

Did Amir Momenan (peace be upon him) and Hosnin (peace be upon him) defend Usman?

The group of Imam Ali (peace be upon him)

The explanation of the question:

Some claim that Amir Momenan(peace be upon him) and Hosnin(peace be upon him) had struggle with the invaders and they brought water for him and ...when Usman was surrounded.

Is this matter true? Is there this narration with valid document in this area in the Sunni and Shiite sources or not?

Answer:

Some of the Sunni scientists have narrated a narration in this area, but they have document and reason problems which we will deal with them briefly.

Only document that there is in the Sunni books about this area and proves this friendly relationship is the narration that Balazeri in the book " Ansab Al-Ashraf", IbnShebheNamiri in the book " the history of Median" and Ib n Abd Rabe in the book " Al-Aghd Al-Farid" have narrated.

The first parts of the serial have been made according to this narration whereas this narration is valid from document according to the clarification of the Sunni dignitaries.

حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ يُوسُفَ بْنِ سُلَيْمَانَ، وَأَحْمَدُ بْنُ مَنصُورِ الرَّمَادِيِّ، قَالَا : حَدَّثَنَا هِشَامُ بْنُ عَمَّارِ بْنِ نُصَيْرٍ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ عِيْسَى بْنِ سَمِيْعِ الْفَرَشِيِّ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنِي ابْنُ أَبِي ذَيْبٍ، عَنِ الزُّهْرِيِّ، عَنْ سَعِيدِ بْنِ الْمُسَيْبِ، قَالَ: أَشْرَفَ عُثْمَانُ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ عَلَى النَّاسِ وَهُوَ مَحْصُورٌ فَقَالَ : أَفِيكُمْ عَلِيٌّ؟ قَالُوا : لَا. قَالَ: أَفِيكُمْ سَعْدٌ؟ قَالُوا: لَا. فَسَكَتَ، ثُمَّ قَالَ: أَلَا أَحَدٌ يُبَلِّغُ مَاءً؟ فَبَلَغَ ذَلِكَ عَلِيًّا رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ، فَبَعَثَ إِلَيْهِ بِثَلَاثِ قَرَبٍ مَمْلُوءَةٍ، فَمَا كَادَتْ تَصِلُ إِلَيْهِ حَتَّى جُرِحَ فِي سَبَبِهَا عِدَّةٌ مِنْ مَوَالِي بَنِي هَاشِمٍ وَمَوَالِي بَنِي أُمَيَّةَ حَتَّى وَصَلَتْ إِلَيْهِ.

