

Did Fatima (peace be upon her) accept the apologies of the Sheikhin?

The group of the opinions of the Shias

Doubt

Suppose that we accept that Fatima (may God be well pleased with her) was angry with Sheikhin in, it has been proved that Abu-Bakr and Umar Ibn Khattab came in the last days of the life of Fatima and apologized her. As Beihaghi and others have narrated

عن الشعبي قال لما مرضت فاطمة أتاها أبو بكر الصديق فأستنذن عليها فقال علي يا فاطمة هذا أبو بكر يستنذن عليك فقالت أتحب أن أأذن؟ قال نعم فأذنت له فدخل عليها يترضاها وقال والله ما تركت الدار والمال والأهل والعشيرة إلا لإبتغاء مرضاة الله ومرضاة رسوله ومرضاتكم أهل البيت ثم ترضاها حتى رضيت.

When Fatima became sick, Abubakr came to her in order to apologize her and he wanted to be allowed to visit her. Ali bade to Fatima " Abubakr wants to vist you". Fatima bade " would you like that Fatima enter?" Ali bade " Yes. Then Fatima allowed and Abubakr entered and tried for satisfy Fatima". Abubakr said " I swear God that I have left my house, life, wealth and relatives for satisfying God, the messenger of God and the dynasty of the prophet. Then Fatem became satisfied of him".

Al-Beihaghi, Ahmad Ben Al-Hossein (died in 458 Hejira), Dalael Al-Nabovat , v 7 p 281

Al-Beihaghi, Ahmad Ben Al-Hossein (died in 458 Hejira), Al-Eteghad Al-Hedayat Ela Sabil Al-Reshad Ala Mazhab Al-Salaf Ashab Al-Hadith, v 1 p 354, Researched by: Ahmad Osam Al-Kateb, Published by: Dar Al-afagh Al-Jadidat, Beirut, First Edition; 1401 Hejira

Criticism and analysis

Lack of satisfaction of Sedighe Shahide (peace be upon her) from Sheikhin denies the basis of legitimacy of their caliphate because it proves that only memory of the messenger of God, the best woman of two worlds and Sayade of

the women of the heaven disagrees with the caliphate of Abubakr and Umar and is dissatisfied and angry of them . According to the narrations with valid document that have been said in the Sunni most valid books, the satisfaction of Fatima is the satisfaction of the messenger of God and her anger is the anger of the messenger of God.

Hence, the Sunni scientists have distorted a narration to prove that after Sheikhin made the daughter of the messenger of God angry, Sheikhin visited her in the last moments of her life and apologized her and Fatima Zahra (peace be upon her) forgave them.

We would like to answer

First: the document of the narration is Morsel because Shoabi is one of obedient and he was not the witness of the event herself and this narration has the same fault that the Sunni scientists consider for the narration of Balazeri and Tabari .

Second: suppose that Morselat of Tabei is acceptable, we cannot accept the narration of Shoabi because Shoabi is one of enemies of Amir Momenan (peace be upon him) and he is Nasebie. Narrating from Shoabi, Balazeri and Abu Hamed Ghazali have written

عن مجالد عن الشعبي قال : قدمنا على الحجاج البصرة، وقدم عليه قراء من المدينة من أبناء المهاجرين والأنصار، فيهم أبو سلمة بن عبد الرحمن بن عوف رضي الله عنه ... وجعل الحجاج يذاكرهم ويسألهم إذ ذكر علي بن أبي طالب فنال منه وتلنا مقاربة له وفرقاً منه ومن شره....

We along with some people came to Hajjis in Basra and some readers of Quran in Medina from the children of the migrants and the supporters, such as Abu Salame Ben Abd Al-Rahman Ben Uf was among them, attended. When Hajjis (title for a man who has gone to Hajj pilgrimage) were talking to them, they remembered Ali Ben Abi Taleb and back bit him and we also back bit him for the satisfaction of Hajjis and relieving from his trouble ...

Al-Balazari, Ahmad Ben Yahya Ben Jaber (died in 279 Hejira), Ansab Al-Ashraf , v 4 p 315

Al-Ghazali, Muhammad Ben Muhammad Abu Hamed (died in 505 Hejira), Ehya Olum Al-Din , v 2 p 346, Published by: Dar Al-Marefat, Beirut

Can the narration of a Nasebie person be reason for us?

