

A Comparative Study of Hadith of “Return of the Sun”

Discussion:

From the past, the story of return of the sun has been concentrated on by many scholars and scientists of different Islamic sects and each of them have debated on it and posed their idea about that and considered it as a miracle of the holy Prophet and a sign of supremacy of Imam Ali (AS). They considered it as a virtue of Imam Ali (AS). They have written books and articles about this incidence and discussed it with reference to different sources. Some of these researches include:

- 1- Ibne Marduye according to what Bayazi wrote in his book (*Sirat Al Mustaqim*) in *Abaqat Al Anwar*, vol., p. 33 and *Manaqin Al Abi Talib*, vol. 1, p. 353
- 2- “Kashf Al Labas An Hadith Rad Al Shams”, Hafiz Jalaluddin Suyuti (deceased in 911 Hijri)
- 3- “Mazil Al Labas An Hadith Rad Al Shams”, Shams Al-Din Muhammad Ibne Yusuf Al-Salihi Shamy (deceased in 942 Hijri)
- 4- *Kashf Al Rams An Hadith Rad Al Shams*, Muhammad Baqir Mahmoodi, Al Maarif Al Islamiya, first publish, Qom, Institute of Islamic Sciences of Qom
- 5- *Hadith of Return of the Sun*, Abi Al Fath, Muhammad Ibne Al Hussein Al Azadi Al Museli (deceased in 374 Hijri)
- 6- *Tashih Khabar Rad Al Shams Wa Tarqim Al Nawasib Al Shams*, Abi Al Qasim, Bin Al Haddad Al Haskani Al Hanafi, Min Alam Al Qarn Al Khamis
- 7- *Hadith Rad Al Shams*, Al Muwafaq Ibne Ahmad Al Maliki Al Kharazmi Al Hanafi (deceased in 568 Hijri)
- 8- *Hadith Rad Al Shams*, Abi Ali Muhammad Ibne Asaad Ibne Ali Al Jawani Al Abidali (deceased in 588 Hijri)

Return of the sun, as a divine miracle and virtue of Imam Ali (AS), has occurred twice according to valid sources; once during lifetime of the holy Prophet and another time during his reign.

In this article, we tend to analyze this hadith according to Shiite and Sunni sources and then we will respond to doubts about this matter.

Return of the Sun in Shiite View

Shiite revayats about this matter are in two types. The first group of narrators believes that the return occurred during lifetime of the holy Prophet and the second group believes that it had happened after death of the holy Prophet.

Part 1: Return of the Sun during Lifetime of the Holy Prophet

First Hadith:

Sheikh Saduq says, according to his own source:

One day, the holy Prophet put his head on Ali's leg and went to sleep. Ali did not say his afternoon salat and then the sun set. When the holy Prophet woke up and understood what happened, he started to pray and said "O, Allah! Truly Ali was obeying you and your Prophet and the time for his salat passed. So please return the sun, so that he could do his salat in its appropriate time". Asma says "I swear to Allah, I saw that the sun which had set rose again and there were no mounts and piece of ground which remained intact from touch of sun, unless Ali made wudu and said salat and then the sun set again".

Al Sheikh Saduq (deceased in 381 after hijrat), Man La Yahzarihu Al Faqih, vol. 1, p 610, publisher: Institute of Islamic Publication for Group of Teachers of Qom, researcher: Ali Akbar Qaffari

Second Hadith:

Sheikh Mufid says:

One day the holy Prophet was at his own house and Ali (AS) was sitting with him. Gabriel came down and transferred the divine message. In that occasion, the holy Prophet put his head on Ali's leg and this situation continued until the sunset. Inevitably, Ali said his afternoon salat in that situation and did his salat in an unusual way (with eye gestures). When the revelation came to an end, the Prophet

returned to his normal status and turned to Ali (AS) and asked “Didn’t you say your afternoon salat?” He replied “You, messenger of Allah! Because of your special situation, that you were receiving the revelation, I could not say my salat standing”.

The holy Prophet said “Pray and ask God to return the sun, so that you can say your salat in its appropriate time. Because you were obeying God and his Prophet, God will answer your request”.

Ali (AS) asked God to return the sun and the sun returned, so that he said his salat in its appropriate time and then the sun set again. Asma says “I swear to Allah, I heard the sun made a noise like the noise of a saw cutting woods when it was setting”.

Al Sheikh Al Mufid, Muhammad Ibne Muhammad Ibne Naman Ibne Al Muallim Abi Abdullah Al Akbari Al Bagdadi (deceased in 413 after hijrat), Al Irshad Fi Marifat Hujaj Allah Ala Al Ibad, vol. 1, p 345, researcher: Aal Al Bait (AS) li Tahqiq Al Turath Institution, Publisher: Dar Al Mufid for publish and distribution, Beirut, Lebanon, second edition, 1414 after hijrat, 1993

Third Hadith:

Koleini says:

Ammar said “I went to Fazikh Mosque with Imam Sadeq (AS). Imam said ‘You, Ammar! Do you see this hole on the ground?’ I said ‘Yes’.

He said ‘Jafar’s wife, who later married Imam Ali (AS), had been sitting in this place with her two children from Jafar. Asma started crying. Her children said ‘You, mother! Why are you crying?’

Asma said ‘I am crying for Imam Ali (AS)’. They said ‘You cry for Ali and you do not cry for our father!’ Asma said ‘It is not like what you think. I remembered a story that Ali (AS) said to me in this place. As I remembered that story, I started crying’. The two asked ‘What was the story?’ She said ‘I was with Ali (AS) in the mosque. He said “Do you see this hole on the ground?” I said “Yes.” He said “The holy Prophet and I were sitting here. The holy Prophet put his head on my leg and rested, so that he went to sleep. The time for afternoon salat came and I could not wake the holy Prophet. So the time of salat passed and the holy Prophet woke up. He told me “Did you say your salat?” I said “No”. He said “Why?” I said “Because I did not want to bother you”. The holy Prophet stood up and turned to Qibla and

said “O, God! Return the sun to its position for afternoon salat, so that Ali may say his afternoon salat”. So the sun came up to that extent that I could say my afternoon salat”.

Al Kuleini Al Razi, Abi Jafar Muhammad Ibne Yaqub Ibne Ishaq Al Kuleini AL Razi (deceased in 329 after hijrat), Al Furu Min Al Kafi, vol. 4, p 561, correction: Ali Akbar Al Qaffari, publisher: House of Islamic Books, Spring of 1367, publisher: Tehran Bazaar, House of Islamic Books

Fourth Hadith:

Sheikh Saduq says:

Asma, daughter of Umais, says “I was at this place [Sahba] with the holy Prophet. He said his noon salat and sent Ali to do something. It turn afternoon and the holy Prophet said the afternoon salat. Ali returned. The Prophet called him and Ali sat next to him. Some revelation was sent down and the holy Prophet put his head on his leg and in that situation he went to sleep. When the holy Prophet woke up, he asked Ali “Have you said your afternoon salat?” He replied “No, because your head was on my leg and I did not want to bother you”. The holy Prophet raised his hand prayed “O, God! This is your servant, Ali who sacrificed his life for your Prophet. Return the sun for him (so he can say his salat)”. Suddenly the sun rose again and everywhere was lit. Ali stood up and said his afternoon salat and then the sun set again.

Al Sheikh Al Saduq (deceased in 381 after hijrat), Ilal Al Sharaii, vol. 2, p 351, publisher: Manshurat Al Maktabat Al Heidariya wa Matbaataha, Najaf, researcher: Al Seyyed Muhammad Sadeq Bahr Al Ulum, 1966

Part 2: Return of the Sun after Death of the Holy Prophet

First Hadith:

Saduq narrates a revayat that shows the return of the sun occurred after death of the holy Prophet and the sun returned after Imam Ali’s pray:

It is quoted from Juwairia Ibne Mushar who said “We were returning from the war of Khawarij with Ali Ibne Abi Talib, commander of believers. We reached Babylon. It was a place near Halle in Iraq in which there is a mosque called Shams (the sun) and many people go to visit this mosque. It was time for afternoon salat. Ali (AS) stopped there and so did the army. Ali (AS) said “You, people! This land has been cursed by God. During history, this land or its people have been punished

by divine wrath three times (or twice according to some revayats) and they are awaiting a next one. This land is one of the lands which were occupied by Lut Tribe and was destroyed and people were killed by drowning into the earth. This land was the first place that idol was worshipped. It is why no Prophet and no successor of a Prophet could pray on this land, but you could do it and say your salat”. So, people went to sides of the road and said their salat. Ali (AS) was seated on the Prophet’s camel and he continued his way. Jawiria (the narrator of the hadith) says “I said to myself that I swear to Allah, I will follow the commander of believers””.

