

Is it true that Imam Hussein's (AS) wives and the women in his family rended their clothes (collars) for mourning for Imam Hussein (AS)?

Shia Beliefs Group

Questioner: Mahdi Ahmadi

Question explanation:

It is mentioned in all the related books that Zeinab (SA) and all the other women in Imam Hussein's (AS) family rended their collars and messed their hair up. Was it appropriate for the women in Imam Hussein's (AS) family to rend their collars?

The Answer:

First of all we should say about "It is mentioned in all the related books that Zeinab (SA) and all the other women in Imam Hussein's (AS) family rended their collars and messed their hair up when they saw Imam Hussein's (AS) dead body without the head" that there is no narrative about it in the books as you said or we have not found any yet; and also it is not mentioned in those related narratives that they messed their hair up:

First narrative (in Yazid's ceremony)

ثم وضع رأس الحسين ع بين يديه و أجلس النساء خلفه لئلا ينظرون إليه فرآه علي بن الحسين ع فلم يأكل الرءوس بعد ذلك أبدا و أما زينب فإنها لما رأته فأهوت إلى جيبها فشقت ، ثم نادت بصوت حزين يفزع القلوب ، يا حسينا ! يا حبيب رسول الله ! يا بن مكة ومنى ! يا بن فاطمة الزهراء سيدة النساء ! يا بن محمد المصطفى . قال : فأبكت والله كل من كان ، ويزيد عليه لعائن الله ساكت ... ثم دعا يزيد عليه اللعنة بقضيب خيزران فجعل ينكت به ثنايا الحسين عليه السلام و جعل يزيد يتمثل بأبيات ابن الزبيري :

ليت أشياخي ببدر شهدوا * جزع الخزرج من وقع الأسل

لأهلوا واستهلوا فرحا * ولقالوا يا يزيد لا تشل

قد قتلنا القوم من ساداتهم * و عدلناه ببدر فاعتدل

لعبت هاشم بالملك فلا * خبر جاء ولا وحي نزل

لست من خندق إن لم أنتقم * من بني أحمد ما كان فعل

Yazid put Imam Hussein's (AS) head in front of himself and let the women stand behind him and therefore they could not see it; but Imam Sajjad (AS) saw the head and after that heartbreaking scene he did not eat the meat of any Halal animals' head. When Zeinab (SA) saw his brother's head, she rended her collar because of her extreme sadness and then cried her brother's name out load, moving everyone.

The narrator said: By Allah, everybody in Yazid's ceremony started crying and Yazid himself did not say anything because of her crying ... and then Yazid asked for (as he got the piece of wood) he hit Imam Hussein's (AS) teeth repeatedly and said:

BaniHashem wanted to be the king and did not pay attention to the incumbent king and kingdom (and Islam was their excuse); and in fact there were not any Divine messages or news (he meant to insult Prophet Mohammad (Peace Be Upon Him) by BaniHashem.)

I wish the great people of my tribe who were killed in Badr War were here and saw how Khazraj tribe (one of the tribes in early Islam) that helped Prophet Mohammad (Peace Be Upon Him) are moaning now [because of the defeat in the war against us]; if they were here, they would be very happy and their faces were shining with excitement and they would say: O' Yazid! Thank you. We had killed the great men of Khazraj in Ohod War and we did it so as a retaliation for the Badr War and there was not a difference between Badr and Ohod.

I would not be one of the Khandaf generation members if I did not take revenge on Prophet Mohammad's (Peace Be Upon Him) children and family for the killed people in Badr War.¹

Only the story of collar rending was mentioned here.

The second narrative

عن خالد بن سدير أخي حنان بن سدير قال سئلت ابا عبد الله عليه السلام ... ولا شئ في اللطم على الخدود سوى الاستغفار والتوبة ، وقد شققن الجيوب ولطمن الخدود الفاطميات على الحسين بن علي عليهما السلام .

KhaledIbn Sadir said: I asked Imam Sadegh (AS) (about the man who rended his clothes (or his collar) because of his father, mother, brother or one of his family member's death), he answered: If he beats himself, he should not make atonement (for his action) and he should just repent of it. Certainly, Imam Hussein's (AS) wives and the women in his family (in Karbala) rended their collars and beat their faces for mourning for Imam Hussein (AS).²

There are two points in those two hadiths to which we should pay attention:

First point: In the second narrative, Imam Sadegh (AS) ascribed rending collars to the above women without any kind of problems and he did not criticize their action. So we can understand that this action is not incompatible with the dignity of Imam Hussein's (AS) wives and the women in his family.

