

Is Hazrat Mahdi (AS) a descendant of Imam Hassan Mujtaba?

The group of Mahdavidism

The inquirer: ‘Ali Jan Amiri

Raising doubts:

One of the basic matters of dispute in the issue of Mahdavidism is whether Hazrat Mahdi (May God Hasten His Appearance) is from Imam Mujtaba’s (AS) generation or Imam Hussein’s (AS).

Unlike the Shia belief, Sunnis claim that Hazrat Mahdi (AS) is a descendant of Imam Hassan Mujtaba (AS) not of Imam Sayyid al-Shuhada (AS).

In his Minhaj al-Sunna, Ibn Taymiyya Harrani has said,

فالمهدي الذي أخبر به النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم اسمه محمد بن عبد الله لا محمد بن الحسن وقد روى عن علي رضي الله عنه أنه قال هو من ولد الحسن بن علي لا من ولد الحسين بن علي.

Mahdi whose arrival has been prophesied by the Holy Prophet (Peace Be Upon Him) is named Mohammad ‘Abdullah not Muhammad Ibn al-Hassan. Ali (AS) has been quoted as stating, “Mahdi is from Hassan Ibn Ali’s generation not Hussein Ibn Ali’s”.

Ibn Taymiyya al-Harani al-Hanbali, Abu al-‘Abbas Ahmad Ibn ‘Abd al-Halim (died in 728 AH), Minhaj al-Sunnat al-Nabawiyat, vol. 8, pp. 254 & 260; researched by D. Mohammad Rishad Salim; published by Muassissat Qurtabat, the first edition, 1406 AH.

By citing this narrative, Ibn Taymiyya was, as a matter of fact, referring to what Abu Dawud Sijistani had quoted.

قال أبو داود حَدَّثْتُ عَنْ هَارُونَ بْنِ الْمُغِيرَةَ قَالَ ثنا عَمْرُو بْنُ أَبِي قَيْسٍ عَنْ شُعَيْبِ بْنِ خَالِدٍ عَنْ أَبِي إِسْحَاقَ قَالَ قَالَ عَلِيٌّ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ وَنَظَرَ إِلَى ابْنِهِ الْحَسَنِ فَقَالَ إِنَّ ابْنِي هَذَا سَيِّدٌ كَمَا سَمَّاهُ النَّبِيُّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ وَسَيَخْرُجُ مِنْ صُلْبِهِ رَجُلٌ يُسَمَّى بِاسْمِ نَبِيِّكُمْ يُشَبِّهُهُ فِي الْخُلُقِ وَلَا يُشَبِّهُهُ فِي الْخُلُقِ ثُمَّ ذَكَرَ قِصَّةَ يَمَلَأُ الْأَرْضَ عَدْلًا....

According to Abu Ishaq, Amir al-Momenin took a look at his son Hassan and stated, “My son is a master as named by the Prophet (PBUH). A man will come up from his generation who is named after the Holy Prophet (Peace Be Upon Him). His conducts do also look like him but his appearance does not.” Then he went on saying, “He is the man who will fill the earth with peace and justice.”

Al-Sijistani al-Azud, Sulayman Ibn al-Ash’ath Abu Dawud (died in 275 AH), Sunan Abi Dawud, vol. 4, p. 108, No. 4290; researched by Mohammad Muhyi al-Din ‘Abd al-Hamid; published by Dar al-Fikr.

Analysis:

This narrative is the only proof Sunnis have provided for the justification of their belief. No other proof can ever be found in other narrative sources. But this very narrative is under criticism due to a number of its basic flaws.

Abu Dawud’s narrative is Mursal (If a narrator is omitted from the chain of transmission)

Firstly: This narrative is regarded as Mursal for two reasons:

A. One of the individuals who reported this narrative from Amir al-Momenin Ali (AS) was Abu Ishaq ‘Amr Ibn ‘Abdullah al-Sabi’i; born in 33 AH and died in 129 AH. When Hazrat Amir al-Momenin (AS) was martyred, he was only seven years of age. Although he had seen Hazrat

Amir Al-Momenin (AS) only once, it has not been proved that he quoted a narrative from the Hazrat. While explaining about this narrative, Mubarak Furi has quoted Munthari as saying that the narrative is a Maqtu' one (a tradition whose chain of narrators stop at the second generation, i.e. Tabi'in).