Al Sheikh Al Saduq (deceased in 381 after hijrat), Man La yahzarohu Al Faqih, vol. 1, p 204, publisher: Institute of Islamic Publication for Group of Teachers of Qom, researcher: Ali Akbar Al Qaffari

There is another hadith with almost the same content that only its reference is mentioned here:

Muhammad Ibne Al Hassan Al Saffar (deceased in 290 after hijrat), Basair Al Darajat, p 237, publisher: Al Aalami publication, Tehran, researcher: Al Haj Mirza Hassan Kuche Baqi, 1404 (after hijrat), publication: Al Ahmadi Publication, Tehran

Second Hadith:

After the war of Nahrawan, Imam Ali (AS) moved from the region of Nahrawanat (and left for Kufa). The city of Bagdad was had not been built yet. They reach a land named Baratha. They said the noon salat there. After salat they kept going. In the afternoon, they reached Babylon. It was time for afternoon salat. Muslims from different parts of the group cried out that it is time for salat. Imam Ali (AS) replied “This land had drowned its own people three times and will do it again for a fourth time. It is not allowed that a successor of a Prophet to say salat in such a land. Whoever desires can say his salat here”.

The hypocrites said “He does not say salat and kills those who say salat (by this, they meant that people of Nahrawan were saying salat).

Juwairia says “I said ‘I do not say salat before Imam does so. Today, I will follow him on this’”. With one hundred cavalry, Imam continued his path and they left Babylon. It was the time that the sun was setting and the horizon was red. He says “Imam looked at me and told me to bring water for him. I brought him some water and he made wuau. He told me to say Adhan. I said ‘But it is not time for night

salat!’ He said “Say adhan of afternoon salat”. I told to myself “Do I say adhan of afternoon after the sunset?!” But I followed what he ordered me. Then, he stood up for saying salat. At that situation, I saw him moving his lips and I could not recognize what he was saying. I just heard him making a noise like a swallow. I understood nothing out of that. All of a sudden, I saw the sun rose from west to a position for afternoon salat and stopped there. He started saying salat. We stood behind him and started our salat. But the end of our salat, the sun suddenly set and everywhere was dark and stars started shining. Then Imam turned to me and said “You who have weakened faith! Say adhan for night salat””.

Hussein Abd Al Wahab, *Oyun Al Mujizat*, p 7, publisher: Muhammad Kazim Al Sheikh Sadeq Al Kutubi, Al Heidariya Publication, Najaf, 1369 (after Hijrat), Al Heidariya Publication, Najaf

Third Hadith:

Nasr Ibne Muzahim Minqari quoted Abd Khair who said:

We were going with Imam Ali (AS) from the land of Babylon and it was time for afternoon salat. All lands were green and beautiful. We reached a place which was greener and more beautiful than other places. The sun was setting. Ali (AS) got off his horse and so did I. He prayed and the sun returned to a position for afternoon salat and stopped in that situation. We said our afternoon salat and it set again.

Ibne Muzahim Al Minqari, *Waqata Siffain*, p 135

This revayat is also mentioned in the following:

Ibne Abi Al Hadid Al Madaini Al Mutazili, Abu Hamid Iz Al Din Ibne Hibat Allah Ibne Muhammad Ibne Muhammad (deceased in 655 after hijrat), *Explanation of Nahj Al Balaqah*, vol. 3, p 98, researcher: Muhammad Abdul Karim Al Namari, publisher: House of Kitab Al Ilmiya, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1998

Al Allama Al Majlisi, *Bihar Al Anwar*, vol. 32, p 419

Fourth Hadith:

Sheikh Tousi quotes Imam Muhammad Baqir through his own reference:

When Imam Ali (AS) was going to Nahrawan, he reached the land of Babylon and it was time for afternoon salat, but he kept going and did not stop. Before leaving the land, the sun set. Everyone got off his horse and said his salat except for Malik Ashtar. He said “I do not say salat if Ali (AS) does not do so”.

After leaving land of Babylon, Ali (AS) got off and said to Malik “You, Malik! This land was salt marsh and salat in there is not acceptable. Whoever said salat in there should do it again”.

Imam Baqir says “Imam turned to Qibla and said three sentences neither in Arabic nor Persian. By the end, the brilliant sun returned to sky again. He said his salat and by the end of his salat, a noise like cutting wood by a saw could be heard”.

Al Sheikh Al Tusi, Abu Jafar Muhammad Ibne Al Hassan Ibne Ali Ibne Al Hassan (deceased in 460 after Hijrat), Al Aamaali, vol. 2, p 671, hadith 22, publisher: Dar Al Thiqafa for publishing and distributing, Qom, researcher: Islamic Teaching Department of Al Bitha Institution, 1414 (after hijrat)

Analyzing Hadith of Return of the Sun in Sunni References:

The hadiths in Sunni sources about the story of return of the sun during lifetime of the holy Prophet are in two groups:

The first group are the hadiths which only focus on the event and do not talk about details and reason of this event.

The second group are the hadiths which talk about details and reason of Imam’s delay in saying salat. In this section, we discuss these revayats with regard to source.

Part 1: Study of the First Group of Revayats

Ahmad Tabarani says:

The holy Prophet ordered the sun to have a delay in its setting. This revayat is quoted from Muqal by no one but Walid.

Al Tabarani, Suleiman Ibne Ahmad Ibne Ayyub Abu Al Qasim (deceased in 360 after hijrat), Al Mujam Al Owsat, vol. 4, p 224, hadith 4039, researcher: Tariq Ibne Awaz Allah Ibne Muhammad and Abdul Muhsin Ibne Ibrahim Al Husseini, publisher: Dar Al Haramain, Cairo, 1415 (after hijrat)

Ibne Hajar says:

The source of this hadith is accurate.

Al Asqalani Al Shafeii, Ahmad Ibne Ali Ibne Hajar Abu Al Fazl (deceased in 852 after hijrat), Fath Al Bari; Explanation of Sahih Al Bukhari, vol. 6, p 221, Publisher: Dar Al Marifat, Beirut, researcher: Muhib Al Din Al Khatib

Zein Al Din Iraqi says:

Tabarani, with accurate evidence, quotes Jabir that the holy Prophet ordered the sun to return.

Al Husseini Al Iraqi, Zein Al Din Abu Al Fazl Abdul Rahim (deceased in 806 after hijrat), Tarh Al Tathrib Fi Sharh Al Taqrib, vol. 7, p 238, publisher: House of Scientific Books, Beirut, 2000, first edition, researcher: Abdul Qadir Muhammad Ali

Abul Hassan Abibakr says:

رواه الطبراني في الأوسط وإسناده حسن

Abu Al Hassan Ali Ibne Abi Bakr (deceased in 807 after hijrat), Majma Al Zawaid wa Manba Al Fawaid, vol. 8, p 296, publisher: Dar Al Riyan Lil Turath, house of Arabic books, Cairo and Beirut, 1407 (after hijrat)

Soyuti says:

وأخرج الطبراني بسند حسن عن جابر أن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم أمر الشمس فتأخرت ساعة من نهار.

Al Khasais Al Kubra, vol. 2, p 137, author: Abu Al Fazl Jalal Al Din Abdul Rahman Abi Bakr Al Soyuti (deceased in 911 after hijrat), publisher: House of Scientific Books, Beirut, 1985

Soyuti refers to Shafei to bring evidence for this hadith.

What proves the incidence of return of the sun is Shafei and others' words about it. They would say no Prophet has been granted a miracle unless the same or greater than that has been granted to Prophet Muhammad. Since it is said in accurate sources that sun has been locked while Prophet Joshua was fighting the brutal (and it is a miracle of that Prophet), so there must be something for our Prophet which it exists.

Jalal Al Din Abdul Rahman Ibne Abi Bakr (deceased in 911 after hijrat), Al Lali Al Masnuat Fi Al Ahadith AlMawzuat, vol. 1, p 312, publisher: House of Scientific Books, Beirut, 1417 (after hijrat), first edition, researcher: Abu Abdul Rahman Salah Ibne Muhammad Ibne Awiza

So the reference of this revayat has no problem.

Fakhr Razi also approved the incidence of return of the sun by Imam Ali (AS). In this regard he writes:

Return of the sun had occurred for Prophet Suleiman. So did occur for Prophet Muhammad. It was when he was sleeping on Ali's (AS) legs and when he got up, the sun had set. Due to the Prophet's pray, the sun returned and Ali could say his salat.

Al Razi Al Shafeii, Fakhir Al Din Muhammad Ibne Omar Al Tamimi (deceased in 604 after hijrat), Al Tafsir Al Kabir Aw Mafatih Al Qaib, vol. 32, p 118, publisher: House of Scientific Books, Beirut, first edition, 2000

Part 2: Study of the Second Group of Revayats

The second group are those revayats which contain details and reason of return of the sun. Here some of these revayats will be mentioned and discussed. Most of these hadiths are quoted from Asma Bint Umais and are mentioned in Manabi Fariqain.