¹ -Al-Lahuf, Seyed Ben Tavoos, p 178, 179, 180.

² -Tahzib Al-Ahkam, v 8 p 325, chapter Al-Kafarat

Second point: It is mentioned in none of these two hadiths that the women messed their hair up for the mourning for Imam Hussein (AS).

And we should give some points in the answer for the second part of your question in which you asked whether rending collar is compatible with the dignity of the women in Imam Hussein's (AS) family.

Imam Hussein's (AS) martyrdom, the greatest catastrophe:

First: We should pay attention that the catastrophe which happened in Karbala was not an ordinary and simple one and the person who was martyred there was not an ordinary or simple one either; but it was mourning and crying for missing one of the Imams (AS) and the lord of young people in the heaven.

Imam Reza (AS) said about this issue:

... قال الرضا عليه السلام ... ان يوم قتل الحسين اقرح جفوننا واسبل دموعنا ، واذل عزيزنا ، أرض كربلا أورثتنا الكرب والبلاء إلى يوم الانقضاء فعلى مثل الحسين فليبك الباكون ، فان البكاء عليه يحط الذنوب العظام ثم قال " عليه السلام " كان أبى " عليه السلام " إذا دخل شهر المحرم لا يرى ضاحكا ، وكانت الكتابة تغلب عليه حتى تمضى منه عشرة أيام فإذا كان يوم العاشر كان ذلك اليوم يوم مصيبته وحزنه وبكائه ويقول هو اليوم الذى قتل فيه الحسين عليه السلام

The day of Imam Hussein's (AS) martyrdom brought tears to our eyes and it (apparently and in the eyes of people) lowered Imam Hussein's (AS) dignity. Karbala is remembered as a disaster and difficulty and catastrophe forever. Because crying for Imam Hussein (AS) removes the great sins. And then he said: As Moharram starts, nobody could find my father, Imam Moosa (AS), laughing. He was mourning for ten days and when the tenth day came, my father started to mourn and cry (for Imam Hussein (AS)). Imam Moosa said: it is the day when Imam Hussein (AS) was martyred.³

Rending the collar is not only done by Imam Hussein's (AS) family members.

Second: Rending the collar is not only done by Imam Hussein's (AS) family members, but according to the narratives, Moses for Aaron and Ansar's women for Prophet Mohammad (Peace Be Upon Him) [as they heard the fabricate story of Prophet's death in Ohod War] and Imam Hassan Asgari for his brother and his father rended their collars.

Moses rended collar when Aaron died.

³ -Al-Amali, Sheikh Sadugh, p 190, 191, chapter Hadith Al-Reza An Yom Ashura, hadith 2/199, Rozat Al-Vaezin, Fatal Neishaburi, v 1 p 210, Al-Matam Al-Hosseini, Alame Seyed Abd Al-Hosseini Sharaf Al-Din Al-Musavi, v 4 p 10, 11

... عن الصادق عليه السلام وسأله عن شق الرجل ثوبه على أبيه و أمه وأخيه أو على قريب له فقال : لا بأس بشق الجيوب قد شق موسى بن عمران على أخيه هارون .

Khaled Ibn Sadir said: I asked Imam Sadegh (AS) [about that man who rended his clothes for his father, mother, brother, or one of his relatives' death] and he answered: there is no problem about rending collar; as Moses rended his collar for his brother's, Aaron, death.⁴

Ansar's women and rending collar for Prophet Mohammad (Peace Be Upon Him)

... نساء الأنصار قد خدشن الوجوه ونشرن الشعور وجزن النواصي وخرقن الجيوب وحرمن البطون على النبي (صلى الله عليه وآله) فلما رأيته قال لهن خيرا وأمرهن أن يستترن ويدخلن منازلهن ...

Ansar's women (as they heard the fabricate story of Prophet Mohammad's (Peace Be Upon Him) death in Ohod War) and messed their hair up and pulled out their hair in the front part of their hair and rended their collars and did not eat food. And as they saw him, he prayed for them and said to them to cover themselves and go to their homes.⁵

As you see, when Prophet Mohammad (Peace Be Upon Him) faced with them prayed for them.

