

IN THE NAME OF ALLAH, THE COMPASSIONATE
THE MERCIFUL

Has the narration “ I was eaten the day when the white cow was eaten “ been authentically quoted from the commander of the faithful (peace be upon him)?

THE BOARD OF IMAM ALI (PEACE BE UPON HIM)

A QUESTION BY; AMIR AHMADI

THE ELABORATION OF THE QUESTION

Recently one of the Sunnite website has quoted a discourse of the commander of the faithful (peace be upon him) and I got a bad headache and I feel nervous as I read that point

And I am going to send you the exact text of that comments and I wish you respond me as soon as possible

The exact text of their comments

THE STORY OF THE THREE COWS FROM THE TONGUE OF HIS HOLINESS ALI (MAY GOD BE PLEASED WITH HIM)

One day HIS Holiness Ali wanted to deliver a speech but Khavarej began to say some mottos and they did not allow His Holiness Ali to deliver his discourse and His Holiness came down from the pulpit while he was unhappy and then stated to those who were near to him that; the example of me and the example of Othman was just like the story of that three cows who were fighting one another

Three cows one in white color and the other in brown color and the last one in the black one who were living in a forest and after some time a lion came to that forest and when he saw that cows then he decided to eat them but he found out that they are three cows and he is not able to fight against them therefore he decided to make division among them and he talked to the black and brown cows and said that our skin color is the same and this

white cow has caused you to look improper so let me eat him and those black and brown cows agreed with him and the lion ate that cow while they were watching them and after a while he talked to the brown cow and said; our skin color is the same so let me to eat that black cow and the brown cow allowed him and after some days, once again the lion became hunger and he came to the brown cow with no problem and shame and said now it is your turn and I am going to eat you and the brown cow said that so let me shout for three times and he said do that and that brown cow said; I ate that day when the white cow was eaten (it means if that day I did leave the white cow then my turn did not come this day

His Holiness Ali (peace be upon him) stated that;

The day when Othman was killed I was somehow careless and if I was not be so negligent then they have not insulted me this day

انما اكلت يوم اكل الابيض . فلو اني نصرته لما اكلت

I was killed in the day when Othman was killed and indeed I was eaten when the white cow was eaten and if that day I helped him then I was not eaten this day

ثم قال علي : انما انا وهنت يوم قتل عثمان و لو اني نصرته لما هنت . قالها ثلاثا

-Al-Badayat Al-Nahayat , v 7, p 233

RESPONSE

At first; one of the accusation which has been attributed to the commander of the faithful (peace be upon him) by Bani Omayah and in their head Moavia Ibn Abi Sofyan was the participation or negligence of His Holiness in the story of the murdering of Othman

And the commander of the faithful (peace be upon him) himself has referred to this accusation of Moavia in the book Nahj Al-Balaqah an din response in a letter to him writes that

و لَعَمْرِي يَا مُعَاوِيَةَ لَئِنْ نَظَرْتَ يَعْظَمُكَ دُونَ هَوَاكَ لَتَجِدَنِي أBRَأَ النَّاسِ مِنْ دَمِ
عُثْمَانَ وَ لَتَعْلَمَنَّ أَنِّي لَكُنْتُ فِي عَزَلَةٍ عَنْهُ إِلَّا أَنْ تَتَجَنَّى فَتَجُنَّ مَا بَدَا لَكَ وَ السَّلَامُ .