First Revayat:

Tahawi in explanation of Mushkil Al Athar writes:

The holy Prophet said the noon salat in Sahba and sent Ali somewhere to do something. When Ali returned, the Prophet had said the afternoon salat. The Prophet put his head on Ali's leg and went to sleep. Ali remained silent and did not move and the Prophet was sleeping. It continued until the sun set. The holy Prophet woke up. When he realized the situation, he raised his hand and said praying "O, God! This is your servant Ali who has this situation because of your Prophet. So, return the light of the sun for him".

Asma says "The sun lit again and Ali got up and made wudu and said his afternoon salat. After Ali's salat, he sun set again. This occurrence was in the land of Sahba and during the war of Kheibar".

Al Tahawi, Abu Jafar Ahmad Ibne Muhammad Ibne Salama (deceased in 321 after hijrat), Sharh Mushkil Al Athar, vol. 3, p 94, no. 92, researcher: Shuaib Al Arnaut, publisher: Al Risalat Institute, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1408 (after hijrat)

Al Tabarani, Suleiman Ibne Ahmad Ibne Ayyub Abu Al Qasim (deceased in 360 after hijrat), Al Mujam Al Kabir, vol. 24, p 144, number 382, publisher: Al Zahra School, Al Musil, 1404 (after hijrat), second edition, researcher: Hamdi Ibne Abdul Majid

Heithami, after quoting two revayats from Tabarani, writes about this revayat:

All of these revayats are quoted by Tabarani and narrators of one of them are narrators of Sahih Bukhari.

Al Heithami, Abu Al Hassan Ali Ibne Abi Bakr (deceased in 807 after hijrat), Majma Al Zawaid wa Manba Al Fawaid, vol. 8, p 297, publisher: Dar Al Riyan Lil Turath, House of Arabic Books, Cairo and Beirut, 1407 (after hijrat)

Studying Reference of the Revayat:

The following are some narrators which were introduced as truthful and reliable.

Ali Ibne Abdul Rahman:

Ibne Hajar Asqalani says:

علي بن عبد الرحمن بن محمد بن المغيرة المخزومي... وكان أصله من الكوفة صدوق

Taqrib Al Tahzib, vol. 1, p 4758, number 4765

Muhammad Ibne Al Muqaira:

Ibne Hajar Asqalani says:

محمد بن المغيرة بن إسماعيل بن أيوب المخزومي صدوق

Al Asqalani Al Shafeii, Ahmad Ibne Ali Ibne Hajar Abu Al Fazl (deceased in 852 after hijrat), Taqrib Al Tahzib, vol. 1, p 508, number 6316, researcher: Muhammad Awama, publisher: Dar Al Rashid, Syria, first edition, 1406 after hijrat

Bin Salih:

Ibne Hajar Asqalani says:

أحمد بن صالح المصري أبو جعفر بن الطبري ثقة حافظ من العاشرة

Al Asqalani Al Shafeii, Ahmad Ibne Ali Ibne Hajar Abu Al Fazl (deceased in 852 after hijrat), Taqrib Al Tahzib, vol. 1, p 80, number 48, researcher: Muhammad Awama, publisher: Dar Al Rashid, Syria, first edition, 1406 after hijrat, Ali Ibne Aabis

Muhammad Ibne Fudaik:

Ibne Hajar Asqalani says:

محمد بن إسماعيل بن مسلم بن أبي فديك بالفاء مصغر الديلي مولاهم المدني أبو إسماعيل صدوق من صغار الثامنة مات سنة

مائتين على الصحيح

Al Asqalani Al Shafeii, Ahmad Ibne Ali Ibne Hajar Abu Al Fazl (deceased in 852 after hijrat), Taqrib Al Tahzib, vol. 1, p 468, number 5736, researcher: Muhammad Awama, publisher: Dar Al Rashid, Syria, first edition, 1406 after hijrat

Muhammad Ibne Musa Al Fitri:

Ibne Hajar Asqalani says:

محمد بن موسى الفطري بكسر الفاء وسكون الطاء المدني صدوق

Al Asqalani Al Shafeii, Ahmad Ibne Ali Ibne Hajar Abu Al Fazl (deceased in 852 after hijrat), Taqrib Al Tahzib, vol. 1, p 509, number 6335, researcher: Muhammad Awama, publisher: Dar Al Rashid, Syria, first edition, 1406 after hijrat

Own Ibne Muhammad:

Hakim Neishabouri says:

وعون هذا هو ابن محمد بن عبيد الله بن أبي رافع هو وأبوه ثقتان.

Al Neishabouri, Muhammad Ibne Abdullah Abu Abdullah Al Hakim (deceased in 405 after hijrat), Al Mustadrak Ala Al Sahihain, vol. 3, p 180, researcher: Mustafa Abdul Qadir Ataa, publisher: House of Scientific Books, Beirut, first edition, 1990

Umme Jafar:

Ibne Hajar Asqalani says:

أم عون بنت محمد بن جعفر بن أبي طالب ويقال لها أم جعفر مقبولة من الثالثة

Al Asqalani Al Shafeii, Ahmad Ibne Ali Ibne Hajar Abu Al Fazl (deceased in 852 after hijrat), Taqrib Al Tahzib, vol. 1, p 757, number 8750, publisher: Dar Al Rashid, Syria, first edition, 1406 after hijrat, researcher: Muhammad Awama, For Al Nizamiya Encyclopedia, India, publisher: Al Aalami Lil Matbuat Institute, Beirut, third edition, 1406 after hijrat

Asma Bint Umais:

Ibne Hajar Asqalani says:

أسماء بنت عميس الخثعمية صحابية

Al Asqalani Al Shafeii, Ahmad Ibne Ali Ibne Hajar Abu Al Fazl (deceased in 852 after hijrat), Taqrib Al Tahzib, vol. 1, p 743, number 8531, researcher: Muhammad Awama, publisher: Dar Al Rashid, Syria, first edition, 1406 after hijrat, Ali Ibne Aabis

Shams Al Din Zahabi writes:

أسماء بنت عميس الخثعمية من المهاجرات الأول

Al Zahabi, Shams Al Din Muhammad Ibne Ahmad Ibne Othman (deceased in 748 after hijrat), Al Kashif Fi Marifat Min Lah Revayat Fi Al Kutub Al Sittah, vol. 1, p 502, number 6947, researcher: Muhammad Awama, publisher: Dar Al Qibla Lil Thiqafa Al Islamiya, Uluw Institution, Jidda, first edition, 1413 (after hijrat)

Second Revayat:

Tabarani quotes Asma Bint Umais who said:

The holy put his head on Ali's leg and was receiving oracle. In that situation, Ali could not say his salat. This continued so much that the time for salat of afternoon

passed and the sun set. When the holy Prophet saw this, he said praying “O, God! Ali was obeying you and your Prophet. Return the sun for him”.

Asma says “I, myself, saw that the sun which had set rose again after its setting”.

Al Tabarani, Suleiman Ibne Ahmad Ibne Ayyub Abul Qasim (deceased in 360 after hijrat), Al Mujam Al Kabir, vol. 24, p 151, number 390, publisher: Al Zahra School, Al Musil, 1404 (after hijrat), second edition, researcher: Hamdi Ibne Abdul Majid

Tahawi also quotes the same revayat in his explanation of Mushkil Al Athar:

The holy Prophet put his head on Ali’s leg and was receiving oracle. Ali had not said his afternoon salat and the sun set. When the Prophet was conscious asked Ali “have you said salat?” He replied “No”. Then the holy Prophet prayed “O, God! Ali was obeying you and your Prophet. Return the sun for him”. Asma says “I, myself, saw that the sun which had set rose again after its setting”.

Al Tahawi, Abu Jafar Ahmad Ibne Muhammad Ibne Salama (deceased in 321 after hijrat), Sharh Mushkil Al Athar, vol. 3, p 92, number 92, researcher: Shuaib Al Arnaut, Al Risalat Institute, Beirut, first edition, 1408 (after hijrat)

About the reference of this hadith and another hadith, Ibne Haban writes:

These two hadiths are true and their narrators are reliable.

Al Tamimi Al Basti, Muhammad Ibne Habban Ibne Ahmad Abu Hatam (deceased in 354 after hijrat), Al Thiqat, vol. 1, p 215, researcher: Al Seyyed Sharaf Al Din Ahmad, publisher: Dar Al Fikr, first edition, 1395 (after hijrat)

Studying Revayat’s Reference:

Al Hussein Ibne Ishaq A; Tustari:

Shams Al Din Zahabi says:

Hussein Ibne Ishaq was a narrator who traveled a lot and was trustworthy.

Al Zahabi, Shams Al Din Muhammad Ibne Ahmad Ibne Othman (deceased in 748 after hijrat), Tarikh Al Islam wa Wafiyat Al Mashhir Wa Al Aalaam, vol. 21, p 157, researcher: Dr. Omar Abdul Salam Tadmari, publisher: House of Arabic Books, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1987

Othman Ibne Abi Shaibe:

Ibne Hajar Asqalani says:

عثمان بن محمد بن إبراهيم بن عثمان العبسي أبو الحسن بن أبي شيبَةَ الكوفي ثقة حافظ شهير.