وَبَلَغَ عَلِيًّا رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ أَنَّ عُمَانَ يُرَادُ قَتْلَهُ، فَقَالَ: إِنَّمَا أُرَدْنَا مِنْهُ مَرْوَانَ، فَأَمَّا قَتْلُهُ فَلَا، وَقَالَ
لِلْحَسَنِ وَالْحُسَيْنَيْنِ: اذْهَبَا بِنَفْسَيْكُمَا حَتَّى تَقُومَا عَلَى بَابِ دَارِ عُمَانَ فَلَا تَدْعَا وَاحِدًا يَصِلُ إِلَيْهِ. وَبَعَثَ الزُّبَيْرَ
ابْنَهِ وَبَعَثَ طَلْحَةَ ابْنَهِ عَلَى كَرِهِ مِنْهُ، وَبَعَثَ عِدَّةً مِنْ أَصْحَابِ مُحَمَّدٍ أَبْنَاءَهُمْ يَمْنَعُونَ النَّاسَ أَنْ يَدْخُلُوا عَلَى
عُمَانَ، وَيَسْأَلُونَهُ إِخْرَاجَ مَرْوَانَ، فَلَمَّا رَأَى ذَلِكَ مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ أَبِي بَكْرٍ وَرَمَى النَّاسُ فِيهِمْ بِاللِّسَانِ حَتَّى خُضِبَ
الْحَسَنُ بِالدِّمَاءِ عَلَى بَابِهِ، وَأَصَابَ مَرْوَانَ سَهْمٌ وَهُوَ فِي الدَّارِ، وَخُضِبَ مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ طَلْحَةَ، وَشُخَّ قَنْبَرٌ.
وَخَشِيَ مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ أَبِي بَكْرٍ أَنْ يَعْضَبَ بَنُو هَاشِمٍ لِحَالِ الْحَسَنِ وَالْحُسَيْنَيْنِ فَ أَخَذَ بِيَدِ رَجُلَيْنِ، وَقَالَ
لَهُمَا: إِنْ جَاءَتْ بَنُو هَاشِمٍ فَرَأَوْا الدِّمَاءَ عَلَى وَجْهِ الْحَسَنِ كَشَفُوا النَّاسَ عَنْ عُمَانَ، وَبَطَلْ مَا تُرِيدَانِ، وَلَكِنْ
مُرًّا بِنَا حَتَّى نَنْسُورَ عَلَيْهِ الدَّارَ، فَنَقْتُلُهُ مِنْ غَيْرِ أَنْ يَعْلَمَ بِنَا أَحَدٌ.
فَنَسُورَ مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ أَبِي بَكْرٍ وَصَاحِبِيَهُ مِنْ دَارِ رَجُلٍ مِنَ الْأَنْصَارِ حَتَّى دَخَلُوا عَلَى عُمَانَ، وَمَا يَعْلَمُ
أَحَدٌ مِمَّنْ كَانَ مَعَهُ؛ لِأَنَّ كُلَّ مَنْ كَانَ مَعَهُ كَانَ فَوْقَ الْبُيُوتِ، فَلَمْ يَكُنْ مَعَهُ إِلَّا امْرَأَتُهُ. فَقَالَ لَهُمَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ
أَبِي بَكْرٍ: مَكَانِكُمَا حَتَّى أُبْدَأَ بِالدُّخُولِ، فَإِذَا أَنَا خَبَطْتُهُ فَادْخُلَا فَنُوجِئَاهُ حَتَّى نَقْتُلَاهُ.
فَدَخَلَ مُحَمَّدٌ فَأَخَذَ بِلِحْيَتِهِ، فَقَالَ لَهُ عُمَانُ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ " أَمَا وَاللَّهِ لَوْ رَأَى أَبُوكَ لَسَاءَهُ مَكَانَكَ
مِثِّي ". فَتَرَاخَتْ يَدُهُ، وَحَمَلَ الرَّجُلَانِ عَلَيْهِ فَوَجَّاهُ حَتَّى قَتَلَاهُ، وَخَرَجُوا هَارِبِينَ مِنْ حَيْثُ دَخَلُوا، وَصَرَخَتْ
امْرَأَتُهُ فَلَمْ يُسْمَعْ صُرَاخُهَا لِمَا فِي الدَّارِ مِنَ الْجَلْبَةِ، فَصَعَدَتْ امْرَأَتُهُ إِلَى النَّاسِ فَقَالَتْ: إِنَّ أَمِيرَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ قَدْ
قُتِلَ.

فَدَخَلَ الْحَسَنُ وَالْحُسَيْنُ وَمَنْ كَانَ مَعَهُمَا فَوَجَدُوا عُمَانَ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ مَذْبُوحًا فَأَنْكَبُوا عَلَيْهِ
يَبْكُونَ، وَخَرَجُوا، وَدَخَلَ النَّاسُ فَوَجَدُوهُ مَقْتُولًا، وَبَلَغَ عَلِيًّا الْخَبْرَ وَطَلْحَةَ وَالزُّبَيْرَ وَسَعَدًا
بِالْمَدِينَةِ، فَخَرَجُوا، وَقَدْ ذَهَبَتْ عُقُولُهُمْ لِلْخَبَرِ الَّذِي أَتَاهُمْ، حَتَّى دَخَلُوا عَلَيْهِ فَوَجَدُوهُ مَذْبُوحًا، فَاسْتَرْجَعُوا.
وَقَالَ عَلِيُّ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ لِابْنَيْهِ: كَيْفَ قُتِلَ وَأَنْتُمَا عَلَى الْبَابِ؟ وَطَمَّ الْحَسَنُ وَضَرَبَ الْحُسَيْنُ،
وَسَتَمَّ مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ طَلْحَةَ، وَلَعَنَ عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ الزُّبَيْرِ، وَخَرَجَ وَهُوَ غَضَبَانُ يَرَى أَنَّ طَلْحَةَ أَعَانَ عَلَى مَا كَانَ
مِنْ أَمْرِ عُمَانَ فَلَقِيَهُ طَلْحَةُ، فَقَالَ: مَا لَكَ يَا أَبَا الْحَسَنِ ضَرَبْتَ الْحَسَنَ وَالْحُسَيْنَيْنِ؟ فَقَالَ: عَلَيْكَ لعنةُ اللَّهِ الْأَ
يَسُوءُنِي ذَلِكَ يُقْتَلُ أَمْ يَرُ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ، رَجُلٌ مِنْ أَصْحَابِ مُحَمَّدٍ بَدْرِيٌّ لَمْ تَقُمْ عَلَيْهِ بَيْنَهُ وَلَا حُجَّةٌ !! فَقَالَ