Imam Hassan Asgari (AS) rended his collar for his brother's death.

محمد بن يحيى وغيره ، عن سعد بن عبد الله ، عن جماعة من بني هاشم منهم الحسن ابن الحسن الأبطس أنهم حضروا - يوم توفي محمد بن علي بن محمد - باب أبي الحسن يعزونه وقد بسط له في صحن داره والنساء جلوس حوله ، فقالوا : قدرنا أن يكون حوله من آل أبي طالب وبني هاشم وقريش مائة وخمسون رجلا سوى مواليه وسائر الناس إذ نظر إلى الحسن بن علي قد جاء مشقوق الجيب ، حتى قام عن يمينه ونحن لا نعرفه ، فنظر إليه أبو الحسن عليه السلام بعد ساعة فقال : يا بني أحدث لله عز وجل شكرا ، فقد أحدث فيك أمرا ، فبكى الفتى وحمد الله واسترجع ، وقال : الحمد لله رب العالمين وأنا أسأل الله تمام نعمه لنا فيك وإنا لله وإنا إليه راجعون ، فسألنا عنه ، فقيل : هذا الحسن ابنه ، وقدرنا له في ذلك الوقت عشرين سنة أو أرجح ، فيومئذ عرفناه وعلمنا أنه قد أشار إليه بالإمامة وأقامه مقامه .

Hassan Ibn Hassan Aftas said: When Mohammad Ibn Ali Ibn Mohammad died, some of Bani Hashem people and I went to offer Imam Hadi (AS) our condolences. He was sitting on a carpet in a house yard and the women in his family were sitting around him also. People who accompanied me said: in our point of view, there were about 150 people from Abu Taleb, Bani Hashem, and Quraish men except Imam Hadi's (AS) servants and some other people around him. Then Imam Hadi (AS) looked at Hassan Ibn Ali (AS) [his son] who entered the house with

⁴ -Bahar Al-Anvar, v 79, p 106, chapter Fi Latm Al-Khadud va Shagh Al-Jeyub va Al-Thiyab va Al-Niyahat.

⁵ -Al-Kafi, v 8 p 322, chapter Ghazvat Ohod Ghesat Al-Monhazemin, hadith 502

rended collar. He went and stood on Imam Hadi's (AS) right. We did not know him. After a while, Imam Hadi (AS) looked at him and said: O' my son! Thank Allah. Surely, He appointed you as an Imam. The young man (Hassan Ibn Ali) cried and thanked Allah and said (إنا لله وإنا إليه راجعون) "Indeed we belong to Allah, and to him do we indeed return." And he said: Thank belongs to Allah who is the Lord of the worlds. I ask Allah to lengthen your life instead of all our blessings and we belong to Allah and we will return to Him. Hassan Ibn Hassan Aftas said: We asked who this young man is. They answered: he is Hassan, Imam Haidi's (AS) son. Hassan Ibn Ali (AS) was 20 years old or more then. We began to know Hassan Ibn Ali (AS) then and we understood that Imam Hadi (AS) mentioned to his son's Imamate and selected him as his successor by saying فقد أحدث فيك أمرا surely Allah appointed you as an Imam.⁶

Imam Hassan Asgari's (AS) rending collar for Imam Hadi's (AS) martyrdom

كشف الغمة (نقلًا من كتاب الدلائل) لعبد الله بن جعفر الحميري ، عن أبي هاشم الجعفري قال خرج أبو محمد عليه السلام في جنازة أبي الحسن عليه السلام وقميصه مشقوق فكتب إليه أبو عون من رأيت أو بلغك من الأئمة شق ثوبه في مثل هذا فكتب إليه أبو محمد عليه السلام يا أحمق ما يدريك ما هذا قد شق موسى على هارون أخيه .