O Moavia, I swear to my life if you look at this issue in a logical manner and not via the lens of low desires and wills then you will figure out that I am the most innocent man in the story of murdering of Othman and you really know that I am innocent unless you want to double cross me and accuse me in such a manner and if it is so then commit any crimes you want. That is it

And in the letter No 28 stated to Moavia as well that

مَرَّ ذَكَرْتَ مَا كَانَ مِنْ أَمْرِي وَ أَمْرَ عُثْمَانَ فَلَكَ أَنْ تُجَابَ عَنْ هَذِهِ لِرَحِمِكَ مِنْهُ فَأَيْنَا
كَانَ أَعْدَى لَهُ وَ أَهْدَى إِلَى مَقَاتِلِهِ أَمْ مَنْ بَدَلَ لَهُ نُصْرَتَهُ فَاسْتَقْعَدَهُ وَ اسْتَكَفَّهُ أَمْ مَنْ
اسْتَنْصَرَهُ فَتَرَاحَى عَنْهُ وَ بَثَّ الْمُنُونَ إِلَيْهِ حَتَّى أَتَى قَدْرَهُ عَلَيْهِ
كَلَّا وَ اللَّهُ (لَ قَدْ عَلِمَ اللَّهُ الْمُعْوِقِينَ مِنْكُمْ وَ الْقَائِلِينَ لِإِخْوَانِهِمْ هَلُمَّ إِلَيْنَا وَ لَا
يَأْتُونَ الْبَاسَ إِلَّا قَلِيلًا)

وَ مَا كُنْتُ لِأَعْتَذِرَ مِنْ أَنِّي كُنْتُ أَنْعِمُ عَلَيْهِ أَحَدًا فَإِنْ كَانَ الدَّنْبُ إِلَيْهِ
إِرْشَادِي وَ هِدَايَتِي لَهُ قَرَبٌ مَلُومٌ لَا دَنْبَ لَهُ وَ قَدْ يَسْتَفِيدُ الطَّنَّةَ الْمُتَنَصِّحُ (وَ
مَا أَرَدْتُ إِلَّا الْإِصْلَاحَ مَا اسْتَطَعْتُ وَ مَا تَوَفَّيْتَنِي إِلَّا بِاللَّهِ عَلَيْهِ تَوَكَّلْتُ وَ إِلَيْهِ
أُنِيبُ) .

Then you said pertaining to the story of Othman and me that and you have to respond to this as well while you were one of his close relatives and kinfolks and which one of us was more hostile to him and paved the way to the murderers to kill him? a man who helped him and asked him to take his place and encouraged him to step down or the man (Othman) who asked that man to help him but that man delayed to be murdered and his life reaches to its end

No, I swear to GOD, Allah the Almighty really knows those who stooped to aid him and those who said to their own brothers that; come to us and in the unpleasant day no one will come to aid unless a handful ones

And I am not telling that I did not censure him for the innovation which have been made by him and I am not going to apologize for that since to guide

and lead people is my fault and there are those who have been blamed while they are innocent and not guilty and as it has been said by a poet that; sometimes the affectionate and advise man would be accused as a result of his insistence in advising the people

And my real intent is to correct things as possible as I can and my success is only due to the mercy of GOD and I ask success from no one else except Allah The Almighty an in GOD I will trust and I return to Him

And these letters show that at that time Bani Omayah and their leader Moavia Ibn Abi Sofyan have made efforts to accuse the commander of the faithful (peace be upon him) of the murder of Othman and to wage a war against His Holiness with such a false excuse

Secondly; the main reason of the beginning of the fight against His Holiness in the battle of Jamal and Safayn was this false excuse and they were saying that the commander of the faithful (peace be upon him) was negligent in the case of the murdering of Othman and the murderers of Othman have been entered in the camp of His Holiness by him and we are going to revenge the murderers of Othman while they personally played the main role in the killing of Othman in fact Ayeshah, Talhah, Zobayr and Moaviah were among the main murderers of Othman since they encouraged the companions against him and for further information pertaining to this issue see the below address

<http://valiasr-aj.com/fa/page.php?bank=maghalat&ID=47>

and these documents indicate that the narration which has been mentioned in the Sunnite website is a false story of the story-tellers of the Moavia Ibn Abi Sofyan's government and the writer of this article with his close eyes or perhaps in order to obey Moaviah and prove his view has made efforts to regard the commander of the faithful (peace be upon him) as the major cause of the story of murdering of Othman

thirdly; the proof of the narration which has been referred to by these men is weak and they have put that narration in their own website with no investigation of the proof of that narration

the reason of the weakness of this narration

this narration has been quoted by Tabarani in the book Al-Mojam Al-Kabir with this proof that

