

IMAM BAGHER (PEACE BE UPON HIM)'S MARTYRDOM

Channel 3

2009/ 09/ 04

The host: Mr. Akbar Nejad

The prophet (Peace be upon him and his family) stated to Jaber Ibn Abdollah Ansari:

You will meet Imam Bagher (peace be upon him), give my best regards to him.

You may have heard this narration many times, but does this narration exist in Sunni sources too?

Dr. Hussein Ghazvini

This narration has been mentioned in Shia sources in detail:

The prophet (Peace be upon him and his family) gave this good news to Jaber Ibn Abdollah Ansari that God will bestow you long life. Your life will be so long that you will be able to meet my son, Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him).

Jaber Ibn Abdollah Ansari met the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family), Amir al-Momenin (Peace be upon him), Imam Hassan (Peace be upon him), Imam Hussein (Peace be upon him), Imam Sadjad (Peace be upon him), Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him). There is no other narrator who has met 6 of the holy Imams. In Sunni sources, Mr. Salah al-Din Safdari has mentioned:

فكان يمشي بالمدينة و يقول : يا باقر متى ألقاك؟ فمر يوما في بعض سكك المدينة فناولته جارية صبيا في حجرها، فقال لها: من هذا؟ فقالت: محمد بن علي بن الحسين بن علي . فضمه إلى صدره و قبل رأسه و يديه و قال: يا بني! جدك رسول الله يقرئك السلام. ثم قال جابر: نعتت إلي نفسي، فمات في تلك الليلة... 1.

Jaber Ibn Abdollah Ansari was walking in the alleys of Medina and said: O Bagher! When will I meet you? Once he saw a child by a woman in one of the alleys of Medina. He asked the woman: who is this child? The woman said: he is

Muhammad Ibn Ali Ibn Hussein Ibn Ali, Bagher. As Jaber heard this, he hugged the child and kissed his head, face, and his hands and said: your grandfather, the God's messenger, sent his best regards... Jaber died at that night.

1. al-Vafi Belvafiyat al-Safdi, vol. 4, p. 77. Sabaek al-Zahb Lelsavidi, P. 74

The host:

What is the view of Sunni brothers about the different aspects of Imam's life, character, knowledge, behavior, and ...?

The scholar Hosseini Ghazvini:

I guess that we cannot talk about Sunnis' point of view about Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him) in a 50 minutes session, but I know more than 50 prominent Sunni scholars who have talked and discussed about the knowledge and dignity of Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him). Even some of great Sunni scholars like Ahmad Ibn Hanbal, while discussing سلسلة الذهب hadith, have the following interpretation:

لو قرئت هذا الإسناد علي مجنون لبرء من جنة.1

If you read this evidence for a crazy one, he will be healed.

Fakhr Razi _who is a known face among Shias and Sunnis_ has a nice interpretation in the interpretation of Kowthar Sourah. He says:

The purpose of Kowthar (كوثر) is Fatima because there will remain good offspring from her:

فانظر كم قتل من أهل البيت؟! ثم العالم ممتلئ منهم و لم يبق من بني أمية في الدنيا أحد يعبأ به، ثم أنظر كم كان فيهم من الأكابر من العلماء كالباقر و الصادق و الكاظم و الرضا عليهم السلام؟!2

Many members of Ahle Bait were killed, but the world is still full of the children of Ahle Bait. There is no nice man from Bani Omaye's generation. There are many great and famous people from the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family)'s generation like Bagher, Sadegh, Kazem, and Reza (Peace be upon them).

Abdollah Ibn Ata says:

1. al-Savaegh al-Mahrooghah for Ibn Hajar al-Heithami, p. 310.

2. Tafsir al-Razi, vol. 32, p. 124.

ما رأيت العلماء عند أحد أصغر علما منهم عند أبي جعفر.¹

I found out that all of Sunni scholars are less than Abu Ja'afar.

It means that the knowledge of Sunni scholars is nothing in comparison with the knowledge of Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him).

Mohye al-Din Novi _the interpreter of Sahih Moslem_ has written in this regard in details in Tahzib al-Asma va al-Loghat, vol. 1, p. 103.

When Mr. Zahabi _one of the greatest Sunni scholars_ writes about the life of Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him), says:

ابو جعفر الباقر: سيد، امام، فقيه، يصلح للخلافة²

He was a great man, the leader, Faghih, and also qualified for the caliphate.

كان أهلا للخلافة³

The Host

Was there any prominent Sunni scholar the student of Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him)?

The scholar Hosseini Ghazvini

Ibn sa'sd _ who died at 230 AH was better than other scholars in history and Rejal science_ has mentioned in Tabaghat al-Kobra:

كان عالما، عابدا، ثقة، روي عنه الأئمة.

He was knowledgeable, reliable, and pious and our Sunni leaders have quoted from him.

1. Tazkerat Khavas al-Omat Lesebt Ibn al-Jozi, p. 337_ Helyat al-Oliya Leolo Naeem, vol. 3, p. 186, the translation of Imam Muhammad Ibn Ali al-Bagher (Peace be upon him)_ the history of Damascus Libn Asaker, vol. 54, p. 278.

