

An investigation into the document of the tradition «عليّ ولي كل مؤمن بعدي» from Sunni viewpoint

Raising a doubt:

The tradition of «عليّ ولي كل مؤمن بعدي» is one of the traditions proving the Imamate of Amir Al-Momenan (saalam of God be upon him) and has been quoted by authentic documents mentioned in the Sunnis' books but because it has been criticized by some so we aim at answering these doubts and criticisms in this article such as:

About this tradition, Ibn Taymiyah says:

قوله « هو ولي كل مؤمن بعدي » **كذب على رسول الله** صلى الله عليه و سلم .

This tradition quoted by the Messenger of God (peace and Saalam be upon) saying: Ali is the Vali of all Momenin after my death” is a false tradition attributed to the Messenger of God (peace and Saalam be upon him).

- Ibn Taymiyyah , Ahmad ibn Abdul Halim al-Harani , died 728 A.H. , Menhaj al-Sunnah al-Nobovyah , vol. 7 , p. 391 , Dar al-Nashr : Institute of Qurtabah – 1406 A.H. , al-Tabaha : 1 , Research : Dr. Muhammad Reshad Salem .

Also Mobarakfori (died 1353H) writes:

1- « وهو ولي كل مؤمن من بعدي » كذا في بعض النسخ بزيادة «من» و وقع في بعضها « بعدي » بحذف « من » وكذا وقع في رواية أحمد في مسنده 2- و قد استدل به الشيعة على أن عليا رضي الله عنه ، كان خليفة بعد رسول الله من غير فصل و استدلالهم به عن هذا باطل فإن مداره عن صحة زيادة لفظ «بعدي» وكونها صحيحة محفوظة قابلة للاحتجاج .
3- و الأمر ليس كذلك فإنها : قد تفرد بها جعفر بن سليمان و هو شيعي بل هو غال في التشيع . . . وقال بن حبان في كتاب الثقات حدثنا الحسن بن سفيان حدثنا إسحاق بن أبي كامل حدثنا جرير بن يزيد بن هارون بين يدي أبيه قال بعثني أبي إلى جعفر فقلت بلغنا أنك تسب أبا بكر وعمر قال أما السب فلا ولكن البغض ما شئت فإذا هو رافضي الحمار انتهى . . . قال في التقريب : جعفر بن سليمان الضبعي أبو سليمان البصري صدوق زاهد لكنه كان يتشيع انتهى وكذا في الميزان وغيره .

1. The tradition of « وهو ولي كل مؤمن من بعدي » has been mentioned in some versions with the addition of «من» and in another cases, only the word «بعدي» has been mentioned without the use of the word «من» in the same way it has been quoted in the book of Masnad by Ahmad Ibn Hanbal.

2. Shias (in justifying their reasons to the Sunnis) has justified this tradition by referring to the books of the Sunnis in this respect that Ali (saalam of God be upon him) is the first caliph of the Messenger of God (S.a) and their justification is invalid because two cases make the core authenticity of this justification.

a. The word “next” should be used in this tradition.

b. This tradition would be authentic and justifiable according to its document.

3. It is not true (and this tradition has not these two characteristics) because it has only been quoted by Jafar Ibn Soleiman who is Shia and especially Ghali Shia (it should be noted that the words such as Ghali and Rafezi shia and Ghali in Rafaz have been created by the Sunnis). In his book, Al- Seghat, Ibn Haban says about him: Hassan Ibn Sofyan and Isaq Ibn Kamel have reported from Jarir Ibn Yazid Ibn Haroon that saying: my father sent me to Jafar Ibn Soleiman. I told him: we heard that you cursed Abu Bakr and Ummar. He said: not cursing but I am hostile toward him a lot. (Ibn Haban says) therefore he is Rafezi and donkey... Ibn Jafar writes in the book “ Taghrib Al- Tahzib” (about Jafar) : Jafar ibn Soleiman Zobe Abu Soleiman Basari was so trustful and pious man but Shia. Zahabi and others have used these words (about him) in the book “ Mizan Al- Etedal”.

4- و ظاهر أن قوله «بعدي» في هذا الحديث مما يقوى به معتقدا الشيعة وقد تقرر في مقره أن المبتدع إذا روى شيئا يقوى به بدعته فهو مردود قال الشيخ عبد الحق الدهلوي في مقدمته : والمختار أنه إن كان داعيا إلى بدعته ومروجا له رد وإن لم يكن كذلك قبل إلا أن يروي شيئا يقوى به بدعته فهو مردود قطعاً انتهى .

4. It is evident that the word “next” uttered by the Messenger of God (S.a) has enhanced the Shia belief (regarding the first Caliph, Ali (saalam of God be upon him)) while it has been proved that if an innovator (Shia and here Jafar Ibn Soleiman) reports a tradition supporting his innovation, from the Messenger of God (S.A) (to the Sunnis), his tradition will be cancelled as Sheikh Abdolhagh Dehlavi says in his introduction: my opinion is that if a narrator who is an innovator promotes his innovation, it can be said that his tradition is

invalid otherwise acceptable unless he reports a tradition promoting his innovation which in this case this tradition is definitely invalid.

5- فإن قلت : لم يتفرد بزيادة قوله «بعدي» جعفر بن سليمان بل تابعه عليها أجليح الكندي فروى الإمام أحمد في مسنده هذا الحديث من طريق أجليح الكندي عن عبد الله بن بريدة عن أبيه بريدة قال بعث رسول الله بعثين إلى اليمن علي أحدهما علي بن أبي طالب وعلى الآخر خالد بن الوليد الحديث وفيه آخ ره « لا تقع في علي فإنه مني وأنا منه و هو وليكم بعدي و إنه مني وأنا منه وهو وليكم بعدي » .
قلت : أجليح الكندي هذا أيضا شيعي قال في التقریب : أجليح بن عبد الله بن حجية يكنى أبا حجية الكندي يقال اسمه يحيى صدوق شيعي انتهى وكذا في الميزان وغيره .

5. If they find fault with this issue that this tradition with the addition of “next” has not only been reported by Jafar Soleiman but by Ajlah Kondi and as in his Masnad, Ahmad Ibn Hanbal has reported it from Ajlah Kondi who has reported from Abdollah Ibn Borideh that he reported from him father, Borideh that he said: the Messenger of God (S.A) sent two groups to Yaman and appointed Ali Ibn Abi Talib (saalam of God be upon him) as the leader of one group and Khalid Ibn Valid as the leader of another group. He continues that: the Messenger of God (S.A) said: don't curse Ali because he belongs to me and will be your Vali after my death,

I will answer that: Ibn Ajlah Kondi has Shia religion. In his book, Taghrib Al- Tahzib, Ibn Hajar says (about him): Ajlah Ibn Abdollah Ibn Hojjiyeh whose nickname is Abu Hojjiyeh Kondi and it has been said that his name is Yahya is very trustful man and has the Shia religion. These descriptions have also been given (about him) in the Zahabi's book namely, Mizan Al- Etedal and other books.

6- و الظاهر أن زيادة «بعدي» في هذا الحديث من وهم هذين الشيعيين و يؤيده أن الإمام أحمد روى في مسنده هذا الحديث من عدة طرق ليست في واحدة منها هذه الزيادة :
فمنها ما رواه من طريق الفضل بن دكين حدثنا بن أبي عيينة عن الحسن عن سعيد بن جبير عن بن عباس عن بريدة قال عزوت مع علي اليمن فرأيت منه جفوة الحديث وفي آخره فقال يا بريدة ألسنت أولى بالمؤمنين من أنفسهم قلت بلى يا رسول الله قال : « من كنت مولاه فعلي مولاه » .
ومنها ما رواه من طريق أبي معاوية حدثنا الأعمش عن سعيد بن عبيدة عن بن بريدة عن أبيه قال بعثنا رسول الله في سرية الحديث وفي آخره من كنت وليه فعلي وليه ومنها ما رواه من طريق وكيع حدثنا الأعمش عن سعد بن عبيدة عن بن بريدة عن أبيه أنه مر على مجلس وهم يتناولون من علي الحديث وفي آخره من كنت وليه فعلي وليه فظهر بهذا كله أن زيادة لفظ «بعدي» في هذا الحديث ليست بمحفوظة بل هي مردودة فاستدلال الشيعة بها على أن عليا رضي الله عنه كان خليفة بعد رسول الله من غير فصل باطل جدا هذا ما عندي والله تعالى أعلم ...

6. Superficially, the hallucination of these two Shias (Jafar Ibn Soleiman and Ajlah Kondi) is the source of the addition of the word “next” to this tradition. Our justification is that Ahmad Ibn Hanbal has reported this tradition in his Masnad using different documents and methods while none of them have this added word (the word “next”).

Among these tradition is a tradition that Ahmad reported from Fazl Ibn Dakin who has reported it from Abu Ayyineh from Hasan from Saeed Ibn Jabir from Ibn Abbas from Borideh that he said: I and Ali oarticipated in the battle of Yaman and I saw something unpleasant with him.... So that the Messenger of God (S.A) said: O, Borideh! Don't have I precedence over Momenin? They said: yes, O, the Messenger of God (S.A). He said: whomsoever I had been Master (Mula), Ali is to be his Master. Another tradition is that Ahmad has it reported from Abu Moaviyah from Aamash from Saeed Ibn Obaydeh from Ibn Boreideh from his father that he said: the Messenger of God (s.A) sent us to a battle... the Messenger of God (s.a) said: “whomsoever I had been Master (Mula), Ali is to be his Master”.

The third tradition has been reported by Ahmad from Vaki and Al- Aamash from Saad Ibn Obaydeh from Ibn Borideh from his father that he said: one day he was passing in front of the Mitting of Mohaddesin.... The Prophet said: whomsoever I had been Master (Mula), Ali is to be his Master”.

According to above subject, the added word “next” in this tradition is not authentic therefore, shias' reference to this tradition to justify that Ali (May God be satisfied with him) is the immediate caliph of the Messenger of God is really invalid. This is my utmost knowledge power and the Almighty God has full knowledge.

فإن قلت : لم يتفرد جعفر بن سليمان بقوله « هو ولي كل مؤمن بعدي » بل وقع هذا اللفظ في حديث بريدة عند أحمد في مسنده ففي آخره « لا تقع في علي فإنه مني وأنا منه وهو وليكم بعدي وإن ه مني وأنا منه وهو وليكم بعدي » قلت : تفرد بهذا اللفظ في حديث بريدة ، أجلح الكندي و هو أيضا شيعي .

And if you want to say: the tradition of « هو ولي كل مؤمن بعدي » is not only reported by Jafar Ibn Soleiman but by Borideh (Sahabi) in the book of Masnad written by Ahmad that its last part is “don't curse Ali because he belongs to me and I belongs to him and he is to be your Vali after my death”

I will answer: this tradition with this added word has only been reported by Ajlah Kondi who has the Shia religion.

Al-Mubarak Fouri , Muhammad Abdul Rahman ibn Abdul Rahim Abu Al-Ahla , Tohfah al-Ahouzi Besharh Jameh al-Tirmidhi , vol. 10 , p. 146 , 147 , Died 1353 A.H. , Dar al-Nashr : Dar al-kotob al-Elmyah – Beirut .

The gist of Mobarakfori's words:

As you observed, his long remarks indicated only one issue which is : this tradition cannot be seen in the sources of the Sunnis with the word “next” and authentic document.

He has mentioned two reasons to justify his claim:

1. This tradition has no more than two documents in the sources of the Sunnis and although all the narrators of these two documents are trustful ones, one shia narrator (Jafar Ibn Soleiman in one case and Ajlah Ibn Abdollah Kondi in another one) can be seen in both of them.
2. This tradition supports the Shia belief therefore, it is invalid.

Then, he cites the name of a witness to prove his remarks: Ahmad Ibn Hanbal reports this tradition in many ways but none of them has this added word.