Al Asqalani Al Shafeii, Ahmad Ibne Ali Ibne Hajar Abu Al Fazl (deceased in 852 after hijrat), Taqrib Al Tahzib, vol. 1, p 386, number 4513, researcher: Muhammad Awama, publisher: Dar Al Rashid, Syria, first edition, 1406 after hijrat, Ali Ibne Aabis

Ubeidullah Ibne Musa:

Ibne Hajar Asqalani says:

عبيد الله بن موسى بن باذام العبسي الكوفي أبو محمد ثقة.

Al Asqalani Al Shafeii, Ahmad Ibne Ali Ibne Hajar Abu Al Fazl (deceased in 852 after hijrat), Taqrib Al Tahzib, vol. 1, p 375, number 4345, researcher: Muhammad Awama, publisher: Dar Al Rashid, Syria, first edition, 1406 after hijrat, Ali Ibne Aabis

Fuzail Ibne Mazruq:

Ibne Hajar Asqalani says:

فضيل بن مرزوق الأغر بالمعجمة والراء الرقاشي الكوفي أبو عبد الرحمن صدوق

Al Asqalani Al Shafeii, Ahmad Ibne Ali Ibne Hajar Abu Al Fazl (deceased in 852 after hijrat), Taqrib Al Tahzib, vol. 1, p 448, number 5437, researcher: Muhammad Awama, publisher: Dar Al Rashid, Syria, first edition, 1406 after hijrat, Ali Ibne Aabis

Shams Al Din Zahabi says:

فضيل بن مرزوق الكوفي... ثقة.

Al Kashif, vol. 2, p 448, number 4492

Ibrahim Ibne Al Hassan:

Ibne Haban says:

إبراهيم بن حسن بن حسن بن علي بن أبي طالب أخو عبد الله بن حسن من أهل المدينة يروى عن أبيه وفاطمة بنت الحسين

Al Tamimi Al Basti, Muhammad Ibne Habban Ibne Ahmad Al Mustadrak Abu Hatam (deceased in 354 after hijrat), Al Thiqat, vol. 6, p 3, number 6467, researcher: Al Seyyed Sharaf Al Din Ahmad, publisher: Dar Al Fikr, first edition, 1975

Fateme Bint Hussein:

Ibne Hajar Asqalani says:

فاطمة بنت الحسين بن علي بن أبي طالب الهاشمية المدنية زوج الحسن بن الحسن بن علي ثقة.

Al Asqalani Al Shafeii, Ahmad Ibne Ali Ibne Hajar Abu Al Fazl (deceased in 852 after hijrat), Taqrib Al Tahzib, vol. 1, p 751, number 8652, researcher: Muhammad Awama, publisher: Dar Al Rashid, Syria, first edition, 1406 after hijrat, Ali Ibne Aabis

Asma Bint Umais:

Ibne Hajar Asqalani says:

أسماء بنت عميس الخثعمية صحابية

Al Asqalani Al Shafeii, Ahmad Ibne Ali Ibne Hajar Abu Al Fazl (deceased in 852 after hijrat), Taqrib Al Tahzib, vol. 1, p 743, number 8531, researcher: Muhammad Awama, publisher: Dar Al Rashid, Syria, first edition, 1406 after hijrat, Ali Ibne Aabis

Third Revayat:

Tabarani quotes:

Whenever the holy Prophet was receiving oracles, he would get unconscious. One day he was receiving oracle and his head was on Ali's leg. When got conscious (and oracle receiving finished), he asked Ali (AS) "You, Ali! Have you said salat?" He replied "No". The Prophet asked God to return the sun, so that Ali could say his afternoon salat. Asma says "I saw the sun rose again though it had set before and Ali said his salat".

Al Tabarani, Suleiman Ibne Ahmad Ibne Ayyub Abul Qasim (deceased in 360 after hijrat), Al Mujam Al Kabir, vol. 24, p 152, number 391, publisher: Al Zahra School, Al Musil, 1983, second edition, researcher: Hamdi Ibne Abdul Majid Al Salafi

Studying Evidence of the Hadith:

Jafar Ibne Ahmad Ibne Sanan Al Wasiti:

Shams Al Din Zahabi writes:

جعفر بن أحمد بن سنان بن أسد الحافظ الثقة بن الحافظ أبي جعفر القطان الواسطي

Al Zahabi, Shams Al Din Muhammad Ibne Ahmad Ibne Othman (deceased in 748 after hijrat), Tazkirat Al Hifaz, vol. 2, p 752, number 754, publisher: House of Scientific Books, Beirut, first edition

Soyuti says:

جعفر بن أحمد بن سنان بن زيد الحافظ الثقة ابن الحافظ أبي جعفر القطان الواسطي

Al Soyuti, Jalal Al Din Abdul Rahman Ibne Abi Bakr (deceased in 911 after hijrat), Tabaqat Al Hifaz, vol. 1, p 319, number 725, publisher: House of Scientific Books, Beirut, first edition, 1403 (after hijrat)

Ali Ibne Al Manzar:

Ibne Haban says:

علي بن المنذر الطريقي بفتح المهملة وكسر الراء بعدها تحتانية ساكنة ثم قاف الكوفي صدوق

Al Tamimi Al Basti, Muhammad Ibne Habban Ibne Ahmad Al Mustadrak Abu Hatam (deceased in 354 after hijrat), Al Thiqat, vol. 2, p 336, number 14260, researcher: Al Seyyed Sharaf Al Din Ahmad, publisher: Dar Al Fikr, first edition, 1975

Ibne Hajar Asqalani says:

علي بن المنذر الطريقي ثقة صدوق قاله ابن نمير

Al Asqalani Al Shafeii, Ahmad Ibne Ali Ibne Hajar Abu Al Fazl (deceased in 852 after hijrat), Taqrib Al Tahzib, vol. 1, p 405, number 772, researcher: Muhammad Awama, publisher: Dar Al Rashid, Syria, first edition, 1406 after hijrat, Ali Ibne Aabis
Abu Hafs Al Waez, Omar Ibne Ahmad (deceased in 385 after hijrat), Tarikh Asma Al Thiqat, vol. 1, p 142, number 772, publisher: Dar Al Salafiye, Al Kuwait, 1984, first edition, researcher: Sabhi Al Sameraie

Shams Al Din Zahabi says:

علي بن المنذر الطريقي عن ابن عيينة والوليد بن مسلم وعنه الترمذي والنسائي وابن ماجة وابن صاعد وابن أبي حاتم قال النسائي: شيعي محض ثقة.

Al Zahabi, Shams Al Din Muhammad Ibne Ahmad Ibne Othman (deceased in 748 after hijrat), Al Kashif Fi Marifat Min Lah Revayat Fi Al Kutub Al Sunnah, vol. 2, p 48, number 3970, researcher: Muhammad Qawama, publisher: Dar Al Qibla Lil Thiqafa Al Islamiya, Uluw Institute, Jidda, first edition, 1413 (after hijrat)

Muhammad Ibne Fuzail:

Shams Al Din Zahabi says:

محمد بن فضيل بن غزوان بفتح المعجمة وسكون الزاي الضبي مولا هم أبو عبد الرحمن الكوفي صدوق عارف

Al Zahabi, Shams Al Din Muhammad Ibne Ahmad Ibne Othman (deceased in 748 after hijrat), Al Kashif Fi Marifat Min Lah Revayat Fi Al Kutub Al Sunnah, vol. 2, p 502, number 6227, researcher: Muhammad Qawama, publisher: Dar Al Qibla Lil Thiqafa Al Islamiya, Uluw Institute, Jidda, first edition, 1413 (after hijrat)

Fuzail Ibne Marzuq:

Ibne Hajar Asqalani says:

فضيل بن مرزوق الأغر بالمعجمة والراء الرقاشي الكوفي أبو عبد الرحمن صدوق

Al Asqalani Al Shafeii, Ahmad Ibne Ali Ibne Hajar Abu Al Fazl (deceased in 852 after hijrat), Taqrib Al Tahzib, vol. 1, p 448, number 5437, researcher: Muhammad Awama, publisher: Dar Al Rashid, Syria, first edition, 1406 after hijrat

Ibrahim Ibne Al Hassan:

Abu Hatam Ibne Haban says:

إبراهيم بن حسن بن حسن بن علي بن أبي طالب أخو عبد الله الهاشمي من سادات أهل المدينة وجلة أهل البيت مات بالمدينة.