Abu Hashem Jafari said: Imam Hassan Asgari (AS) came out as he rended his collar in Imam Hadi's (AS) funeral. Abu Oun asked him in a letter that who told you or who you saw that rended his collar or from which Imam you could understand that you can rended your clothes. Imam Hassan Asgari answered him: O' Unwise! How could you understand it? (And for whom did I rend the collar?) Moses also rended his collar for his brother's, Aaron, death.⁷

Rending collar in mourning for Yazid Ibn Omar Ibn Hobaireh in 182 (AH) (the last Omavi ruler in Iraq:

When Ibn Hobaireh was killed by Abbasids in Waset city, Abu Ata Sendi wrote a poem for him:

⁶ -Al-Kafi, v 1 p 326, 327, hadith 8, chapter Al-Esharat Al-Nas Ali Abi Muhammad Alaihem Al-Salam, Vasael Al-Shia, v 3 p 273, 274, hadith 3632, Abvab Al-Dafn va Ma Yanasebah, chapter 84: Kerahat Al-Sayah Ala Al-Meit va Shagh Al-Thaob Ala Gheir Al-Ab Al-Akh Al-Gharabat, Kafarat Zaleka, hadith 3, Jame Al-Ahadith Al-Shia, v 3 p 491, 492, hadith 4823, Abvab Al-Taziye Al-Tasliyat Al-Beka Ala Meit Sabr Al-Masab, chapter (8), Hakam Al-Sayah Al-Sarakh be Al-Vil Al-Avil Al-Thabur Al-Doa bel Zel Al-Thakal Al-Nuh va Latm Al-Vajh Al-Sadr va Tasfigh Aleid Ala Aleid Joz Al-Sher Nashrah Eghamah Al-Niyah va Shagh Al-Thiyab, hadith 39

⁷ -Vasael Al-Shia, v 3 p 274, hadith 3634, Abvab Al-Dafn va ma Yanasebah, chapter 84: Kerahat Al-Siyah Ala Al-Meit va Shagh Al-Thaob Ala Ghair Al-Ab va Al-Akh Al-Gharabat, va Kafarat Zaleka, hadith 5 , Jame Al-Ahadith Al-Shia, v 3 p 490, hadith 4820, Abvab Al-Taziye Al-Tasliye Al-Boka Ala Meit Sabr Al-Masab, , chapter (8), Hakam Al-Sayah Al-Sarakh be Al-Vil Al-Avil Al-Thabur Al-Doa bel Zel Al-Thakal Al-Nuh va Latm Al-Vajh Al-Sadr va Tasfigh Aleid Ala Aleid Joz Al-Sher Nashrah Eghamah Al-Niyah va Shagh Al-Thiyab, hadith 36

ألا إن عينا لم تجد يوم واسط * عليك بجارى دمعها لجمود
عشية قام النائحات وشققت * جيوب بأیدی ماتم وحدود . . .

Surely, may the eyes that did not cry for your death in Waset city get blind. Last night, women wept in your mourning and they rended collars and scratched their faces.⁸

Rending collar in Nouvi's death (one of the most famous Ulema):

There are so many poems that were written for Nouvi's death and it is said in one of them:

خطب رفع من شق الجيوب له ... فقد شققت جناني دون قمصان

(Nouvi was a dignified person in whose death the collars were rended ... I rended not only my collar but also my heart in his death.⁹

Ulema's (religious authorities) Fatwas

Third: A lot of Ulema made some Fatwas to agree with rending collar for someone's father or brother according to these narratives. Pay attention to these statements:

Shahid Awal (RA) said:

واستثنى الأصحاب إلا ابن إدريس شق الثوب على موت الأب والأخ لفعل العسكري على الهادي ، وفعل الفاطميات على الحسين (عليه السلام) ... عن خالد بن سدير ، عن الصادق (عليه السلام) ، وسأله عن شق الرجل ثوبه على أبيه وأمه وأخيه ، أو على قريب له ؟ فقال : لا بأس بشق الجيوب ، قد شق موسى بن عمران على أخيه هارون .