Answering the claims of Mobarakfori:

Firstly, it should be noted that this tradition quoted from the Messenger of God (S.A) has been reflected in the first-rate sources of the Sunnis in various ways which below, some of them have been mentioned:

1- « عليّ وليّ كل مؤمن بعدي »

- Al-ketab al-Musnaf fi al-Ahadith va al-Asar , Author name : Abu Bakr Abdullah ibn Muhammad ibn Abi Shaibah al-kufi , died 235 A.H. , vol. 6 , p. 372 , Dar al-Nashr : Maktabah al-Roshd – Riyadh – 1409 A.H. , al-Tabaha : 1 , Research : kamal Yusuf al-Hout .

2- « هو وليّ كل مؤمن من بعدي »

- Musnad Ahmad ibn Hanbal , Author name : Ahmad ibn Hanbal Abu Abdullah al-Shaibani , died 241 A.H. , vol. 4 , p. 437 , Dar al-Nashr : Institute of Qurtabah – Egypt .

3- « انت وليّ كل مؤمن بعدي »

- Al-Tayalisi , Soleiman ibn Davod Abu Davod al-Farsi al-Basri , Musnad Abi Davod Tayalisi , died 204 A.H. , vol. 1 , p. 360 , H – 2752 , Dar al-Nashr : Dar al-Mahrefah – Beirut .

4- « أنت ولي كل مؤمن بعدي و مؤمنة »

- Ahmad ibn Hanbal al-Shaibani , died 241 A.H. , Fazaal al-Sahabah vol. 2 , p. 684 , H – 1168 , Dar al-Nashr : Institute of al-Resala – Beirut – 1403 A.H. , 1983 A.D. , al-Tabaha : 1 , Research : Dr. Wasiullah Muhammad Abbas .

5- « أنت ولي في كل مؤمن بعدي »

- Ahmad ibn Hanbal al-Shaibani , died 241 A.H. , Musnad Ahmad ibn Hanbal , vol. 1 , p. 330 , Dar al-Nashr : Institute of Qurtabah – Egypt .

6- « فانه وليكم بعدي »

- Al-Esabah fi Tamiiz al-Sahabah , Author name : Ahmad ibn Ali ibn Hajar Abulfazl al-Asghalani al-Shafei , died 852 A.H. , vol. 6 , p. 623 , Dar al-Nashr ; Dar al-Jil – Beirut – 1412 A.H. – 1992 A.D. , al-Tabaha : 1 , Research : Ali Muhammad al-Bedjaouwi .

7- « ان علياً وليكم بعدي »

- AL-Badayah va al-Nahayah , author name : Ismail ibn Umar ibn kasir al-Qurashi Abu al-Fada , died 774 A.H. , vol. 7 , p. 346 , Dar al-Nashr : Maktabah al-Maharef Beirut .

8- « هذا وليكم بعدي »

- Al-Sunnan al-kubra , author name : Ahmad ibn Shoaib Abu Abdul Rahman al-Nisayy , died 303 A.H. , vol. 5 , p. 133 , Dar al-Nashr : Dar al-kotob al-Elmyah – Beirut – 1411 A.H. – 1991 A.D. , al-Tabaha : 1 , Research : Dr. Abdul Qader Soleiman al-Bandari , Sayed Ksravi Hassan .

10- « أنك ولي المؤمنين من بعدي »

- Tarikh Baghdad, author name: Ahmad ibn Ali Abu Bakr al-khatib al-Baghdadi died 463 A.H. vol. 4, p. 338, Dar al-Nashr : Dar al-kotob al-Elmyah – Beirut .

11- « أنت ولي في كل مؤمن بعدي »

- Musnad Ahmad ibn Hanbal , Author name : Ahmad ibn Hanbal Abu Abdullah al-Shaibani , died 241 A.H. , vol. 1 , p. 330 , Dar al-Nashr : Institute of Qurtabah – Egypt .

12- « إنه لا ينبغي أن أذهب إلا وأنت خليفتي في كل مؤمن من بعدي »

- Al-sunnah , author name : Amr ibn Abi Asem al-zahak al-shaibani , died 287 A.H. , vol. 2 , p. 565 , Dar al-Nashr : al-Maktab al-Islami – Beirut - 1400 , al-Tabaha : 1 , Research : Muhammad Nasser al-Din al-Albani .

13- « فهو أولى الناس بكم بعدي »

- Al-Mahjam al-kabir , author name : Soleiman ibn Ahmad ibn Jacob Abu al-Qasim al-Tabarani , died 360 A.H. , vol. 22 , p. 135 , Dar al-Nashr : Maktabah al-Zahra – Mosel – 1404 A.H. – 1983 A.D. , al-Tabaha : 2 , Research : Hamdi ibn Abdul Majid AL-Salafi .

It should be mentioned that the last definition has been discussed in detail in a separate article.

The first answer:

The authentic documents not reporting by Shia narrators

Mobarakfori had said: قد تفرد بها جعفر بن سليمان : it means that this tradition has only been reported by Jafar Ibn Soleiman.

In answering this part of his claim, we say: despite of the opinion of these Aghayan, in the sources of the Sunnis, the document of this noble tradition has not exclusively been assigned to Jafar Ibn Soleiman and Ajlah Kondi but it has been quoted from the Messenger of God (s.a) and has authentic and reliable document is such a way that in the chain of its narrators, the name of these two Shia persons have not been mentioned. Also, Albani has emphasized on this point and says:

... على أن الحديث قد جاء مفرقا من طرق أخرى ليس فيها شيعي ...

... Furthermore, this tradition has been reported in many ways is such a way that none of them has the name of Shia narrator.

- Albani , : Muhammad Nasser al-Din , al-Selsalah al-Sahiha , vol. 5 , p. 222 .

Now, some cases of this Noble tradition reported in the first-rate of the sources of the Sunnis are to be given:

Tiyalesi (died 204 H):

Being among the oldest and prominent Sunni narrators, Tiyalesi reports this tradition in this way:

حدثنا يونس قال حدثنا أبو داود قال حدثنا أبو عوانة عن أبي بلج عن عمرو بن ميمون عن ابن عباس ان رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم قال لعلي : «أنت ولي كل مؤمن بعدي» .

.... Ibn Abbas reports that the Messenger of God (S.A) told Ali (A.S) that: “after my death, you are the Vali of All Momenin”.

- Al-Tayalisi , Soleiman ibn Davod Abu Davod al-Farsi al-Basri , Musnad Abi Davod Tayalisi , died 204 A.H. , vol. 1 , p. 360 , H – 2752 , Dar al-Nashr : Dar al-Mahrefah – Beirut .

Ahmad Ibn Hanbal (died in 241 H):

Also, Ahmad Ibn Hanbal- the Imam of Hanbalis- has reported this tradition in his two books namely Masnad and Fazaal Al- Sahabah:

حدثنا عبد الله حدثني أبي ثنا يحيى بن حماد ثنا أبو عوانة ثنا أبو بلج ثنا عمرو بن ميمون قال إني لجالس إلي بن عباس إذا أتاه تسعة رهط فقالوا يا أبا عباس أما إن تقوم معنا وأما أن تخلونا هو لاء قال فقال بن عباس : بل أقوم معكم قال وهو يومئذ صحيح قبل أن يعمي قال فابتدؤا فتحدثوا فلا ندري ما قالوا قال: فجاء ينفض ثوبه و يقول أف و تف وقعوا في رجل له عشر وقعوا في رجل قال له النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم . . . فقال له أما ترضى أن تكون منى بمنزلة هارون من موسى إلا أنك لست بنبي ، انه لا ينبغي أن أذهب إلا وأنت خليفتي قال : وقال له رسول الله : « أنت وليي في كل مؤمن بعدى » .

- Ahmad ibn Hanbal al-Shaibani , died 241 A.H. , Musnad Ahmad ibn Hanbal , vol. 1 , p. 330 , Dar al-Nashr : Institute of Qurtabah – Egypt .

... Amro Ibn Meimon (the student of Ibn Abbas) says: I had sat near to Ibn Abbas with some people. A group of people came to him and said: Ibn Abbas, you come to us or we would be here without the presence of strangers. Amro Ibn Meimon says: Ibn Abbas answered: I will come to you. On that time, Ibn Abbas was not sick and blind. When they met privately, he said: say your words. (Amro Ibn Ummar says :) we don't know what did they say to Ibn Abbas that when he returned and while shaking his clothes, he was saying something to himself: OF and TOF (these two words are used to show disgust and hatred). They cursed a person having ten points. They cursed a person to whom the Messenger of God (S.A) said:... and (also) the Messenger of God (S.A) told Ali (A) that: aren't you satisfied that your position toward me would be the same as the position of Haroon toward Musa except that you are not the Prophet? In fact, it is not worthy that I would die but you are my Caliph. Ibn Abbas said: the Messenger of God (S.A) told Ali (A) that: "after my death, you are the Vali of all Momenin".

He has reported this tradition in the book of Fazaal Al- Sahabah in this way:

حدثنا عبد الله قال حدثني أبي قتنا يحيى بن حماد قتنا أبو عوانة قتنا أبو بلج قتنا عمرو بن ميمون قال إني لجالس إلي بن عباس إذا أتاه تسعة رهط قالوا : يا أبا عباس أما إن تقوم معنا و أما أن تخلو بنا عن هؤلاء قال فقال بن عباس : بل أنا أقوم معكم قال : و هو يومئذ صحيح قبل أن يعمي قال : فابتدؤا فتحدثوا فلا ندري ما قالوا قال فجاء ينفض ثوبه و يقول اف و تف وقعوا في رجل له عشر . . . فقال له أما ترضى أن تكون منى بمنزلة هارون من موسى إلا أنك ليس نبي انه لا ينبغي أن أذهب إلا وأنت خليفتي قال : و قال له رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم : « أنت ولي كل مؤمن بعدى ومؤمنة » .

This report is the same as the previous report except that the last part of it and the words of the Messenger of God (S.A) are a little different. The difference is that the Messenger of God (S.A) told Ali (A) :” after my death, you are the Vali of All righteous men and women.”

- Ahmad ibn Hanbal al-Shaibani , died 241 A.H. , Fazael al-Sahabah vol. 2 , p. 682 , H – 1168 , Dar al-Nashr : Institute of al-Resala – Beirut – 1403 A.H. , 1983 A.D. , al-Tabaha : 1 , Research : Dr. Wasiullah Muhammad Abbas .

After reviewing this tradition and its narrators' remarks, now is the time to discuss the authenticity and lack of authenticity of its document and examine its strength and weakness from the viewpoint of the great Sunni clerics.

Hakim Al- Neishabori authenticates this tradition:

After reporting this tradition, Hakim Al- Neishabori explains about its document:

أخبرنا أبو بكر أحمد بن جعفر بن حمدان القطيعي ببغداد من أصل كتابه ثنا عبد الله بن أحمد بن حنبل حدثني أبي ثنا يحيى بن حماد ثنا أبو عوانة ثنا أبو بلج ثنا عمرو بن ميمون قال إني لجالس عند بن عباس إذ أتاه تسعة رهط . . . فقال له : « أما ترضى أن تكون مني بمنزلة هارون من موسى إلا أنه ليس بعدي نبي إنه لا ينبغي أن أذهب إلا وأنت خليفتي » قال بن عباس : وقال له رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم : « أنت ولي كل مؤمن بعدي ومؤمنة » . . . هذا حديث **صحيح الإسناد** ولم يخرجاه بهذه السياقة .

... The document of this tradition is authentic but Bokhari and Muslim have not used these words in their books “Sahih”

- Al-Hakim al-Nishaburi , Muhammad ibn Abdullah , al-Mostadrak alay al-sahihain , vol. 3 , p. 143 , H – 4652 , (died 405 A.H.) , Dar al-Nashr : Dar al-kotob al-Elmyah – Beirut – 1411 A.H. , 1990 A.D. , al-Tabaha : 1 , Research : Mustafa Abdul Qader Ata .