طَلْحَةُ: لَوْ دَفَعَ إِلَيْنَا مَرْوَانَ لَمْ يُقْتَلَ. فَقَالَ عَلِيُّ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ: لَوْ أَخْرَجَ إِلَيْكُمْ مَرْوَانَ لُقِنَلَا قَبْلَ أَنْ تَنْبُتَ عَلَيْهِ حُكُومَةٌ.

It has been narrated from Saeid Ben Mosib that when Usman was surrounded, he talked to the people from the roof of the house and asked " is Ali among you?" they said " no". He asked " is Sad among you?" they said " no". Then he said nothing more. Afterwards, he asked " Is there any one among you to give me water?" Imam Ali (peace be upon him) informed of this news. Then he sent three goatskins full of water. Usman received the water after some of servants of Bani Hashem and servants of Bani Omaye wounded.

Imam Ali (peace be upon him) informed that they wanted to kill Usman. Then he said " we want Marvan from him, but we do not want to kill him. He bade to Hasan and Hussein (peace be upon him) " go and stand in the front of the house of Usman and do not let anyone hurt him. Zobeir and Talhe sent their sons, but the son of Talhe was sad of this action. Some of the companions of Hazrat Muhammad (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) sent their children so that they do not let the people enter the house of Usman and they want him to let Marvan leave there. Muhammad Ben Abi Bakr saw the people shooting them. Imam Hasan (peace be upon him) covered with blood in the house. Marvan was shot in the house; Muhammad Ben Talhe became colorful from blood and the head of Ghanbar broke. Muhammad Ben Abi Bakr scared that Bani Hashem tribe would be angry because of the situation of Imam Hasan (peace be upon him) and Imam Hussein (peace be upon him). Hence, he held their hands and said to them

If the Bani Hashem tribe comes and see blood on the face of Imam Hasan (peace be upon him), they will become sad. Therefore, they will prevent the people from reaching to Usman and you will not achieve to your purpose. Let's climb the wall and kill him without awareness of any one. Then Muhammad Ben Abi Bakr and his two companions climbed the wall of house of a man from Anasr and entered the house of Usman. None of the companions of Usman knew that they were into the house because all of his companions were on the roof and only the wife of Usman was there. Muhammad Ben Abi Bakr said to his two companions " stay there; at first I will enter and when I put him under my hands

and feet and hit him, you enter and hit him until he dies.

Muhammad Ben Abi Bakr entered the house and pulled the beard of Usman. Usman said to him " I swear God that if your father saw you, he would die because you are bothering me. Muhammad stopped bothering him. Those two persons invaded him and they hit him as much as they killed him and they ran away from the way that they had come while they had scared. The wife of Usman screamed, but no one heard her voice. The wife of Usman went to the people and said

The leader of the faithful was killed. Then Hassan, Hussein and their troops entered and they saw Usman killed. Imam Ali (peace be upon him), Talhe, Zobeir, Sad and other people of Median informed of this news. While they had lost their mind with hearing this news, they left their houses and entered the house of Usman. They saw him killed and said

«انا لله وإنا اليه راجعون»

Imam Ali (peace be upon him) said to his two children " how was he killed when you were in front of him?". They slapped Hasan and hit Hussein. Moreover, they abused Muhammad Ben Talhe and cursed Abdullah Ben Zobeir.