Al Tamimi Al Basti, Muhammad Ibne Habban Ibne Ahmad Ibne Abu Hatam (deceased in 354 after hijrat), Mashahir Ulamaa Al Amsar, vol. 1, p 127, number 995, publisher: House of Scientific Books, Beirut, 1959, researcher: M. Falayoshahmar

Fateme Bint Ali:

Ibne Hajar Asqalani says:

فاطمة بنت علي بن أبي طالب ثقة من الرابعة

Al Asqalani Al Shafeii, Ahmad Ibne Ali Ibne Hajar Abu Al Fazl (deceased in 852 after hijrat), Taqrib Al Tahzib, vol. 1, p 751, number 8654, researcher: Muhammad Awama, publisher: Dar Al Rashid, Syria, first edition, 1406 after hijrat

Fourth Revayat:

Thalabi says:

Ali (AS) was with the holy Prophet. Oracle was being sent to the holy Prophet. It was so heavy for the holy Prophet that Ali (AS) covered the holy Prophet with his robe and this situation continued until the sunset or some time near that. The holy Prophet returned to his normal status and asked Ali (AS) “Have you said prayer?” He replied “No”. The holy Prophet said praying “O, God! Return the sun for Ali”. The sun rose to the extent that half of the mosque was lit by the sun.

Al Thalabi, Fi Qisas Al Anbiya, p 340

Fifth Revayat:

The holy Prophet was sleeping while his head was on Ali’s leg and he had not said his afternoon salat. The sun set. When the holy Prophet woke up, he prayed for return of the sun and so it happened. Ali said his salat and it set again.

Al Soyuti, Jalal Al Din Abdul Rahman Ibne Abi Bakr (deceased in 911 after hijrat), Al Khasais Al Kubra, vol. 2, p 137, publisher: House of Scientific Books, Beirut, 1405 after hijrat

Ali Ibne Muhammad Fath Al Din Al Hanafi (deceased in 1371 after hijrat), Falak Al Nijat Fi Al Imama wa Salat, p 193, publisher: Dar Al Islam Institute, 1997

Abu Huraira says “Hassan Ibne Ali was with his grandfather, the holy Prophet, one night. The holy Prophet loved him so much. He said ‘I want to go to my mother’. I said ‘I will accompany him’. The Prophet said ‘No, there is no need to that’. A light descended from the sky and Hassan went home under that light.

Al Soyuti, Jalal Al Din Abdul Rahman Ibne Abi Bakr (deceased in 911 after hijrat), Al Khasais Al Kubra, vol. 2, p 137, publisher: House of Scientific Books, Beirut, 1405 after hijrat

Part 3: Sunni Scholars’ Admission to accuracy of Hadith of “Return of the Sun”

Badr Al Din Al Ayni writes about the hadith:

Ahmad Ibne Salih had said that “For those who seek knowledge, it is not suitable to ignore the hadith which is quoted by Asma Bint Umais. That is because this hadith is among the greatest signs and evidences of prophecy”.

He also had said “The hadith of ‘Return of the Sun’ had been quoted through several quotations and its narrators are all reliable and Ibne Jowzi’s criticism over this hadith cannot be accepted”.

Al Aini, Badr Al Din Abu Muhammad Mahmud Ibne Ahmad Al Qitabi Al Hanafi (deceased in 855 after hijrat), Umda Al Qari Sharh Sahih Al Bukhari, vol. 15, p 43, publisher: Dar Al Ihya Al Turath Al Arabi, Beirut

Qazi Ayyaz also has quoted the same matter from Ahmad Ibne Salih.

Al Qazi Ayyaz, Abu Al Fazl Ayyaz Ibne Musa Ibne Ayyaz Al Yahsabi Al Sibti (deceased in 544), Kitab Al Shifa, vol. 1, p 215

Ansari writes about the hadith of “Return of the Sun” that:

The hadith of “Return of the Sun” is fixed and approved. If this return had no use and reason and time did not change, he would not return the Sun.

Al Ansari Al Andolosi, Abu Abdullah Shams Al Din Muhammad Ibne Ahmad (deceased in 671 after hijrat), Al Tazkirah Be Ahwal Al Muta wa Umur Al Akhirah, p 14

Qazi Ayyaz writes about two hadiths of “Return of the Sun” which are quoted by Tahawi:

These two hadiths are proved to be true and their narrators are reliable people.

Al Qazi Ayyaz, Abu Al Fazl Ayyaz Ibne Musa Ibne Ayyaz Al Yahsabi Al Sibti (deceased 544), Al Shifa Betarif Hoquq Al Mustafa, vol. 1, p 215, researcher: Allama Ahmad Ibne Muhammad Ibne Muhammad Al Shamni

Mannawi writes about hadith of “Return of the Sun”:

Ibne Jowzi made a mistake to consider this hadith as an accurate one.

Al Manawi, Muhammad Ibne Abdul Rauf Ibne Ali Ibne Zein Al Abedin (deceased in 1031 after hijrat), Fiez Al Taqdir Sharh Al Jame Al Saqir, vol. 5, p 440, publisher: Al Tijariya Al Kubra School, Egypt, first edition, 1356 after hijrat

Heithami mentioned the hadith of “Return of the Sun” as a “dignity of Amir Al Mumenin (Imam Ali (AS)) and writes about it:

Tahawi and Qazi had considered this hadith true and Abu Zare called it fine and this that some called it invalid is rejected by them.

Al Heithami, Abu Al Abbas Ahmad Ibne Muhammad Ibne Ali Ibne Hajar (deceased in 973 after hijrat), Al Sawaiq Al Muhraqa Ala Ahl Al Rafz wa Al Zilal wa Al Zandaqa, vol. 2, p 376, number 376, researcher: Abdul Rahman Ibne Abdullah Al Turki and Kamil Muhammad Al Kharrat, publisher: Al Risalat Institute, Lebanon, first edition, 1417 after hijrat

Huzrami Shafeii writes about the reference of this hadith:

The hadith of “Return of the Sun” has been quoted by Tahawi with two accurate references.

Al Hazrami Al Shafeii, Muhammad Ibne Omar Buhraq (deceased in 930 after hijrat), Hadaiq Al Anwar wa Matali Al Asrar fi Sira Al Nabi Al Mukhtar, vol. 1, p 140, publisher: Dar Al Hawi, Beirut, 1998, first edition, researcher: Muhammad Qassan Nassuh Azqul

Soyuti in correction of the hadith of “Return of the Sun” writes:

Ibne Mande, Ibne Shahin, and Tabarani quote Asma Bint Umais with references which are valid according to Sahih Bukhari that the holy Prophet was receiving oracles while his head was on Ali’s legs.

Al Soyuti, Jalal Al Din Abdul Rahman Ibne Abi Bakr (deceased in 911 after hijrat), Al Khasais Al Kubra, vol. 2, p 137, publisher: House of Scientific Books, Beirut, 1405 after hijrat

Ibne Hajar Al Heithami considers the hadith of “Return of the Sun” as a significant dignity for Imam Ali (AS) and writes about it:

One of dignities of Imam Ali (AS) is that the sun rose for his sake while it had set. It was because while the holy Prophet was receiving oracle, his head was on Imam

Ali's leg and did not wake up before the sun set. Ali (AS) could not say his afternoon salat in such condition. The holy Prophet returned to his normal status when the sun had set and found out that Ali could not say his afternoon salat. When the holy Prophet understood what went on, he started praying and said "O, God! Ali was obeying you and your Prophet. So return the Sun so that he may say his salat". His pray came true and the Sun rose while it had set before.

Ibne Hajar says that the hadith of "Return of the Sun" is among the hadiths whose reference had been considered true by Tahawi and also Qazi in his *Al Shafa* had considered its reference as true. Sheikh Al Islam Abu Zare considered its reference as fine and others have followed his in this. He goes on to say that Sibte Ibne Jowzi quoted some famous Iraqi narrators who said that "We saw that 'Abu Mansoor Muzaffar Ibne Ardeshir Qubawi Waiz" gave a lecture after the afternoon salat and spoke about the hadith of "Return of the Sun". He used very beautiful words and along with that, he talked about virtues of Ahle Bait. Meanwhile, a dark cloud covered the face of the sun. It was so dark that people thought the sun had set. At this moment, Abu Mansoor stood up and pointed to the sun and sang these lines:

You, Sun! Do not set while my praise for the tribe of Mustafa and his seeds had not finished. Control your movements and if you, like me, praise them, do not forget that you should stop for their sake and do not intend to set. If your pause was because of the Master (Imam Ali (AS)), so you have to stop for the sake of his seeds!"

The attendants who have heard about the story say that it did not take long that the cloud faded and the sun shone again".

Al Heithami, Abu Al Abbas Ahmad Ibne Muhammad Ibne Ali Ibne Hajar (deceased in 973 after hijrat), *Al Sawaiq Al Muhraqa Ala Ahl Al Rafz wa Al Zilal wa Al Zandaqa*, vol. 2, p 376, number 376, researcher: Abdul Rahman Ibne Abdullah Al Turki and Kamil Muhammad Al Kharrat, publisher: Al Risalat Institute, Lebanon, first edition, 1417 after hijrat

Part Four: Criticism and Analysis of Doubts

The virtue which is proved by hadith of "Return of the Sun" is among supremacy and significance of Imam Ali (AS). None of other companions of the holy Prophet enjoyed such virtue and even could make a one like that for them. So it is a reason for them to pose doubts about that and try to question such a great virtue.