Zahabi authenticates this tradition:

Zahabi, a famous Sunni man, authenticates this tradition in his Taaligh on Hakim's Al-Mostadrak:

تعليق الذهبي في التلخيص : صحيح .

- Al-Mostadrak Betahligh al-Zahbi , vol. 3 , p. 143 , H – 4652 , Mahrefah al-Sahabah book , (section) Zekr Islam Amir al-Moaminin Ali (May God be well pleased with him) .

Al- Bani authenticates this tradition:

After reporting the viewpoint of Hakim and Zahabi, Al- Bani expresses his viewpoint about it and writes:

... و أما قوله : « وهو ولي كل مؤمن بعدي » فقد جاء من حديث **ابن عباس** فقال الطيالسي (2752) : حدثنا أبو عوانة عن أبي بلج عن عمرو بن ميمون عنه " أن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم قال لعلي

**: « أنت ولي كل مؤمن بعدي » و أخرجه أحمد (1 / 330 - 331) و من طريقه الحاكم (3 / 132 - 133)
و قال : صحيح الإسناد و وافقه الذهبي و هو كما قالاً .**

This word of the Messenger of God (S.A) that” and he is the Vali of all Momenin after my death” has been reported by Ibn Abbas and Tiyalasi has reported it in this way: Abu Avaneh has reported from Abu Balaj and he has reported from Amro Ibn Meimon and finally from Ibn Abbas this tradition for us that the Messenger of God (S.A) told Ali:” you are the Vali of all Momenin after my death”.

This tradition has been narrated by Ahmad Ibn Hanbal (vol 1, ps 330 to 331) and he has reported it with the same document reported by Hakim Al- Neishabori in (vol 3, ps 132 to 133) and says: the document of this tradition is authentic and Zahabi gas agreed with the opinion of Hakim (and has authenticated it) and this tradition is in line with the viepoint of these two person.

- Albani , : Muhammad Nasser al-Din , al-Selsalah al-Sahiha , vol. 5 , p. 222 .

One point:

Mobarakfori has expressed two more claims too:

و الظاهر أن زيادة «بعدي» في هذا الحديث من وهم هذين الشيعيين و يؤيده أن الإمام أحمد روى في مسنده هذا الحديث من عدة طرق ليست في واحدة منها هذه الزيادة ...

Superficially, the mistakes of these two Shia men (Jafar Ibn Soleiman and Ajlah Kondi) are the sources of the added word of the “Next” in this tradition. We prove our opinion in such a way that Ahmad Ibn Hanbal has reported this tradition in his book “Masnad” in many ways documents while none of them has this added word.

Considering this tradition reported by the sources of the Sunnis along with its authentication by their clergies, we cannot find fault with these two narrators because this noble tradition has been reported by authentic document without being reported by Shia narrators.

And also there will be no room for Mobarakfori (that he had said: Ahmad has reported this tradition in his book “Masnad” in many ways without using this added word) to authenticate it because as mentioned earlier, the same tradition has been reported by Ahmad Ibn Hanbal both in his Masnad and Fazaal Al- Sahabah and using the same added word.

The other sources:

Another Sunni great narrator has reflected this authentic tradition in their book. Below, some of them have been given:

AbuBak Ajori (died 360 H):

- AL-Ajuri , Abi Bakr Muhammad ibn al-Hussein , al-sharyah , vol. 4 , p. 2021 , 1488 , Dar al-Nashr : Dar al-Vatan – Riyadh / Saudi – 1420 A.H. – 1999 A.D. , al-Tabaha : 2 , Research : Dr. Abdullah ibn Umar Soleiman al-Damiji .

Tabarani (died 360 H)

- al-Tabarani , Soleiman ibn Ahmad ibn Jacob Abu al-Qasim , Al-Mahjam al-kabir , vol. 12 , p. 97 , H – 12593 , Dar al-Nashr : Maktabah al-Zahra – Mosel – 1404 A.H. – 1983 A.D. , al-Tabaha : 2 , Research : Hamdi ibn Abdul Majid AL-Salafi .

Ibn Abd Al- Ber (died 463H)

- Ibn Abdul Barr, Yusuf ibn Abdullah ibn Muhammad ibn Abdul Bar, al-Estihab fi Mahrefah al-Asab , vol. 3 , p. 1091 , Dar al-Nashr : Dar al-Jil – Beirut – 1412 A.H. , al-Tabaha : 1 , Research : Ali Muhammad al-Bedjaoui .

Ibn Asaker (died 571H)

- Ibn Asaker al-Damascene al-Shafei , Abi al-Qasim Ali ibn Hassan ibn Hobah Allah ibn Abdullah , (571 A.H.) , The history of the city of Damascus and Zekr Fazloha va Tasmih mana Haloha menal Amasel , vol. 42 p. 199, publisher : Dar al-Fekr – Beirut – 1995 A.D research : Moheb al-Din Abi Saiid Umar ibn Gheramah al- Amri.

Talmesani (died 644H)

- Al-Joharah fi Nasab al-Nabi va Asabah al-Ashrah , author name : Muhammad ibn Abi Bakr al-Ansari al-Telmesani al-Mahruf al-Bari (died 644 A.H.) , VOL. 1 , P. 292 .

Safadi (died 746H)

- Al-Safadi , Salah al-Din khalil ibn Abik (died 764 A.H.) , al-vafi Belvafyat , vol. 21 , p. 178 , publisher ; Dar Ahya al-Tras – Beirut – 1420 A.H. – 2000 A.D , research by Ahmad al-Arnoot and Turky Mustafa .

IBn Kasir (died 774H)

- Ibn Kasir , Ismail ibn Umar ibn Kasir al-Qurashi Abu al-Fada , al-Badayah va al-Nahayah , vol. 7 , p. 339 , 346 , publisher : Maktabah al-Maharef – Beirut .

Ibn Hajar Asghalani (died 852H)

- Ibn Hajar , Ahmad ibn Ali Ibn Hajar Abulfazl Al-Asghalani al-Shafei , al-Asabah fi Tamiiz al-sahabah , vol. 4 , p. 567 , publisher : Dar al-Jil – Beirut , al-Tabaha : 1 , 1412 A.H. – 1992 A.D. Research : Ali Muhammad al-Bedjaoui .

Abdolghader Baghdadi (died 1093H)

- Abdul Qader ibn Umar al-Baghdadi, khazaneh al-Adab valab Laban Lisan al-Arab, vol. 6, p. 68, Dar al-Nashr : Dar al-kotob al-Elmyah – Beirut – 1998 A.D. , al-Tabaha : 1 , Research : Muhammad Nabil Tarifi / Amil Badih al-Yahghoub .

Definitely, Ibn Taymiyah and Bobarakfori become disgraced because this tradition is authentic and has the added word “Next”. They have tried to ignore the reality and pretend it as they want.

An important question:

Now, an important question raised here is that didn't these men see this valid tradition in such a valid books? Or they didn't want to see it to... God has full knowledge.

The second answer:

The authenticity of the tradition reported by Jafar Ibn Soleiman

The tradition reported by Jafar Ibn Soleiman is the same tradition rejected by Mobarakfori. Answering his remark, we say: this tradition is reported in many sources of the Sunnis from the Messenger of God (S.A). We will mention the text of one of the oldest sources and then give the opinion of Sunnis clergies in this regard:

Al- Mosannaf Ibn Sheibeh (died 235H):

Ibn Abi Sheibeh, one of the oldest Sunni narrators and the Sheikhs of Bokhari and whose book “Al- Mosannef” is one of the oldest tradition book of the Sunnis, narrates in this book that:

حدثنا عفان قال ثنا جعفر بن سليمان قال حدثني يزيد الرشك عن مطرف عن عمران بن حصين قال : بعث رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم سرية و استعمل عليهم عليا فصنع علي شيئا أنكره فتعاهد أربعة من أصحاب رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم أن يعلموه وكانوا إذا قدموا من سفر بدأوا برسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم فسئلوا عليه ونظروا إليه ثم ينصرفون إلى رجالهم قال فلما قدمت السرية سلموا على رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم فقام أحد الأربعة فقال يا رسول الله ألم تر أن عليا صنع كذا وكذا فأقبل إليه رسول الله يعرف الغضب في وجهه فقال : « ما تريدون من علي ؟ ما تريدون من علي ؟ علي مني وأنا من علي **وعلي ولي كل مؤمن بعدي** » .

.... Umran Ibn Hasin (a companion) reports that the Messenger of God (peace be upon him and his households) sent a group of people and commissioned Ali Ibn Abi Talib (saalam of God be upon him) as their leader. (They found war booties). Amir Al- Momenin (saalam of God be upon him) performed an action not being savory to them. Four of them who were the companions of the Messenger of God (S.A) agreed to report this action of Ali (saalam of God be upon him) to the Messenger of God (S.A) when they saw him. (It was common that) when Musilms returned from a trip, first of all they went to the Messenger of God (peace be upon him

and his households) and after visiting him, they went to their houses. When this group of people arrived at Medinah, they went to the Messenger of God (peace be upon him and his households) and greeted him. Then, One of those four persons said: O, the Messenger of God, do you know that Ali has done such and such? While angry, the Messenger of God (S.A) came toward him and said: what do you want from Ali? What do you want from Ali? Ali belongs to me and I belong to him and after my death, he is the Vali of all Momenin.

- Ibn Abi Shaibah al-kufi , Abu Bakr Abdullah ibn Muhammad Ibn Abi Shaibah al-kufi , al-ketab al-Mosnaf fi al-Ahadith va al-Asar , died 235 A.H. , vol. 6 , p. 372 , H – 21213 , publisher : Maktabah al-Roshd – Riyadh , al-Tabaha : 1 , 1409 A.H , Research : kamal Yusuf al-Hout .

The opinions of the first-rate Sunni clergies:

Now, a part of the viewpoints of the Sunni clergies about this tradition will be given:

Ibn Hajar Asghalani:

Regarding the tradition of Jafar Ibn Soleiman, he says:

و أخرج الترمذي **باسناد قوي** عن عمران بن حصين في قصة قال فيها قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم : « ما تريدون من علي ؟ إن عليا مني و أنا من علي و هو ولي كل مؤمن بعدي » .

Tarmazi has reported this tradition having strong document, from Umran Ibn Hasin together with an event that the Messenger of God (peace be upon him and his households) said: **what do you want from** Ali? Ali belongs to me and I belong to him and he is the Vali of all Momenin.

- Ibn Hajar , Ahmad ibn Ali Ibn Hajar Abulfazl Al-Asghalani al-Shafei , al-Asabah fi Tamiiz al-sahabah , died 852 A.H. , vol. 4 , p. 569 , publisher : Dar al-Jil – Beirut , al-Tabaha : 1 , 1412 A.H. – 1992 A.D. Research : Ali Muhammad al-Bedjaoui .

Zahabi, a famous Sunni man:

After reporting the tradition of Jafar, he says:

. . . أخرجه أحمد في المسند و الترمذي و **حسينه** والنسائي .

This tradition is reported by Ahmad in his book Masnad and by Tarmazi- introducing its document as an excellent one- and Nesabi.

- Al-zahbi , Shamsuddin Muhammad ibn Ahmad ibn Osman , (748 A.H.) , Tarikh al-Islam va vafyat al-Mashahir va al-Ahlam , vol. 3 , p. 630 , research by Dr. Umar Abdul Salam Tadmouri , publisher : Dar al-kitab al-Arabi – Lebanon / Beirut , al-tabaha : 1 , 1407 A.H. – 1987 A.D .

- Al-zahbi , Shamsuddin Muhammad ibn Ahmad ibn Osman , (748 A.H.) , sayr Ahlam al-Nebla , vol. 8 , p. 197 , research : Shoaib al-Arnoot , Muhammad Nahim al-Arquesosi , publisher : Institute of al-Resala – Beirut , al-Tabaha : 9 , 1413 A.H.

