

# **Why did Amir Momenin (peace be upon him) disagree with the uprising of Abu Sofyan against Abu Bakr?**

The group of Imam Ali (peace be upon him)

## **Doubt:**

Writer: Ayatollah Mohseni Bastami

The martyrdom of Zahra: the greatest lie of the history

We believe that this matter is the greatest insult and the lie of the history and it is not true at all. To prove this matter, we can discuss in detail in order to prove this matter. However, unfortunately, the small space of weblog does not have such capacity; therefore, we mention only few matters.

The Ghoreish was the greatest and the most powerful tribe in the peninsula of Arab and Bani Hashem was the best and the most powerful tribe (with dark skin) in the Ghoreish tribe which all of them accepted the its superiority

The Ghoreish tribe had animosity with the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants), but they could not do against him and they were afraid of revenging Bani Hashem

We do not know whether this person is really Shiite or not? They may say that he is Shiite and he has been Sunni

## **Criticism and analysis**

### **A remarkable point**

At first, we refer an important point: pay attention to the statements of this text carefully. Ayatollah Mohseni Bastami has said " the martyrdom of Zahra: the greatest lie of the history.

We believe that this matter is the greatest insult and lie of the history and it is not true at all. We need to discuss widely in order to prove it. Unfortunately,

since our weblog with little space does not have such capacity, we only mention few matters.

In your opinion, does Ayatollah Mohseni Bastami organize this weblog himself or write matter for this weblog?

If you search the statements of Ayatollah Mohseni Bastami on the internet, you will face only a matter. It has been said in a lot of Sunni sites without distortion and all of them relate this matter to him.

Aside from who is Ayatollah, he has just appeared in the theological schools of Shias and the way of his writing is like Sunni scientists because he has written the beginning of this text in this way " the way of writing of Ayatollah Mohsen Bastami and ...he has not written in the name of God after it. On the face of it, the whole text has been written by him. However, we see some words about site, weblog and ...and it is in contrast with the way of writing and saying of Ayatollah

A lot of cases in this article are defense of matters that Shias do not believe.

We do not know whether this person is Shiite or not? They may say that his religion was Shiite, but now his is Sunni. Hence, his matters are in contrast with the remarks of Mostabser because he does not refer to a Shiite book and in some cases, he considers some narrations as documents that Shias have narrated against them; we will deal with them in the text.

Hence, we request the Sunni scientists " if they want to write an article, they write it with their own names or they do not mention the writer of an article by mistake or at least, write the remarks of such and such a person not his writing...

## **Did Abu Sofyan want caliphate for himself and Ali or Abbas**

It should be said about Ghoreish and Abu Sofyan

Ayatollah Mohseni Bastami has confessed that Bani Omaye had animosity with the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) in Ghoreish and one of the most prominent persons about this animosity was Abu Sofyan, the head of Ghoreish. Everyone knows that no one hurt Ghoreish and Bani Omaye as much as Imam Ali (peace be upon him) did. As you see in this writing, Abu Sofyan says to Imam Ali (peace be upon him), if you want, I can have a lot of people walk and ride horses in Medina. In other words, did Abu

Sofyan, the enemy of Imam Ali (peace be upon him), want to bring bloody soldiers in Medina in the favor of Amir Momenan? No stupid person can believe such matter. Hence, Amir Momenan disagreed with him.

Why did Abu Sofyan come to Imam Ali (peace be upon him)? Why didn't he say such remark to Talhe and Zobeir? Wasn't he one of dignitaries of Ghoreish? and why didn't he go to the people of Ghoreish in Medina? Don't the Sunni scientists say that Imam Ali (peace be upon him) agreed with the caliphate of Abu Bakr? This narration demonstrates clearly that Abu Sofyan knew that Amir Momenan was right and he wanted to use this war against the Islam.

### **Distorting the narration of the Sunni scientists**

We should say about the main narration that Ayatollah Mohseni Bastami has not paid attention to impartiality and omitting the beginning and the end of the narration, he has pretended that Abu Sofyan has wanted caliphate for Ali or Abbas and Hazrat Ali has not accepted and he has said " Abubakr is not qualified for caliphate".

