

Did Abu Bakr assign Umar as his successor according to the referendum and the public votes?

The group of the Sunni scientists

This question has been come up by: Yazdan

The explanation of the question:

Abu Bakr suggested Umar as his successor in the last days of his life according to referendum and the public votes. He went to the mosque and said to the people " I have not selected any one among your relatives to be as a leader. My selected person is Umar. The people said unanimously

سمعنا و أطعنا

The biography of the second caliph by Shebeli; the face of Farugh Azam by Mola Abdullah Ahmadian; Farugh Azam by: Heikal; the complete history by: Ibn Alasir; the history by: Ibn Juzi and other history books.

Answer:

The Sunni scientists believe that the choice of caliph and successor after the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) should be left to people and say " no order has been issued from God about this matter and the prophet of the Islam (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) did not will about it. Therefore, they claim that the caliphate of Abu Bakr was according to the choice of people and the companions agreed it unanimously.

However, it has been proved that this matter is far from reality and there was no unanimous agreement about it which has been proved.

But our question is why this way was not followed about the choice of Umar and the choice of Umar did not happen according to the unanimous agreement of the companions, but his choice was done by Abi Bakr.

The announcement of the dissatisfaction of the companions from selecting Umar:

Imam Muhammad Ben Mofleh Moghadasi(died in 763 A.H.) (The student of Zahabi: Mezi Taghi Al-Din Sabki) as one of jurisprudents and Sunni famous Mohaddesin (Majam Al-Momenin v 12 p 44) has said about this matter

لما استخلف أبو بكر عمر رضي الله عنهما قال لمعيقب الدوسي : ما يقول الناس في استخلاف

عمر؟

قال : كرهه قوم ورضيه قوم آخرون .

قال : الذين كرهوه أكثر أم الذين رضوه؟

قال : بل الذين كرهوه ...

Abu Bakr selected as his successor. Moeighib Dusi was asked " what was the opinion of the people about selection of umar?". He said " some of people were satisfied and others were dissatisfied. He was asked " were most of them satisfied or dissatisfied?" he answered " most of them were satisfied".

The objection of the companions to the selection of Umar:

Ibn Abi Shibe, one of other Sunni scientists, has written about the disagreements of Umar and their logical reasons for announcing their dissatisfaction of this selection due to his inner grimness and harsh behavior

عن وكيع ، وابن إدريس ، عن إسماعيل بن أبي خالد ، عن زبيد بن الحرث ، أن أبا بكر حين حضره الموت أرسل إلى عمر يستخلفه فقال الناس : تستخلف علينا فظاً غليظاً ، ولو قد ولينا كان أفض وأغلظ ، فما تقول لربك إذا لقيتَه وقد استخلفت علينا عمر

It has been narrated from Zeid Ben Hares " when he was about to die, he sent someone to call Umar in order to assign him as his successor. The people said " are you assigning a person that is grim and bad-tempered. If he undertakes the government, he will be more serious and grimmer. How will you answer God when he visits him for assigning a person that is bad-tempered and grim?

In addition, Ibn TEimie, the theorist and the thought founder of Wahhabite, has written about this matter

وقد تكلموا مع الصديق في ولاية عمر وقالوا ماذا تقول لربك وقد وليت علينا فظاً غليظاً .

The companions talked to him about the successor of Umar after him and said " why are they assigning a harsh person for caliphate and imposing him to people? How will you answer God?

Ibn Hajar Hakami has written about this matter

ودخل عليه بعض الصحابة فقال قائل منهم : ما أنت قائل لربك إذا سألك عن تولية عمر وقد ترى غلظته ...

Some of the companions came. One of them said " how will you answer your God when he asks you about selecting a person that you knew about his harshness and grimness?

Ibn Asaker has written

عن عمرو بن محمد ومجالد عن الشعبي قال بينما طلحة والزبير وعثمان وسعد وعبد الرحمن جلوسا عند أبي بكر في مرضه عوادا فقال أبو بكر ابعثوا إلي عمر فأتاه فدخل عليه فلما دخل أحسست أنه خيرته لهم فنفروا عنه وخرجوا وتركوهما فجلسوا في المسجد وأرسلوا إلى علي ونفر معه فوجدوا عليا في حائط في الحوائط التي كان رسول الله (صلى الله عليه وسلم) تصدق بها فتوافوا إليه فاجتمعوا وقالوا يا علي ويا فلان إن خليفة رسول الله (صلى الله عليه وسلم) ددمستخلف عمر وقد علم وعلم الناس أن إسلامنا كان قبل إسلام عمر وفي عمر من التسلط على الناس ما فيه ولا سلطان له فادخلوا بنا عليه نسأله فإن استعمل عمر كلمناه فيه وأخبرناه عنه ففعلوا فقال أبو بكر اجمعوا لي الناس أخبركم من اخترت لكم فخرجوا فجمعوا الناس إلى المسجد فأمر من يحمله إليهم حتى وضعه على المنبر فقام فيهم باختيار عمر لهم ثم دخل فاستأذنوا عليه فأذن لهم فقالوا ماذا تقول لربك وقد استخلفت علينا عمر؟ ...

