

IN THE NAME OF ALLAH, THE COMPASSIONATE  
THE MERCIFUL

**Were the children of Abd Al-Motaleb more than 17 men in the case of Yom Al-Dar?**

THE BOARD OF IMAMATE AND CALIPHATE

A question by; Ali Alavi, the lover of Ahl Al-Bayt and devotee of Ahl Al-Bayt

THE ELABORATION OF QUESTION

One of the narrations which has been quoted to a high successive extent by Shiites and Sunnites as well as it is one of the most important reason which implies in the Imamate of the commander of the faithful (peace be upon him) is the narration of Yom Al-Dar. The holy prophet of GOD (peace and bless of GOD be upon him and his progeny) has invited his own relatives and the children of Abd Al-Motaleb who were around 40 men in that day in his house and announced his own prophecy as well as the Imamate of the commander of the faithful (peace be upon him) to them

Some of the opponents such as Ibn Taymyah Harani has called this narration into question and claimed that this narration is a false and forge - saying since the children of Abd Al-Motaleb were not more than 40 men in that day rather than they were less than 17 men

What is your response to this religious doubt?

The brief response

1- the most significant answer to this question is that in spite of the narration which implies in the number 40 of these men but the number of the men in the house of the holy prophet of GOD does not necessarily concern with the issue itself

2, Ibn Taymyah says that; this narration is one of the false sayings and for this reason it has not been mentioned in any narrative book

أن بني عبد المطلب لم يبلغوا أربعين رجلا حين نزلت هذه الآية ... هذا الحديث كذب عند أهل المعرفة بالحديث ... ولهذا لم يروه أحد منهم في الكتب التي يرجع إليها في المنقولات.

-Menhaj Al-Sonat, Ibn Teimiye , v 7, p 302

3, we are going to prove the falsity of Ibn Taymyah's claim with referral to some of the Sunnite authentic narrative sources such as; Mosnad Ahmad Hanbal which have quoted the narration of Anzar

... ففعلت ما أمرني به، ثم دعوتهم له وهم يومئذ أربعون رجلا يزيدون رجلا أو بقصونة، فيهم أعمامه أبو طالب وحمزة والعباس وأبو لهب ...

-Tarikh Tabari, v 2, p 62 , Al-Kamel Fi Al-Tarikh, v 1, p 487

5, the correction of the narration of Yom AL-Dar

a, IbN Jarir Tabari according to the quotation of Motaqi Hendi in the book Kanz Al-Omal, v 13, p 128, No 36408

b, Haythami in the book Majma Al-Zavaed, v 8, p 302

## The detailed response

The text of the this religious doubt has been set forth by Ibn Taymayah and he says in his own book in an effort to reject the narration of Yom Al-Dar which has been quoted in a successive extent that

أن بني عبد المطلب لم يبلغوا أربعين رجلا حين نزلت هذه الآية

The number of the children of Abd Al-Motaleb at the time of the revelation of this verse (invite your own relatives) were not reached to 40 men at all (thus it has been said that the holy prophet of GOD (peace and bless of GOD be upon him and his progeny) has gathered 40 men of Abd Al-

Motaleb family is a false claim thus the text of the narration Yom Al-Anzar is a forge one)

-Menhaj Al-Sonat, Ibn Teimiye, v 7, p 302

### The most essential response

The essential answer to this religious doubt of Ibn Taymyah that the number of Abd Al-Motaleb's children were not 40 men is that

In spite of the availability of the authentic and accurate sayings in the Sunnite texts pertaining to the 40 men of that family which will be mentioned below as well as it has been mentioned this number as 40 or 30 men in some narrations and all of these cases imply that these numbers do not impact on the main subject and the importance of this issue is not concerned with the number of the men who were present in that meeting rather than the main point is the occurrence of this story in the house of His Holiness with a high number of Abd Al-Motaleb's children and the announcement of His Holiness Ali (peace be upon him) as His Holiness; Qaliph, heir and successor now it is not important whether they were 40 men or 30 or more or less

But Ibn Taymyah, in fact, has made efforts to put out the light which has been by Allah the Almighty but he is unaware that He stated that

يُرِيدُونَ لِيُطْفِئُوا نُورَ اللَّهِ بِأَفْوَاهِهِمْ وَاللَّهُ مُنِيرٌ نُورِهِ وَلَوْ كَرِهَ الْكَافِرُونَ

888

Therefore, sometime he sets forth some religious doubts pertaining to the proofs and the other times regarding to its referral or the text of the narration in an effort to deny the truth of one of the most evident historical event which has been happened after the revelation of the holy verse

هذا الحديث كذب عند أهل المعرفة بالحديث ، فما من ع الم يعرف الحديث إلا وهو يعلم أنه كذب موضوع ، ولهذا لم يروه أحد منهم في الكتب التي يرجع إليها في المنقولات ، لأن أدنى من له معرفة بالحديث يعلم أن هذا كذب ...

888

Thus in his own book says pertaining to this successive and certain proof narration in the eyes of Shiites as well as Sunnite that

ع

This narration is a false claim in the view of the narration experts and there is no one who is knowledgeable about the science of narration unless he is certain about the falsity and manipulation of this narration and for this reason, none of them narrated this saying in their own narrative sources

-Menhaj Al-Sonat, Ibn Teimiye, v 7, p 302

### The texts which quoted the narration of Yom Al-Dar

In this point it is worth-mentioning that this narration has been quoted by Ahmad Ibn Hanbal in his own Mosnad in volume 1, page 111 as well as Haytham says after the narration of this saying that

رواه أحمد ، ورجاله ثقات .