Imam Ali (peace be upon him) left the house as he was angry. He thought Talhe cooperated in killing Usman. Talhe faced Hazrat Ali (peace be upon him) and said " O' Abu Al-Hasan! Why have you beaten up Hasan and Hussein?" Imam Ali (peace be upon him) bade " the curse of God be upon you; why shouldn't I be sad? While the leader of the faithful has been killed. he was one of the companions of the messenger of God and one of participants of the Badr War and they killed him without any reasons". Talhe said " if had given us Marvan, he would not have been killed". Imam Ali (peace be upon him) bade " if he had given Marvan to you, he would have been killed before his government was established and entered his house".

Al-Namiri Al-Basri, Abu Zeid Omar IbnShebe (died in 262 Hejira) History of Medina; v 2 p 301; no 2363; researched by: Ali Muhammad Dandel and YasinSaad Al-Din Bayan; published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie; Beirut; 1417 Hejira; 1996

-Al-Balazeri, Ahmad IbnYahyaIbnJaber (died in 279 Hejira) Ansab Al-Shraf; v 2 p 284; According to Al-Jame Al-Kabir;

-Al-Andolesi, Ahmad Ibn Muhammad IbnAbdRebe (died in 328 Hejira) Al-Aghd Al-Farid; v 4 p 273; published by: Dar Ehya Al-Toras Al-Arabi; Beirut; Lebanon; Third Edition; 1420 Hejira; 1999.

The first point: the document of the narration is weak.

The main problem in the document of this narration is Muhammad Ben Isa Ben Samie that has been weakened by some of the Sunni scientists and they have said " he has cheated in the document of this narration. Additionally, they have attributed that narration that has been heard from a weak person to IBn Abi Zaeb in order to cover the weakness of the narration.

After narrating this narration,Namiri has said

وَهَذَا حَدِيثٌ كَثِيرٌ التَّخْلِيصُ، مُنْكَرُ الإِسْنَادِ لَا يُعْرَفُ صَاحِبُهُ الَّذِي رَوَاهُ عَنِ ابْنِ أَبِي ذَنْبٍ، وَأَمَّا ابْنُ

أَبِي ذَنْبٍ وَمَنْ فَوْقَهُ فَأَفْوِيَاءُ.

Falsiy and honesty have been mixed in this Hadith and its document is unacceptable. The narrator that has narrated it from AbiZaeb is not known. But Abi Zaeb and narrators that more superior than him are professional.

Al-Namiri Al-Basri, Abu Zeid Omar Ibn Shebe (died in 262 Hejira) History of Medina; v 2 p 301; no 2363; researched by: Ali Muhammad Dandel and YasinSaad Al-Din Bayan; published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie; Beirut; 1417 Hejira; 1996

Ibrahim Ben Muhammad Torabelsi has mentioned the name of Muhammad Ben Isa Ben Samieas cheaters and he has said clearly that he has not heard this narration from IbnAbiZaeb, but he has heard it from someone else that was weak

د س ق محمد بن عيسى بن سميع ذكر بن حبان ك انه روى حديث مقتل عثمان عن بن أبي ذئب

ولم سمعه منه إنما سمعه عن إسماعيل بن يحيى أحد الضعفاء عنه وكذلك قال صالح بن محمد وغيره.

Muhammad Ben Isa BenSamieIbnHaban has said that he has narrated the narration of killing Usman from IbnAbiZaeb whereas he has not heard the narration from him. But he has heard it from Ismaeil Ben Yahya that is one of weak narrators. Saleh Ben Muhammad and others have said this remark as well.

Al-Halbi Al-Terablosi, Abu Al-VafaEbrahimIbn Muhammad IbnSebtIbn Al-Ajmi (died in 841 Hejira) Al-Tabeen Al-Asma Al-Modalesin; v 1 p 193; no 72; researched by: Muhammad EbrahimDavood Al-Movaseli; published by: Al-Ryan Institute; Beirut; First Edition; 1414 Hejira; 1994

It is interesting that the Sunni dignitaries have considered cheating as the brother of lie and they have highly disapproved it.

Khatib Baghdadi, one of Sunni famous scientists, has said about the rule of cheating

. سمعت الشافعي يقول قال شعبة بن الحجاج التدليس أخو الكذب ... قال ثنا غندر قال سمعت

شعبة يقول: التدليس في الحديث أشد من الزنا ولأن أسقط من السماء أحب الي من ان ادلس ... سمعت

المعافي يقول سمعت شعبة يقول لأن أزني أحب الي من ادلس ... سمعت الحسن بن علي يقول سمعت أبا

أسامة يقول خرب الله بيوت المدلسين ما هم عندي الا كذابون.