قال المنذري هذا منقطع أبو إسحاق السبيعي رأي عليا عليه السلام رؤية.

According to Munthari, this narrative is Maqtu' because Abu Ishaq Sabi'i had seen Ali (AS) only once.

Al-Mubarak Furi, Abu al-'Ula Mohammad 'Abd al-Rahman Ibn 'Abd al-Rahim (died in 1353 AH), Tuhfat al-Ahuthi bi Sharh Jami' al-Tarmathi, vol. 6, p. 403; published by Dar al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyya, Beirut.

B. In its chain of transmission, Abu Dawud has said, حَدَّثْتُ عَنْ هَارُونَ بْنِ الْمُغِيرَةَ, (It was reported to me from Harun). But he has refused to mention who had actually reported it from Harun. Harun Ibn al-Mughayra is from the ninth class and Abu Dawud Sijistani is from the eleventh class of the Sunni narrators. As a conclusion, this narrative is considered as Mursal.

In the preface of his book, Ibn Khaldun has written,

وأما أبو اسحاق الشيعي وإن خرج عنه في الصحيحين فقد ثبت أنه اختلط آخر عمره وروايته عن علي منقطعة وكذلك رواية أبي داود عن هارون بن المغيرة

Although several narratives have been cited from Abu Ishaq Shi'i in both Sahih Bukhari and Sahih Muslim, he was suffering from the disorder of the senses at the end of his life. Therefore, his narrative was disconnected from Ali (AS). And so is Abu Dawus's narrative from Harun Ibn al-Mughayra.

Ibn Khaldun al-Hadrami, 'Abd al-Rahman Ibn Mohammad (died in 808 AH), Muqaddama Ibn Khaldun, vol. 1, p. 314; published by Dar al-Qalam, Beirut, 1984, the fifth edition.

Al-Bani Wahhabi has played down this narrative in a number of his books based on the two reasons mentioned above. In follow-up to devaluing a narrative cited by Tarmathi, he has said as follows in Silsilat al-Da'ifa.

هذا، وقبل إنهاء الكتابة حول حديث الترجمة لا بد لي من أن أذكر له شاهداً وجدته في "سنن أبي داود" في إسناده انقطاع وجهالة؛ فلم تطمئن النفس إليه، فقال أبو داود (4290): حَدَّثْتُ عَنْ هَارُونَ بْنِ الْمُغِيرَةَ...

هكذا ساقه أبو داود . فقال الخطابي عقبه في "المعالم" (162/6): «هذا منقطع؛ أبو إسحاق السبيعي رأى علياً رضي الله عنه رؤية، وقال فيه أبو داود: حدثت عن هارون بن المغيرة.» قلت: يعني أن شيخ أبي داود فيه لم يسم؛ فهو مجهول. وأيضاً؛ فأبو إسحاق كان اختلط، وشعيب بن خالد ليس مذكوراً فيمن روى عنه قبل الاختلاط.

Before wrapping up the discussion about this narrative, I have no other option but to provide a piece of evidence for the narrative which I have found in Abu Dawud's Sunan. In the chain of transmission of this narrative, there is a disconnection of narrators. That is why I can not trust it. Abu Dawud has said, "It was reported to me from Mughayra ...". Khitabi has said in his Kitab al-Mu'allim, "This narrative is Munqati' because Abu Ishaq Sabi'i had seen Ali (AS) only one time. And also Abu Dawud had said that it was narrated from Harun to him.

What I say is that there is no mention of Abu Dawud in this narrative. So, he is Majhul (missing) in the chain. Abu Ishaq also suffered from disorder of senses. And Shu'ayb Ibn Khalid, who was one of those quoting him before his disease, was not mentioned either.

Al-Bani, Mohammad Nasir (died in 1420 AH), al-Silsilat al-Da'ifat wa Athariha al-Say fi al-Umma, vol. 13, p. 1097; published by Maktabat al-Ma'arif lil Nashr wa al-Towzi' li Sahibiha Sa'd Ibn 'Abd al-Rahman al-Rashid, Riyadh, the first edition, 1425 AH-2004 AD.