All Shia Ulema but Ibn Edris Helli believe that there is no problem about rending collar for one's father's or brother's death because Imam Hassan Asgari (AS) rended his collar for his father, Imam Hadi's (AS), death and women in Imam Hussein's (AS) family rended their collars in his martyrdom ... Khaled Ibn Sarir said: I asked Imam Sadegh (AS) about someone who rended his clothes (rended his collar) for one of his relatives' death and he answered: There is no problem in rending collar, as Moses rended his collar in his brother, Aaron's death.¹⁰

⁸ -Al-Tabari, Abi Jafar Muhammad Ben Jarir (died in 310 hejira), Tarikh Al-Tabari, v 4 p 364, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut, Ibn Asaker, Abi Al-Ghasem Ali Ben Al-Hasan Ibn Habatollah Ben Abdullah Al-Shafein (died in 571 hejira), Tarikh Medina Damascus, Va Zakara Fazloha Tasmiye Min Haleha Min Al-Amathel, v 65, p 334, Translated by: Yazid Ben Omar ben Hobeire, no 8328, Researched by: Moheb Al-Din Abi Saeed Omar Ben Ghrame Al-Omari, Published by: Dar Al-Fekr, Beirut,1995

⁹ -Ala Al-Din Ali Ben Ebrahim Ben Al-Atar (died in 724 hejira), Tohfah Al-Talebin Fi Tarjome Al-Emam Al-Navavi, v 1 p 20

¹⁰ -Zakari Shia Fi Ahkam Al-Shariat, Shahid Aval, v 2 p 56, 57, chapter Al-Baht Al-Rabe: Al-Niyahat

شق الثوب على غير الأب والأخ من الأقارب وغيرهم لما فيه من إضاعة المال والسخط بقضاء الله وعلى استثناء الأب و الأخ أكثر الأصحاب لان العسكري عليه السلام شق ثوبه على أبيه الهادي عليه السلام خلف وقدام وفعله الفاطميات على الحسين عليه السلام وعن الصادق عليه السلام إن موسى عليه السلام شق على أخيه هارون ...

Shahid Sani said: it is forbidden to rend your collar for one of your relatives' death but your father and brother as it causes losing money and properties (Esarf) and it is objecting to Divine Decisions (قضا و قدر الهى). And most of the Shia Ulema believe that rending collar for the father's or brother's death is an exception because Imam Hassan Asgari (AS) rended his collar from its front and back for his father, Imam Hadi's (AS) martyrdom and also women in Imam Hussein's (AS) family rended their collars for his martyrdom. It is quoted by Imam Sadegh (AS) that surely Moses rended his collar for his brother, Aaron's death.¹¹

وأما الاستثناء ، فدليله ما استفيض في الأخبار من فعل أبي محمد الحسن عليه السلام على أبيه الهادي عليه السلام ، وفي بعضها تعليل بأن موسى شق ثوبه على هارون ، ولما نقل من فعل الفاطميات على الحسين عليه السلام .

Ulema's reason for excepting the collar rending in father's or brother's death is the detailed narrative about Imam Hassan Asgari's (AS) rending collar in Imam Hadi's (AS) martyrdom and Moses's rending collar in Aaron's death and rending collar of the women in Imam Hussein's (AS) family. This narrative is quoted to us.¹²

Mourning is Muslims' lifestyle

Fourth: The mourning tradition for the relatives does not only belong to Shias, but it also is common in most of the nations in the world and it does not matter which religion they follow. To avoid circumlocution, we are not going to describe it in details, but according to the narratives and in some books, it is considered as an important matter among Shias and also Sunnis. As it is emotional, too. The narrators and history writers recorded that Prophet Mohammad's (Peace Be Upon Him) wives beat their faces and chests in mourning for him, and Muslims played drum, closed the malls, and in some cases, they mourned for one year in mourning for Abdul Mo'men and Joweini and Ibn Jowzi (the Sunni Ulema).

Pay attention to these cases:

Prophet Mohammad's (Peace Be Upon Him) wives, the first planners of chest beating (for mourning)

Ibn Hosham quoted:

¹¹ -Roz Al-Janana, Shahid Thani, p 320, 321, chapter Nabsh Al-Ghabr

¹² -Ghanaem Al-Ayam, Mirzaye Ghomi, v 3 p 556, 557, chapter Shagh Al-Thaob Ala Al-Meit

قال ابن اسحاق وحدثني يحيى بن عباد بن عبدالله بن الزبير عن أبيه عباد قال سمعت عائشة تقول . . .
قمت ألتدم مع النساء وأضرب وجهي .