Talhe, Zobeir, Usman, Sad and Abd Al-Rahman had sat beside Abu Bake to visit him when he was sick. Abu Bakr said " send someone to tell Umar to come here". When Umar entered, he felt that Abu Bakr had selected him as their caliph. Hence, all of them came out of there, left both of them alone and sat in the mosque of the messenger of God.

The people sent someone to call Ali and his companions. Ali was working in one of gardens that the messenger of God had donated him. All of them came and gathered around him and said " O' Ali! The caliph of the prophet has assigned Umar as his successor. The people and Umar know that our Islam was before the Islam of Umar and Umar has quarrelsome spirit and no one can control him. Therefore, let's go to visit Umar, talk to him about this matter and inform him about the characteristics of Umar.

When all of them gathered around Abu Bakr, Abu Bakr said " gather people for me to inform you who I have selected for you. They had the people got together in the mosque. Abu Bakr ordered to take him to the mosque and let him sit over

the pulpit. Then he announced the news of the selection of Umar to the people and came back to his house.

The people came to his house and said to him " how will you answer God since you have selected Umar as our caliph?

The objection of Imam Ali (peace be upon him) and Talhe:

Ibn Teimie has written in the book " Menhaj Al-Sane"

لما استخلفه أبو بكر كره خلافته طائفة حتى قال طلحة ماذا تقول لربك إذا وليت علينا فظا غليظا

When Umar assigned Abu Bakr as his successor, some became angry of this selection. Talhe said " how will you answer God when you visit him since you have chosen a grim and bad tempered person as our caliph?

Ibn Asaker has written in the book " the history of Medina Damascus"

عن يوسف بن ماهك عن عائشة قالت لما حضرت أبا بكر الوفاة استخلف عمر فدخل عليه علي وطلحة فقالا من استخلفت قال عمر قالوا فماذا أنت قائل لربك ...

It has been narrated from Aeshe that said " when Abu Bakr was about to die, he selected Umar as his successor. Then Ali and Talhe came to him and said " who have you chosen?" he answered " Umar". They said " how will you answer God?".

Hussein Ben Farhan Maleki has said after narrating this narration

وهذه قد رواها ابن عساكر بسند صحيح من طريق الضحاك بن مخلد (صاحب السنة) عن عبيد الله بن أبي زياد (وهو صدوق) عن يوسف بن ماهك (وهو ثقة معروف) عن عائشة فهذا إسناد صحيح وأقل رجاله توثيقا هو ابن أبي زياد وهو (صدوق) .

Ibn Asaker has narrated this narration with valid document through Zahak Ben Mokhaled and he has narrated through Ubeidullah Ben Abi Ziyad and he has narrated through Yusef Ben Mahak and he has narrated through Aeshe. The weakest person in this narration is Ibn Abi Ziyad that is honest.

In addition, Muhammad Naser Al-Bani that is one of Wahhabi leaders and Ibn Ziyad considers him a weak person, has also added

لكنه لم يتفرد به ، فقد رواه صالح بن رستم عن ابن أبي مليكة عن عائشة به نحوه . وصالح بن رستم هو أبو عامر الخزاز

Saleh Ben Rostam Abu Amer Khazaz has narrated from Ibn Abi Malike that said " Aeshe, Um Al-Momenin, has said "when my father was about to die, such and such persons said came to him and said " O' the caliph of the messenger of God! How will you answer your God when you visit him since you have assigned Umar as our caliph?

However, unfortunately, the trustee the Sunni scientists have distorted the narration in order to keep the honor of the caliphs and to guard the legitimacy of their caliphate and they have used such and such names instead of the names of Imam Ali (peace be upon him) and Talhe.

Muhammad Ben Jarir Tabari has written in the book " history"

عن الزهري عن القاسم بن محمد عن أسماء ابنة عميس قالت دخل طلحة بن عبيد الله على أبي بكر فقال استخلفت على الناس عمر وقد رأيت ما يلقي الناس منه وأنت معه فكيف به إذا خلا بهم وأنت لاق ربك فسألك عن رعيتك ...

Talhe Ben Ubeidullah came to Abu Bakr and said " you have assigned Umar as the caliph of the people even though you know, when you have been alive, what troubles the people have experienced from him. What will happen when he is assigned as the caliph of the people? When you visit your God, he will ask you about your God.