Ibne Jowzi after quoting this hadith writes about the narrators of this hadith:

This hadith, without any doubt, is fake and unrest of its narrators is clear. Ahmad Ibne Dawoud is weak and Dar Qatani had said that he could not quote hadith anymore. Ibne Haban said he would coin hadiths. Ammar Ibne Matar quoted false hadiths from Thaqat and Ibne Udai banned him from quoting hadith. And also Fuzail Ibne Marzuq was weakened by Yahya. Ibne Haban said that Fuzail quoted false revayats and made mistake about the revayat of Theqa. His revayat from Fateme Bint Ali was fasle. Abdurrahman Ibne Sharik quotes his father who said from the view of Abu Hatam Razi he had quoted false hadiths, though I do not accuse him of such mistake. But Ibne Uqda is Rafizi (Shiite) and has quoted disadvantages from the companions.

Al Qarshi, Abu Al Faraj Abdul Rahman Ibne Ali Ibne Muhammad (deceased in 597 after hijrat), Al Mowzuat, vol. 1, p 266, publisher: House of Scientific Books, Beirut, 1415 after hijrat, first edition, researcher: Towfiq Hamdan

Analysis:

If hadith of “Return of the Sun” was quoted only through one channel, Abu Al Faraj’s criticism could be acceptable, while this hadith had been quoted through different channels. One of them is Fateme Bint Ali’s hadith from Asma which was criticized by Abu Al Faraj and Ibne Timiye.

Those who were criticized by Ibne Jowzi were praised by famous scholars and we referred to those scholars in our studies. But here we mention some of them for more emphasis.

Ibne Haban writes about characteristics of Ahmad Ibne Dawoud:

كان حافظا متقنا

Al Tamimi Al Bisti, Muhammad Ibne Habban Ibne Ahmad Abu Hatam (deceased in 354 after hijrat), Sahih Ibne Habban Be Tartib Ibne Balban, vol. 8, p 10, number 12044, researcher: Shuaib Al Arneut, publisher: Al risala Institute, Beirut, third edition, 1414 after hijrat

Zahabi says about Ahmad Ibne Dawoud Ibne Mousa:

قال ابن يونس: أحمد بن داود ثقة.

Al Zahabi, Shams Al Din Muhammad Ibne Ahmad Ibne Othman (deceased in 748 after hijrat), Tarikh Al Islam wa Wafiyat Al Mashahir wa Al Aalam, vol. 21, p 57, number 4, researcher: Dr. Omar Abdul Islam Tadmari, publisher: House of Arabic Books, Beirut, first edition, 1407 (after hijrat)

Ibne Hajar Asqalani says:

وقال يوسف بن الحجاج...عمار بن مطر ثقة.

Al Asqalani Al Shafeii, Ahmad Ibne Ali Ibne Hajar Abu Al Fazl (deceased in 852 after hijrat), Lisan Al Mizan, vol. 4, p 275

Ibne Hajar writes about Abdurrahman:

Abdurrahman Ibne Sharik Ibne Abdullah Nakhai is honest.

Al Asqalani Al Shafeii, Ahmad Ibne Ali Ibne Hajar Abu Al Fazl (deceased in 852 after hijrat), Taqrib Al Tahzib, vol. 1, p 342, number 3893, researcher: Muhammad Awama, publisher: Dar Al Rashid, Syria, first edition, 1406 after hijrat

Analysis of Ibne Jowzi's Theory in Sunni Scholars' View:

1- Ibrahim Ibne Muhammad Ajlooni after quoting Ahmad Ibne Hanbal and Ibne Jowzi who said this hadith is fake, writes:

Ahmad said that this hadith does not have any basis and Ibne Jowzi said that hadith of "Return of the Sun" is fake. This is wrong. Because of that, Soyuti says "Ibne Mande and Ibne Shahin quoted this hadith from Asma Bint Umais and their reference is fine and Tahawi and Qazi Ayyaz considered it as an accurate hadith. And Qari had said "Perhaps this that the Sun returned because of Ali's order is not true, but its return because of the holy Prophet's pray is something absolute and it had been proved. It is necessary for any man of knowledge to memorize this hadith from Asma, because this hadith is a sign of prophecy. This hadith is true and its narrators are reliable and Ibne Jowzi's criticism is not acceptable".

Al Ajluni Al Jirahi, Ismail Ibne Muhammad (deceased in 1162 after hijrat), Kashf Al Khifa wa Mazil Al Ilbas Amma Ashtahar Min Al Ahadith Ala Alsenah Al Nas, vol. 1, p 255, publisher: Al Risala Institution, Beirut, fourth edition, researcher: Ahmad Al Qilash

2- Sibte Ibne Jowzi after quoting this hadith from Fateme, daughter of Imam Hussein (AS) who quoted from Asma poses a question. He says:

Someone might say that your grandfather had mentioned this hadith in the book Al Mowzuaat, in which only false hadiths could be found. So the hadith of "Return of the Sun" is false and non-original.

Also this revayat has problem with its reference. Among narrators of this hadith Ahmad Ibne Dawoud could be seen who is an unreliable person. Also Fuzail Ibne Mazruq is another person among its narrators who cannot be trusted.

Also some other narrators were considered as inaccurate such as Abdul Rahman Ibne Sharik who is doubted by Abu Hatam.

Also your grandfather had said “We accuse Ibne Uqda in quoting this hadith. That is because he is Rafezi (which means he was Shiite)”. In response to what his grandfather said, Ibne Jowzi rejected his grandfather and wrote:

My grandfather’s idea that this hadith is not original and true is an unproved claim. He has some doubt about justness of narrators of the hadith and of course the answer to that is very clear; In our revayat, none of the mentioned people were not mentioned. But this that he says “I accuse Ibne Uqda of coining this revayat” is again a false claim. Ibne Uqda was famous for his justness and he would only quote those revayats which were about virtues of Ahle Bait and he had no word for or against the companions. As a result he was entitled Shiite...

Sibt Ibne Jowzi, Shams Al Din Abu Al Muzaffar Yusuf ibne Farqali Ibne Abdullah Al Bagdadi (deceased in 654 after hijrat), Tazkira Al Khawas, p 54, Ahle Bait Institute, Beirut, 1401

3- Shahab Al Din Khafaji also responds to doubts of Ibne Jowzi in the following way:

“Most of issues which are mentioned in Ibne Jowzi’s book are false. As Soyuti and Sakhawi said, Ibne Jowzi had presented weak and false hadiths in his book and there so many mistakes in that. Even in some cases, he has doubted about some accurate hadiths and revayats from the Sahihs”.

Musannaf considered this hadith as accurate and had said that repetition of quotation of this hadith is a reason for its accuracy. Before that, many people such as Tahawi had corrected that and proved it to be true. Others like Ibne Shahin, Ibne Mandi, and Ibne Marduye had quoted that and also Tabarani had quoted it and write about it that “It is a fine revayat”. Ad also Ibne Hajar in his Sharh Irshad writes “If the sun set and again returned, so with its return time must have reversed. Our justification is this hadith”.

Khafaji, Shahab Al Din, Nasim Al Riyadh, vol. 3, p 11

So we may conclude that quotation of hadith of “Return of the Sun” which is considered false by Abu AL Faraj Jowzi and Ibne Timiya Hurrani and named its narrators as unreliable has no problem regarding its reference according to some famous scholars approval such as those of Zahabi and Ibne Hajar Asqalani and all of them are accepted as reliable by many famous Sunni scholars. Furthermore, some of narrators of this hadith are narrators of Sahih Bukhari and Sahih Muslim. How is it possible that the same unreliable people, of course according to Abu Al Faraj and Ibne Timiya, can be trusted on in another occasion?

Also we may ask them how is it possible that if a person narrates a hadith in Sahih Bukhari and Sahih Muslim he is reliable and his narration is true, but when the same person narrates the hadith of “Return of the Sun”, he is unreliable and his narration is not acceptable!

Answer to Some Questions

1- Few Sources Have Mentioned the Hadith of “Return of the Sun”.

If such great occurrence such as return of the Sun had ever happened, no one could ever decline it. On the contrary, many may retell that due to several causes and reasons. But we see that few have quoted this occurrence and because of that the main theme is put under doubt.

In this regard Ibne Timiya writes:

If this had happened on the day of Kheybar and in presence of the army and a crowd of Muslims –which were more than one thousand and four hundred present at that time, so everyone must have seen that and it must have been narrated and retold due to different reasons. This that only one or two have retold this story is not acceptable. If the companions had narrated that, many scholars would have quoted it. But only some unknown and unreliable people have done so and they and their justice are not known to all. There is not even one document among references of this hadith that shows justice of narrators of that.