2. Seir A'alam al-Nabla Lelzahabi, vol. 13, p. 120.

3. Seir A'alam al-Nabla LeLzahabi, vol. 4, p. 402

When Ibn Kathir Dameshghi _ he is one of Wahhabi and Salafi scholars who tries to justify or deny the narrations related to the virtues of Amir al-Momenin (Peace be upon him)_ is going to write about Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him), says:

و حدث عنه جماعة من كبار التابعين و غيرهم. فمن روى عنه ابنه جعفر الصادق و الحكم بن عتيبة و ربيعة و الأعمش و أبو إسحاق السبيعي و الأوزاعي و الأعرج و هو أسن منه و ابن جريج و عطاء و عمرو بن دينار و الزهري¹

The great Sunni men and their prominent scholars have quoted narrations from him and were his student. His students include: ...

Ibn Hajar Asghalani has named the people who were the students of Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him) and quoted narrations from him in Tahzib al-Tahzib Libn Hajar, vol. 9, p. 312.

The host

The audiences' questions

Was Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him) in Karbala? Please explain about Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him)'s scientific works and also tell us how many of Bani Omaya' s caliphs were contemporaneous with him.

The Scholar Hosseini Ghazvini

Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him) was born in 57 AH and Karbala incident occurred in 61 AH. Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him) met Imam Hussein (Peace be upon him) for 4 years and he was in Karbala too. In some of Sunni sources, it is said that Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him) himself quoted some of the incidents of Karbala. Certainly Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him) presented in Karbala and there is no doubt.

Regarding to his works, it is enough to say that he was the leading cause of finding Islamic great university and then his son, Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him),

1. Al-Bedayat va al-Nahayat Libn Kathir, vol. 9, p. 338

Continued the school of his father and treated more than 4 thousands great Faghih and scholars. Many of Shia and Sunni scholars were his students and it is mentioned in some of references that Jaber Ibn Yazid Ja'afi has quoted 70 thousands hadiths from Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him). We are going to write the encyclopedia of Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him) which will exist in about 20 volumes.

He lived with 10 of Bani Omayya's caliphs contemporaneously. The first one of them was Muawiya who were contemporary with him 3 years and died in 60 AH. After him, he was Yazid and then the son of Yazid, Muawiya, who met him too. Muawiya died in 64 AH. Next Marwan Ibn Hakam became caliph and died the same year (i.e. 64 AH). After him, Abd al-Malek Ibn Marwan became caliph. Then the Imamate of Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him) started and met 5 members of Bani Omayya's caliphs: Valid Ibn Abd al-Malek, Soleiman Ibn Abd al-Malek, Omar Ibn Abd al-Aziz, Yazid Ibn Abd al-Malek, and Hesham Ibn Abd al-Malek. Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him) was killed by the incitement of Hesham Ibn Abd al-Malek. He feed him poison.

If we want to talk about the political condition of the time of Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him), we will need 7 one-hour sessions to study and discuss about the political conditions from Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him)'s childhood until 114 AH, when he was killed.

The political conditions of the time of Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him) roots back to the kings and governors of that time. Dear Shia and Sunni audience! Pay attention that the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family) stated Thaghalein Hadith in different places:

إني تارك فيكم الثقلين: كتاب الله و عترتي اهل بيتي، إن تمسكتم بهما لن تضلوا بعدي.

I will leave you Quran and my Ahle Bait. If you resort to them, you will never go astray.

The result of getting away from Ahle Bait (Peace be upon them) is plaguing by Yazid, Marwan, and Abd al-Malek Ibn Marwan. Ibn Kathir Dameshghi Salafi Amavi_ died at 774 AH_ says in al-Bedayah va al-Nahayah:

Abd al-Malek Ibn Marwan was always in mosque before becoming caliph. He was always praying and reading Quran. When he was informed that he became caliph, he kissed the Quran and put it aside and said:

هذا فراق بيني و بينك.¹

Sivaty_ one of the greatest Sunni scholars who died in 911 AH_ says:

When Abd al-Malek Ibn Marwan made his first speech, he said that nobody should advise him and order him to virue.²

Abdollah Ibn Zobair was a controversial person in Mecca at the time of Abd al-Malek. Abd al-Malek ordered:

Nobody must go to the house of God.

He made holy house like Mecca and said:

Here is the footprint of the prophet and one who wants to go on Haj should first go to holy house and circle around it.³

Abd al-Malek even did not respect the ex-caliphs and insulted Osman, Muawiya, and others:

ولست بالخليفة المستضعف - يعني عثمان - و لا الخليفة المداهن - يعني معاوية - و لا الخليفة المأبون -
يعني يزيد بن معاوية.⁴

I'm not a miserable caliph like Osman. I'm not a cunning caliph like Yazid ...

One of the sensitive points of the time of Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him) was the problem of Islamic community with Hojjaj Ibn Youssef Saghafi. When the

1. al-Bedayat va al-Nahayat Libn Kathir, vol. 9, p. 76

2. The history of Caliphs for Sivaty, p. 219

3. Tarikh Ya'ghubi, vol. 2, p. 261

4. AL-Bedayah va al-Nahayah Libn Kathir, vol. 9, p. 77_ the history of Islam Lezahabi, vol. 5, p. 325_ the history of Damascus Libn Asaker, vol. 37, p. 135_ Sharh Nahjol Balaghe Libn Abi al-Hadid, vol. 6, p. 17_ al-Kamel fi al-Tarikh Libn al-Athir, vol. 4, p. 391.

People made Amir al-Momenin (Peace be upon him) so sad and bother him a lot, he said over and over:

قد ملأتم قلبي قيحا.¹

You bothered me to no end.