And also in Mishkat al-Masabih, vol. 3, p. 186, H. 5462; published by al-Maktabat al-Islami, Beirut, the third edition, 1405 AH-1985 AD as well as Abi Dawud's Sunan, H. 924 the narrative was considered as weak.

Elsewhere, it has been reported in a different form with **نظر إلى ابنه الحسين**

Secondly, this narrative has also been recounted in other Sunni sources where the phrase of **نظر إلى ابنه الحسن** is replaced by **نظر إلى ابنه الحسين**.

Below is what Shams al-Din Jizri Shafi'i has written in his Asna al-Matalib,

والأصح أنه من ذرية الحسين بن علي لنص أمير المؤمنين علي عليه السلام، فيما أخبرنا به شيخنا المسند رحلة زمانه عمر بن الحسن الرقي قراءة عليه، قال : أنبأنا أبو الحسن بن البخاري، أنبأنا عمر بن محمد الدارقزي، أنبأنا أبو البدر الكرخي، أنبأنا أبو بكر الخطيب، أنبأنا أبو عمر الهاشمي، أنبأنا أبو علي اللؤلؤي، أنبأنا أبو داود الحافظ قال : حدثت عن هارون بن المغيرة، قال : حدثنا عمر بن أبي قيس، عن شعيب بن خالد، عن أبي اسحاق قال : قال علي عليه السلام - ونظر إلى ابنه الحسين - فقال : إن ابني هذا سيد كما سماه النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم، وسيخرج من صلبه رجل يسمى باسم نبيكم، يشبهه في الخلق، ولا يشبهه في الخلق . ثم ذكر قصة يملأ الأرض عدلاً . هكذا رواه أبو داود في سننه وسكت عنه.

The right idea is that Hazrat Mahdi (AS) is from Hussein Ibn Ali's (AS) generation as affirmed by Amir al-Momemnin Ali (AS). My professor 'Amr Ibn al-Hassan told me, recounting what Abu Ishaq had quoted from Ali (AS) as saying that he took a look at Hussein and said, "My son is a master as named by the Prophet (PBUH). A man will come up from his generation who is named after the Holy Prophet (Peace Be Upon Him). His conducts do also look like him but his appearance does not." Then he went on saying, "He is the man who will fill the earth with peace and justice."

Abu Dawud has cited this narrative with the same format in his Sunan and has avoided making comments about it.

Al-Jizri al-Shafi'i, Abi al-Khayr Shams al-Din Mohammad Ibn Mohammad (died in 833), Asna al-Matalib fi Manaqib Sayidina Ali Ibn Abi Talib

Karama Allah Wajhah, Taqdim, p. 130; researched by Dr. Mohammad Hadi al-Amini; published by Maktabat al-Imam Amir al-Momenin (AS) al-‘Amma, Isfahan, Iran.

It is in contradiction with narratives which consider Hazrat Mahdi (AS) as a descendant of Imam Hussein (AS).

Thirdly, this narrative clearly contradicts the narratives which Sunni scholars have cited in their books, proving that Sayyid al-Shuhada (AS) is Hazrat Mahdi’s (May God Hasten His Appearance) ancestor. For instance, the following is the comment Muqaddasi Shafi’i has made in his ‘Aqd al-Durar and Muhib al-Din Tabari in his Thakhair al-‘Uqba.

وعن حذيفة رضي الله عنه قال : خطبنا رسول الله (ص) فذكرنا رسول الله (ص) بما هو كائن، ثم قال: «لو لم يبق من الدنيا إلا يوم واحد لطول الله عز وجل ذلك اليوم، حتى يبعث في رجلاً من ولدي اسمه اسمي.»

فقام سلمان الفارسي رضي الله عنه فقال: يا رسول الله، من أي ولدك؟ قال: «هو من ولدي هذا»، وضرب بيده على الحسين عليه السلام .
أخرجه الحافظ أبو نعيم، في صفة المهدي

Hathifa has been cited to have recounted, “The Holy Prophet (Peace Be Upon Him) was making a speech to us until he got to the subject of the fate of the world. He stated that even if only one day were left from the world, Allah would prolong that day until a man from his household who is named after him would rise up. Salman Farsi asked him from whose generation he would be. The Prophet (PBUH) answered, “From this son of mine (pointing to Hussein (AS))” This narrative has been cited by Abu Na’im Isfahani in Sifat al-Mahdi.