The dissatisfaction of Fatima (peace be upon her) from Abubakr in the Sunni most valid books

Second: the anger of Fatima (peace be upon her) to Abubakr is as clear as day light and it is undeniable. Bokhari has said about the anger of Fatima (peace be upon her) to Abubakr.

He has written in the book " Abvab Al-Khoms"

فَعَضِبَتْ فَاطِمَةُ بِنْتُ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ فَهَجَرَتْ أَبَا بَكْرٍ فَلَمْ تَزَلْ مُهَاجِرَتَهُ حَتَّى

تُؤَقِّبَتْ.

Fatima, the daughter of the messenger of God, became sad from Abubakr and refused to communicate with him. her sadness from him continued until she passed away.

Al-Bokhari Al-Jaafi Muhammad Ben Esmaeel Abu Abdullah (died in 256 Hejira), Sahih Al-Bokhari, v 3 p 1126, hadith 2926, chapter Farz Al-Khoms, Researched by: D. Mostafa Deib Al-Bagha, Published by: Dar Ibn Kathir, Al-Yamame, Beirut, Third Edition; 1407- 1987

He has said in the book " Al-Maghazi" (chapter: the war of Ghazve/ Hadith 3998)

فَوَجَدَتْ فَاطِمَةَ عَلَى أَبِي بَكْرٍ فِي ذَلِكَ فَهَجَرَتْهُ فَلَمْ تُكَلِّمُهُ حَتَّى تُؤَقِّبَتْ

Fatima was angry of Abubakr and she did not talk to him until she passed away.

Al-Bokhari Al-Jaafi Muhammad Ben Esmaeel Abu Abdullah (died in 256 Hejira), Sahih Al-Bokhari, v 4 p 1549, hadith 3998, Kitab Al-Maghazi, chapter Ghazvat Kheibar, Researched by: D. Mostafa Deib Al-Bagha, Published by: Dar Ibn Kathir, Al-Yamame, Beirut, Third Edition; 1407- 1987

He has written in the book " Al-Faraez"; Chapter:

قَوْلُ النَّبِيِّ (ص) لَا تُورَثُ مَا تَرَكْنَا صَدَقَةً Hadith 6346

فَهَجَرَتْهُ فَاطِمَةُ فَلَمْ تُكَلِّمْهُ حَتَّى مَاتَتْ.

Fatima refused to communicate with Fatima and she did not talk to him until she passed away.

Al-Bokhari Al-Jaafi Muhammad Ben Esmaeel Abu Abdullah (died in 256 Hejira), Sahih Al-Bokhari, v 6 p 2474, hadith 6346, Ketab Al-Faraez, chapter Ghole Al-Nabi La Nuratho Ma Tarakna Sadaghat, Researched by: D. Mostafa Deib Al-Bagha, Published by: Dar Ibn Kathir, Al-Yamame, Beirut, Third Edition; 1407- 1987

It has been said in the narration of Ibn Ghotibe " when they came to visit her, Fatima did not let them enter and they had to resort to Imam Ali (peace be upon him) and he intermediated. Amir Momenan (peace be upon him) bade

البيت بيتك.

Dear Ali! This is your house and you are free to let whoever you like enter the house. Imam Ali (peace be upon him and his descendants) let them enter because he wanted to fulfill his duty and they did not make any excuses that Ali did not let us when we wanted to apologize Fatima

When they apologized, Sedighe Tahere did not accept, but he made them confess

نشدتكما الله ألم تسمعا رسول الله يقول «رضا فاطمة من رضاي وسخط فاطمة من سخطي فمن أحب فاطمة ابنتي فقد أحبني ومن أَرْضَى فاطمة فقد أَرْضَانِي ومن أسخط فاطمة فقد أسخطني»

I swear you to God; didn't you hear from the messenger of God that bade " the satisfaction of Fatima is my satisfaction and the sadness of Fatima is my sadness. Whoever likes and respects my daughter, Fatima, likes and respects me and whoever satisfies Fatima satisfies me and whoever makes her sad makes me sad"?

Both of them confessed " yes. We have heard such thing".

نعم سمعناه من رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم.

Then Sedighe Tahere bade

فإني أشهد الله وملائكته أنكما أسخطتماني وما أرضيتماني ولئن لقيت النبي لأشكونكما إليه.

I consider God and angels as witness that you have irritated me and have made me sad and I will complain you when I visit my father.

She also bade

والله لأدعون الله عليك في كل صلاة أصليها.

I swear God that I curse you after each prayer.