I heard that Shafei said " Shoabe Ben Hojaj said " cheating is the brother of lie". Ghandar has said " I heard that Shoabe said "cheating is worse than adultery in Hadith. If I fall from the sky, it will be better than cheating for me". I heard that Shoabe said " if I commit adultery, it will be better than cheating for me". I heard that Aba Asame said " God destroys the house of Modlesin; in my opinion, they are only liars".

Al-Baghdadi, Abubakr Ahmad Ibn Ali IbnSabet Al-Khatib (died in 463 Hejira) Al-Kefayat Fi Elm Al-Revayat v 1 p 355-356; researched by: Abu Abdullah Al-Sureghi; EbrahimHamdi Al-Madani; published by: Al-Maktabat Al-Elmie; Al-Medina

Hence, Muhammad Ben Isa Ben Samie was one of cheaters. He has heard this narration from one of weak narrators and he has attributed it to IbnAbiZaeb as a lie in order to cover the weakness of its document.

Consequently, the story that Amir Momenan (peace be upon him) brought water for Usman, the defense of BaniHashem, Imam Hasan (peace be upon him)and Imam Hussein (peace be upon him) from Usman, the injury of Imam Hasan in order to defend Usman and ... are all lie.

The second point: considerable points in this narration:

Considerable matters have been said in this narration; some of them have not been presented by the Sunni scientists and the falsities of others are as clear as daylight.

In addition, it has been said that Amir Momenan (peace be upon him) abused Muhammad Ben Talhe and he also cursed Abdullah Ben Zobeir and Talhe Ben Ubeidullah.

If Amir Momenan(peace be upon him) had cursed Talhe and Abdullah Ben Zobeir whereas both of them were as companions why the Sunni would scientists have supported both of them so much?

It has been said in this narration that Amir Momenan (peace be upon him) had cooperated in killing Usman.

These matters have a lot of cost for the beliefs of the Sunni scientists; they have undone all of their texture and they will falsify the basis of their beliefs about the fairness of all companions.

Can Talhe that cooperated in killing Usman be fair?

It has also been said that Muhammad Ben AbiBakr took part in the murder of Usman and he was agent whereas the Sunni scientists claim that he had no role in it and even when he informed of killing Usman, he became sad so much and invaded the murderers of Usman.

In this narration, there are no sign of Abdullah Ben Saba and his miracles whereas Wahhabi people claim that he had the main role in killing Usman.

The third point: Amir Momenan (peace be upon him) sheltered the innocent persons that were in the house of Usman not Usman.

Even we suppose that Amir Momenan (peace be upon him) had sent his children in order to defend the house of Usman or Hazrat Ali had brought water

when the companions had not given water to him...however, would all of these actions have been for defending and giving water to Usman?

There is no question that there were wives, servants and children in the house of Usman that had no role in the actions of Usman. Hence, they should have not been burnt and hurt and killed of thirsty due to the sin of Usman. Amir Momenan (peace be upon him) had tried to save them and to give water to the innocent persons not because of Usman Ben Afan.

It is interesting that there is a narration with valid document in the Sunni sources that proves this matter. Um Al-Momenin Um Habibe, the dear wife of the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) that was from Bani Omaye Tribe came to save the surrounded persons and he requested Amir Momenan (peace be upon him) to shelter the surrounded persons. Imam Ali (peace be upon him) bade firmly " all of the surrounded persons are in your shelter except Usman and Saeid Ben Al-As.