Al-Muqaddasi al-Shafi’i, al-Silmi, Jamal al-Din, Yusuf Ibn yahya Ibn Ali (died in 685 AH), ‘Aqd al-Durar fi Akhbar al-Muntazir, vol. 1, pp. 82 & 95, Tibq. Barnama al-Jami’ al-Kabir.

Al-Tabari, Abu Ja'far Muhib al-Din Ahmad Ibn 'Abdullah Ibn Mohammad (died in 694 AH), Thakhair al-'Uqba fi Manaqib Thawi al-Qurba, vol. 1, p. 137; published by Dar al-Kutub al-Misriyya, Egypt.

The following can be found in Na'im Ibn Hamad Mawazi's al-Fitan, Muqaddasi Shafi'i's 'Aqd al-Durar and Jalal al-Din Siyuti's al-Hawi Lil Fatawa.

حدثنا الوليد ورشدين عن ابن لهيعة عن أبي قبيل عن عبد الله بن عمرو رضى الله عنهما قال يخرج رجل من ولد الحسين من قبل المشرق ولو استقبلته الجبال لهدمها واتخذ فيها طرُقاً.

'Abdullah Ibn 'Amr has quoted the Holy Prophet (Peace Be Upon Him) as stating that a man from Hussein's (AS) generation would rise up from the east. Even if mountains stood against him, he would blow them up in order to pave his way ahead between them.

Al-Marwazi, Na'im Ibn Hamad Abu 'Abdullah (died in 288 AH), Kitab al-Fitan, vol. 1, p. 371, No. 1095; researched by Samir Amin al-Zahiri, published by Maktabat al-Towhid, Cairo, the first edition, 1412.

Al-Muqaddasi al-Shafi'i, al-Silmi, Jamal al-Din, Yusuf Ibn Yahya Ibn Ali (died in 685 AH), 'Aqd al-Durar fi Akhbar al-Muntazir, vol. 1, pp. 195 & 284, Tibq 2. Barnama al-Jami' al-Kabir.

Al-Siyuti, Jalal al-Din 'Abd al-Rahman Ibn Abibakr (died in 911 AH), al-Hawi lil Fatawa fi al-Fiqh wa 'Ulum al-Tafsir wa al-Hadith wa al-Usul wa al-Nahw wa al-I'rab wa Sair al-Funun, vol. 2, p. 60; researched by 'Abd al-Latif Hasan 'Abd al-Rahman; published by Dar al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyya, Beirut, the first edition, 1421 AH-2000 AD.

In a lengthy narrative from the Holy Prophet (Peace Be Upon Him), Ibn Sabbagh Maliki quoted him as putting his hand over Imam Hussein's (AS) shoulder, insisting that Mahdi is from his generation.

...يا فاطمة إنا أهل بيت أعطينا ست خصال لم يعطها أحد من الأولين ولا يدركها أحد من الآخرين
غيرنا، فنبينا خير الأنبياء [وهو أبوك]، ووصينا خير الأوصياء وهو بعلك، وشهيدنا خير الشهداء
وهو عم أبيك [حمزة]، ومنا من له جناحان يطير بهما في الجنة حيث يشاء وهو جعفر، ومنا
سبطا هذه الأمة وهما ابناك، ومنا مهدي [هذه] الأمة الذي يصلي خلفه عيسى بن مريم. ثم ضرب
على منكب الحسين (عليه السلام) وقال: من هذا مهدي هذه الأمة . هكذا أخرج الدار قطني
صاحب الجرح والتعديل.

...“O Fatima! God has granted us, Ahl al-Bayt, six special privileges which neither people coming up in the future will have them, nor those who have passed away did have. Our prophet is the best of all prophets and he is your father. Our leader is the best and he is your husband. Our martyr is the best one and he is your uncle, Hamza. The man who possesses two wings to fly in the Heaven any time he wishes is Ja’far who is also from us. The Sibb of Umma are your two sons, Hassan and Hussein. Mahdi will be from us as well. He is the one behind whom Jesus, son of Mary, will perform a prayer.” Then, he put his hand over Hussein’s (AS) shoulder, adding, “Mahdi is from his generation”.