Al-Dinvari , Abu Muhammad Abdullah Ben Moslem Ibn Ghatibe (died in 276 Hejira), Al-Emamat Al-Siyasat, v 1 p 17, chapter; Kaifa Kanat Beiat Ali Raziollah Anho, Researched by: Khalil Al-Mansur, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut, 1418 Hejira- 1997

However, how can we believe that Sedighe Shahide (peace be upon her) was satisfied of both of them? Is the narration of Bokhari prior or the narration of Beihaghi that is considered as the enemy of Amir Momenan(peace be upon him) and he was not the witness of the event himself?

Third: if Fatima Zahra (peace be upon him) had been satisfied of both of them why would she have willed to be buried at night and not to inform persons that tyrannized her for funeral ceremony and prayer?

Muhammad Ben Ismaeil Bokhari has written

وَعَاشَتْ بَعْدَ النَّبِيِّ صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ سِتَّةَ أَشْهُرٍ فَلَمَّا تُوفِّيتُ دَفَنَهَا زَوْجُهَا عَلِيٌّ لَيْلًا وَلَمْ يُؤْذَنْ بِهَا
أَبَا بَكْرٍ وَصَلَّى عَلَيْهَا

Fatima remained alive for six months for six months and because she passed away her husband, Ali, buried her at night and she did not inform Abubakr and he himself prayed for the corpse of Fatima.

Al-Bokhari Al-Jaafi Muhammad Ben Esmaeel Abu Abdullah (died in 256 Hejira), Sahih Al-Bokhari, v 4 p 1549, hadith 3998, Kitab Al-Maghazi, chapter

Ghazvat Kheibar, Researched by: D. Mostafa Deib Al-Bagha, Published by: Dar Ibn Kathir, Al-Yamame, Beirut, Third Edition; 1407- 1987

Ibn Ghotaybe Dinvari has written in the book " Tavail Mokhtalef Al-Hadith" has written

وقد طالبت فاطمة رضي الله عنها أبا بكر رضي الله عنه بميراث أبيها رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم فلما لم يعطها إياه حلفت لا تكلمه أبدا وأوصت أن تدفن ليلا ليلا يحضرها فدفنت ليلا

Fatima requested Abubakr the inheritance of his father, the messenger of God, from Abubakr and because Abubakr disobeyed, he swore that would not talk to him any longer more. Moreover, she willed to bury her at night so that Abubakr did not take part in her funeral ceremony.

Al-Dinvari , Abu Muhammad Abdullah Ben Moslem Ibn Ghatibe (died in 276 Hejira), Tavail Mokhtalef Al-Hadith, v 1 p 300, Researched by: Muhammad Zahari Al-Najar, Published by: Dar Al-Jeil, Beirut, 1393- 1972

Abd Al-Razagh Sanaee has written

عن بن جريج وعمر بن دينار أن حسن بن محمد أخبره أن فاطمة بنت النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم دفنت بالليل قال فر بها علي من أبي بكر أن يصلي عليها كان بينهما شيء

He has narrated that Hasan Ben Muhammad said " Fatima, the daughter of the prophet, was buried at night so that Abubakr could not pray for her corpse because there was animosity between them.

And he has added

عن بن عيينة عن عمرو بن دينار عن حسن بن محمد مثله الا أنه قال اوصته بذلك.

It has been narrated from Hasan Ben Muhammad the same as the last narration, but it has been narrated in this narration " Fatima willed to be buried at night.

Al-Sanaani, Abu Bakr Abd Al-Razagh Ben Hemam (died in 211 Hejira), Al-Mosnef, v 3 p 521, hadith 6554, 6555, Researched by: Habib Al-Rahman Al-Azami, Published by: Al-Maktab Al-Eslami, Beirut, Second Edition; 1403 Hejira

Of course, someone may say " Abubakr was sorry later and repented". We should answer " repent is good and valuable when it is from the inner of human with regret and on the other hand, that person should make up his past. It means that a repentant should make up spoilt rights (whether God or people).

We would like to ask" did Abubakr give back Fadak to Sedighe Tahere so that his repent could be accepted by God?

Conclusion

The anger of Fatima from Sheikhin in her last moments of life and lack of her satisfaction from both of them are matters that have been said in the Sunni most valid books after Quran and the narration of Beihaghi that can be interpreted the satisfaction of Fatima from it has no valid because of Nasebi in its document.

The group in charge of answering doubts

Research centre of Hazrat Valiasr