

IN THE NAME OF ALLAH, THE COMPASSIONATE
THE MERCIFUL

Has the narration “ no one claimed my superiority over Abu Bakr and Omar unless I punished him for this false accusation” been authentically quoted from the commander of the faithful (peace be upon him)?

THE BOARD OF IMAM ALI (PEACE BE UPON HIM)

A QUESTION BY; Shahin Moqim

The elaboration of the question

The above-mentioned narration has been quoted in the Sunnite books such as Fazael Al-Sahabah of Ahmad Ibn Hanbal as a clear indication of the legitimacy of the Caliphate of Abu Bakr which means that the commander of the faithful Ali Ibn Abi Taleb (peace be upon them) stated that; on one claimed my superiority over Abu Bakr and Omar unless I punished him for this false accusation

THE BRIEF RESPONSE

- 1, the above-mentioned narration has problems in terms of its proof
- 2, most of the companions and the followers have considered the precedence and superiority of His Holiness Ali (peace be upon him)
- 3, the acknowledgement of Abu Bakr pertaining to the lack of his superiority
- 4, the emphasis of His Holiness Ali (peace be upon him) pertaining to his own precedence and superiority
- 5, this punishment order has not been implemented for anyone

6, the emphasis of the holy prophet of GOD (peace and bless of GOD be upon him and his progeny) pertaining to the precedence of His holiness Ali (peace be upon him)

THE DETAILED RESPONSE

1, the weakness of the proof of the narration

Ahmad Ibn Hanbal has quoted this narration in the book Fazaal Al-Sahabah in such a manner that

حدثنا عبد الله ، قال : حدثني هدية بن عبد الوهاب ، قال : ثنا أحمد ابن إدريس ، قال : ثنا محمد بن طلحة ، عن أبي عبيدة بن الحكم ، عن الحكم بن جحل ، قال : سمعت عليا يقول : لا يفضلني أحد على أبي بكر وعمر إلا جلده حد المفتري.

Hakam Ibn Jahal says that; I heard from Ali (peace be upon him) that stated; no one claimed my superiority over Abu Bakr and Omar unless I punished him for this false accusation

And then he has said after the mentioning of the chain of the proofs of the narration that

وهو من زيادات عبد الله بن أحمد .

This narration has been manipulated by Abd Allah Ibn Ahmad

The researcher of the above book” Fazaal Al-Sahabah” has said in the margin of that book

إسناده ضعيف لأجل أبي عبيدة بن الحكم ومحمد بن طلحة لم يتبين لي من

هو؟

The proof of this narration is weak as a result of the presence of Abi Abd Allah Ibn Ahmad and I did not figure out who Mohammad Ibn Talhah is?

-Fazaal Al-Sahabe, v 1 p 83, no 49, 1/ 294, no 387, Researched by: D. Vasiollah Muhammad Abbas, Resalat Institute, Beirut

Aqili writes in the book Al-Zoafa after the quotation of this narration pertaining to Mohammad Ibn Talhah who has been mentioned in the proof of the narration that

وضَعفه يحيى، وروى عن عبد الله بن أحمد قال سمعت يحيى بن معين
يقول: كان يقال: ثلاثة يتقى حديثهم، محمد بن طلحة وإيوب بن عتبة وفليح.

Yahya has regarded Mohammad Ibn Talha as a weak man and it has been quoted from Abd Allah Ibn Ahmad that he constantly said; there are 3 men that we have to reject their narrations; Mohammad Ibn Talha, Ayub Ibn Otbah and Falih Ibn Solayman

-Zoafa Al-Aghili, v 1 p 108, v 4 p 85, Refer to: Tahzib Al-Kamal, Mazi, v 25 p 420, Seir Alam Al-Nobala, v 7 p 353, Mizan Al-
Etedal, v 3 p 365, Al-Jaraha Al-Tadil, Al-Razi, v 7 p 292, Al-Kamel, Abdullah Ben Adi, v 6 p 236,....