Abdolghader Baghdadi (died 1093H):

He writes about the tradition of Jafar Ibn Soleiman:

وأخرج الترمذي **بإسناد قوي** عن عمران بن حصين في قصة قال فيها : قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم : « ما تريدون من علي ؟ إن علياً مني وأنا من علي وهو ولي كل مؤمن بعدي » .

Tarmazi reported this tradition with strong document from Emran Ibn Hasin that he has narrated it along with an event from the Messenger of God that he said: what do you want from Ali? Ali belongs to me and I belong to him and after my death, he is the Vali of all Momenin.

- Abdul Qader ibn Umar al-Baghdadi, khazaneh al-Adab valab Laban Lesan al-Arab, vol. 6, p. 69, Dar al-Nashr : Dar al-kotob al-Elmyah – Beirut – 1998 A.D. , al-Tabaha : 1 , Research : Muhammad Nabil Tarifi / Amil Badih al-Yahghoub .

Soyoti (died 911H):

He has also has reflected this tradition in his book together with the veracity of it by Ibn Jarir and writes:

عَنْ عِمْرَانَ بْنِ حُصَيْنٍ قَالَ : بَعَثَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ سِرِّيَّةً وَاسْتَعْمَلَ عَلَيْهِمُ عَلِيًّا رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ فَعَيَّمُوا . . . فَقَالَ : « مَا تُرِيدُونَ مِنِّي عَلِيٌّ ؟ عَلِيٌّ مِنِّي وَأَنَا مِنِّي عَلِيٌّ ، وَعَلِيٌّ وَلِيُّ كُلِّ مُؤْمِنٍ بَعْدِي » . (ش و ابن جرير و صححه) .

..... Emran Ibn Hasin (a companion reportes that the Messenger of God (peace be upon him and his households) sent a group of people and appointed Ali Ibn Abi Talib (saalam of God be upon him) as their leader. They found war booties..... The fourth person stood too and repeated their words. The Messenger of God (S.A) became angry and went towards him and said: "what do you want from Ali? Ali belongs to me and I belong to him and after my death, he is the Vali of all Momenin".

(This tradition is reported by both Ibn Abi Sheibeh and Ibn Jarir and Ibn Jarir has authenticated it).

- Al-Suyuti , Abdul Rahman al-Hafiz , Jameh al-Ahadith (al-Jameh al-saghir va zavaed va al-Jameh al-kabir) , vol. 16 , p. 256 , H – 7866 and vol. 21 , p. 72 .

Mottaghi Hendi (died 975H):

Regarding this tradition and the viewpoint of Ibn Jari, he writes:

... فقال : ما تريدون من علي ؟ علي مني وأنا من علي وعلي ولي كل مؤمن بعدى .
(ش وابن جرير وصححه) .

.... And he said: "what do you want from Ali? Ali belongs to me and I belong to him and after my death, he is the Vali of all Momenin". (Mottaghi Hendi says: Ibn Shibeh and Ibn Jarir have reported this tradition and Ibn Jarir has authenticated it).

And he reports this tradition elsewhere and writes his opinion about him in this way:

- Al-Mottaghi al-Hendi , Ala al-Din Ali al-Mottaghi ibn Hesam al-Din al-Hendi , kanz al-Ahmal fi sunnan al-Aqval va al-Afhal , vol. 13 , p. 62 , Dar al-Nashr : Dar al-kotob al-Elmyah – Beirut – 1419 A.H. – 1998 A.D. , al-Tabaha : 1 , Research : Mahmoud Umar al-Domyati .

... علي مني وأنا من علي ، وعلي ولي كل مؤمن بعدى . (ش عن عمران بن حصين ؛ صحيح) .

He said: "Ali belongs to me and I belong to him and after my death, he is the Vali of all Momenin". (Mottaghi Hendi says: this tradition has been reported from Ibn Abi Shibeh and he has reported it from Emran Ibn Hasin and it is authentic).

- Al-Mottaghi al-Hendi , Ala al-Din Ali al-Mottaghi ibn Hesam al-Din al-Hendi , kanz al-Ahmal fi sunnan al-Aqval va al-Afhal , vol. 11 , p. 279 , H – 32941 , vol. 13 , p. 62 , Dar al-Nashr : Dar al-kotob al-Elmyah – Beirut – 1419 A.H. – 1998 A.D. , al-Tabaha : 1 , Research : Mahmoud Umar al-Domyati

Other sources:

Other famous Sunni clergies have reported this tradition. The names of some of them have been given below:

Tayalesi (died 204H)

- Al-Tayalisi , Soleiman ibn Davod Abu Davod al-Farsi al-Basri , Musnad Abi Davod Tayalisi , died 204 A.H. , vol. 1 , p. 111 , Dar al-Nashr : Dar al-Mahrefah – Beirut .

Ahmad Ibn Hanbal (died 241H)

- Ahmad ibn Hanbal al-Shaibani , Musnad Ahmad , vol. 4 , p. 437 , Dar al-Nashr : Institute of Qurtabah – Egypt .

Abubakr Sheibani (died 287H)

- Ahmad ibn Hanbal al-Shaibani , Fazaal al-Sahabah vol. 2 , p. 605 , vol. 2 , p. 620 , vol. 2 , p. 649 , Dar al-Nashr : Institute of al-Resala – Beirut – 1403 A.H. , 1983 A.D. , al-Tabaha : 1 , Research : Dr. Wasiullah Muhammad Abbas .

Nasaee (died 303H)

- Al-Nisayy , Ahmad ibn Shoaib Abu Abdul Rahman al-Nisayy , al-Sunnan al-kubra , vol. 5 , p. 132 , recalled the words al-Nabi holy prophet (PBUH) : Ali is guardian of every believer after me , Dar al-Nashr : Dar al-kotob al-Elmyah – Beirut – 1411 A.H. – 1991 A.D. , AL-Tabaha : 1 , Research : Dr. Abdul Qafar Soleiman al-Bandari , Sayed kasravi Hassan .

Abubaali Mosali (died 307H)

- Abu Yahli , Ahmad ibn Ali ibn al-Mosanna Abu Yali al-Moseli al-Tamim , Musnad Abi Yali , vol. 1 , p. 293 , Dar al-Nashr : Dar al-Mamoon Leltras – Damascus – 1404 – 1984 , al-Tabaha : 1 , Research : Hussein Salim Asad.

Royani (died 307H)

- Al-Ruyani , Muhammad ibn Aaron al-Ruyani Abu Bakr , Musnad al-Ruyani , vol. 1 , p. 125 , Dar al-Nashr : Institute of Qurtabah – Cairo – 1416 , al-Tabaha : 1 , Research : Aiman Ali Abu Yamani .

Ibn Haban (died 354H)

- Ibn Hibbaan , Muhammad ibn Hibbaan ibn Ahmad Abu Hatem al-Tamimi al-Busti , Sahih ibn Hibbaan betartib ibn Bulban , vol. 15 , p. 373 , Dar al-Nashr : institute of al-Resalah – Beirut – 1414 – 1993 , al-Tabaha : 2, Research : Shoaib al-Arnoot .

Tabarani (died 360H)

- Al-Tabarani , Suleiman ibn Ahmad ibn Ayoub Abu al-Qasim al-Tabarani , al-Mahjam al-Kabeer , vol. 18 , p. 128 , Dar al-Nashr : Maktabah al-Zahra – al-Mosul – 1404 – 1983 , al-Tabaha : 2 , Research : Hamdi ibn Abd al-Majid al-Salafi .

And so forth...

An investigation into the position of Jafar Ibn Soleiman in the sources of the Sunnis:

In the last part of the second answer, it is also necessary to investigate into the position of Jafar Ibn Soleiman in the books of the Sunnis:

1. He is the narrator of Sahih Muslim

He is one of the narrators of the best book after Quran which according to the viewpoint of the Sunnis is Sahih Muslim in that weakening him means weakening the traditions of Sahih Muslim.

Regarding this tradition and Jafar, writes:

... **وهو ثقة من رجال مسلم** وكذلك سائر رجاله و لذلك قال الحاكم : **صحيح علي شرط مسلم وأقره الذهبي .**

Jafar Ibn Soleiman is reliable and is considered as the narrator of Muslim and other narrators of this tradition are also reliable. Therefore, Hakim Neishabori has said about the document of this tradition: "considering Muslim, the document of this tradition is authentic (his quotation in his book Sahih) and Zahabi has confessed to it.

- Al-Albani , Muhammad Nasser al-Din , al-Selseleh al-Sahihah , vol. 5 , p. 222 .

... توفي جعفر بن سليمان في سنة ثمان وسبعين ومئة ، **أحتج به مسلم** .

Jafar Ibn Soleiman died in 178 H and Muslim has referred (Ehtejaz) to his tradition.

- Al-zahbi , Muhammad ibn Ahmad ibn Osman Qaimaz al-Zahbi , (748 A.H.) , sayr Ahlam al-Nebila , vol. 8 , p. 197 , research : Shoaib al-Arnoot , Muhammad Nahim al-Arquesosi , publisher : Institute of al-Resala – Beirut , al-Tabaha : 9 ,1413 A.H.

He reports thirteen traditions from Jafar Ibn Muslim in his book Sahih that we will mention to one of them:

حدثنا يحيى بن يحيى أخبرنا **جعفر بن سليمان** عن أبي عمران الجوني عن عبد الله بن الصامت عن أبي ذر قال قال لي رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم : « يا أبا ذر أنه سيكون بعدي أمراء يميئون الصلاة فصل الصلاة لوقتها فإن صليت لوقتها كانت لك نافلة وإلا كنت قد أحرزت صلاتك » .

- Moslim , moslim ibn al-Hajaj Abu al-Hussein al-Qushairi al-Nishaburi , Died 261 A.H , Sahih Moslim , vol. 1 , p. 448 , H. 648 , Dar al-Nashr : Dar Ahya al-Tras al-Arabi – Beirut , Research : Muhammad Fouad Abd al-Baghi .

In addition to that he is one of the men and narrators of Sahih Muslim, he has been considered as a reliable narrator by the Sunni clergies including:

2. Zahabi uses the word ‘Imam’ to introduce him:

How much reliable is he that Zahabi describes him with words such as Imama:

- Al-zahbi , Shamsuddin Muhammad ibn Ahmad ibn Osman , (748 A.H.) , Tarikh al-Islam va vafyat al-Mashahir va al-Ahlam , vol. 11 , p. 68 , research by Dr. Umar Abdul Salam Tadmouri , publisher : Dar al-ketab al-Arabi – Lebanon / Beirut , al-tabaha : 1 , 1407 A.H. – 1987 A.D .

الإمام أبو سليمان الضبعي البصري . كان ينزل في بني ضبيعة فنسب إليهم .

3. Yahya Ibn Moein authenticates him

وروى محمد بن عثمان العبيسي عن يحيى بن معين قال : ... وكان عندنا **ثقة** و روى عباس عن يحيى بن معين : **ثقة** .

- Al-zahbi , Muhammad ibn Ahmad ibn Osman Qaimaz al-Zahbi , (748 A.H.) , Ahlam al-Nebla , vol. 8 , p. 197 , research : Shoaib al-Arnoot , Muhammad Nahim al-Arquesosi , publisher : Institute of al-Resala – Beirut , al-Tabaha : 9 , 1413 A.H.