The origin of the narration:

Ibn Shebhe Namiri has written in the history of Median

. حَدَّثَنَا مُوسَى بْنُ إِسْمَاعِيلَ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا يُوسُفُ بْنُ الْمَاجِشُونِ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنِي أَبِي، أَنَّ أُمَّ حَبِيبَةَ زَوْجِ

النَّبِيِّ (ص) وَرَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهَا حِينَ حُصِرَ عُثْمَانُ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ حُمِلَتْ حَتَّى وَضِعَتْ بَيْنَ يَدَيَّ عَلِيٍّ

رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ فِي خِدْرِهَا وَهُوَ عَلَى الْمِنْبَرِ، فَقَالَتْ: " أَجْرُ لِي مَنْ فِي الدَّارِ ". قَالَ: نَعَمْ إِلَّا نَعْتَلًا وَشَقِيًّا،

قَالَتْ: " فَوَاللَّهِ مَا حَاجَتِي إِلَّا عُثْمَانَ، وَسَعِيدُ بْنُ الْعَاصِ ". قَالَ: مَا إِلَيْهِمَا سَبِيلٌ. قَالَتْ: " مَلَكْتَ يَا ابْنَ أَبِي

طَالِبٍ فَأَسْجِحْ "، قَالَ: أَمَا وَاللَّهِ مَا أَمْرُكَ اللَّهُ وَلَا رَسُولُهُ.

Majeshun has narrated that when Usman was surrounded, Um Habibe, the wife of the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) came to Imam Ali (peace be upon him) and when he was sermonizing, he said " persons that were in the house of Usman put in my house". He bade " except Nasal (the Jewish old man(implication from Usman) and Shaghi (implication from Saeid Ben Al-As).

Um Habibe said my main purpose is both of them. He bade " you cannot free those two persons". Um Habibe said " forgive the son of Abu Talebi". Amir

Momenan (peace be upon him) bade " I swear God that God and his messenger have not ordered to you such thing".

Al-Namiri Al-Basri, Abu Zeid Omar IbnShebe (died in 262 Hejira) History of Medina; v 2 p 219; no 2019; researched by: Ali Muhammad Dandel and YasinSaad Al-Din Bayan; published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie; Beirut; 1417 Hejira; 1996

Analyzing the document of the narration:

The document of this narration is completely valid and all of its narrators are reliable. To prove this matter, we have to analyze each and every narration:

Abu Salame, Musa Ben Ismaeil:

He is considered as one of masters of Muhammad Ben IsmaeilBokhari as Zahabi has written about his biography

موسى بن إسماعيل أبو سلمة التبوذكي الحافظ عن شعبة وهمام وخلق وعنه البخاري وأبو داود

وابن الضريس وابن أبي عاصم سبطه قال عباس الدوري كتبنا عنه خمسة وثلاثين ألف حديث قلت ثقة

ثبت مات 223 ع

Musa Ben Ismaeil was Hafez (he has memorized a hundred Hadiths). He has narrated from Shae and ...Bokhari, Abu Davud and ...have heard Hadith from him. AbasDuri has said " I wrote 35000 Hadiths from him. I (Zahabi) say " he is reliable".

Al-Zahabi Al-Shafei, Shams Al-Din Abu Abdullah Muhammad Ibn Ahmad Ibn Osman (died in 748 Hejira) Al-Kashef Fi Marefat Fi Min La Revayat Fi Al-Kotob Al-Sette v 2 p 301; no 5677; researched by: Muhammad Avame; published by: Dar Al-Ghebe Al-Seghat Al-Islami; OlovInstitue; First Edition; 1413 Hejira; 1992

Yusef Ben Yaghub:

He is one of the narrators of Bokhari, Mosalam, Termezi, Nasaei and IbnMaje. Zahabi has written about him

يوسف بن يعقوب بن أبي سلمة الماجشون أبو سلمة المدني عن أبيه والمقبري والزهرى وعنه أحمد
ومسدد ثقة مات 185 خ م ت س ق

Yusef Ben Yaghub has narrated a narration from his father, Zahri and Maghbari. Ahmad Ben Hanbel has narrated from him and he is reliable.

Al-Kashef v 2 p 402; no 6459

Yaghub Ben Abi Salame:

He was one of narrators of Sahih Mosalam, Abu Davud, Termezi and Ibn Maje. Ibn Hajar Asghalani has written about his biography

يعقوب بن أبي سلمة الماجشون التيمي مولا هم أبو يوسف المدني صدوق من الرابعة مات بعد العشرين م د ت ق

Yaghub Ben Abi Salame was honest.

Taghrib Al-Tahzib v 1 p 608; no 7819

The important point in this narration is that Amir Momenan (peace be upon him) remembered him as Nasal. It is a title that most of the companions have remembered Usman with it.