2, the majority of the companions and the followers had considered the precedence of His Holiness Ali (peace be upon him) over the others

Tarmazi who died in 279 Hejrah has quoted from Ayesah via his own proofs that

روى الترمذي، بإسناده عن جميع بن عمير قال : دخلت مع عمّتي على
عائشة فسألت: أيّ الناس كان أحبّ إلى رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلّم؟ قالت :
فاطمة، فقيل: من الرجال؟ قالت: زوجها....

Jami Ibn Omar says that; my aunt and I met Ayesah and asked her; who was the most popular man in the view of the holy prophet of GOD (peace and bless of GOD be upon him and his progeny)? In response she said that; the most beloved women in the view of His Holiness was Fatima (peace be upon her) and among the men his husband His Holiness Ali (peace be upon him)

Tarmazi says after the quotation of the narration that;

هذا حديث حسن غريب

This narration is a sound and strange saying

-Sonan Al-Termezi, v 5 p 362, Al-Mostadrak, Hakem Neishaburi, (died in 405 hejira), v 3 p 157, Al-Estiab Ibn Abd Al-Ber, (died in 462 hejira), v 4 p 1897

Zahabi says that

ليس تفضيل علي برفض ولا هو ببدعة ، بل قد ذهب إليه خلق من الصحابة والتابعين.

To consider the precedence and superiority of (His Holiness) Ali (peace be upon him) is not an innovation nor a baseless issue rather than some of the companions and the followers believe in such a thing

-Seir Alam Al-Nobala, v 16 p 457

Ibn Abd Al-Bar, one of the Sunnite great scholars has quoted in the book Al-Estilab which is one of the most authentic narrative books that

وروي عن سلمان ، وأبي ذر ، والمقداد ، وخباب ، وجابر ، وأبي سعيد الخدري ، وزيد بن أرقم : أنّ علي بن أبي طالب - رضي الله عنه - أول من أسلم ، وفضله هؤلاء على غيره.

It has been quoted from Salman, Abu Zar, Meqdad, Hobab, Jaber, Abu Saeed Khadri and Zayd Ibn Arqam that; Ali Ibn Abi taleb (peace be upon them) was the first man who became Moslem and the above-mentioned companions whose names have been mentioned considers him (His Holiness Ali peace be upon him) as the most precedence one

-Al-Estiab Fi Marefat Al-Ashab, v 3 p 1090

Ibn Hazm says in his own book Al-Fasl that

اختلف المسلمون في من هو أفضل الناس بعد الأنبياء ، فذهب بعض أهل السنة وبعض المعتزلة وبعض المرجئة وجميع الشيعة : إلى أن أفضل الأمة بعد رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم : علي بن أبي طالب - رضي الله عنه - . وقد روينا هذا القول نضا عن بعض الصحابة - رضي الله عنهم - وعن جماعة من التابعين والفقهاء.

There was a disagreement among the Moslems pertaining to who is the most eminent man after the holy apostles of GOD. And some of Motazalah

and some of Morjaah and the majority of Shiites believe that the most precedence man after the holy prophet of GOD (peace and bless of GOD be upon him and his progeny) is (His Holiness) Ali (peace be upon him) and we quoted this narration as the main text from some of the companions, the followers and Faqihs (the religious jurists)

-Al-Fasl Fi Al-Melal va Al-Nahl, v 4 p 181

Ibn Jozi in the book Manaqeb Ahmad has quoted from the son of Ahmad Ibn Hanbal that

عبد الله بن أحمد بن حنبل يقول : حدثت أبي بحديث سفينه فقلت . . ما تقول في التفضيل ؟ قال : في الخلافة أبو بكر وعمر وعثمان ، فقلت : فعلي؟ قال : عليّ من أهل بيت لا يقاس بهم أحد.