Dar Qatani, the writer of Jarh wa Ta’dil, has also reported the same narrative.

Ibn Sabbagh al-Maliki al-Makki, Ali Ibn Mohammad Ibn Ahmad (died in 855 AH), al-Fudul al-Muhimma fi Ma’rifat al-Aimma, vol. 2, p. 1114; researched by Sami al-Ghariri; published by Dar al-Hadith lil Taba’at wa al-Nashr, Qom, the first edition, 1422 AH.

In his Yanabi’ al-Mawadda, Qunduzi has quoted the same narrative from Dar al-Qatani’s Jarh wa Ta’dil.

ومنها: أخرج الدارقطني في كتابه الجرح والتعديل: عن أبي سعيد الخدري: أن...

In Jarh wa Ta’dil, Dar Qatani has quoted Abu Sa’di Khidiri as saying, ...

Al-Qunduzi al-Hanafi, al-Sheikh Sulayman Ibn Ibrahim (died in 1294 AH), Yanabi' al-Mawaddat Li Thawi al-Qurba, vol. 3, p. 394; researched by Sayyid Ali Jamal Ashraf al-Husseini' published by Dar al-Aswad Lil Taba'at wa al-Nashr, Qom, the first edition, 1416 AH.

Muqaddasi Shafi'i has quoted Imam Baqir (AS) as stating that Mahdi is a descendant of Imam Hussein (AS).

وعن جابر بن يزيد الجعفي، قال : قال أبو جعفر عليه السلام : يا جابر... قال: فيجمع الله تعالى للمهدي أصحابه، ثلاثمائة وثلاثة عشر رجلاً، يجمعهم الله تعالى على غير ميعاد وقزح كقزح الخريف، فيبايعونه بين الركن والمقام . قال: والمهدي، يا جابر، رجل من ولد الحسين، يصلح الله له أمره في ليلة واحدة

Jabir Ibn Yazid has been narrated to have quoted Imam Baqir (AS) as stating, "O Jabir! God would impromptu gather Mahdi's 313 close companions who have been scattered around like leaves in autumn. They would pay allegiance to the Hazrat right away." He went on saying, "O Jabir! He is a man from Hussein's generation. God would reform his affairs just overnight.

Al-Muqaddasi al-Shafi'i, al-Silmi, Jamal al-Din, Yusuf Ibn Yahya Ibn Ali (died in 685 AH), 'Aqd al-Durar fi Akhbar al-Muntazir, vol. 1, p. 157, Tibq Barnama al-Jami' al-Kabir.

Even though Aby Dawud's narrative is disregarded, it is in contradiction with many other narratives. As a result, it is by no means reliable.

Hazrat Mahdi is a descendant of Hassanayn (Hassan and Hussein):

Fourthly, even if we approve Abu Dawud's narrative as authentic, it will not refute the Shia belief. Nor will it challenge the narratives which prove that Hazrat Mahdi (May God Hasten His Appearance) is from Imam Hussein's (AS) generation. The reason is because the Hazrat is paternally from Imam Hussein's (AS) ancestry and maternally from that of Imam Hassan (AS).

The fact is that Imam Ali Ibn al-Hussein's (AS) wife; namely, Imam Baqir's (AS) mother was Imam Hassan Mujtaba's (AS) daughter, Fatima. As a conclusion, Hazrat Mahdi (AS) is from the generation of both Imam Hassan and Imam Hussein (Peace be Upon them).

The Holy Qur'an has made such a similar attribution when talking about Hazrat Jesus (AS). It has introduced him as being from the generations of former prophets such as Jacob, Isaac and Abraham.

وَوَهَبْنَا لَهُ إِسْحَاقَ وَيَعْقُوبَ كُلًّا هَدَيْنَا وَنُوحًا هَدَيْنَا مِن قَبْلُ وَمِن ذُرِّيَّتِهِ دَاوُدَ وَسُلَيْمَانَ وَأَيُّوبَ وَيُوسُفَ وَمُوسَى وَهَارُونَ وَكَذَلِكَ نَجْزِي الْمُحْسِنِينَ . وَزَكَرِيَّا وَيَحْيَى وَعِيسَى وَإِلْيَاسَ كُلٌّ مِّنَ الصَّالِحِينَ.