4. He has not Rafezi religion

Mobarkfori has considered him as Ghali in Shiism and Rafezi and has reported a tradition from Ibn Haban regarding cursing Abubakr and Ummar by him:

... جعفر بن سليمان و هو شيعي بل **هو غال في التشيع** ... وقال ابن حبان في كتاب الثقات ... فإذا هو **رافضي** الحمار انتهى

To answer his claim, we refer to two outstanding Sunni clergies:

a. Zahabi (died 748H)

Zahabi, a famous Sunni man, has rejected this claim and writes:

... وقد قيل لجعفر بن سليمان : تشتم أبا بكر وعمر؟ قال : لا ، ولكن بغضاً يا لك وفي صحة هذه عنه نظر ، فإنه لم يكن رافضياً ، حاشاه وقال زكريا الساجي : قوله بغضاً يا لك إنما عنى به جارين له ، كان قد تأذى بهما اسمهما أبو بكر وعمر ...

Jafar Ibn Soleiman was asked : " do you curse Abubakr and Ummar?" He said: no, but I am against them very much. (Zahabi says :) the veracity of this issue is subject to fault because he wasn't Rafezi at all and Zakariya Sajedi said: his intention of saying this words that " I am against them very much" is simply that he has had two neighbor that annoyed him and the names of them were Abubakr and Ummar.

- Al-zahbi , Shamsuddin Muhammad ibn Ahmad ibn Osman , (748 A.H.) , Tarikh al-Islam va vafyat al-Mashahir va al-Ahlam , vol. 11 , p. 68 , research by Dr. Umar Abdul Salam Tadmouri , publisher : Dar al-ketab al-Arabi – Lebanon / Beirut , al-tabaha : 1 , 1407 A.H. – 1987 A.D .

ويروى أن جعفراً كان يترفض فقيل له أتسب أبا بكر وعمر قال لا ولكن بغضاً يا لك ، فهذا غير صحيح عنه .

It has been reported that Jafar was Rafezi and he was asked: do you curse Abubakr and Ummar? He has said: No but I am against them very much". Zahabi says: this issue is not true about him.

- Sayr Ahlam al-Nebla , author name : Muhammad ibn Ahmad ibn Osman ibn Qaimaz al-Zahbi Abu Abdillah , (748 A.H.) , , vol. 8 , p. 197 , publisher : Institute of al-Resala – Beirut , al-Tabaha : 9 , 1413 A.H ,

Research: Shoaib al-Arnoot , Muhammad Nahim al-Arquesosi .

b. Mohammad Naseroddin Albani:

Regarding the claim about the Rafezi religion of Jafar, Albani says:

إنه قال في ثقافته (6 / 140) : " كان يبغض الشيخين " . وهذا ، وإن كنت في شك من ثبوته عنه ، فإن مما لا ريب فيه أنه شيعي لإجماعهم على ذلك ولا يلزم من التشيع بغض الشيخين رضي الله عنهما وإنما مجرد التفضيل والإسناد الذي ذكره ابن حبان برواية تصريحه ببغضهما ، فيه جرير بن يزيد بن هارون ولم أجد له ترجمة ولا وقعت على إسناد آخر بذلك إليه ومع ذلك فقد قال ابن حبان عقب ذلك التصريح : " وكان جعفر بن سليمان من الثقات المتقنين في الروايات غير أنه كان ينتحل الميل إلى أهل البيت .

Ibn Haban has said about him in the book "Al- Seghat" (vol 6, p 140) : "he had a grudge against Sheikhein". If I have misgivings about this issue but he has undoubtedly Shia religion because of common consent of all clergies about this issue. (Firstly) to have Shia religion doesn't mean to have a grudge against Sheikhein and Shiism (according to the belief of the Sunnis) is defined as believing only in superiority of Ali to Abubakr and Ummar with regard to eminence. And secondly: in the document of this tradition emphasizing Jafar's grudge against Abubakr and

Ummar, the name Jarir Ibn Yazid Ibn Haroon is seen who is anonymous (therefore, its document is fragile) and I didn't find any document regarding this issue and thirdly Ibn Haban continues: Jafar Ibn Soleiman is one of the reliable narrator and possessing strong and careful traditions but he has inclined to Ahlulbayt.

- Al-Albani , Muhammad Nasser al-Din , al-Selseleh al-Sahihah , vol. 5 , p. 222 .

5. The tradition of the innovators!!! is acceptable

As mentioned before, Mobarakfori has impertinently considered the followers of Ahlulbayts (saalam of God be upon them) as the innovators and has written:

وقد تقرر في مقره أن المبتدع إذا روى شيئا يقوى به بدعته فهو مردود قال الشيخ عبد الحق الدهلوي في مقدمته و المختار أنه إن كان داعياً إلى بدعته و مروجاً له رد وإن لم يكن كذلك قبل إلا أن يروي شيئا يقوى به بدعته فهو مردود قطعاً انتهى .

It has been proved that if an innovator (he has considered Shias as innovator and here his intention is Jafar Ibn Soleiman), narrates a tradition enhancing his innovation from the Prophet (S.a) (to the Sunnis), his tradition is invalid as Sheikh Abdolhagh Dehlavi explains in the introduction of his book that: my opinion is that if a narrator who is an innovator spreads his innovation, his tradition will be invalid otherwise acceptable unless he narrates a tradition enhancing his innovation which in this case it is definitely invalid.

To answer his ambition, we limit ourselves to an answer given by Albani, a contemporary famous Sunni dignitary:

Regarding this claim and the traditions of those narrators considered as the innovators according to the viewpoint of the Sunnis, Albani-considered as Bokhari of the age by the Sunnis- explains in this way:

و كان جعفر بن سليمان من الثقات المتقين في الروايات غير أنه كان ينتحل الميل إلى أهل البيت ولم يكن بداعية إلى مذهبه و ليس بين أهل الحديث من أئمتنا خلاف أن الصدوق المتقن إذا كان فيه بدعة و لم يكن يدعو إليها ، أن الاحتجاج بأخباره جائز .

Jafar Ibn Soleiman is a reliable narrator possessing strong and careful traditions but he had inclined to Ahlulbayts. He has not invited people to his religion and there is no dispute among our Hadeeth leaders about this issue that if a trustful and careful narrator is an innovator but don't invite people to his religion, using and resorting to his traditions is correct and lawful.

- Al-Albani , Muhammad Nasser al-Din , al-Selseleh al-Sahihah , vol. 5 , p. 222 .

The third answer:

The tradition of Ajlah Kondi is valid

Mobarakfori has also rejected the tradition of Ajlah while according to the Sunnis clergies' emphasize, his tradition is best and valid and Ajlah has been authenticated by Sunnis public.

1. Albani's assertion:

He considers the tradition of Ajlah as a witness for the veracity of the tradition reported by Jafar Ibn Soleiman and after quoting it, he states his opinion about it explicitly.

و للحديث شاهد برويه أجليح الكندي عن عبد الله بن بريدة عن أبيه بريدة قال : بعث رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم بعثين إلى اليمن ، علي أحدهما علي بن أبي طالب . . . فذكر القصة بنحو ما تقدم ، وفي آخره : « لا تقع في علي ، فإنه مني و أنا منه **وهو وليكم بعدى** » أخرجه أحمد (356/5) قلت : **وإسناده حسن** .

And a witness for the tradition of Jafar Ibn Soleiman is the one reported by Ajlah Ibn Kondi and he has reported it from Abdollah Ibn Borideh and he has reported it from his father, Borideh that: the Messenger of God (peace be upon him and his households) sent two groups to Yemen that the leader of one them was Ali Ibn Abitali (saalam of God be upon him)... Borideh reported the event in the same as it happened until that the Messenger of God said: “don't curse Ali because he belongs to me and I belong to him and he is your Vali after my death”. This tradition is reported by Ahmad Ibn Hanbal (365/5). And I say: the document of this tradition is best.

- Al-Albani , Muhammad Nasser al-Din , al-Selselah al-Sahihah , vol. 5 , p. 222 .

2. Hafiz Araghi's assertion:

He has lived many years before Ibn Taymiyah and many centuries before Mobarakfori. After reporting this tradition, he writes about Ajlah Kondi:

خرج أحمد من طريق الأجليح الكندي عن ابن بريدة عن أبيه قال : بعث رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم بعثين إلى اليمن علي أحدهما علي والآخر خالد فقال : إذا التقيتما فعلي علي الناس وإن افترقتما فكل منكم علي حده فظهر المسلمون فسبوا فاصطفى علي امرأة من السبي لنفسه فكتب خالد إلى النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم بذلك فلما أتته دفعت الكتاب فقرأ عليه فرأيت الغضب في وجهه فقلت : يا رسول الله هذا مكان العائذ بك فقال : « لا تقع في علي فإنه مني وأنا منه **وهو وليكم بعدى** » . قال جدنا للأمر ، الزين العراقي : الأجليح الكندي **وثقه الجمهور** و باقيهم رجاله **رجال الصحيح** .

Ahmad has reported from Ajlah Kondi and he has reported from his father that the Messenger of God (peace be upon him and his households) sent two groups to Yemen. The leader of one of them was Ali and the other was Khalid and said: whenever you, two groups, are with each other, Ali will be the general leader and if you are separated, each of you is the leader of his own group. Muslims won that battle and the enemy was captured and Ali selected a slavegirl for himself. Khalid Ibn Valid wrote a letter to the Messenger of God (peace be upon him and his households) about this event (and gave me to deliver it). When I saw the Messenger of God (S.A) and he read the letter, he became angry. I said: O, the Messenger of God! I refuge in you. He said:” don’t curse Ali because he belongs to me and I belong to him and he is your Vali after my death”.

(Manavi says :) my mother’s ancestor, Zein Araghi has said: Ajlah Kondi (whes name is in the document of this tradition) has been considered as a reliable man by the viewpoint of all clergeries and the other narrators of this tradition are authentic narrators.

- Al-Manawi , Abdul Rahouf al-Manawi , died 1031 , Faiz al-Qadir sharh al-Jameh al-saghir , vol. 4 , p. 357 , Dar al-Nashr : al-Maktabah al-Tejaryah al-kubra , Egypt – 1356 A.H. , AL-Tabaha : 1 .

Who is Zein Araghi?

His name is Abdolrahim Hussein Ibn Abdolrahman Ibn Abibakr (died in 806H) and he is the professor of Ibn Hajar Asghalani who is a famous and bigoted Sunni narrator. In the sources of the Sunnis, words such as Imama, Allameh, the great Hafez, the age Hafez and so forth have been used to introduce him and Heisami, one of the Sunni scholars, was his companion and servant for many years and finally he has become his son-in-law. He has lots of books and compositions too.

For example, Soyoti writes about him that:

الحافظ الإمام الكبير الشهير أبو الفضل زين الدين عبد الرحيم بن الحسين ابن عبد الرحمن بن أبي بكر بن إبراهيم العراقي حافظ العصر... و تقدم في فن الحديث بحيث كان شيوخ عصره يبالغون في الثناء عليه بالمعرفة كالسيكي و العلائي و العز بن جماعة و العماد بن كثير و غيرهم ونقل عنه الشيخ جمال الدين الإسني في المهمات و وصفه بحافظ العصر...

He is Hafez and great and famous Imam. Whose name is Abolfazl, Zein Al-din, Abd Al-rahim Ibn Al-Hussein Ibn Abd Al-Rahman Ibn Abibakr Ibn Ibrahim Al-Araghi and the age Hafez... he is the best narrator in the science of tradition in such a way that his age greats like Sabki and Alae and Ez Ibn Jamaah and Emad Ibn Kasir and so forth have praised him greatly wether orally or written and Sheikh Jamal Al-Din Esnavi has reported his tradition in basic and important issues and considered him as the age Hafez....

- Al-Suyuti , Abdul Rahman ibn Abi Bakr al-Suyuti , died 911 A.H. , Tabaghat al-Hefaz , vol. 1 , p. 543 , Dar al-Nashr : Dar al-kotob al-Elmyah – Beirut – 1403 A.H. , al-Tabaha : 1 .