According to the opinion of the Sunni scientists, Imam Ali (peace be upon him) and Talhe are Ashre Mobashere. Therefore, at least, they should pay attention to their remarks.

The objection of the migrants and the supporters:

Ibn Ghatibe Dinuri has written in the book " Al-Emame and Al-Siyase"

فدخل عليه المهاجرون والأنصار حين بلغهم أنه استخلف عمر ، فقالوا : نراك استخلفت علينا عمر ، وقد عرفته ، وعلمت بوائقه فينا وأنت بين أظهرنا ، فكيف إذا وليت عنا وأنت لاق الله عز وجل فسألك ، فما أنت قائل ؟

when the migrants and the supporters informed that Abu Bakr had assigned Umar as his successor, they came to him and said " I have informed that you have assigned Umar as our caliph although you know his personality and you know how seriously he behaves to us in spite of your presence. What will happen when you leave us? In addition, how will you answer God when you visit great God?

The objection of the people of Sham:

Ibn Ghatibe Dinuri has written about this matter

وكان أهل الشام قد بلغهم مرض أبي بكر ، واستبطؤ الخبر فقالوا : إنا لنخاف أن يكون خليفة رسول الله قد مات ، وولى بعده عمر ، فإن كان عمر هو الوالي فليس لنا بصاحب ، وإنا لنرى خلعه.

When the people of Sham informed that Abu Bakr was sick, they thought that they informed about it late. Then they said " we are afraid the caliph of the messenger of God has passed away and he has assigned Umar as his successor. Therefore, if he is a king, we will not get along with him and we have decided to dismiss him".

Abu Bakr fainted when he was writing his will:

One of interesting points of this selection is that he fainted due to severe disease before he finished his will. Before Abu Bakr came to, Usman Ben Afan that was the writer of the will wrote the name of Umar and when Abu Bakr came to, he faced to the done action and confirmed it.

Some of the Sunni scientists have narrated

عن زيد بن أسلم ، عن أبيه ، قال : « كتب عثمان بن عفان عهد الخليفة من بعد أبي بكر ، فأمره أن لا يسمي أحدا ، وترك اسم الرجل ، فأغمي على أبي بكر إغماءة ، فأخذ عثمان العهد فكتب فيه اسم عمر . قال : فأفاق أبو بكر فقال : أرنا العهد ، فإذا فيه اسم عمر ، فقال : من كتب هذا ؟ فقال عثمان : أنا . فقال : رحمك الله وجزاك خيرا ، فوالله لو كتبت نفسك لكنت لذلك أهلا .

Zeid Ben Aslam has narrated from his father that said " Usman was writing the treaty of the caliph after Abu Bakr. Then Abu Bakr ordered him no to write the name of someone and leave blank in the part of his name. Then Abu Bakr fainted and Usman picked up the letter and wrote the name of Umar on it. Afterwards, when Abu Bakr came to, he said " show me the treaty and he saw the name of Umar on it.

Then he said " who has written this?" Usman answered " I have written it ". Abu Bakr said " God forgives you and gives you rewards. I swear God that if you had written your name, you would have deserved for it".

Motaghi Hendi has said after narrating this narration

قال ابن كثير اسناده صحيح .

Ibn Kasir has said " the document of this narration is valid".

Our question from the Sunni friends is:

You say that the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) assigned no one for his successor and left his assignment to people. Hence, why did Umar act against the tradition of the messenger of God and he selected Umar as the Imam of people whereas most of people were against this choice and announced their reasons for this disagreement?

Isn't it right that the messenger of God is considered as an exemplary person for all of the Muslims and following Hazrat Muhammad is necessary for all of people?

If the action of the messenger of God had been appropriate, why would Abu Bakr have acted against it and if the action of Abu Bakr had not been appropriate, you should be convinced that the action of the messenger of God was not correct.

How come is the will of Abu Bakr in coma impressive and her remark is not nonsense, but when the messenger of God said nothing except revelation according to the clear words of the Quran and he wanted to will, some insulted him that he said nonsense remarks because he was sick and they prevented him from writing the will? If the selection of caliph had been left to the people, why would Abu Bakr have imposed Umar to the people although he knew that most of the people were dissatisfied of Umar selection as caliph and he limited the freedom of people in selecting the king?

Wasn't it appropriate that the emotions and feelings of the dissatisfied people were paid attention and he did not impose Umar on the people in contrast with the opinion of most of the Muslims or at least, he consulted with the council and knew their opinion according to the principles of the council?

Good luck

The group in the charge of answering doubts

Research centre of Hazrat Valiasr