And We gave to Abraham, Isaac and Jacob - all [of them] We guided. And Noah, We guided before; and among his descendants, David and Solomon and Job and Joseph and Moses and Aaron. Thus do We reward the doers of good. And Zechariah and John and Jesus and Elias - and all were of the righteous. (The Cattle: 84-85)

When Hazrat Jesus (AS) is linked to Isaac, Jacob and Abraham, Hazrat Mahdi (AS) can also be maternally attached to Imam Hassan Mojtaba (AS). It is like the link both Imam Hassan (AS) and Imam Hussein (AS) have to the Holy Prophet (Peace Be Upon Him) through Hazrat Siddiqa Tahira (AS). Amazingly, some Sunni scholars, who have failed to reject or deny the narratives proving that Hazrat Mahdi (AS) is a descendant of Imam Hussein (AS), desperately resort to weird justifications. They claim that Hazrat Mahdi (AS) is maternally linked to Imam Hussein (AS) but paternally to Imam Hassan (AS).

Mulla 'Ali Qari has explained it in his Mirqat al-Mafatih as follows.

واختلف في أنه من بني الحسن أو من بني الحسين، ويمكن أن يكون جامعاً بين النسبتين الحسنين. والأظهر أنه من جهة الأب حسني ومن جانب الأم حسيني قياساً على ما وقع في ولدي إبراهيم

وهما إسماعيل وإسحاق عليهم [الصلاة] والسلام، حيث كان أنبياء بني إسرائيل كلهم من بني إسحاق، وإنما نبيء من ذرية إسماعيل نبينا وقام مقام الكل ونعم العوض وصار خاتم الأنبياء .
فكذلك لما ظهرت أكثر الأئمة وأكابر الأمة من أولاد الحسين فناسب أن يجبر الحسن بأن أعطى له ولد يكون خاتم الأولياء ويقوم مقام سائر الأصفياء ... وسيأتي في حديث أبي إسحاق عن علي كرم الله تعالى وجهه ما هو صريح في هذا المعنى والله [تعالى] أعلم

A rift has emerged over whether Imam Hassan (AS) is Hazrat Mahdi's (AS) ancestor or Imam Hussein (AS). The combination of the both is possible. But the strongest possibility is that he paternally belongs to Hassan's generation and maternally to Hussein's. It is compared to the link between Abraham's two sons, Issac (AS) and Ishmael (AS). All of the prophets of Bani Israel (children of Israel) were from Isaac's ancestry while our prophet who is the seal and the best of prophets was a descendant of Ishmael (AS).

Alike is all members of Aamma (Peace Be Upon Them) who are from Imam Hussein's generation. Therefore, it is good to compensate it for Imam Hassan Mujtaba with the seal of Imams being from his lineage. We will soon provide Abu Ishaq's narrative from Ali (AS), clarifying this matter.

Mullaa 'Ali al-Qari, Nur al-Din Abu al-Hassan 'Ali Ibn Sultan Mohammad al-Hirawi (died in 1014 AH), Mirqat al-Mafatih Sharh Mishkat al-Masabih, vol. 10, p. 90; researched by Jamal 'Aytani; published by Dar al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyya, Lebanon/Beirut, the first edition, 1422 AH-2001 AD.

Below are the responses we can give to him.

Firstly, in order to support his claim, he has not found any other reason but a logical deduction or any other narrative except Abu Ishaq Sabi'i's. Earlier, we discussed in detail that his narrative is Mursal for two separate reasons, so it is absolutely unreliable. Hazrat Mahdi's (May God Hasten His Appearance) ancestry can never be authenticated with only a logical deduction or weak narratives.

In response to the analogy he has drawn between Imam Hassan's (AS) generation with Hazrat Abraham's, we should say that one's kinship can never be figured out simply based on a logical deduction and without authentic evidence or justification. Such an issue requires a compelling reason to be substantiated.

We agree that the merging of two narratives is likely. But why shouldn't they be merged in a way that Hazrat Mahdi (AS) reaches to Imam Hussein (AS) paternally and to Imam Hassan (AS) maternally? It can be supported by historical facts because as discussed earlier Imam Baqir's (AS) mother is Imam Hassan Mojtaba's daughter.