Abd Allah the son of Ahmad Ibn Hanbal says that; I quoted the narration of Safinah for my father and then I asked him; what do you think about the virtue of the companions after the holy prophet of GOD? And he said that; pertaining to the Caliphate at first Abu Bakr is the most merit man and after him Omar and after him is Othman and I said; what about (His Holiness) Ali (peace be upon him) he responded that; (His Holiness) Ali (peace be upon him) who is considered one of Ahl Al-Bayt then no one is more superior than them (Ahl Al-Bayt peace be upon them)

-Managheb Al-Emam Ahmad le Ibn Al-Jozi, p 163

3, the acknowledgment of Abu Bakr pertaining to the lack of his superiority

The Sunnite narrators have quoted from Abu Bakr that he has said;

I accepted your leadership while I was not the best man among you

وَلَيْتَكُمْ وَ لَسْتُ بِخَيْرِكُمْ .

-Tabaghat Ibn Sad, v 3 p 182, Tavit Mokhtalef Al-Hadith, Le Ibn Ghotabe, (died in 276), p 109, Dar Al-Jeil, Beirut, Researched by: Muhammad Zahari Al-Najar, Tarikh Medina Damascus, v 30, p 304, Takhrij Al-Ahadith va Al-Athar Lel Ziali (died in 762), Dar Ibn Khazime Al-Riyadh and gharib Al-Hadith Lel Khatabi, (died in 388), Jameat Omol Ghora, Researched by: Abd Al-Karim Al-Azabavi, Tafsir Al-Ghartabi, v 3 p 262, Gharib Al-Hadith, v 2 p 35, Al-Emamat Al-Siyasat, p 22, Al-Aghd Al-Farid, v 5, p 13, Al-Saghifat va Fadak, Johari, p 52, Al-Meyar Al-Movazenat, Jafar Al-Eskafi, p 39, Sharh Nahaj Al-Balaghe, Ibn Abi Al-Hadid, v 1 p 169, v 2 p 56, Kanz Al-Emal, v 5 p 636, Al-Badayat Al-Nahayat, Ibn Kathir, v 5 p 269

And in another narration he has said that

أقبلوني ولست بخيركم.

Leave me alone (and go to the superior man than me) since I am not the best men among you

-Majma Al-Zavaed, v 5 p 183, Sirat Ibn Hesham, v 1 p 661, Tarikh Al-AI-Kholafa, p 71, Sharh Al-Nahaj lel Motazeli, v 1 p 169, Tafsir Al-Ghartabi, v 1 p 272, Al-Seir Al-Kabir lel Sheibani, v 1 p 36, Al-Emamat Al-Siyasat, v 1 p 31, Al-Meyar Al-Movazenat lel Eskafi, p 39, Al-Mojam Al-Aowsat Lel Tabarani, v 7 p 267, Kanz Al-Emal, v 5 p 631

And if they say that Abu Bakr has said such a thing as a result of his humility then it has to be said that; in such a point that such a sentence causes to mislead and deceive the people then humility is meaningless

4, The emphasis of His Holiness Ali (peace be upon him) pertaining to his precedence and superiority

Ibn Abi Hadid motazeli quotes that

ابن ابي الحديد معتزلي نقل مي كند:
وقال عثمان لعلي عليه السلام إنك إن تربصت بي فقد تربصت بمن ه و خير
مني ومنك، قال: ومن هو خير مني؟ قال: أبو بكر وعمر.