Also Ibn Fahad Makki says about him:

He is Abd Al-Rahim Ibn Hussein Ibn Abd Al-Rahman Ibn Abibakr Ibn Ibrahim Kordi, Raziyani, Egyptian, Shafeii, unique, Allameh, Hojjat, scholar, critic, better than other people, Islam Hafwz, the single and unique person of the period and age, taking the degree of Hafez and Estehkam in the science of tradition and the greats of his age have witnesses to his uniqueness in the science of tradition.... And Hafez Tagh Al-Din Ibn Rafe who was in Mecca in 736 H and Hafez Araghi has used of him, has introduced him in this way: there is no narrator in ghahereh save he and when Ghazi Ezzedin Jamaah was informed of the death of Ghazi Ezzedin – who was resident of Damascus- he said: now, no narrator has been left in Ghahereh except Sheikh Zeinoddin Araghi...

When Abul Hassan Heisami Was fifty years old, he became the companion and friend of Hafez Abolfazl Araghi and served him and utilized him and became his son-in-law.

- Ibn Fahad , Taghi al-Din Muhammad ibn Muhammad ibn Fahad al-Hashemi al-Mecci , died 871 , Lahz al-Alhaz Bezalil Tabaghat al-Hefaz , vol. 1 , p. 220 - 239 , Dar al-Nashr : Dar al-kotob al-Elmyah – Beirut .

Now, we should investigate into the doubt raised about Ajlah Shia religion carefully:

Criteria for the veracity of this tradition:

Although Mobarakfori has accepted that Ajlah Kondi is trustful narrator, he rejected his tradition on the pretext of his Shite religion (not having Rafezi religion) and has written:

أجلح الكندي هذا أيضا شيعي قال في التقريب : أجلح بن عبد الله بن حجة يكنى أبا حجة الكندي يقال اسمه يحيى صدوق شيعي وكذا في الميزان وغيره.

Ajlah Kondi has Shia religion. Ibn Hajar in the book “ Taghrib Al- Tahzib” says about him: Ajlah Ibn Abdollah Ibn Hojziyeh whose nickname is Abu Hojziyeh Kondi and it has been said that his name is Yahya is so trustful and has Shia religion . The same words have been used in the book “Mizan Al-Etedal” by Zahabi and so forth (about him).

To answer the remarks of Mobarakfori, we have used the assertion of Albani and considered it sufficient.

فإن قال قائل : راوي هذا الشاهد شيعة وكذلك في سند المشهود له شيعي آخر وهو جعفر بن سليمان ، أفلا يعتبر ذلك طعنا في الحديث وعله فيه ؟ !

If someone says: this tradition’s narrator (Ajlah Kondi) considered by you as a witness proving the veracity of tradition of Jafar Ibn Soleiman has Shia religion and the same is also true about Jafar Ibn Soleiman, won’t it be a fault with this tradition?!

He answered:

فأقول : كلاً ، لأن العبرة في رواية الحديث إنما هو الصدق والحفظ ، وأما المذهب فهو بينه وبين ربه فهو حسيبه ولذلك نجد صاحبي " الصحيحين " وغيرهما قد أخرجوا لكثير من الثقات المخالفين كالخوارج و الشيعة وغيرهم .

I answer his question in this way: not at all because the only criterion for accepting this tradition is narrator’s truthfulness and accuracy in quoting a tradition and his religion is a personal issue (and it hasn’t to do with his business, narrating). Therefore, we see that the writers of Sahih Bokhari and Muslim (the most authentic books among the Sunnis) and other writers have reported many traditions from reliable narrators whose religion is against the religion of the Sunnis such as Khavarej, Shities and so forth.

- Al-Albani , Muhammad Nasser al-Din , al-Selselah al-Sahihah , vol. 5 , p. 222 .

Albani’s astonishment at denying and disbelieving this tradition:

In the last part of his remarks about this noble tradition including the veracity of this tradition and so forth previously mentioned, Albani expresses his astonishment at denying by Ibn Taymiyah and also his intention of denying it in this way:

فمن العجيب حقاً أن يتجرأ شيخ الإسلام ابن تيمية على إنكار هذا الحديث و تكذيبه في " منهاج السنة " (104/4) كما فعل بالحديث المتقدم هناك . . . فلا أدري بعد ذلك وجه تكذيبه للحديث إلا التسرع و المبالغة في الرد على الشيعة ، غفر الله لنا و له .

Among things making me really surprised is that Sheikh Al-Islam , Ibn Taymitah has dared to deny and disbelieve this tradition in the book, Menhaj Al-Senah (vol 4, p 104) as he has treated the previous tradition in the same manner..... I don't know that by raising his brokerage fault with this tradition, he has no reason to disbelieve it except hastiness in rejecting Shities. May God bless us and him.

- Al-Albani , Muhammad Nasser al-Din , al-Selselah al-Sahihah , vol. 5 , p. 222 .

Final result:

The blessed result gained is that there is no reason to deny and disbelieve the basis of this noble tradition and its issue by the Messenger of God (S.A) unless someone have blind bigot that hopefully nobody being weltered in its slough.

Textual analysis of this tradition

We tried to erase the dust covering the bright face of reality in this article. it is referred to the dust of denying the basic of this tradition and what is left with regard to this noble tradition is its textual analysis which we should say: although its text and content is very clear but unfortunately because of raising a doubt about it for their followers, they not only have made it unclear but also expressed it upside-down. Of course, this issue should be discussed in a separate and detailed article and praise be to God, an article has been compiled in this field that will be give soon. Now, we want to give a short answer to this textual doubt:

Definition of the word “Vali”:

According to the confession of some pioneer Sunni clergies, the best and most resonant words proving the Caliph of the Messenger of God (S.A) is «وليكم بعدي» and also when the Sunni

caliphs wanted to introduce themselves as the caliph of the Messenger of God (S.A) and also appointing the leaders, they used the word “Vali”.

In an artificial debate among Shites (according to his interpretation, Rafezi) and the Sunnis, Ibn Saad, one of the Sunni greats, who died in 230H, says on behalf of a Sunni person: the most resonant and eloquent word proving the caliphate of a person is « وليكم من بعدي » and if the Prophet wanted to appoint Ali as his caliph, he should have said: « علي وليكم من بعدي » while he has used the word « مولي ».

... فقال له الرافضي : ألم يقل رسول الله عليه السلام لعلي « من كنت مولاه فعلي مولاه » فقال أما والله أن لو يعني بذلك الإمرة والسلطان لأفصح لهم بذلك كما أفصح لهم بالصلاة والزكاة وصيام رمضان وحج البيت و لقال لهم : أيها الناس هذا وليكم من بعدي .

.... Rafezi asked a Sunni clergy: didn't say the Messenger of God (saalam of God be upon him) « من كنت مولاه فعلي مولاه »? the Sunni clergy answered: I swear by God that if the intention of Messenger of God was leadership and authority, he should have used a more eloquent word as he has spoken eloquently about prayer, Zakat , Ramazan Feast and Pilgrimage to Mecca and told people: **هذا وليكم من بعدي** ! أيها الناس

- Ibn Saad , Muhammad ibn Saad ibn Monih Abu Abdullah al-Basri al-zahri , al-Tabaghat al-kubra , vol. 5 , p. 319 , Dar al-Nashr : Dar Sader – Beirut .

Later, when the great Shia clerigies showed traditions from their own sources and authentic document by using the word “Vali”, they didn't accept them as the eloquent and resonant words and the same was seen with regard to the words « أولي بكم بعدي » and « خليفتي من بعدي » ...

The word “Vali” in the lexicon of the Sunnis’ caliphs:

Muslim Ibn Hajjaj Neishabori quoting from the second caliph, when Amir Al-Momenin (A) and Abbas came to him to receive their inheritance, writes:

... فَلَمَّا تَوَقَّي رَسُولُ اللَّهِ - صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ - قَالَ أَبُو بَكْرٍ أَنَا وَلِيُّ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ - صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ - فَجِئْتُمَا تَطْلُبُ مِيرَاتِكَ مِنْ ابْنِ أَخِيكَ وَيَطْلُبُ هَذَا مِيرَاتِهِ مِنْ أَبِيهَا فَقَالَ أَبُو بَكْرٍ قَالِ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ - صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ - « مَا نُورِثُ مَا تَرَكْنَا صَدَقَهُ » . فَرَأَيْتُمَاهُ كَادِبًا أَنَّمَا عَادِرًا خَائِنًا وَاللَّهُ يَعْلَمُ إِنَّهُ لَصَادِقٌ بَارٌّ رَاشِدٌ تَابِعٌ لِلْحَقِّ ثُمَّ تَوَقَّي أَبُو بَكْرٍ وَأَنَا وَلِيُّ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ - صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ - وَوَلِيُّ أَبِي بَكْرٍ فَرَأَيْتُمَانِي كَادِبًا أَنَّمَا عَادِرًا خَائِنًا .

After the death of the Messenger of God (peace be upon him and his households), Abubakr said: I am the Vali of the Messenger of God. You (Abbas and Ali) come to me and you, Abbas demands me your nephew's inheritance and you, Ali demands me the inheritance of Fatimah, the Prophet's daughter. Abubakr said: the Messenger of God has said: we don't bequeath anything and what is left is Sadagheh. And you called them liar, tricky and traitor while God knows that Abubar was trustful and religious man and follower of truth.

After the death of Abubakr, I became the Prophet's and Abubakr's Vali and again you, two persons call me traitor, liar, tricky and guilty.

- Moslim , moslim ibn al-Hajaj Abu al-Hussein al-Qushairi al-Nishaburi , Died 261 A.H , Sahih Moslim , vol. 3 , p. 1378 , H. 1757 , ketab al-Jahad va al-sayr , Bab Hokm al-Fay , Research : Muhammad Fouad Abd al-Baghi , Dar al-Nashr : Dar Ahya al-Tras al-Arabi – Beirut .

In this authentic tradition, the second caliph of the Sunnis specifies that Abubakr identified himself as the Vali and caliph of the Messenger of God (s.a) ; but Amir Al-Momenin (saalam of God be upon him) and Abbas has rejected him and called him as traitor and so forth and Ummar identified himself as the Vali of the Messenger of God (S.A) too and like Abubakr was called traitor and liar and so forth by them.

1. Abubakr: I have been appointed as your Vali

After taking the position of caliphate, giving his speech to the companions, Abubakr called himself as “the Vali of all Muslims”.

Belazari in his book, Ensab Al-Ashraf, Ibn Ghatibeh Dinoori in Oyun Al-Akhbar, Tabarai and Ibn Kasir in their Histories and many other Sunni greats, have reported the first sermon of Abubakr in this way:

لما ولي أبو بكر رضي الله تعالى عنه، خطب الناس فحمد الله وأثنى عليه ثم قال: أما بعد أيها الناس فقد وليتكم ولست بخيركم .

When Abubakr (may God be satisfied with him) took the position of caliphate, he delivered a speech to people and after praising God, he said: O, people, I have become your Vali but I am not the best of you.

- Ansab al-Ashraf , vol. 1 , p. 254 , author name : Ahmad ibn Yahya ibn Jaber al-Buladhiri (died 279 A.H.) , Died : 279 , Dar al-Nashr : Ayoun al-Akhbar , vol. 1 , p. 34 , author name : Abu Muhammad Abdullah ibn Moslim ibn Qutaibah al-Dinouri (died 276 A.H.) , Died : 276

- Tarikh al-Tabari , vol. 2 , p. 237 – 238 , author name : ABI Jafar Muhammad ibn Jurair al-Tabari (died : 310 A.H.) Dar al-Nashr : Dar al-kotob al-Elmyah – Beirut .

This sermon has been reported with authentic document.

After reporting this sermon, Ibn Kasir Damascus and Salafi writes:

وهذا إسناد صحيح .

The document of this tradition is authentic.

- Al-Badayah va al-Nahayah , vol. 6 , p. 301 , author name : Ismail ibn Umar ibn kasir al-Qurashi Abu al-Fada , died 774 A.H. , Dar al-Nashr : Maktabah al-Maharef – Beirut .