Ahmad has quoted this narration and its narrators are authentic

-Majma Al-Zavaed, Heithami, v 8, p 302

And Nasaei has mentioned this narration in Khasaes p 133, the narration 66

And also Bazar, Tabarani in the book Al-Osat has mentioned that in a brief manner as well as Ibn Eshaq, Tabari, Tahavi, Ibn Abi Hatam, Ibn Mardaviah, Abi Naim, Zya Al-Moqadasi and most of the other narrators have quoted this narration via accurate proof

Did not the number of the children of Abd Al-Motaleb reach to 40 men?

the holy prophet of GOD (peace and bless of GOD be upon him and his progeny) invited around 40 men of the children of Abd Al-Motaleb in the early days of His Holiness' public announcement of the prophecy (however this number has been said in some texts around 30 or more or less than

that) and after the public announcement of his own prophecy appointed a man as his own brother, heir and successor and the Qaliph after His Holiness but in each time when the holy prophet of GOD asked for cooperation no one accepted His Holiness' invitation except Ali Ibn abi Taleb (peace be upon them)

Ibn Taymyah with the presentation of this religious doubt that the children of Abd Al-Motaleb were less than 40 men at that day has made effort to call into question the text of this narration

Now in this point, we are going to refer to some of the Sunnite historical texts and proofs which both imply in the exact occurrence of this event as well as the number 40 of the participants in this meeting

### The text of the narration

Tabari writes in his own history book via the quotation from the commander of the faithful (peace be upon him) that

عن علي بن أبي طالب قال : «لَمَّا نَزَلَتْ هَذِهِ آيَةُ عَلَى رَسُولِ اللَّهِ (ص):  
(وَأَنْذِرْ عَشِيرَتَكَ الْأَقْرَبِينَ) دَعَانِي رَسُولُ اللَّهِ (ص) فَقَالَ: يَا عَلِيُّ، إِنَّ اللَّهَ أَمَرَنِي أَنْ  
أَنْذِرَ عَشِيرَتِي الْأَقْرَبِينَ...

اجمع لي بني عبد المطلب حتى أكلمهم وأبلغهم ما أمرت به.

ففعلت ما أمرني به، ثم دعوتهم له وهم يومئذ أربعون رجلاً أو

بئقصونه، فيهم أعمامه أبو طالب وحمزة والعباس وأبو لهب ...

When this holy verse revealed that “announce your prophecy to your nrear relatives” the holy prophet of GOD (peace and bless of GOD be upon him and his progeny) called me and stated that O Ali, Allah the Almighty has ordered me to invite my near relatives and people to Islam (Anzar) ..

Go and invite the chidren of Abd Al-Motaleb to my house in order to talk to them and to announce my mission to them

And I did as the holy prophet of GOD (peace and bless of GOD be upon him and his progeny) ordered me and invited them to the house of HIS

Holiness and that day the number of the guests were 40 or even more or less and Abu Taleb, Hamzah, Abbass and Abu Lahab the uncles of the holy prophet of GOD (peace and bless of GOD be upon him and his progeny) were among them

-Tarikh Al-Tabari, v 2, p 62 , Al-Kamel Fi Al-Tarikh, v 1, p 487 , Al-Badayat Al-Nahayat, v 3 p 53 , Tafsir Ibn Kasir, v 3 p 363, Tarikh Madina Damascus , Ibn Asakor, v 42 p 48 , Al-Kashf , Al-Bayat Al-Marof be Tafsir Al-Thalabi, v 7 p 182 , Shavahed Al-Tanzil, v 1 p 580, 420,421, 486 , Kanz

## The correction of the narration's proof

Some of the Sunnite great figures that their names have been mentioned below have corrected the proof of the narration Yom Al-Dar

- 1, IbnJarir Tabari according to the quotation of Motaqi Hendi in the book Kanz Al-Omal, v 13, p 128, No 36408
2. Haythami in the book Majma Al-Zavaed, v 8, p 302
- 3, Abu Jafar Eskafi in the book Sharh Nahj Al-Balaqah Ibn Abi al-Hadid , v 13, p 243
- 4, Hakem Nayshaburi in Al-Mostadrak Al-Sahihayn, v 3, p 132
- 5, Zahabi in Takhlis Al-Mostadrak, in a detailed narration
- 6, Shahab Khafaji in his own description of the book Al-Shefa from Qazi Ayaz
- 7, Nasim Al-Ryaz, v 3, p 35
- 8, the quotation of this saying (Yom Al-Dar) in the book Al-Mokhtarah from Zya Al-Moqadasi who has obliged himself not to quote any narration in his own book unless that narration has had an authentic and accurate proof which this is a clear mark of the authenticity and accuracy of this narration's proof as some men have born witness pertaining to this case such as; Abd Allah Ibn Sediq Maqrebi in the book rad Etebar Al-Jame Al-Saqir, p 42

GOOD LUCK

THE BOARD OF THE RELIGIOUS DOUBT  
THE RESEARCH INSTITUTE OF HIS HOLINESS IMAM OF THE AGE  
(MAY GOD PRECIPITATE HIS BLESSING REAPPEARNCE)