Ibne Timiye Al Hurrani, Ahmad Ibne Abd Al Halim Abu Al Abbas (deceased in 728 after hijrat), Minhaj Alsena Al Nabawiyya, vol. 8, pp. 176-7, publisher: Qartaba Institute, first edition, researcher: Dr. Muhammad Rishad Salim

Analysis

First of all, there might be several causes and motifs for hiding the truth about this hadith and even ignoring that. That is because political control of the society was with those who had a well organized program to conceal the virtues of Ahle Bait and especially Imam Ali (AS). They used all facilities and equipments, personal or public, to gain their will.

Second, this doubt might be undone by studying the story of the holy Prophet's miracle in dividing the moon into two. All interpreters agree on occurrence of this great incidence. Also there may be a very strong cause for retelling that. But we can see that the number of narrators of that incidence is not more than those of the hadith of "Return of the Sun".

Even Ibne Timiya had claimed that:

That incidence (the Prophet's miracle in dividing the moon into two parts) happened during night time, while many were sleeping.

Ibne Timiye Al Hurrani, Ahmad Ibne Abd Al Halim Abu Al Abbas (deceased in 728 after hijrat), Minhaj Alseni Al Nabawiyya, vol. 8, pp. 171, publisher: Qartaba Institute, first edition, researcher: Dr. Muhammad Rishad Salim

This claim that the miracle happened at night is basically wrong. That is because, according to Bukhari, people of Mecca asked the holy Prophet to perform a miracle and in response, the holy Prophet divided the moon into two parts.

Al Bukhari Al Jufi, Muhammad Ibne Ismail Abu Abdullah (deceased in 256 after hijrat), Sahih Bukhari, vol. 3, p 1330, hadiths 3437 and 3438, researcher: Dr. Mustafa Dib Al Baqa, publisher: Ibne Kathir publication, Al Yamama, Beirut, third edition, 1407 after hijrat

According to this narration, people of Mecca were informed about this matter and they had gathered to behold this divine miracle and some of them must have known what was going to happen and probably some of them were among members of Quraish, but again we see few have narrated that.

2- "Return of the Sun" and its Contradiction with some other Hadiths

Some had claimed that according to Sahih, the Sun stopped for no one but Prophet Joshua.

The holy Prophet said "The Sun stopped for no one but Joshua while he was travelling to Jerusalem". This hadith is quoted only by Ahmad Hanbal and no others.

Ibne Kathir Al Damishqi, Ismail Ibne Omar Al Qarshi Abu Al Fada (deceased in 774 after hijrat), Al Bidaya wa Al Nahaya, vol. 6, p 282, publisher: Al Maarif School, Beirut

So this claim that the Sun returned for Imam Ali (AS) is in contradiction with this hadith and, as a result, we could conclude that the story of return of the Sun cannot be true.

Analysis:

The story of the Prophet Joshua is about the sun's stopping and not moving, and not about its returning.

After all, the hadith says that in no era of time such a miracle had ever occurred and it happened only to Joshua until that time. But there is no word that it might or might not occur in the future. So there is no contradiction between these two hadiths, because there is difference between stopping the sun and returning it. By stopping the sun, we mean stopping it from setting and stopping its movement, but returning it is reversing its movement and bringing it back.

Therefore, to describe the difference between stopping the sun and returning that, Salehi Shami writes:

The hadith of "Return of the Sun" does not contradict with what Ahmad quoted Abu Harira through a valid reference.

Al Salihi Al Shami, Muhammad Ibne Yusif (deceased in 942 after hijrat), Sabil Al Huda wa Al Irshad fi Shira Khair Al Ibad, vol. 9, p 439, researcher: Adil Ahmad Abdul Mowjud and Ali Muhammad Muwaz, publisher: House of Scientific Books, Beirut, first edition, 1414 after hijrat

Asqalani says:

By this revayat, it is meant that to none of the Prophets before Joshua the sun had been stopped and it does not mean that it cannot stop for our Prophet.

Ibne Shahab Al Din Al Bagdadi, Zain Al Abedin Abi Al Faraj Abdul Rahman Ibne Shahab Al Din Al Bagdadi Thuma Al Damishqi famous as Ibne Rajab (deceased in 795 after hijrat), Fath Al Barri fi Sharh Sahih Al Bukhari, vol. 6, p 221, publisher: Ibne Al Jowzi publication, Al Dimam, Saudi Arabia, 1422 (after hijrat), second edition, researcher: Abu Maaz Tariq Ibne Awaz Allah Ibne Muhammad

3- Difference in Details:

The hadiths which have been quoted about return of the sun have differences regarding details and statistics of the story. It may be a reason for its being non-original and fake.

1- According to some revayats, Ali (AS) had delayed his salat while he was distributing spoils of the and according to another group, the reason for his delay was considering the holy Prophet's situation while his head was on Ali's leg.

2- In some of the revayats, it is mentioned that the holy Prophet was receiving oracle while his head was on Ali's leg and in some others it is mentioned that he was sleeping during that while.

3- In some revayats it is quoted that Return of the Sun happened during war of Kheibar, which was a place far from Medina, and in some others it is said that the sunlight lit half of the mosque.

Also there are some other differences in some other revayats.

Ibne Timiya poses this difference as a doubt about occurrence of the story of return of the sun and writes:

This revayat is in contradiction with the first one. In this revayat it is mentioned that the holy Prophet was sleeping on Ali's leg from the time of the afternoon salat to the sunset. And also this story had happened at the time of the war of Kheibar in Sahba. But in the second revayat it is said that the holy Prophet was awake and he was receiving oracle and his head was on Ali's leg while he was receiving oracle. These two quotations are in contradiction with each other and so we may conclude that it never had happened.

Ibne Timiya Al Hurrani, Ahmad Abdul Halim Abu Abbas (deceased in 728 after hijrat), Minhaj Alsena Al Nabawiya, vol. 8, pp. 172 and 175, researcher: Muhammad Rashad Salim, publisher: Qartaba Institute, first edition, 1406 after hijrat

Analysis:

Existence of some differences in narration of a story cannot mean that the whole story and its happening are fake. If we want to decide like this, many of historical and even religious rules might be put under question and doubt. That is because many of them are narrated with some differences.

In other words, many of important historical events, though have been narrated repeatedly, have some differences in their narrations and even this had happened about some obvious, great miracles such as dividing the moon into two parts by the holy Prophet. There is no doubt about the occurrence of that, but there are still some differences in details. For instance, in some the revayats it is said that the moon had been divided into two parts and each part was out over a mount. Tarmazi quotes Jubair Ibne Mutaem who quoted his father:

حدثنا عبد بن حُمَيْدٍ حدثنا محمد بن كَثِيرٍ حدثنا سُلَيْمَانُ بن كَثِيرٍ عن حُصَيْنٍ عن مُحَمَّدِ بن جُبَيْرِ بن مُطْعِمٍ عن أَبِيهِ قال أنشَقَّ الْقَمَرُ على عَهْدِ النَّبِيِّ صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ حَتَّى صَارَ فِرْقَتَيْنِ على هَذَا الْجَبَلِ وَعَلَى هَذَا الْجَبَلِ...

Al Salmi, Muhammad Ibne Isa Abu Isa (deceased in 279 after hijrat), Sunan Al Termezi, vol. 5, p 398, number 3289, researcher: Ahmad Muhammad Shakir and others, publisher: Dar Al Ihya Al Turath Al Arabi, Beirut

According the Muslim's quotation from Abdullah Ibne Masoud, when the moon was divided into two parts, half of it went to the back of the mount and the other half went in front of the mount.

حدثنا عُبَيْدُ اللهِ بن مُعَاذِ الْعُنْبَرِيِّ حدثنا أَبِي حدثنا شُعْبَةُ عن الْأَعْمَشِ عن إِبْرَاهِيمَ عن أَبِي مُعَمَّرٍ عن عَبْدِ اللهِ بن مَسْعُودٍ قال أنشَقَّ الْقَمَرُ على عَهْدِ رَسُولِ اللهِ فَلَقَّتَيْنِ فَسَنَّ الْجَبَلُ فَلَقَّةً وَكَانَتْ فَلَقَّةً فَوْقَ الْجَبَلِ فقال رسول الله اللهم أشهد.

Al Neishabouri, Muslim Ibne Al Hajjaj Abu Al Hussein Al Qashiri (deceased in 261 after hijrat), Sahih Muslim, vol. 4, p 2158, number 2800, publisher: Dar Al Ihya Al Turath Al Arabi, Beirut, researcher: Muhammad Fuad Abdul Baqi

Bukhari quotes Abdullah:

We were with the holy Prophet in Mena when the moon was divided into two parts. But there is another revayat from this person that we were in Mecca when it happened.

Al Bukhari, Muhammad Ibne Ismail Abu Abdullah Al Jufi (deceased in 256 after hijrat), Al Jami Al Sahih Al Mukhtasar, vol. 3, p 1404, publisher: Dar Ibne Kathir, Al Yamama, Beirut, 1987, third edition, researcher: Dr. Mustafa Dib Al Buqa

The question here is that although the happening of dividing the moon is accepted, then why there are so many differences about details! Is it acceptable to question the whole story because of some differences in narration?