In the last moments of his life he cursed them and said: I wish God plague me by something better than you and you by someone worse than me. Hojaj Ibn Youssef Thaghafi was one of the results of the curse of Amir al-Momenin (Peace be upon him) and one of the important point of the time of Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him). Omar Ibn Abd al-Aziz, one of Omavi caliphs, says:

لو جاءت كل أمة بخبيثها و جننا بالحجاج، لغلبناهم²

If all of the world's Ummah introduce their most evil people, we will bring Hojaj and we will overcome them.

Sunnis great men like Damiri says in Hayat al-Heivan book:

مات في حبسه خمسون ألف رجل و ثلاثون ألف امرأة.³

50 thousand men and 30 thousand women were killed in the jails of Hojaj.

Most of them were kept naked.

Ibn Hajar Asghalani says:

The number of the Muslims who were killed by Hojaj was 120 thousand people, except those who were killed by his tortures.⁴

1. Nahjol Balaghe, sermon: 27

2. Tahzib al-Tahzib Libn Hajar, vol. 2, p. 185_ al-Bedayah va al-Nahayah Libn Kathir, vol. 6, p. 286 and vol. 9, p. 139_ the history of Damascus Libn Asaker, vol. 12, p. 186_ al-Kamel fi al-Tarikh Libn al-Athir, vol. 4, p. 586

3. Hayat al-Heivan, vol. 1, p. 170

4. Tahzib al-Tahzib Libn Hajar al-Asghalani, vol. 2, p. 185_ al-Tanbih va al-Eshraf Lelmasoodi, p. 274_ al-Kamel fi al-Tarikh Libn al-Athir, vol. 4, p. 587_ the history of Islam Lezahabi, vol. 6, p. 323_ al-Bedayah va al-Nahayah Libn Kathir, vol. 9, p. 156_ the history of Damascus Libn Asaker, vol. 12, p. 184

Sunnis criticize Shias that and say:

Shias believe that Imams (Peace be upon them) were innocent and they were in relationship with angels and Gabriel.

We believe that Imams (Peace be upon them) are innocent and we are proud of it. There are tens of hadiths and verses which back this belief such as Mobahele and Tathir verses. Does revealing continue after the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family) or not? No Shia child has said that revealing continued after the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family). It means that nobody believes that something was revealed to Imams (Peace be upon them). But Hojaj Omavi who some people protect him a lot says:

إن خبر السماء لم ينقطع عن الخليفة الأموي.

The revealing to Omavi caliphs did not cut after the prophet (May pace upon him and his family).

Even Hojaj has said some where:

ما أعمل إلا بوحى¹

I only act according to the revelation.

Ibn Hajar has quoted from one of great Sunni scholars in Lesan al-Mizan:

من خالف الحجاج فقد خالف الإسلام.²

One who is opposed to Hojaj, is opposed to Islam.

Manavi _one of the great Sunni scholars_ says:

In Bani Omaye dynasty, some of scholars gathered and said about Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him):

إن الخليفة لا حساب عليه.³

1. Tahzib Tarikh Damascus, vol. 4, p. 74_ the history of Damascus Libn Asaker, vol. 12, p. 160

2. Lesan al-Mizan Libn Hajar al-Asghalani, vol. 6, p. 89_ Masnad Ahmad Ibn Hanbal, vol. 5, p. 12_ al-
Thaghat Libn Hobban, vol. 5, p. 421

3. Feiz al-Ghadir Sharh al-Jame' al-Saghir Lelmanavi, vol. 1, p. 455 and vol. 2, p. 531

Muslims caliph will not be asked and no sin will be recorded for him.

These are the result of getting away from Ahle Bait (Peace be upon them) and grounding them. As a result of these, the people plagued by the people like Hesham, Hojaj, and Marwan.

The host

What is the lesson Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him) teach us about Sunnis and Shias?

Is there any narration from Abu Hurairah and Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him) in Sahih Bukhari and Sahih Moslem?

Please explain us about the prevention of cursing Amir al-Momenin (Peace be upon him) by Omar Ibn al-Aziz at the time of Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him).

The scholar Hosseini Ghazvini

We read many narrations about preventing people from insulting to Sunnis and their holy issues at the night of Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him)'s night and also Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him) prevents us from insulting to Sunnis and recommends us to go to their mosques and say prayers with them. These all show that our Imams (Peace be upon them) believed that there must be relationship between Shias and Sunnis. Of course, Shias and Sunnis are firm in their faith and believe, but these differences should not cause them to insult to each other. You do not even one bad word from Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him) to Sunnis and their great men. He had scientific discussion with them and stated:

شرقاً و غرباً، فوالله! لا تجدان علماً صحيحاً إلا شيئاً خرج من عندنا أهل البيت.¹

Even there is not one narration from Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him) in Sahih Bukhari, but there are about 460 narrations from Abu Hurairah in Sahih Bukhari. There is only 29 narrations from Hazrat Ali (Peace be upon him), only one narration from Hazrat Fatima Zahra (Peace be upon her), just one narration from Imam Hassan (Peace be upon him), and no narration from Imam Hussein (Peace be upon him) in Sahih Bukhari. Mr. Bukhari died in 256 AH. He was contemporary with Imam Hadi (Peace be upon him) and Imam Askari (Peace be upon him) who were very known in science worldwide and all of people _

1. Vasel al-Shia Lelameli, vol. 21, p. 477

Shia and Sunni_ came to learn from them from far distances, but he has not quoted even one narration from them.

Cursing Amir al-Momenin (Peace be upon him) started at the time of Muawiya and by his order. In Sahih Moslem book, vol. 7, p. 120, it is mentioned that Muawiya ordered Sa'ad Ibn Vaghas you should curse Hazrat Ali (Peace be upon him):

أمر معاوية بن أبي سفيان سعدا فقال: ما منعك أن تسب أبا التراب؟!