Nasal was a Jewish tall, ugly and stupid man; whenever they wanted to make a fool of someone, they used his name.

The fourth point: Amir Momenan (peace be upon him) swore that he would not defend Usman?

There are narrations in the Sunni sources that when Usman accused Amir Momenan (peace be upon him) that he was the writer of the letter to the and guardian of Hazrat Ali, he swore that he would not defend Usman until he would face to him in the presence of God.

IbnShebheNamiri has narrated two narrations in the book " the history of Medina" about this matter

The first narration:

حَدَّثَنَا عَمْرُو بْنُ الْحُبَابِ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا عَبْدُ الْمَلِكِ بْنُ هَارُونَ بْنُ عَنَّتْرَةَ، عَنْ أَبِيهِ، عَنْ جَدِّهِ، قَالَ: لَمَّا

كَانَ مِنْ أَمْرِ عُثْمَانَ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ مَا كَانَ قَدِمَ قَوْمٌ مِنْ مِصْرَ مَعَهُمْ صَحِيفَةٌ صَغِيرَةٌ الطِّيِّ، فَأَتَوْا عَلِيًّا

رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ، فَقَالُوا: إِنَّ هَذَا الرَّجُلَ قَدْ غَيَّرَ وَبَدَّلَ، وَلَمْ يَسِرْ مَسِيرَةَ صَاحِبِيهِ، وَكَتَبَ هَذَا الْكِتَابَ إِلَيَّ

عَامِلِهِ بِمِصْرَ، أَنْ خُذَ مَالَ فُلَانٍ وَأَقْتُلَ فُلَانًا وَسَيِّرْ فُلَانًا، فَأَخَذَ عَلِيُّ الصَّحِيفَةَ فَأَدْخَلَهَا عَ لِي عُثْمَانَ، فَقَالَ:

أَتَعْرِفُ هَذَا الْكِتَابَ؟ فَقَالَ: " إِنِّي لِأَعْرِفُ الْخَاتَمَ "، فَقَالَ: اكْسِرْهَا فَكَسَرَهَا.

فَلَمَّا قَرَأَهَا، قَالَ: " لَعَنَ اللَّهُ مَنْ كَتَبَهُ وَمَنْ أَمَلَاهُ ".

فَقَالَ لَهُ عَلِيُّ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ: أَنْتَهُمْ أَحَدًا مِنْ أَهْلِ بَيْتِكَ؟ قَالَ: " نَعَمْ ".

قَالَ: مَنْ تَنْهَمُ؟ قَالَ: " أَنْتَ أَوَّلُ مَنْ أَتَهُمْ "، قَالَ: فَغَضِبَ عَلِيُّ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ فَقَامَ، وَقَالَ: وَاللَّهِ لَا أَعِينُكَ وَلَا أَعِينُ عَلَيْكَ حَتَّى أَلْتَقِيَ أَنَا وَأَنْتَ عِنْدَ رَبِّ الْعَالَمِينَ

Abd Al-Molk Ben Harun from his father and his father from his grandfather has narrated that when that event happened for Usman, some people of Egypt came with a folded letter and said " this man has changed the tradition of the prophet and he never follows the path of his two friends. He has written this letter to his leader in Egypt " usurp the wealth of such and such a person; kill such and such a person and exile such and such a person. Imam Ali (peace be upon him) took the letter, came to Usman and said " do you know this letter?" he said " I know its seal". Then he said " open it". Usman opened the letter and when he read it, he said " the curse of God be for someone that has written it.

Then Imam Ali (peace be upon him) said to him " are you accusing someone from your family? He said " yes". Imam Ali (peace be upon him) asked " who are you accusing?" Usman said " you are the first accused person". The narrator said " Imam Ali (peace be upon him) became angry, stood up and said " I swear God I will not help you and I will not stand against you until you and I will meet each other in the presence of God".

