَبَرَّجْنَ تَبَرُّجَ الجَاهِلِيَّةِ الأُولَى⁵⁵

All these are threatening tone of speech. But in the verse of Tathir, the tone changes to the praising and complimentary one.

2. Yes, there are old-fashioned verses in Quran, like Surah Baghare verse 187 which says:

أُحِلَّ لَكُمْ لَيْلَةَ الصِّيَامِ الرَّفَثُ إِلَى نِسَائِكُمْ هُنَّ لِبَاسٌ لَكُمْ وَ أَنْتُمْ لِبَاسٌ لَهُنَّ عَلِمَ
 اللَّهُ أَنَّكُمْ كُنْتُمْ تَخْتَانُونَ أَنْفُسَكُمْ فَتَابَ عَلَيْكُمْ وَ عَفَا عَنْكُمْ فَالآنَ بَاشِرُوهُنَّ وَ
 ابْتَغُوا مَا كَتَبَ اللَّهُ لَكُمْ وَ كَلُوا وَ اشْرَبُوا حَتَّى يَتَبَيَّنَ لَكُمْ الخَيْطُ الأَبْيَضُ مِنَ
 الخَيْطِ الأَسْوَدِ مِنَ الفَجْرِ ثُمَّ أَتَمُوا الصِّيَامَ إِلَى اللَّيْلِ وَ لَا تُبَاشِرُوهُنَّ وَ أَنْتُمْ
 عَاكِفُونَ فِي المَسَاجِدِ تِلْكَ حُدُودُ اللَّهِ فَلَا تَقْرُبُوهَا كَذَلِكَ يُبَيِّنُ اللَّهُ آيَاتِهِ لِلنَّاسِ
 لَعَلَّهُمْ يَتَّقُونَ

It is made lawful for you to go in unto your wives on the night of the fast. They are raiment for you and ye are raiment for them. Allah is Aware that ye were deceiving yourselves in this respect and He hath turned in mercy toward you and relieved you. So hold intercourse with them and seek that which Allah hath ordained for you, and eat and drink until the white thread becometh distinct to you from the black thread of the dawn. Then strictly observe the fast till nightfall and touch them not, but be at your devotions in the mosques. These are the limits imposed by Allah, so approach them not. Thus Allah expoundeth His revelation to mankind that they may ward off (evil).

3. I have to say that the people whom Ali trusted them were quite few. He also had problems with his cousin, Ibn-Abbas. And also he punished Osman-bin-Honayf, the one who came to Basra and attended a party which only rich people were invited:

و ما ظننت أنك تجي ب إلي طعام قوم عائلهم مجفو و غنيهم مدعو . فانظر إلي ما
 تقضمه من هذا المقضم، فما اشتبه عليك علمه فالفظه و ما أيقنت بطيب وجوه
 فنل منه .

⁵¹ -Surah Ahzab verse 28

⁵² -Surah Ahzab verse 29

⁵³ -Surah Ahzab verse 30

⁵⁴ -Surah Ahzab verse 32

⁵⁵ -Surah Ahzab verse 33

“I didn’t expect you to accept the invitation of those whose people are poor and deprived because of oppression and only rich have been invited. Be careful where you sit and eat. Stay away from the food that you don’t know whether it is Haram and Halal, and just consume the things you are sure about cleanliness.”

ألا و إن لكل مأموم إماما يقتدي به و يستضي بنور علمه، ألا و إن إمامكم قد اكتفي من دنياه بطمريه و من طعمه بقرميه . ألا و إنكم لا تقدرّون علي ذلك و لكن أعينوني بورع و اجتهاد و عفة و سداد⁵⁶.

“Be aware that any follower has an Imam to follow and he is led by his knowledge. Be aware, that your Imam, (me) is satisfied with 2 loaves of bread and 2 shabby clothes. You are not capable of doing so, but help me with your efforts, abstinence, and trustworthiness.”

Amir-al-Momeneen had a lot to say and he was truly oppressed even among his own friends. His being oppressed is like the one stated in in the supplication:

السلام عليك يا ولي الله، أنت أول مظلوم و أول من غضب حقه⁵⁷.

Amir-al-Momeneen says:

و لقد أصبحت الأمم تخاف ظلم رعايتها و أصبحت أخاف ظلم رعيتي⁵⁸.

“People in other nations wake up in the morning being afraid of their oppressors and I wake up in the morning being afraid of my followers` oppression”

In the battle of Khavarej, the comrades of Ali stood against him. What did Ali have to do? Amir-al-Mommeneen said:

لوددت أني لم أركم و لم أعرفكم، معرفة و الله جرت ندما و أعقبت سدما، قاتلكم الله! لقد ملأت قلبي قيحا و شحنتم صدري غيظا و جرعتموني نخب التهمام أنفاسا و أفستم علي رأيي بالعصيان و الخذلان⁵⁹.

“I really wish I hadn’t met you, cause it was nothing but regret and sorrow; may God kill you, you don’t know how much I angry with you; you fed me with sadness and sorrows; you spoiled my ideas with your disobedience”

⁵⁶ -Nahjol-balaghe letter 45

⁵⁷ -Kafi Sheikh Koleini v4 p 569 / Man layahzarat Faghih Sheikh Sadugh v 2 p 587 / Tahzib Al-Ahkam Sheikh Tusi, v 6 p 28 / Vasaal Shia (published by Beit) Hor Ameli v 14 p 394 /Kamel Ziarat Jafar ibn Muhammad bin Ghulie p 95

⁵⁸ -Nahjol Balaghe oration no 97

⁵⁹ -Nahjolbalaghe Oration no 27

أَللّهُمَّ إِنِّي قَدْ مَلَلْتَهُمْ وَ مَلُونِي وَ سَأَمْتَهُمْ وَ سَأَمُونِي، فَأَبْدَلْنِي بِهِمْ خَيْرًا مِنْهُمْ وَ
أَبْدَلْهُمْ بِي شَرًّا مِنِّي⁶⁰.

“Oh God, I made these people tired with my advices and warnings, they are tired of me and I`m tired of them. Bless me with better people than them and give them someone worse than me to rule over them.”

Amir-al-Momeneen assigned people who were so-called trustworthy. If God willing, I`m going to talk about Abu-Musa-Ashari. Ibn-Abbas mediated in and said that Abu-Musa-Ashari was someone good, but you see what terrible things he did for Amir-al-Momeneen and what conspiracies he planned against Amir-la-Momeneen. That`s the character of Abu-Musa-Ashari.

«و السلام عليكم و رحمة الله و بركاته»»

Dr.Sayyed Muhammad Hussain Ghazvini.

⁶⁰ -Nahjol Balaghe oration no 25