You can see this event in the following sources:

1. Sonan Al-Beyhagji

- Sunnan al-Baihaqi al-kubra , author name : Ahmad ibn Hussein ibn Ali ibn Musa Abu Bakr al-Baihaqi , died 458 A.H. , vol. 6 , p. 353 , Dar al-Nashr : Maktabah Dar al-Baz – holy Mecca – 1414 A.H. – 1994 A.D. , Research : Muhammad Abdul Qader Ata .

2. Al-Seghat

- Al-Seghat , author name : Muhammad ibn Hiban ibn Ahmad Abu Hatem al-Tamimi al-Busti , died 354 A.H. , vol. 2 , p. 157 , Dar al-Nashr : Dar al-Fekr – 1395 A.H. – 1975 A.D. , al-Tabaha : 1 , Research : al-sayed sharaf al-Din Ahmad .

3. Al-Havi AlKabir

- Al-Hawi al-kabir fi Feqh Mazhab al-Imam al-Shafei va Hova sharh Mokhtasar al-Muzani , author name : Ali ibn Muhammad ibn Habib al-Mawerdi al-Basri al-Shafei , died 450 A.H. , vol. 14 , p. 100 , Dar al-Nashr : Dar al-kotob al-Elmyah – Beirut – Lebanon – 1419 A.H. – 1999 A.D. , al-Tabaha : 1 , Research : al-Shaykh Ali Muhammad Mouawaz and al-shaykh Adel Ahmad Abdul Mojod .

4. Al-Kamel in the History

- Al-kamel fi Tarikh , author name : Abu al-Hassan Ali ibn Abi al-karam Muhammad ibn Muhammad ibn Abdul karim al-Shaibani , died 630 A.H. vol. 2 , p. 194 , Dar al-Nashr : Dar al-kotob al-Elmyah – Beirut – 1415 A.H. , AL-Tabaha : 2 , Research : Abdullah al-Qazi .

5. Al-Riyadh Al-Nazarah

- Al-Riyadh al-Nazarah fi Managhib al-Ashrah , author name : Ahmad ibn Abdullah ibn Muhammad Tabari Abu Jafar , died 694 A.H. , vol. 2 , p. 213 , Dar al-Nashr : Dar West al-Islami – Beirut – 1996 A.H. , al-Tabaha : 1 , Research : Isa Abdullah Muhammad Maneh al-Humairi .

6. Nayhayat Al-Arab

- Nahayah al-Arb fi Fonon al-Adab , author name : Shahab al-Din Ahmad ibn Abdul Wahab al-Noueiri , died 733 A.H. , vol. 19 , p. 25 , Dar al-Nashr : Dar al-kotob al-Elmyah – Beirut / Lebanon – 1424 A.H. – 2004 A.D. , al-Tabaha : 1 , Research : Mofid Qamhiyah va Jamaha .

7. Tohfah Tark

- Tohfah al-Tark Fima Yajeb anna Yahmel fi al-Melk , author name : Ibrahim ibn Ali ibn Ahmad ibn Abdul Vahed ibn Abdul Monham al-Tarsusi , Najm al-Din (died 758 A.H.) , Vol. 1 , p. 4 .

8. Takhrib Al-Havadith Va Asar Al-Vagheah

- Takhrij al-Ahadith va al-Asar al-Waqe'ha fi Tafsir al-keshaf Lelzemukhshiri , author name : Jamal al-Din Abdullah ibn Yusuf ibn Muhammad al-Zili , (died 762 A.H.) , vol. 2 , p. 406 , Dar al-Nashr : Dar Ibn Khuzaimah – Riyadh – 1414 A.H. , al-Tabaha : 1 , Research : Abdullah ibn Abdul Rahman .

9. Al-Sirah Al-Nabaviyah

10. - Al-Sirah al-Nobovyah by Ibn kasir , author name : Abu al-Fada Ismail ibn Umar ibn kasir al-Qurashi al-Damascene , (Died 774 A.H.) , vol. 4 , p. 493 .

11. Al-Mostadraf

12. - Al-Mostadref fi kol Fana Mostazraf Majledin , author name : Shahab al-Din Muhammad ibn Ahmad Abi Al-Fatah al-Aishiihi , (died 850 A.H.) , vol. 2 , p. 190 , Dar al-Nashr : Dar al-kotob al-Elmyah – Beirut – 1406 A.H. – 1986 A.D. , al-Tabaha : 2 , Research : Mofid Muhammad Qamiha .

Muhammad Ibn Saad in Tabaghat, Soyuti in the History of the Caliphs and Ibn Hajar Heisami in Al-Savaghe and the other Sunni greats have reported another sermon from the second caliph that after taking the position of caliphate, he delivered a speech to people and said: I have appointed as your Vali while I am reluctant to accept it.

لما بويج أبو بكر قام خطيبا فلا والله ما خطب خطبته أحد بعد فحمد الله وأثنى عليه ثم قال أما بعد فإنني وليت هذا الأمر وأنا له كارهٍ والله لوددت أن بعضكم كفانيه

- Al-Tabaghat al-kubra , vol. 3 , p. 212 , author name : Muhammad ibn Saad ibn Monih Abu Abdullah al-Basri al-Zahri , (died 230 A.H.) , Dar al-Nashr : Dar Sader – Beirut .

- Tarikh al-kholafa , vol. 1 , p. 71 , author name : Abdul Rahman ibn Abi Bakr al-Suyuti , (died 911 A.H.) , Dar al-Nashr : Matbaha : al-Sahada – Egypt – 1371 A.H. – 1952 A.D. , al-Tabaha : 1 , Research : Muhammad Mohi al-Din Abdul Hamid .

- Al-Savaegh al-Moharaghah Ali Ahl al-Rafaz va al-Zelal va al-zandaqah , vol. 1 , p. 37 , author name : Abu al-Abbas Ahmad ibn Muhammad ibn Ali ibn Hajar al-Haithami , (died 973 A.H.) , Dar al-Nashr : Institute of al-Resala – Lebanon – 1417 A.H. – 1997 A.D. , al-Tabaha : 1 , Research : Abdul Rahman ibn Asullah al-Turkey – kamel Muhammad al-kharrat .

2. Abubakr: I appointed Ummar as their” Vali”

The first caliph felt that his life has come to end and therefore, he appointed the second caliph after his death. In the ceremony of appointment, he used the word “Vali” explicitly and declared to the companions that Ummar is the Vali of all Muslims after my death.

Ibn Haban Basti writes:

... ثم رفع أبو بكر يديه فقال اللهم وليته بغير أمر نبيك ولم أرد بذلك إلا صلاحهم وخفت عليهم الفتنة فعملت فيهم بما أنت أعلم به وقد حضر من أمري ما قد حضر فاجتهدت لهم الرأي فوليت عليهم خيرهم لهم وأقواهم عليهم وأحرصهم على رشدهم ولم أرد محاماة عمر ...

Then, Abubakr raised his hands and said: O, my God, I have appointed Ummar as the Vali without the order of your Prophet and my only intention to do this work is best for people and fear of disturbance. I have done a work that you are aware of it better than me and the time of my death has come to end therefore, I deemed it advisable to people and appointed the best, strongest and most avaricious person to leadership as Vali and I didn't want Ummar's deprivation.

- Al-Seqaf , author name : Muhammad ibn Hiban ibn Ahmad Abu Hatem al-Tamimi al-Busti , died 354 A.H. , vol. 2 , p. 192 - 193 , Dar al-Nashr : Dar al-Fekr – 1395 A.H. – 1975 A.D. , al-Tabaha : 1 , Research : al-sayed sharaf al-Din Ahmad .

3. Abubakr addressed military leaders: Ummar is your Vali

Ibn Asir Jazri writes that after appointing Ummar as his substitute, the first caliph of the Sunnis wrote a letter to the leaders of army:

وَكَتَبَ إِلَى أُمَرَاءِ الْأَجْنَادِ : **وَلَيْتُ عَلَيْكُمْ عَمْرًا** ...

Abubakr wrote a letter to army leader: I have appointed Ummar as your Vali...

- Majmah Jameh al-Usool fi Ahadith al-Rasol , vol. 4 , p. 109 , author name : al-Mobarak ibn Muhammad ibn al-Asir al-Jazri , (died 544 A.H.) , Dar al-Nashr .

The words “Caliph” and “Vali” in these two traditions indicate that at that time, people used these words interchangeably and “Vali” had the same meaning as the word “Caliph”.

4. Sahabah addressed Abubakr: why do you appoint Ummar as the caliph?

Not only has the first caliph used the word “Vali” in appointing Ummar but also the companions in complaining to Abubakr have used these two words “Vali” and “Successor” side by side:

Ibn Abi Shibeh writes:

عن وكيع ، وابن إدريس ، عن إسماعيل بن أبي خالد ، عن زبيد بن الحرث ، أن أبا بكر حين حضره الموت أرسل إلى عمر يستخلفه فقال الناس : تستخلف علينا فظاً غليظاً ، ولو قد ولينا كان أظ وأغلظ ، فما تقول لربك إذا لقينه وقد استخلفت علينا عمر .

Zeid Ibn Hares has reported that: when Abubakr was in the throes of death, he sent someone to Ummar to appoint him as his substitute. People said: do you dominate a person upon us who is tough and bad-tempered? If he establishes control over government, he will be stricter and tougher than before. what do you want to say God when you visit him and you have been asked why you have dominated a bad-tempered and tough man like Ummar upon us?

- Al-Mosnaf , Ibn Abi Shaibah , vol. 8 , p. 574 , research by Saiid Muhammad al-Laham , publisher : Dar al-Fekr – Beirut and Tarikh al-Medina al-Monavvarah , Ibn Shabah al-Nimeiri , vol. 2 , p. 671 , research by Fahim Muhammad Shaltout , publisher : Dar al-Fekr – Beirut and the history of the city of Damascus , Ibn Asaker , vol. 30 , p. 413 , and kanz al-Ahmal , Mottaghi Hendi , vol. 5 , p. 678 .

Ibn Taymiyah Harrani, a Vahabbi theorist and the intellectual founder of this sect writes:

لما استخلفه أبو بكر كره خلافته طائفة حتى قال طلحة ماذا تقول لربك إذا وليت علينا فظاً غليظاً .

- Menhaj al-Sunnah , vol. 7 , p. 461 .

And when he appointed Abubakr as his substitute, some individuals became sad because of this appointment. Talhe said: what do you want to answer God when you visit him and you have been asked why you have appointed a tough and bad-tempered person as our Vali?

Also in this tradition, the words «وليت» and «استخلفه» have been used and their meaning is the same.

He writes somewhere that:

وقد تكلموا مع الصديق في ولاية عمر وقالوا ماذا تقول لربك وقد وليت علينا فظاً غليظاً .

Sahabah spoke with Abubakr about substitution of Ummar and said: why have you appointed a tough and hot-tempered person taking the position of caliphate and imposed him on people? What do you want to answer God?

- Menhaj al-Sunnah , vol. 6 , p. 155 , al-Nasher : Institute of Qurtabah , al-Tabaha : 1 , 1406 A.H. , Research : Dr. Muhammad Reshad Salem Adad al-Ajza : 8 .

5. Ummar: I am your Vali

After receiving allegiance from people and during the course of his caliphate, the second caliph has delivered many speeches to people that has called himself as the” Vali of Muslims” by using the word “Vali”.

In his book Ensab Al-Eshraf, Belazari writes:

المدائني في إسناده ، قال : **خطب عمر بن الخطاب رضي الله عنه حين ولي** فحمد الله وأثنى عليه وصلى على نبيه ثم قال : **إني قد وليت عليكم** ، ولولا رجائي أن أكون خيركم لكم ، وأقواكم عليكم ، وأشدكم اضطلاماً بما ينوب من مهم أمركم ، ما توليت ذلك منكم ...