حدثني محمد بن عثمان بن صفوان الثقفي قال حدثنا أبو قتيبة قال حدثنا مالك يعني ابن مغول عن ابن الحر قال قال أبو سفيان لعلي ما بال هذا الأمر في أقل حي من قريش والله لئن شئت لأملأها عليه خيلا ورجالا قال فقال علي يا أبا سفيان طالما عاديت الإسلام وأهله فلم تضره بذاك شيئا إنا وجدنا أبا بكر لها أهلا

حدثني محمد بن عثمان الثقفي قال حدثنا أمية بن خالد قال حدثنا حماد بن سلمة عن ثابت قال لما استخلف أبو بكر قال أبو سفيان مالنا ولأبي فصيل إنما هي بنو عبد مناف قال فقيل له إنه قد ولي ابنك قال وصلته رحم

حدثت عن هشام قال حدثني عوانة قال لما اجتمع الناس على بيعة أبي بكر أقبل أبو سفيان وهو يقول والله إنني لأرى عجاجة لا يطفئها إلا دم يا آل عبد مناف فيم أبو بكر من أموركم أين المستضعفان أين الأذلان علي والعباس وقال أبا حسن ابسط يدك حتى أبايك فأبى علي عليه فجعل يتمثل بشعر المتلمس

ولن يقيم علي خسف يراد به إلا الأذلان غير الحي والوند

هذا على الخسف معكوس برمته وذا يشج فلا يبكي له أحد

قال فزجره علي وقال إنك والله ما أردت بهذا إلا الفتنة وإنك والله طالما بغيت الإسلام ش ر لا حاجة لنا في نصيحتك.

...Abu Sofyan said to Ali" what has caused that Ghoreish, the smallest tribe, has the responsibility of caliphate? If you want, I will have Medina full of persons that walk and ride horses? Ali said " O' Abu Sofyan! It is a long time that you have animosity with the Islam and the Muslims, but you have not been able to harm it. We have found Abubakr qualified for caliphate.

... When Abubakr was appointed as a caliph, Abu Sofyan said " what kind of relationship do we have with Abu Fasil (in order to accept his caliphate?) the children of Abd Monaf are right. He was said " Abubakr has assigned your child as a guardian". He said " he has done his responsibility as your relatives".

The people got together in order to swear allegiance with Abubakr . Abu Sofyan said " there is a riot that only blood can relieve it. O' the children of Abd Monaf! in what affairs has Abubakr had any roles? O' two wretched persons! O' Ali and Abbas! Then he said to Ali "O' Ali! Open your hand in order to swear allegiance with you". Ali accepted. Abu Sofyan recited his poem " no one lives in the deserts except two wretched tribes, Hay and Vatad".

one of them has put his lance on the earth in the desert ( he never wants to fight) and the other one moans , but no one helps him.

Ali prevented him and said " you want only riot doing such things and it is a long time that you have behaved the Islam badly and we do not need you benevolence".

Al-Tabari , Abi Jafar Muhammad Ben Harir ( died in 310 A.H.); Tarikh Tabari v 2 p 237; published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie- Beirut.

Ayatollah Mohseni Bastami has not mentioned the main narration in the Sunni books in order to keep the rank of a companion, Jalil Al-Ghadr Abu Sofyan Ben Harb, and his purpose for betraying and he has distorted its translation

When we informed that Abubakr, vey weak race of Ghoreish( Bani Tim) has been appointed as the successor of the prophet, it was intolerable for Abu Sofyan that had just become Muslim . Hence, he called immediately " where are two wretched men?

They asked " whom do you mean? " He said " Ali and Abbas". When Abu Sofyan faced Ali and Abbas, he said " why have you sat? Who is Bani Team that wants to have leadership? " Abu Sofyan continued

والله لاملان المدينة خيلا و رجالا

(I swear God that I will have a lot of people walk and ride horses in Medina and take back the government from them by force).

Ali that was listening to the remarks of Abu Sofyan admonished him and bade " if you do any actions against Abubakr, I am the first person that will stand against you. We consider Abubakr as one of our supporters. Abu Sofyan became sad, said bad remarks and then went. (The history of Tabari ( v 2 ) ;the introduction of the history of Tabari).