(Note: due to the lack of time, some of the questions remained unanswered)

و السلام عليكم و رحمة الله و بركاته

Dr. Seyed Muhammad Hosseini Ghazvini

Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) 's martyrdom

Channel: 3

2009/07/21

The host: Mr. Akbar Nejad

Please explain us about the social and political conditions of the time of Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) and his positioning.

The scholar Hosseini Ghazvini

The political condition of the time of Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) is one of the complicated issues of the history of Islam because Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him)'s Imamate lasted more than other Imams (Peace be upon them). It lasted about 34 years and he was contemporary with some of Bani Omiya's caliphs:

Hesham Ibn Abd al-Malek (from 105 AH to 125 AH), Valid Ibn Abd al-Malek (from 125 AH to 126 AH), Yazid Ibn Valid Ibn Abd al-Malek (from 126 AH to a few months later), Ibrahim Ibn Valid Ibn Abd al-Malek (70 days), and Marwan Hemar who governed until 132 AH and after him the Bani Omayya's caliphate rooted out.

Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) was contemporary with two Abbasi caliphs: Abdollah Ibn Muhammad Saffah (from 132 AH to 137 AH) and Abu Ja'afar Mansoor Davanighi (from 137 AH to 158 AH) who killed Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) by poison in 148 AH, Shavval 25. Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) was buried next to the tomb of his father, Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him) and Imam Sadjad (Peace be upon him), and Imam Hassan (Peace be upon him) in Baghi'i cemetery.

Among Imams (Peace be upon him), only Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) encountered two cultures and attitudes of Bani Omayya and Bani Abbas. The behavior and manner of Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) with Bani Omayya and Bani Abbas' caliphs was not the same. Bani Omayya caliphs hurt people one kind and Bani Abbas caliphs did it in another form. Some people say that an open condition was created for Imams (Peace be upon them) by emerging Bani Abbas, but no, it is wrong. The crimes of Bani Abbas were not less than Bani Omayya. As the poet says:

يا ليت جور بني مروان دام لنا و ليت عدل بني العباس في النار

I wish the oppressions of Bani Marwan (Bani Omayya) had continued, but the false justice of Bani Abbas had gone into hell.

So Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) was against both cultures.

Regarding to Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him)'s positioning against political issues we cannot talk in a short time, but in brief I should tell you that there was a public revolution and chaos in the society at the time of Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him). People from different cities came into the streets and rose against the government. They had decided to root out Bani Omayya's dynasty and bring into power an ideal Abbasi government to support Ahle Bait (Peace be upon them). During these incidents they invited Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) to join and

help them. Abu Salame Khalal wrote a letter to Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him). When the letterman brought the letter to Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him):

He read the letter and stated: closer that light to me. He burnt the letter. The letterman said: what is your respond?

Hazrat said: it was the answer.¹

Abu Moslem Khorasani _One of the criminal men in the history of Islam_ wrote a letter to Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) and introduced himself as one of Imam's friends and sought his help and. Imam (Peace be upon him) stated clearly:

ما أنت من رجالي و لا الزمان زماني²

You are not my friend and it not the time for me to rise.

Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) noticed that they committed many crimes in the cover of supporting Ahle Bait (Peace be upon them) which is unique in the history. Even the cruelest people have not done such measures during the history. For example Ibn Kathir Dameshghi _ one of the greatest Sunni scholars who is Salafi and Wahhabi_ says in al-Bedayah va al-Nahayah:

أن أبا مسلم قتل في حروبه و ما كان يتعاطاه لأجل دولة بني العباس ستمائة ألف صنبراً زيادة عن من قتل
بغير ذلك³

Abu Moslem Khorasani killed about 600 thousand people by torturing in Khorasan and also he killed many people by the other ways.

1. Moravej al-Zahab Lelmasoodi, vol. 3, p. 252

2. al-Melal va al-Nahal Lelshahrestani, vol. 1, p. 154_ Yanabi'I al-Mavadat Lezavi al-Ghorba Lelghondozi al-Hanafi, vol. 3, p. 161

3. al-Bedayah va al-Nahayah Libn Kathir, vol. 10, p. 77

You see that these people claim that they are the friends of Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) and the helpers of Ahle Bait (Peace be upon him), but they cheat people to take the revenge of Ahle Bait (Peace be upon them). It is interesting that they cut the roots of Ahle Bait (Peace be upon them) under the name of Ahle Bait (Peace be upon them). Unfortunately many people were cheated due to the lack of suitable culture among people and many Shias were attracted by their acts and lost their faith. But Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) entered this situation wisely and did not let Bani Omaye and Bani Abbas to have the least excuse.

The host

What are Sunni scholars' attitudes toward Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him)?

The scholar Hosseini Ghazvini

This year Qom Seminary great scholars declared three days as "Sadeghiye days" and the Seminary was off during these three days for the first time. It was a kind of appreciating Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him).

Regarding to Sunnis attitudes toward Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him), dear audience should note that Sunni brothers' idea is different from ours. They do not count Imams (Peace be upon them) as innocent, but Sunnis count them as someone who has performed valuable services in cultural areas and as a scientific personality and a person who has played an important role in treating Faghihs and scholars. Most of Sunni great scholars have positive and nice attitudes toward him.