Othman said to (His Holiness) Ali (peace be upon him) that if you was waiting for me then I was expecting another man better than you? His Holiness stated that; and who is better than me? Othman said that; Abu Bakr and Omar

His Holiness stated that; you are telling a lie I am better than you and both of those two (Abu Bakr and Omar) since I has worshiped Allah the Almighty before and after you

-Sharh Nahaj Al-Balaghe Motazeli, v 10 joz 20 p 25, Ehtejaj Tabarsi, v 1 p 229, Managheb Ibn Shahr Ashub, v 1 p 289, Al-Mastar shod Tabari, p 227, Al-Fosul Al-Mokhtar, Sheikh Mofid, p 261

5 this punishment order has not been implemented pertaining to anyone

If this narration is authentic then why His Holiness the commander of the faithful (peace be upon him) has not implemented this order of punishment

pertaining to anyone while all of the Ahl Al-Bayt (peace be upon them) and the majority of the companions and the followers regarded His Holiness superior and more precedence over Abu Bakr and Omar

And the holy prophet of GOD (peace and bless of GOD be upon him and his progeny) was the first person who set forth the precedence an superiority of Ali (peace be upon him) over the others and if the above-mentioned narration is accurate (we take refuge to Allah the Almighty) then this order of punishment had to be implemented toward the holy prophet of GOD

6, the emphasis of the holy prophet of GOD (peace and bless of GOD be upon him and his progeny) pertaining to the precedence of His Holiness Ali (peace be upon him) over the others

If this narration was right then (we take refuge to Allah the Almighty) this order of punishment had to be implemented toward the holy prophet of GOD (peace and bless of GOD be upon him and his progeny) since that His holiness in every time and everywhere has declared the superiority of His Holiness Ali (peace be upon him) over the other men as it was occurred in the story of Mobahalah (the cursing ceremony)

It has been mentioned in the book Sahih Bokhari and most of the Sunnite authentic books that

ولمّا نزلت هذه الآية : (فقلّ تعالوا ندع أبناءنا وأبنائكم) دعا رسول الله ص عليّاً وفاطمة وحسناً وحسيناً فقال : اللهم هؤلاء أهلي.

And when this verse has been revealed

-Sahih Moslem, v 7 p 120, hadith 6373, v 5 p 23 hadith 32, Kitab Fazaal Al-Sahabe, chapter Fazaal Ali, Mosnad Ahmad, v 1 p 185, Sahih Termezi, v 5 p 596, Al-Mostadrak Ala Sahihein, v 3 p 150, Fatah Al-Bari, v 7 p 60, Tafsir Al-Tabari, v 3 p 212, Al-Dor Al-Manthur, v 2 p 38, Al-Kamel Fi Al-Tarikh, v 2 p 293

The holy prophet of GOD (peace and bless of GOD be upon him and his progeny) called Ali, Fatima, Hasan and Hossein and stated that; O my Lord, these are my household

Zamakhshari has mentioned in the below of this verse that

وفيه دليل لا شئ أقوى منه على فضل أصحاب الكساء عليهم السلام.

And in this verse the most significant reason of the precedence and the superiority of the Kasa narration has been mentioned and there is no powerful reason than that

-Al-Kashef, v 1 p 370

And too many other cases which they take time such as

A, the contract of brotherhood between His Holiness and Ali (peace be upon him)

B, to close the whole doors leaded to the Mosque of the holy prophet of GOD (Masjed Al-Nabi) with the exception of the door of the house of the commander of the faithful (peace be upon him)

C, the announcement of His Holiness as the most merit man equal to his daughter Her Holiness Fatima (peace be upon her) while the majority of the great companions proposed to marry her

D, to appoint His Holiness as his Qaliph and successor

E, His Holiness frequently stated that; whoever loves Ali then in fact he loves Allah the Almighty and His prophet as well as Allah the Almighty and His prophet love him

F, The holy prophet of GOD announced Ali (Peace be upon him) toward himself as Aaron to Moses

G, to announce the friendship with His Holiness as the friendship with himself and hostility toward His Holiness as the enmity toward himself

GOOD LUCK

THE BOARD OF ADDRESSING THE RELIGIOUS DOUBTS

THE RESEARCH INSTITUTE OF HIS HOLINESS IMAM OF THE AGE

(MAY GOD PRECIPITATE HIS REAPPEARANCE)