As you knew, Molavi Ayatollah Mohseni Bastami has not mentioned the words of Amir Momenan that reveal the purpose of Abu Sofyan and he has distorted it.

### **The main narration in the Shiite books**

The final part of this narration with the mentioned content is not available in the Shiite books, but this content is available in the Sunni books and this demonstrates lack of familiarity of the writer of the article with the Shiite narrations because if he had been familiar with the Shiite works, he would have narrated a narration in this area. hence, the Shias reason to the first part of this narration discussing with the Sunni scientists because the last part has been distorted and if the last part in the Shiite books were as Molavi Ayatollah Bastami had said, we, Shias, would not discuss with the Sunni scientists any longer more and they could reason to this narration. The main narration is in the Sunni books in this way

أما والله لئن شئتم لأملأنها خيلا ورجلا. فناداه أمير المؤمنين عليه السلام: ( ارجع يا أبا سفيان، فوالله ما تريد الله بما قول، وما زلت تكيد الإسلام وأهله، ونحن مشاغيل برسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله، وعلى كل امرئ ما اكتسب وهو ولي ما احتقب ).

I swear God that if you want, I will have Medina full of person that walk and ride horses. Amir Momenan bade to him " O' Abu Sofyan! Come back. I swear God that you don't seek God in whatever you are saying. You have always been planning for the Islam and the Muslims. At the present, we are performing ablution and shrouding and burying the messenger of God. There are some burdens on the shoulder of each one and he is responsible for them. (In other words, Abubakr will have responsibility of his sins and he is planning for his caliphate instead of performing ablution and burying the messenger of God).

Al-Sheikh Al-Mofid, Muhammad Ben Muhammad Ben Al-Naman Ibn Al-Moalem Abi Abdullah Al-Akbari( died in 413 A.H.); Al-Ershd Fi Marefe Hojaj

Allah Ala Al-Ebad v 1 p 190; researched by : Moasese Al-Al-Beit ; researched by: Dar Al-Mofid Leltabae and Al-Nashr and Al-Tozie- Beirut-Lebanon; the second edition -1414A.H., -1993 a.d.

However, why didn't Amir Momenan use the help of Ghoreish?

The answer is clear. If Abu Sofyan had led the troop to Medina, the first person that would have killed was Ali instead of Abubakr and Umar and eradicated the Islam. This is same matter that Amir Momenan referred to.

Of course, as it has been said in the book " Al-Ershad" and this narration demonstrates, this event happened on the day of Saghife. In other words, Amir Momenan had not sworn allegiance with Abubakr. This content can be understood from some the statements of Sunni scientists because they have said at the beginning of this narration

«لما اجتمع المهاجرون لبيعة ابي بكر»؛ «علي بيعة ابي بكر»؛ «لما بويع لابي بكر»؛ «لما اجتمع الناس على بيعة ابي بكر».

The migrants got together in order to swear allegiance with Abubakr or Abubakr was sworn allegiance or people got together in order to swear allegiance with Abubakr.

However, it has been said in Sehad of Sunni scientists that Ali Ben Abu Taleb swore allegiance after six months and he refused swear allegiance with them for six months. This demonstrates the falsity of the end of this narration in the Sunni books.

## Conclusion

His remark about Abu Sofyan that wanted to usurp caliphate is correct. But it is important to know for whom he wanted to usurp caliphate. When he knew that caliphate was usurped from Imam Ali (peace be upon him) and it was under control of Abubakr and Umar, he decided to missed from this event in the favor of himself. However, since Abubakr knew him, he appointed Moavie and Yazid Ben Sofyan as his special agents ( the address of this matter has been mentioned in the history of Tabari.

Hence, it turns out that the nature of Abu Sofyan and his family and Bani Omaye are the same as the nature of Umar and all of them wanted to usurp the right of Ali by any means.

Is it wise that Imam Ali uses the help of Abu Sofyan and other persons like him in order to take back his right?

The group in charge of answering doubts

Research centre of Hazrat Valiasr