1. Zahabi

Mr. Zahabi _ he was one of the greatest Sunni Rejali scholars. He died in 748 AH. He was contemporary with Allame Helli_ writes about the biography of Imam Sdegh (Peace be upon him):

مناقب جعفر كثيرة و كان يصلح للخلافة لسؤدده و فضله و علمه و شرفه رضي الله عنه.¹

Ja'far Ibn Muhammad has numerous characteristics and virtues and due to his science, knowledge, dignity, and honor he was qualified for the caliphate.

2. Malek Ibn Anas

1. The history of Islam for Zahabi, vol. 9, p. 93

Mr. Malek Ibn Anas _the leader of Maleki people_ says:

إختلفت إليه زماناً، فما كنت أراه إلا على ثلاث خصال إما مصل و إما صائم و إما يقرأ القرآن و ما رأيته يحدث إلا على طهارة¹

It was a long time that I went to him. I only saw him in 3 situations: either he was saying prayers or he was fasting or reading Quran and he only talked while he was clean.

I have never seen such interpretation that Late Ibn Shahr Ashoob has mentioned in his book, Managheb. Of course, some of great scholars have quoted from Tahzib al-Tahzib (by Ibn Hajar Asghalani), but it does not exist in new editions. When Malek Ibn Anas is going to talk about Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) writes:

و ما رأيت عين و لا سمعت أذن و لا خطر على قلب بشر أفضل من جعفر الصادق فضلا علما و عبادة و ورعا.²

No eye has ever seen and no ear has ever heard about someone superior to Ja'afar Sadeh in virtues, worship, and knowledge.

Ibn Shahr Ashoob is proved by Shia and Sunni scholars and he was contemporary with Allame Helli in 8th century.

2. Mezzi

Mr. Mezzi _one of the greatest Sunni scholars who died in 742 AH_ says in Tahzib al-Tahzib book:

ما رأيت أحدا أفقه من جعفر بن محمد³

Abu Hanife was asked about Ja'afar Ibn Muhammad. He said: I have never seen someone more knowledgeable than Ja'afar Ibn Muhammad.

4. Ibn Hajar Asghalani

Ibn Hajar Asghalani says:

1. Tahzib al-Tahzib Libn Hajar al-Asghalani, vol. 2, p. 89

2. Managheb Al Abi Taleb Libn Shahr Ashoob, vol. 3, p. 372

3. Tahzib al-Kamal Lelmezzi, vol. 5, p. 79_ Seir A'alam al-Nabla Lelzahabi, vol. 6, p. 257

فقيه إمام¹

He is both Faghih and Imam.

5. Ibn Khallakan

Ibn Khallakan _died in 681 AH_ says:

و فضله أشهر من أن يذكر²

The virtues of Ja'afar Ibn Muhammad are more than that can be expressed.

6. Manavi

Mr. Manavi _one of Sunni scholars who died in 1031 AH_ says:

له كرامات كبيرة و مكاشفات شهيرة³

Ja'afar Ibn Muhammad had numerous virtues and miracles and he also had known revelations.

7. Ibn Timiyah

Mr. Ibn Timiyah _one of the greatest Wahhabi theoretician and theorists who died in 728 AH_ says:

فإن جعفر بن محمد لم يجئ بعد مثله.⁴

No one has been born like Ja'afar Ibn Muhammad after him.

He has said in the second volume of this book:

فإن جعفر بن محمد من أئمة الدين بإتفاق أهل السنة

All Sunnis agree that Ja'afar Ibn Muhammad is one of the leaders of the religion.

1. Taghrib al-Tahzib Libn Hajar, vol. 1, p. 163

2. Vafiyat al-A'yan Libn Khallakan, vol. 1, p. 327

3. al-Kavakeb al-Doriat, p. 94

4. Menhaj al-Senat Libn Timiyah,, vol. 4, p. 126

When we read these interpretations about Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) from Sunni great scholars, we are surprised. We will notice that although they are opposed to Shias, they believe in their Imamat.

The host

Some of Sunni great men were in relationship with Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him). Please explain in this regard.

The scholar Hosseini Ghazvini

You can see this interpretation a lot in Shia books that Abu Hanife himself has said:

لولا السنتان لهلك النعمان.

If I were not the student of Ja'afar Ibn Muhammad for two years, I would be miserable.

We tried hard to find it from Sunni references. I myself spent many hours on finding it until I found a book from Mr. Aloosi _the grandson of the owner of Tafsir Aloosi_ titled as Mokhtasar Tohfah Ithna Ashariyah. On page 8 of this book, he has mentioned that Abu Hanife was proud of being the student of Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him).

Mr. Jahez _ He wrote the first book against Shia titled as al-Osmaniyah. He died in 255 AH_ has said in his Rasael book:

جعفر بن محمد الذي ملأ الدنيا علمه و فقهه و يقال : إن أبا حنيفة من تلامذته و كذلك سفيان الثوري و حسبك بهما.¹

Ja'afar Ibn Muhammad filled the world with his knowledge and it is said that: Abu Hanife and Sofyan Thuri were his students.

Mr. Mezzi has named the people who have quoted narrations from Imam Sadegh

1. Tahzib al-Kamal Lelmezzi, vol. 5, p. 76

(Peace be upon him) in Tahzib al-Kamal book: Sofyan Thuri, Sofyan Ibn Eikne, Sho'obe, Malek Ibn Anas, Muhammad Ibn Ishagh, Abu Hanife, Yahya Ibn Saeed Ghatan,... who all of them were the students of Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him).

Ibn Timiyah says in menhaj al-Sanat:

و قد أخذ العلم عنه هؤلاء الأئمة، كمالك و ابن عيينة و شعبة و الثوري و ابن جريج و يحيى بن سعيد.¹

Sunni leaders like Malek and ... learned from Ja'afar Ibn Muhammad.