In addition, the comparison he has made is quite wrong. It is true that the Seal of Prophets, i.e. the Holy Prophet of Islam (Peace Be Upon Him) is the best of all but no one has ever said that Imam Mahdi (May God Hasten His Appearance) is similarly superior to all other Aimmah.

Why should God create the best prophet from Ishmael's generation only for the reason that He had chosen most of the preceding prophets from among Isaac's descendants?

God has never picked a prophet or an Imam merely based on this simple criterion. He has stated in the Holy Qur'an,

اللَّهُ أَعْلَمُ حَيْثُ يَجْعَلُ رِسَالَتَهُ

Allah is most knowing of where He places His message. (The Cattle: 124)

Furthermore, has Mulla Ali Qari ever accepted the fact that other Imams are from Imam Hussein's (AS) descendants? And now he draws such an analogy saying that it is good to compensate it for Imam Hassan Mujtaba with the seal of Imams being from his lineage!

Ahl al-Bayt's narratives about Hazrat Mahdi's ancestry:

Above all, there are a number of narratives with authentic chains of transmission from Ahl al-Bayt (Peace Be Upon Them) which expose the fact that Imam Mahdi (May God Hasten His Appearance) is from Imam Hussein's (AS) descendants. And since the Holy Prophet (Peace Be Upon Him) has declared his household equal to the Qur'an, calling upon all people to abide both of them equally, Shias are obeying his order. So it is precisely where the Shia belief is originated from.

The narratives concerning this point are numerous and Mutawatir (widely transmitted) but here we only refer to one of them in brief.

حَدَّثَنَا أَبِي رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا سَعْدُ بْنُ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ أَبِي خَلْفٍ قَالَ حَدَّثَنِي يَعْقُوبُ بْنُ يَزِيدَ عَنْ
 حَمَّادِ بْنِ عَيْسَى عَنْ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ مُسْكَانَ عَنْ أَبَانَ بْنِ تَغْلِبَ عَنْ سُلَيْمِ بْنِ قَيْسِ بْنِ لَهْلَالِيٍّ عَنْ سَلْمَانَ
 الْفَارِسِيِّ رَحِمَهُ اللَّهُ قَالَ دَخَلْتُ عَلَى النَّبِيِّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَإِذَا الْحُسَيْنُ عَلَى فُخْدَيْهِ وَهُوَ يَقْبَلُ
 عَيْنَيْهِ وَيَلْتَمُ فَاهُ وَهُوَ يَقُولُ أَنْتَ سَيِّدُ ابْنِ سَيِّدٍ أَنْتَ إِمَامٌ ابْنُ إِمَامٍ أَبُو الْأَيْمَّةِ أَنْتَ حُجَّةُ ابْنِ حُجَّةٍ أَبُو
 حُجَجٍ تَسْعَةٌ مِنْ صُلْبِكَ تَأْسِعُهُمْ قَائِمُهُمْ

Salman Farsi has said, “When I went to meet the Holy Prophet (Peace Be Upon Him), I found him with Imam Hussein (AS) [his grandson] sitting on his lap. The Prophet (PBUH) kept kissing his eyes and lips, telling him, ‘You are a master and a master’s son! You are a leader, a leader’s son and a leader’s father! You are Hujjat (authority), a Hujjat’s son and the father of nine other Hujjats. The ninth one will be Qaim (upriser).”

Al-Saduq, Abu Ja’far Mohammad Ibn ‘Ali Ibn al-Hussein (died in 381 AH), al-Khisal, p. 475, H. 38; researched by ‘Ali Akbar al-Ghaffari; published by Jama’at al-Mudarrisin fi al-Howza al-‘Ilmiyya, Qom, 1403 AH-1362 solar year.

Conclusion:

The Sunni belief that Hazrat Mahdi (AS) is a descendant of Imam Hassan Mojtaba (AS) is not based on authentic evidence and compelling

justification at all. On the other hand, it clearly contradicts other narratives.
It only lies on one weak narrative which is by no means dependable.

Good Luck

The Group Responsible for Answers to Doubts

Hazrat Wali Asr (AS) Research Institute