Ayesha said: (when Prophet Mohammad (Peace Be Upon Him) passed away) his other women and I beat at our chests and I beat my face.¹³

Ibn Manzoor wrote for the term (لدم):

لدم : اللدم ضرب المرأة صدرها . . . و التدام النساء : ضربهن صدورهن ووجوههن في النياحة .
لدم means women's chest beating ... and women's التدام means women's beating chest or face in mourning.¹⁴

Sakehi Shami wrote under Ayesha's narrative:

وهذا الحديث تفرد به ابن إسحاق ، وهو حسن الحديث إذا صرع بالتحديث ، وقد صرح به فقال : حدثني
يحيى بن عباد بن عبد الله بن الزبير عن أبيه قال : سمعت عائشة إلخ .

This narrative is only quoted by Ibn Eshagh, and when Ibn Eshagh specifies, and then his narrative is reliable and true. He said in this narrative: I heard from Yahiya Ibn Ebad Ibn Abdullah Al-Zubair that he was quoting from his father that he had heard it from Ayesha...¹⁵

Ibn Teymiyeh said about Ibn Eshagh:

وبن إسحاق اذا قال حدثني فحديثه صحيح عند أهل الحديث .

When Ibn Eshagh specifies that he had heard the hadith, his hadith then is true and reliable in hadiths Ulema's point of view.¹⁶

¹³ -Abd Al-Malek Ben Hosham Ben Ayub Al-Hamiri Al-Moaferi Abu Muhammad (died in 213 hejira), Al-Sirat Al-Nabaviye, v 6 p 75, hadith 26391, Researched by: Taha Abd Al-Rauf Sad, Published by: Dar Al-Jeil, Beirut, First Edition, 1411, Ibn Hanbal Abu Abdullah Al-Sheibani, Ahmad (died in 241 hejira), Mosnad, v 6 p 274, Published by: Ghortabat Institute, Egypt, Al-Balazeri, Ahmad Ben Yahya Ben Jaber (died in 279 hejira), Ansab Al-Ashraf, v 1 p 243, Mosnad abi Yali, Abu Yali Al-Movaseli Al-Tamimi, Ahmad Ben Ali Ben Al-Mothana (died in 307 hejira), Mosnad abi Yali, v 8 p 63, Researched by: Hossein Salim Asad, Published by: Dar Al-Mamun Leltorath, Damascus, First Edition, 1404- 1984, Al-Tabari, Abi Jafar Muhammad Ben Jarir (died in 310), Tarikh Al-Omam Al-Moluk, v 2 p 232, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut

¹⁴ -Ibn Manzur, Muhammad ben Mokaram Ben Manzur Al-Afrighi Al-Mesri (died in 711 hejira), Lisan Al-Arab, v 12 p 539, Published by: Dar Sader, Beirut, First Edition

¹⁵ -Al-Salehi Al-Shami (died in 942), Sabl Al-Hoda Al-Reshad, v 12 p 267, Researched by: Al-Sheikh Adel Ahmad Abd Al-Mojud, Al-Sheikh Ali Muhammad Moavez, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut, Lebanon, First Edition, 1414- 1993

¹⁶ -Ibn Teimiye Al-Horani, Ahmad Ben Abd Al-Halim Abu Al-Abbas (died in 728), Kotob va Rasael Fatavi Ibn Teimiye Fi Al-Feghh, v 33, p 86, Researched by: abd Al-Rahman Ben Muhammad Ben Ghasem Al-Asemi Al-Najedi, Published by: Maktab Ibn Teimiye, Second Edition, Ibn Teimiye Al-Horani, Ahmad Ben Abd Al-Halim

Holding mourning ceremony for Abdul Al-Momen Ben Khalaf

Zahabi wrote in his translation:

الإمام الحافظ القدوة . . . قال جعفر المستغفري : أخبرنا أبو جعفر محمد بن علي النسفي ، قال : شهدت جنازة الشيخ أبي يعلى بالمصلى ، فغشيتنا أصوات طبول مثل ما يكون من العساكر ، حتى ظن جمعنا أن جيشاً قد قدم ، فكنا نقول : ليتنا صلينا على الشيخ قبل أن يغشانا هذا . فلما اجتمع الناس وقاموا للصلاة [وأنصتوا] ، هدا الصوت كأن لم يكن . . .