The host

What was the role of Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) in developing Shia's culture? It is said that he had 4 thousand students.

The scholar Hosseini Ghazvini

After the death of the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family), no nice and suitable condition was prepared for Imams (Peace be upon them) to develop and explain the Islamic culture which they had inherited from the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family). Even during the Imamt of Amir al-Momenin (Peace be upon him), Imam Hassan (Peace be upon him), and Imam Hussein (Peace be upon him). During those struggling years _ 10 to 15 years_ between Bani Omaye and Bani Abbas dynasties, they let Imams (Peace be upon them) be free. As a result, it was a golden opportunity for Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him) and Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) to develop Islamic culture and treat some students. The number of Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him)'s narrations are more than other Imams (Peace be upon them). One of Seminary great men named as Karbalayi Ghazvini was going to make the encyclopedia of Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him), but he died and his children are continuing his way. I am

1. Menhaj al-Sanat Libn Timiyah, vol. 4, p. 126

informed that the encyclopedia has become 40 volumes so far. We tried hard and we could make the encyclopedia of Imam Javad (Peace be upon him) in two volumes, the encyclopedia of Imam Askari (Peace be upon him) in 6 volumes, and the encyclopedia of Imam Reza (Peace be upon him) in 8 volumes.

All of our works are in four books and al-Kafi which is the most complete Shia narrative book contains 16199 narrations, Tahzib al-Ahkam contains 13 thousand narrations, al-Estebzar contains 5500 narrations, and Man La Yahzaroh al-Faghih contains almost 6 thousand narrations. Late the owner of Vasael al-Shia has also collected the narrations of four books with some other books and have mentioned up to about 36 thousand narrations. Also Late Mohadeth Noori has mentioned about 23 thousand narrations in Mostadrak al-Vasael. Allame Majlesi has mentioned about 150 narrations in Beharol Anvar which in compiled in 110 volumes. Our great men pay lots of attention to these books and infer the divine rules from them. I myself as a person who has spent almost 20 years on Imams (Peace be upon them)'s encyclopedia books believe that:

Amir al-Momenin (Peace be upon him) narrations are more than other Imams (Peace be upon them); even more than Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him)'s.

despite of this fact that Amir al-Momenin (Peace be upon him) was in isolation and had little opportunity.

Maybe it is the first time that our dear audiences hear this interpretation about Amir al-Momenin (Peace be upon him), but they have heard it about Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) before. Mr. Safdi _one of the great Sunni scholars who died in 764 AH_ quotes in al-Vafi Belvafiyat book:

قال أبو حنيفة: ما رأيت أفتقه من جعفر بن محمد و كان يقول : سلوني قبل تفقدوني، فإنه لا يحدثكم بعدي بمثل حديثي¹

Abu Hanife said: I have never seen anyone more knowledgeable than Ja'afar Ibn Muhammad. He always said: ask me before you lose me. Nobody will quote you hadiths like me.

1. al-Vafi Belvafiyat Lilsafdi, vol. 11, p. 99

Many scholars from different countries and cities came to Medina to use the knowledge of Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him). Learning was not only dedicated to Shias because many Sunni great scholars were proud of being his student. Ibn Hajar Heithami _ one of the greatest Sunni scholars who was Shafeii_ says:

و فجر الإمام الصادق ينابيع العلم و الحكمة في الأرض و فتح للناس ابوابا من العلوم لم يعهدوها من قبل و قد ملأ الدنيا بعلمه، كما يقول الجاحظ و نقل الناس عنه من العلوم ما سارت به الركبان و انتشر ذكره في البلدان.¹

He ran the springs of knowledge and wisdom on earth and opened those doors of knowledge which were closed to people before him and filled the world with his knowledge. Groups of scholars came to him from all over the world to use his knowledge. He was famous all around the world.

Regarding to treating the students by Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him), late Sheikh Mofid _died in 413 AH_ says:

لم ينقل عن أحد من أهل بيته العلماء ما نقل عنه ... فإن أصحاب الحديث قد جمعوا أسماء الرواة عنه من الثقات على إختلافهم في الآراء و المقالات، فكانوا أربعة آلاف رجل²

What is quoted from Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) has not quoted from the other members of Ahle Bait (Peace be upon them). The number of prominent and

trustful people who were the students of Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) was 4 thousand people.

It means that 4 thousand people were his best and prominent students, while ten thousand more people were using the knowledge of Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) in Medina and Kufa. Also Mr. Ibn Aghade says:

4 thousand people who have quoted narrations from Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him), ...

Late Najashi _died in 450 AH_ quotes from Hassan Ibn al-Vesha' in his Rejal book:

1. al-Savaegh al-Mahreghah, p. 120

2. al-Irshad Lisheikh al-Mofid, vol. 2, p. 179

فاني أدركت في هذا المسجد تسعمائة شيخ كل يقول حدثني جعفر بن محمد.¹

I saw that 900 Faghihs who were the best students of Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) and were quoting hadiths from Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him).

Mr. Yafei _one of the great Sunni scholars who died in 786 AH_ says:

وله كلام نفيس في علوم التوحيد و غيرها و قد ألف تلميذه جابر بن حيان الصوفي كتابا يشتمل على ألف ورقة يتضمن رسائل²

Valuable words are left from Ja'afar Ibn Muhammad in theism and one of his students, Jaber Ibn Hayan, has a book which was more than one thousand pages including Ja'afar Ibn Muhammad's knowledge.