Al-Namiri Al-Basri, Abu Zeid Omar IbnShebe (died in 262 Hejira) History of Medina; v 2 p 212; no 2008; researched by: Ali Muhammad Dandel and YasinSaad Al-Din Bayan; published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie; Beirut; 1417 Hejira; 1996

The second narration:

حَدَّثَنَا عَلِيُّ بْنُ مُحَمَّدٍ، عَنِ الْوَقَّاصِ، عَنْ إِبْرَاهِيمَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ سَعْدٍ، عَنْ أَبِيهِ، قَالَ : رَجَعَ أَهْلُ مِصْرَ إِلَى الْمَدِينَةِ قَبْلَ أَنْ يَصِلُوا إِلَى بِلَادِهِمْ، فَتَزَلُّوا ذَا الْمَرُورَةِ فِي آخِرِ سُؤَالٍ، وَبَعَثُوا إِلَى عَلِيِّ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ، أَنْ عُثْمَانَ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ كَانَ أَعْتَبْنَا، ثُمَّ كَتَبَ يَأْمُرُ بِقَتْلِنَا، وَبَعَثُوا بِالْكِتَابِ إِلَى عَلِيِّ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ،

فَدَخَلَ عَلِيٌّ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ عَلَى عُثْمَانَ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ بِالْكِتَابِ، فَقَالَ: مَا هَذَا يَا عُثْمَانُ؟ فَقَالَ: " الْخَطُّ خَطُّ كَاتِبِي، وَالْخَاتَمُ خَاتَمِي، وَلَا وَاللَّهِ مَا أَمَرْتُ وَلَا عَلِمْتُ "

قَالَ: " أَتَهْمُكَ وَكَاتِبِي "

فَعَضِبَ عَلِيٌّ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ، وَقَالَ: وَاللَّهِ لَا أَرُدُّ عَنْكَ أَحَدًا أَبَدًا

Ibrahim Ben Muhammad Ben Sad has narrated from his father that the Egyptian people came back and before they arrived their own cities, they entered the region of Za Al-Marve at the end of Shoval Month. They came to Imam Ali censured us, (peace be upon him) and said " Usman already and he has written a letter and has ordered to kill us. The letter was sent to Imam Ali (peace be upon him). Imam Ali with the letter came to Usman and said " O' Usman! What is this?" Usman said " this is line and line of my writer and this is my letter. But I swear God that I have not ordered it and I am not informed of it. Then he said to Imam Ali (peace be upon him)

I accuse you and my writer. Then Imam Ali (peace be upon him) became angry and said " I swear God that I never reject anyone against you (I never prevent someone that wants to hurt you)".

In addition, Abd Al-Razagh Sanaei has narrated another narration in the book " Amali" that Amir Momenan (peace be upon him) and Usman abused each other and even such abuses had not been heard until that day;

أَنَا مَعْمَرٌ، حَدَّثَنِي عَلِيُّ بْنُ زَيْدِ بْنِ جُدْعَانَ، عَنْ سَعِيدِ بْنِ الْمُسَيَّبِ، قَالَ: " شَهِدْتُ عَلِيًّا رَضِيَ اللَّهُ

عَنْهُ وَعُثْمَانَ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ اسْتَبَّ بِسَبَابِ مَا سَمِعْتُ أَحَدًا اسْتَبَّ بِمِثْلِهِ، وَلَوْ كُنْتُ مُحَدِّثًا بِهِ أَحَدًا لَحَدَّثْتُكَ بِهِ، قَالَ: ثُمَّ نَظَرْتُ إِلَيْهِمَا يَوْمًا آخَرَ فَرَأَيْتُهُمَا جَالِسَيْنِ فِي الْمَسْجِدِ، أَحَدُهُمَا يَضْحَكُ إِلَى الْآخَرَ.

It has been narrated from Saeid Ben Mosib that one day, I saw Imam Ali (peace be upon him) and Usman abusing each other which I had not seen such abuses before. And if I had told someone whatever they uttered, I would have told you as well. Then he said " on another day, I saw both of them smiling at each other in the mosque.

Al-Sanani, AbubakrAbd Al-Razagh Ibn Hemam (died in 211 Hejira) Al-Amali Fi Asar Al-Sahabe; v 1 p 70; hadith no 91; researched by: Majdi Al-Sayyed Ebrahim; published by: Maktabat Al-Quran; Cairo

In conclusion, Amir Momenan (peace be upon him), Imam Hasan (peace be upon him and Imam Hussein (peace be upon him) have not defended Usman and his house. If they had gathered around in front of his house, they would have wanted to defend innocent people and the wife and the child of Usman no Usman.

Good luck

The group in charge of answering doubts

The research Centre of HazratValiasr