Becoming the Caliph, Ummar gave a speech to people and after praising God and the Prophet, he said: really I am your Vali and if I had no hope that I am the best and strongest person among you, I didn't become your Vali.

- Ansab al-Ashraf , vol. 3 , p. 412 , author name : Ahmad ibn Yahya ibn Jaber al-Buladhiri (died 279 A.H.) .

Also regarding the speech of Ummar and introducing himself as Vali, Tabari writes:

وقفل عمر من الشام إلى المدينة في ذي الحجة وخطب حين أراد القبول فحمد الله وأثنى عليه وقال ألا **إني قد وليت عليكم** وقضيت الذي علي في الذي ولاني الله من أمركم إن شاء الله قسطننا بينكم .

After returning from Sham to Medinah, Ummar gave a speech and after praising God, he said: I have become your leader and caliph and I have done my duty about you. With the help of God, justice will be established among you.

- Tarikh al-Tabari , vol. 2 , p. 490 , author name : ABI Jafar Muhammad ibn Jurair al-Tabari (died : 310 A.H.) Dar al-Nashr : Dar al-kotob al-Elmyah – Beirut .

And also writes:

ذكر بعض خطبه رضي الله تعالى عنه ... عن عروة بن الزبير أن عمر رضي الله تعالى عنه خطب فحمد الله وأثنى عليه بما هو أهله ثم ذكر الناس بالله عز وجل واليوم الآخر ثم قال يا أيها الناس **إني قد وليت عليكم** ولولا رجاء أن أكون خيركم لكم وأقواكم عليكم وأشدكم استضلاماً بما ينوب من مهم أموركم ما توليت ذلك منكم

Ummar delivered a sermon and praised God and then said addressing people: O, people, I have become your caliph and if I weren't the best and strongest and strictest about your life's issues, I would have not accepted this duty.

- Tarikh al-Tabari , vol. 2 , p. 572 , author name : ABI Jafar Muhammad ibn Jurair al-Tabari (died : 310 A.H.) Dar al-Nashr : Dar al-kotob al-Elmyah – Beirut .

Also Ibn Kasir Al-Damascus writes:

فلما اراد القفول إلى المدينة في ذي الحجة منها خطب الناس فحمد الله واثنى عليه
ثم قال الا **اني قد وليت عليكم** وقضيت الذي علي في الذي ولاني الله من امركم ان شاء
الله

Ummar was going to leave Shan on the month of ZiHajjah and therefore stated in his sermon that: I have become your leader and I have completed my responsibility.

- Al-Badayah va al-Nahayah , vol. 7 , p. 79 , author name : Ismail ibn Umar ibn kasir al-Qurashi Abu al-Fada , died (774 A.H.) , Dar al-Nashr : Maktabah al-Maharef – Beirut .

6. Ummar regretted that he lost his friends

When the second caliph felt that the stroke of knife was effective and he was dying soon, he thought of his friends having effective role in leading Banihashem astray from the position of caliphate and appointing him as the first and then the second caliph and were completely faithful to their agreement but their life was over and died. Recalling their names, the second caliph says: If they were alive, I would have appointed them as Vali of the Muslims after my death.

Ibn Ghatibah Dinnori writes:

فلما أحس بالموت قال لابنه اذهب إلى عائشة وأقرنها مني السلام واستأذنها أن أقبر
في بيتها مع رسول الله ومع أبي بكر فأناها عبد الله بن عمر فأعلمها فقالت نعم وكرامة ثم
قالت يا بني أبلغ عمر سلامي وقل له لا تدع أمة من حمد بلا راع استخلف عليهم ولا تدعهم
بعدك هملا فإني أخشى عليهم الفتنة فأتى عبد الله فأعلمه فقال ومن تأمرني أن أستخلف
لو أدركت أبا عبيدة بن الجراح باقيا استخلفته و وليته فإذا قدمت على ربي فسألني وقال
لي من وليت على أمة محمد؟ قلت أي ربي سمعت عبدك ونبيك يقول لكل أمة أمين وأمين
هذه الأمة أبو عبيدة بن الجراح ولو أدركت معاذ بن جبل استخلفته فإذا قدمت على ربي
فسألني من وليت على أمة محمد؟ قلت : أي ربي سمعت عبدك ونبيك يقول إن معاذ بن
جبل يأتي بين يدي العلماء يوم القيامة **ولو أدركت خالد بن الوليد ، لوليته** فإذا قدمت على
ربي فسألني من وليت على أمة محمد؟ قلت أي ربي سمعت عبدك ونبيك يقول خالد بن
الوليد سيف من سيوف الله سله على المشركين ...

- Al-Imamah va al-Siasah , author name : Abu Muhammad Abdullah ibn Moslim ibn Qutaibah al-Dinouri (died 276 A.H.) , vol. 1 , p. 25 , Dar al-Nashr : Dar al-kotob al-Elmyah – Beirut – 1418 A.H. – 1997 A.D. , Research : khalil al-Mansour .

And Ibn Khaldon writes in the famous introduction of his book that Ummar said:

لو كان سالم مولى حذيفة حيا **لوليته** .

If Salem, the servant of Hazifeh was alive, I would have appointed him as Vali and my substitute.

- Preface of Ibn khaldun , vol. 1 , p. 194 , author name : Abdul Rahman ibn Muhammad ibn Khaldun al-Hadhrami , (died 808 A.H.) , Dar al-Nashr : Dar al-Qalam – Beirut – 1984 A.H. , al-Tabaha : 5 .

7. Ummar's direction to Ali (saalam of God be upon him):

After reporting the story of appointing Shora as the caliph by Ummar, Ibn Hajar Asghalani writes in explaining Sahih Bokhari that: the second caliph advised them in this way:

يا علي لعل هؤلاء القوم يعلمون لك حقك وقرابتك من رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم وصهرك وما اتاك الله من الفقه والعلم فان وليت هذا الأمر فاتق الله فيه ثم دعا عثمان فقال يا عثمان فذكر له نحو ذلك ووقع في رواية إسرائيل عن أبي إسحاق في قصة عثمان فان ولوك هذا الأمر فاتق الله فيه ولا تحملن بني أبي معيط على رقاب الناس ...

O' Ali, maybe this nation recognize your right and closeness to the Messenger of God (s) and that you are his son-in-law and jurisprudence and knowledgeable by God. Therefore, If you were Vali of the affair, be pious!!! Then he turned his face toward Osman and said the same words to him. Regarding what Ummar has told Osman, Israeel has narrated from Abi Isaq that: Ummar said: if people have appointed you as their Vali, be pious and don't dominate Bani Abi Moit over people (don't give them indecency).

- Fatah al-Bari Sharh Sahih al-Bukhari , vol. 7 , p. 68 , author name : Ahmad ibn Ali ibn Hajar Abulfazl al-Asghalani al-Shafei , (died 852 A.H.) , Dar al-Nashr : Dar al-Mahrefah – Beirut , Research : Moheb al-Din al-khatib .

- Ansab al-Ashraf , vol. 2 , p. 259 , author name : Ahmad ibn Yahya ibn Jaber al-Buladhiri (died 279 A.H.) .

8. Ummar appointed Abumosa as Vali of people:

The word Vali and taking the position Imamat, responsibility and government has extensively been used in such a way that the same word has been used in the letters and orders of leaders and governors of other Islamic areas in the period of appointment including Ibn Kasir Damascus has reported the text order of the second caliph during appointing Abumosa Ashari in this way:

وكتب إلى اهل البصرة اني قد وليت عليكم ابا موسى لياخذ من قويمكم لضعيفكم وليقاتل بكم عدوكم وليدفع عن دينكم ...

Ummar wrote a letter to the nations of Basreh : in fact I appointed Abumosa as your Vali

- AL-Badayah va al-Nahayah , author name : Ismail ibn Umar ibn kasir al-Qurashi Abu al-Fada , died 774 A.H. , vol. 7 , p. 82 , Dar al-Nashr : Maktabah al-Maharef Beirut .

9. Moavieh addressing the people of Basreh : I appointed Abdollah as your Vali:

Tabari and Ibn Jozi have written that during the appointment of Obeidellah Ibn Ziyad. Mpaviyeh told the people of Basreh:

ثم قال قد وليت عليكم ابن أخي عبيد الله بن زياد

.... In fact, I appointed my brother's son, Obeidellah Ibn Ziyad as your Vali.

- Tarikh al-Tabari , vol. 3 , p. 245 , author name : ABI Jafar Muhammad ibn Jurair al-Tabari (died : 310 A.H.) Dar al-Nashr : Dar al-kotob al-Elmyah – Beirut .

- Al-Montazam fi Tarikh al-Molok va al-Umam , vol. 5 , p. 278 – 279 , author name : Abdul Rahman ibn Ali ibn Muhammad ibn al-Jozi Abu al-Faraj , (died 597 A.H.) , Dar al-Nashr : Dar Sader – Beirut – 1358 A.H. , al-Tabaha : 1 .

10. Abdolmalik Marvan complains about Ghoraysh:

The word Vali has extensively been used in the next centuries of Islam History and others considered them as Vali of the Muslims following the caliphs.

Ahmad Zaki Safvat writes in Jomhorah Khotab Al-Arab that Abdolmalik Ibn Barvan complains about Ghoraysh during his caliphate in this way:

فيا معشر قريش وليكم عمر بن الخطاب فكان فظا غليظا مضيقا عليكم فسمعتم له وأطعتم ثم وليكم عثمان فكان سهلا فعدوتم عليه فقتلتموه

O, the people of Ghoraysh! (When) you listened to the words of your Vali Ummar Ibn Khattab who was so bad-tempered and strict and obeyed him, then Osman became your Vali who was not strict and you were hostile toward him and killed him.

Jomherah khatb al-Arab, vol. 2, p. 196, author name: Ahmad Zaki sefvat al-vafat : without , Dar al-Nashr : al-Maktabah al-Elmyah – Beirut.

- Moravaj al-Zahb , vol. 1 , p. 401 , author name : Abu al-Hassan Ali ibn al-Hussein ibn Ali al-Masoudi (died : 346 A.H.) .

- Al-Mahkam va al-Mohit al-Ahzam , vol. 1 , p. 514 , author name : Abu al-Hassan Ali ibn Ismail ibn sayeda al-Mersi , (died 458 A.H.) , Dar al-Nashr : Dar al-kotob al-Elmyah – Beirut – 2000 A.D. , al-Tabaha : 1 , Research : Abdul Hamid Hindawi .

- Lesan al-Arab, vol. 8, p. 166, author name : Muhammad ibn Mokarram ibn Manzor al-Afriqi al-Mesri , (died : 711 A.H.) , Dar al-Nashr : Dar Sader – Beirut , al-Tabaha : 1 .

Generally, according to the previous discussions proving the authenticity of the document of this tradition: وهو (عليّ عليه السلام) وليّ كلّ مؤمن بعدي، “Ali is the leader of Momenin”, the claims of the bigot unwise and unaware people became unstable and there is no way for them otherwise accepting the truth if they abandon the prejudice and erase their hearts from enmity and hostility.

In the last part of this article, we want to aske a question from truthseekers to judge themselves and select what is right:

Despite of the extensive usage of the word Vali in the literature of the followers of caliph ideology and using it in the sense of substitution and government and its explicit reason for substitution and guiding people, why, when it is the followers of Ahlulbayt turn, do they try so hard to change the right and real meaning of this tradition by distortion and unwise interpretation? Or why, when the name of Ali (saalam of God be upon him) is called, the do the sensitivities become provoked and the minds and pens become active? Do you know why like other historical events, do they deny the realities wickedly and mislead this explicit word from the main content? Tell us its reason!

Peace be upon you and God’s mercy and blessings

The group of answering the doubts under the authority of research Institute Hazrat Vali Asr (A.j)