(113) حدثنا علي بن عبد العزيز ثنا عارم ثنا حماد بن زيد حدثنا مجالد بن سعيد عن عمير بن رودي قال خطبهم علي رضي الله تعالى عنه فقطعوا عليه خطبته فقال إنما وهنت يوم قتل عثمان رضي الله تعالى عنه وضرب لهم

-Al-Majam Al-Kabir , Al-Tabarani , v 1, p 81

There are two main problems in the proof of this narration one is Mojaled Ibn Saeed and the other Omayr Ibn Ravadi

Haythami says after the quotation of this narration that

رواه الطبراني وعمير لم أعرفه ، وبقية رجاله الصحيح غير مجالد بن سعيد وفيه خلاف .

-Majma Al-Zavaed Al-Heithami , v 7, p 245

Mazi in the book Tahzib Al-Kamal, v 27, p 220 writes pertaining to Mojaled Ibn Saeed that

قال البخاري : كان يحيى بن سعيد يضعفه ، وكان عبد الرحمان بن مهدي لا يروي عنه شيئا . وكان ابن حنبل لا يراه شيئا يقول : ليس بشئ .

Bokhari has said that; Yahya Ibn Saeed has declared him as a not trustworthy man and Abd Al-Rahman Ibn Mahdi has not narrated any saying from him and Ahmad Ibn Hanbal regarded him as a worthless man and has said that he is a worthless man

عن يحيى بن معين : لا يحتج بحديثه .

It has been quoted from Yahya Ibn Moin that they do not refer to his narrations

وقال أبو بكر بن أبي خيثمة عن يحيى بن معين : ضعيف ، واهي الحديث .

Abu Bakr Ibn Abi Khaythmah has quoted from Yahya Ibn Moin that he was a not trustworthy man and their narrations are worthless as well

And numerous other blames that we refer to them in a brief manner

And Omayr Ibn Ravadi is a strange and not well-known man

Was the commander of the faithful guilty in the case of murdering Othman?

Fourthly; when they speak about the friendly relations among the Qaliphs then The Sunnite scholars say that the commander of the faithful has defended Othman in the case of his murdering and even His Holiness sent both his honorable sons Imam Hasan and Imam Hossein (peace be upon them) to defend him as well and...

But in this point they are making efforts with the publication of such an issue to prove that His Holiness was negligent in the murder of Othman and later (we take refuge to Allah the Almighty) he became regretful and he has considered His Holiness' martyrdom as the result of his negligent and guilt in the killing of Othman as well as the main reason of such an event

This is our question for the Sunnite scholars that at last, the commander of the faithful (peace be upon him) has defended Othman or not? And if His Holiness defended Othman then why do you quote such a shameful and insulting comments?

And if His Holiness did not defend Othman then what was the real reason of that? Has he deserved Othman to be killed and regarded his murderers rightful ones?

In fact what was the real intent of the writer of this article?

did he really intend to prove that the commander of the faithful (peace be upon him) was negligent in the case of Othman's murder (we take refuge to Allah the Almighty) and did not defend him? if so then the commander of the faithful (peace be upon him) deserved Othman to be killed and accepting such a point necessarily destroy the foundation of the Sunnites religion

fifthly; to compare the Qaliphs to cow is an insult itself and if a Shiite has presented such a comparison then the Sunnite gentlemen would destroy him but you are free to say anything they like

GOOD LUCK

THE BOARD OF ADDRESSING THE RELIGIOUS DOUBTS
THE RESEARCH INSTITUTE OF HIS HOLINESS IMAM OF THE AGE
(MAY GOD PRECIPITATE HIS BLESSING REAPPEARANCE)