Late Sheikh Horr Ameli has reported the number of the works and books of Imams (Peace be upon them) which were compiled by companions in Vasael al-Shia. He says:

More than 6600 books were compiled by the companions.³

But unfortunately we do not know the exact number of these books and the name of the writer or compiler. Some of great scholars like Sheikh Toosi in al-Fehrest book, Late Najashi in Rejal book, and late Kashi in Rejal book have mentioned the name of the books which their writers are identified. The names of 1695 books and

their writers have brought in Seir Hadith in Islam, p. 310. It is interesting that 500 of those books have been written by Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him)'s companions. For example just Hesham wrote and compiled 49 books, Hossein Ibn Saeed and his brother wrote 33 books, Hesham Ibn Hakam wrote 26 books, Momen al-Tagh wrote 11 books, and Jaber Ja'afi wrote 9 books. It shows that Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) had treated very skillful students who their works and books have remained among Shias. But unfortunately by some invades against Shias, some of these books and works

1. Rejal al-Najashi, p. 39
2. Merat al-Janan, vol. 1, p. 238
3. Vasaal al-Shia Lilameli, vol. 30, p. 65, al-Faedat al-Rabeat.

Have been burnt and destroyed. Especially Sheikh Toosi library which is reported to have 40 thousand books, but some extremists burnt this library and its whole books. Many of Shia works existing in this library was ruined by enemies and we could not have access to them.

The host

What was the role of Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) in treating the students who could answer to the doubts?

The scholar Hosseini Ghazvini

Quoted narrations from Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) related to answering to the doubts, show that he had worked hard in this area. We gathered all of narrations which were about answering to the doubts quoted by holy Imams (Peace be upon them). In my idea, the most beautiful narration was a narration from Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him). He states in this regard:

علماء شيعتنا مرابطون بالشجر الذي يلي إبليس و عفاريطه، يمنعونهم عن الخروج على ضعفاء شيعتنا و عن أن يتسلط عليهم إبليس و شيعته و النواصب، ألا فمن إنتصب لذلك من شيعتنا كان أفضل ممن جاهد الروم و الترك و الخزر ألف ألف مرة، لأنه يدفع عن أديان محبيينا و ذلك يدفع عن أبدانهم.¹

Shia scholars and scientists are like border patrols that guard Islamic borders to stop Satan and his army invading to the faith and believe of Islam by their doubts. ... the value of those who have prepared themselves to answer to the doubts is thousands and thousands of times more than those who fight in for right in battlefields because these are defending the faith of our lovers and those are defending the body of our lovers.

Regarding to treating students, I have a lot to say because it is my major and I think it will need several 1 hour and half sessions. You will see that Imam Sadegh

-
1. al-Ehtiyaj Lelsheikh al-Tabarsi, vol. 1, p. 8_ al-Yaghin Lilseyes Ibn Tavous, p. 8_ Behar al-Anvar Lilalamat al-Majlesi, vol. 2, p. 5

(Peace be upon him) did not teach all of sciences to one person. He taught people based on their talents. Late Kashi quotes an interesting narration. Hesham Ibn Salem says:

I was sitting by Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) with some of his special students. A man from Sham _who was Nasbi and insulted Amir al-Momenin (Peace be upon him) _ came and said:

بلغني أنك عالم بكل ما تسأل عنه، فصرت إليك لأناظرك، فقال: أبو عبدالله عليه السلام فيماذا؟ قال: في القرآن وقطعه وإسكانه وخفضه ونصبه ورفع، فقال أبو عبدالله عليه السلام : يا حمران! دونك الرجل. فقال الرجل: إنما أريدك أنت لا حمران، فقال أبو عبد الله عليه السلام: إن غلبت حمران فقد غلبتني، فأقبل الشامي يسأل حمران حتى ضجر و مل و عرض و حمران يجيبه، فقال أبو عبدالله عليه السلام: كيف رأيت يا شامي؟! قال: رأيت حاذقا ما سألته عن شيء إلا أجابني فيه، فقال أبو عبدالله عليه السلام : يا حمران! سل الشامي، فما تركه يكشر فقال الشامي: رأيت يا أبا عبدالله أناظرك في العربية، فالتفت أبو عبدالله عليه السلام فقال: يا أبان بن تغلب! ناظره، فناظره، فما ترك الشامي يكشر، قال : أريد أن أناظرك في الفقه، فقال أبو عبدالله عليه السلام: يا زرارة! ناظره فما ترك الشامي يكشر، قال : أريد أن أناظرك في الكلام، فقال : يا مؤمن الطاق! ناظره، فناظره، فسجل الكلام بينهما، ثم تكلم مؤمن الطاق بكلامه، فغلبه به . فقال: أريد أن أناظرك في الاستطاعة، فقال للطيار: كلمه فيها، قال: فكلمه، فما ترك يكشر، فقال: أريد أناظرك في التوحيد، فقال لهشام بن سالم: كلمه فسجل الكلام بينهما، ثم خصمه هشام، فقال : أريد أن أتكلم في الإمامة فقال : لهشام بن الحكم، كلمه يا أبا الحكم، فكلمه ما تركه يرتم و لا يحلي و لا يمر، قال : فبقي يضحك أبو عبدالله عليه السلام، حتى بدت نواجده.¹

I have heard that you have mastery over all of the sciences of the universe. I am here to discuss with you. Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) stated: in which area are going to discuss with me? He said: Quranic sciences. Hazrat stated: O Hamran!