I participated in abdul Al-Momen's funeral. There was a deafening sound of drums that I thought an army attacked Baghdad. This ceremony continued till the people got ready to say the corpse prayer.¹⁷

Holding mourning ceremony for Joweini (died in 478)

Zahabi explained holding the mourning ceremony for Joweini so:

الإمام الكبير، شيخ الشافعية، إمام الحرمين - إلى أن قال : - توفي في الخامس والعشرين من ربيع الآخر ، سنة ثمان وسبعين وأربع مئة ، ودفن في داره ، ثم نقل بعد سنين إلى مقبرة الحسين ، فدفن بجانب والده ، وكسروا منبره ، وغلقت الأسواق ، ورثي بقصائد ، وكان له نحو من أربع مائة تلميذ ، كسروا محابرهم وأقلامهم ، وأفاموا حولاً ، ووضعت المناديل عن الرؤوس عاماً ، بحيث ما اجترأ أحد على ستر رأسه ، وكانت الطلبة يطوفون في البلد نائحين عليه ، مبالغين في الصياح والجزع .

First he was buried in his house and then he was moved to Maghbarat Al-Hussein (maybe Karbala). They wrecked his culprit in his mourning ceremony, closed the malls and lament for him. He had four hundred students. They damaged their pens in his mourning ceremony and they mourned for one year. They did not wear their turbans so that nobody dared to wear a turban. They were lamenting in the city all this time and they were really sad in his mourning.¹⁸

Holding mourning ceremony for Ibn Al-Jowzi (died in: 597) during Ramadan

Sebt Ibn Jowzi died on Thursday, Ramadan thirteenth. Zahabi wrote about the reaction of his death:

Abu Al-Abbas (died in 728), Al-Fatavi Al-Kobra, v 3 p 23, Researched by: Ghadam Lah Hasanin Muhammad Makhluf, Published by: Dar Al-Marefat, Beirut

¹⁷ -Seir Alam Al-Nobala, v 15, p 480, 481, 482, Tarikh Medina Damascus, Ibn Asaker, v 10 p 272

¹⁸ -Seir Alam Al-Nobala, v 8 p 468, 476, Al-Montazem, v 9 p 20

أبو الفرج ابن الجوزي الشيخ الإمام العلامة الحافظ المفسر، شيخ الإسلام، مفخر العراق . . . وتوفي ليلة الجمعة بين العشاءين الثالث عشر من رمضان سنة سبع وتسعين وخمس مئة في داره بقطفتا . وحكت لي أمي أنها سمعته يقول قبل موته : أيش أعمل بطواويس ؟ يردددها ، قد جيتم لي هذه الطواويس . وحضر غسله شيخنا ابن سكيّنة وقت السحر ، وغلقت الأسواق ، وجاء الخلق ، وصلى عليه ابنه أبو القاسم علي اتفاقا ، لان الأعيان لم يقدرّوا من الوصول إليه ، ثم ذهبوا به إلى جامع المنصور ، فصلوا عليه ، وضاق بالناس ، وكان يوما مشهودا ، فلم يصل إلى حفرته بمقبرة أحمد إلى وقت صلاة الجمعة ، وكان في تموز ، وأفطر خلق ، ورموا نفوسهم في الماء . إلى أن قال : وما وصل إلى حفرته من الكفن إلا قليل ، كذا قال ، والعهدة عليه . وأنزل في الحفرة ، والمؤذن يقول الله أكبر ، وحزن عليه الخلق ، وباتوا عند قبره طول شهر رمضان يختمون الختمات ، بالشمع والقناديل و أصبحنا يوم السبت عملنا العزاء و تكلمت فيه و حضر خلق عظيم و عملت فيه المراثي .

When he died, they closed the malls and a big crowd took part in his funeral. The excess of people and the hot weather made a lot of the mourners break their fast. Some threw themselves into the Tigris ... only a little piece of the shroud was left ... the people spent their nights next to his grave until the end of Ramadan. They took some candles and lights and they recited the Holy Quran. We held the mourning ceremony on Saturday. The speakers gave speeches about him. A lot of people took part. Some lamented for him.¹⁹

Consequently and as it was mentioned above, when Shia and Sunni Ulema believe that mourning to that extent is permissible, not only there is no mismatching between rending the collar and mourning for Imam Hussein (AS), but also it is a permissible and desired matter.

Good luck

Answering to the doubts

Vali Asr research Institute

¹⁹ - Seir Alam Al-Nobala, v 21, p 365, 379