The truth is those who narrate an occurrence vary regarding their intellect and their purpose of narration. Many of them narrate others and what they have said and try to transfer a general idea of what they said. Some memorize an occurrence with all

its details and retell that for others. Some only retell those details which are important and valuable to them. Some others just suffice in retelling the main happening and do not care about the details. This kind of differences cannot result in non-originality of the main happening, because all these revayats are talking about happening of an incidence. If there is a difference about one part of the revayats and the quotations are different about that special part, so that part cannot be trusted on and that may be put under question and not the whole story.

As well, minor differences in details about the story of return of the sun cannot result in inaccuracy of the whole story and reject of its occurrence. Although there are differences how high the sun was when it returned, but all narrations agree on one thing and it is it was so high that it was an appropriate time for afternoon salat and Ali (AS) got up and said his salat. Some may say it returned to the middle of the sky, but these are differences in narration and nothing more. But about details and characteristics of reason of Imam Ali's delay in saying salat we should say there is no contradiction. This that the holy Prophet put his head on Imam Ali's leg for receiving oracle or sleeping go with each other. We can say that the holy Prophet put his head on Imam Ali's leg and slept and during his sleeping, he was receiving oracle. So his getting up and getting conscious can be an end to his special situation of receiving oracle. That is why in some revayats first they speak about receiving oracle and in the end they talk about the Prophet's waking up.

But what is said in some revayats that Ali (AS) delayed his salat because he was distributing spoils of war, it has no contradiction with what is said in other revayats that because the holy Prophet's head was on Imam Ali's leg he did not say his afternoon salat. We may respond that distributing the spoils of war did not allow Ali to say his afternoon salat at the beginning and as soon as he went to the holy Prophet for saying salat, the holy Prophet put his head on Ali's legs and went to sleep.

Also other differences are all justifiable and they result in no contradiction.

4- Consequences of Declining “Return of the Sun”

A- Loosing Salat (Not saying that in its appropriate time)

After talking about abomination of sleeping after salat of afternoon and saying that only the Prophet's eye are shot while he is asleep and his heart is awake, Ibne Timiya writes:

If delaying salat was allowed, so Ali had committed no sin by saying his afternoon salat after the sunset. On the other hand, Ali is not superior to the holy Prophet. The holy Prophet delayed his afternoon salat on the day of war of Khandaq and said it after the sunset and the sun did not return.

And if delaying salat is forbidden, so Ali committed a great sin. It is quoted from the holy Prophet that anyone who does not say his afternoon salat, it is like he had left his assets and family.

Al Hurrani, Ahmad Ibne Abdul Halim Ibne Timiya Abu Al Abbas (deceased in 728 after hijrat), *Minhaj Al Sena Al Nabawiya*, vol. 8, p 175, publisher: Institute

Analysis

Ali's salat had not been completely forgotten. It was just delayed from its perfect time and the sun was about to set. So it was possible even in that short time to say it in the allowed time. But with the holy Prophet's pray, it returned to a position that is best for afternoon salat and Imam Ali (AS) said it in its best time.

Also, according to another group of revayats, Imam Ali (AS) said his salat and only used finger pointing for *sajde* and *roku* while the holy Prophet's head was on his leg. But when the holy Prophet woke up and prayed, the sun returned and Ali (AS) could say his salat in a normal situation and did it completely.

This matter has been pointed out in many books by great scholars of Shiites and they have emphasized over it. Some of them were mentioned earlier in this article.

Sheikh Mofid quotes some of the companions:

Asma Bint Umair, Ume Salame (the Prophet's wife), Jabir Ibne Abdullah Ansari, Abu Said Khedri, and some other companions said that one day the holy Prophet was at home and Ali (AS) was sitting with him. At this moment Gabriel came to the Prophet and started speaking to the holy Prophet. Because at the time of this contact the holy Prophet felt great heaviness, so he needed something to rely on. At this moment he put his head on Ali's knees and did not stand up until the sunset.

Imam Ali (because could not put the Prophet's head on the ground) said his afternoon salat seated and, inevitably, did his *sajde* and *roku* through finger pointing. As soon as the holy Prophet return to his normal status, he asked Ali (AS) whether he had said his afternoon salat or not. He replied "You, the messenger of God! Because of your situation and this that you were receiving divine oracle, I could not say my salat standing". The holy Prophet said "Ask God to return the sun for you, so that you can say your salat as you have some it. God will respond you, because you were obeying him and his Prophet". So Imam Ali (AS) asked God to return the sun for him and the sun returned to position which was appropriate for afternoon salat. So he said his afternoon salat twice in two different times and then the sun set again. Asma says "I swear to Allah, when the sun was setting, it made a noise like that of a saw which is being rubbed on wood".

Al Sheikh Al Mufid, Abi Abdullah Muhammad Ibne Muhammad Ibne Al Naman Al Akbari Al Bagdadi (deceased in 336 or 413 after hijrat), Li Irshad, vol. 1, p 345, researcher: Aal Al Bait Li Tahqiq Al Turath Institute, Publisher: Dar Al Mufid Li Tibaa, Beirut, Lebanon, 1414 after hijrat

B- Change in Nature

The whole universe and existence is based on and created according to order. And one way of proving existence of God is the exact order which is governing the whole universe and controls the movement of all planets and stars, including the earth and the sun. In this regard, a small change and disorder cannot be imaginable.

Here it might be claimed that this return of the sun, as it is said in the hadith, is a movement in opposition of the normal circulation of the universe and it may result disorder and problem in movement of other particles. But we see that there is no disorder and everything is fine. This, itself, is a reason that the story of return of the sun is not true.

Analysis:

There is no doubt that this incidence is a great divine miracle that happened due to the Prophet's request. It is characteristic of a miracle to be something supernatural, although it has rules of its own and there is a cause and effect relationship even in miracles. Basically, miracles are actions which are not normal and natural, but they are not against the order of existence and universe. This is why we see that stopping the sun, which happened about Joshua and it is accepted by all sects, had

no effect on universe and its order. If this change in movement of the sun was against the order of the sun and the whole universe, so the same doubt could be raised about the story of the Prophet Joshua. But we see that Sunni scholars accept that incidence and prove it to be true and in their important sources quote that. Some of them are mentioned here:

Ibne Jarir Tabari says:

Joshua was fighting the enemies with his army and this conflict continued until the sunset. Joshua did not want the war continued until tomorrow, so he turned to the sun and said “You are obeying God’s order and so am I. So please, God, return the sun for me”. The sun returned for him and daytime continued so long that the enemies were defeated and the enemies fled.

Al Tabari, Abi Jafar Muhammad Ibne Jarir (deceased in 310 after hijrat), Jami Al Bayan An Tawil Ay Al Quran, vol. 1, p 260, publisher: Dar Al Fikr, Beirut, 1405 after hijrat

Something similar to this miracle exists in the story of dividing the moon, about which there is no doubt. That great miracle must have caused disorder in the universe and nature. But it did not happen.

Bukhari quotes Anas Ibne Malik:

People of Mecca asked the holy Prophet to perform a miracle for them and the holy Prophet divided the moon into two parts.

Al Bukhari Al Jufi, Muhammad Ibne Ismail Abu Abdullah (deceased in 256 after hijrat), Sahih Al Bukhari, vol. 3, p 1330, hadith 3437, researcher: Dr. Mustafa Dib Al Buqa, publisher: Dar Ibne Kathir, Al Yamama and Beirut, third edition, 1987

In this regard, Fakhr Razi writes:

All scholars believe that the moon was cut into two parts and there are many narrations to prove it. In Sahih, there is a famous revayat which quotes the companions who said “The holy Prophet was asked to divide the moon into two parts and he asked God, then it was separated and divided into two parts ...”

Al Razi Al Shafeii, Fakhr Al Din Muhammad Ibne Omar Al Tamimi (deceased in 604 after hijrat), Al Tafsir Al Kabir Aw Mafatih Al Qaib, vol. 29, p 26, publisher: House of Scientific Books, Beirut, first edition, 2000

Conclusion

“Return of the Sun” is a divine miracle which happened with the Prophet’s pray. Such incidents, which are known as miracle, cannot be metered according to natural laws and rules. It can only be measured according to logical factors of human mind. In the first look, human reason rejects whatever which is in contradiction with natural order and law. But finally man accepts these exceptions which are called miracles and they are done through divine will. It accepts that miracle is something against the usual and natural rule and it is beyond human laws and cannot be justified and analyzed by means of human logic. Then as “dividing the moon” and “the Prophet’s ascend” caused no failure in nature and universe, so it is the same about the story of “return of the sun” and it must be accepted as an absolute divine miracle which happened about Imam Ali (AS) and it did not affect the universe and, forever, cannot be rejected.

Good Luck