Stand up and discuss with this Shami man. The Shami man got sad and said to Hazrat: I am here to discuss with you not with your students. Hazrat said: if you defeat Hamran, it is like you have defeated me. Hamran and Shami man discussed until that man got the answer of his questions. Hazrat stated: O Shami man! How is Hamran? The man said: Hamran is a specialist and he answered to all of my questions. Then Hazrat turned to Hamran and said: ask Shami man all you want? Hamran was asking questions, but Shami man could not answer them. Shami man said: I would like to discuss you in the area of Arabic literature. Hazrat

1. Rejal Kashi, p. 275, No. 494_ Behar al-Nvar Lilalamat al-Majlesi, vol. 47, p. 407

pointed to Aban Ibn Taghlab who was specialist in Arabic literature. They started to discuss and the Shami man was defeated again. The Shami man said: I would like to discuss you in Feghh issues. Hazrat showed him Zarare to discuss with him. They began to discuss and the Shami man was defeated again. The Shami man said: I would like to discuss you about Kalam and faith issues. Hazrat pointed to Momen al-Taregh to discuss him. Their discussion lasted longer than before until Momen al-Taregh defeated him. The Shami man said: I would like to discuss you about determinism and free will. Hazrat pointed to Tayyar to discuss him. They began to discuss until the Shami man was defeated. The Shami man said: I would like to discuss about theism. Hazrat pointed to Hesham Ibn Salem to discuss him. They began to discuss until the Shami man was defeated again. The Shami man said: I would like to discuss about Imamah. Hazrat pointed to Hesham Ibn Hakam to discuss with him. They began to discuss. Hesham was such specialist in this area that the Shami man could not breathe or devour his mouth water. When Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) saw the ability of Hesham Ibn Hakam, he laughed as his teeth showed.

See the students of Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him)! If one of them were defeated, it was like Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) had defeated. He had a specialist student in all areas.

The host

How was the strategy of Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) to prevent the dispute among his students? Since each one of them had different attitudes.

The scholar Hosseini Ghazvini

Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) was the pattern of unity. There are many narrations from Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) in this regard. Those who imagine that they are serving Shias by insulting to Sunnis and their sanctities pay close attention to this part. I will mention some of Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him)'s narrations to show his behavior with other Islamic sects.

Mr. Koleini has written in Kafi:

كيف ينبغي لنا أن نصنع فيما بيننا و بين قومنا و بين خلطاننا من الناس ممن ليسوا على أمرنا؟ قال : تنظرون إلى أئمتكم الذين تقتدون بهم، فتصنعون ما يصنعون، فوالله ! إنهم ليعودون مرضاهم و يشهدون جنازتهم و يقيمون الشهادة لهم و عليهم و يؤدون الأمانة إليهم.¹

The narrator asked Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him): how should we behave with opponents? Hazrat stated: look at the behavior of your leaders and Imams. You do whatever they did. I swear to God that they visited their patients, took part in their funeral ceremonies, testified for or against them in courts, and turn them back their trusts.

Hazrat says that your Imams (Peace be upon them) behave like this. On the day of resurrection, If Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) complains the extremists, what will be their reply?

In another narration, Late Sheikh Sadoogh quotes:

خالقوا الناس بأخلاقهم، صلوا في مساجدهم و عو دوا مرضاهم و اشهدوا جنازتهم و إن استطعتم أن تكونوا الأئمة و المؤذنين فافعلوا، فإنكم إذا فعلتم ذلك قالوا : هؤلاء الجعفرية رحم الله جعفرا ما كان أحسن ما يؤدب أصحابه و إذا تركتم ذلك قالوا: هؤلاء الجعفرية فعل الله بجعفر ما كان أسوء ما يؤدب أصحابه²

Your behavior with Sunnis must be based on their customs. Say prayers in their mosques, visit their sick people, and take part in their funeral ceremonies and behave in a way that they chose you as their prayers Imam. If you do so, they will say: they are Ja'afari. God bless Ja'afar. He has treated nice companions. If you do

not so, they will say: they are Ja'afari. God behave them worse than what the companions of Ja'afar do to us.

One of the companions came to Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) and said:

إنا نرى في المسجد رجلا يعلن بسب أعدائكم و يسميهم، فقال: ما له؟! لعنه الله! تعرض بنا! قال الله: و لا

1. al-Kafi Lil Sheikh al-Koleini, vol. 2, p. 636

2. Man La Yahzaroh al-Faghih Lil Sheikh al-Sadoogh, vol. 1, p. 383

تَسُبُّوا الَّذِينَ يَدْعُونَ مِنْ دُونِ اللَّهِ فَيَسُبُّوا اللَّهَ عَدْوًا بِغَيْرِ عِلْمٍ^{2و1}

One of your companions is sitting in mosque and is cursing and damning your enemies. Hazrat stated: what's wrong with him?! God damn him! He is exposing us to the curse of others! God stated: ...

This was the behavior of Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) and his interaction with Sunnis and the way that he treated students. We should take the advices Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) and Imams (Peace be upon them).

و السلام عليكم و رحمة الله و بركاته

Dr. Seyed Muhammad Hosseini ghazvini

1, 2. Al-Anam Sourah. Verse: 108

Behar al-Anvar Lilalamat al-Majlesi, vol. 71, p. 217_ al-Tafsir al-Safi Lilfeiz al-Kashani, vol. 2, p. 148_ al-Eteghadat Fi Din al-Imamiyat Lil Sheikh al-Sadoogh, p. 107

The scholar Hosseini Ghazvini

Due to the Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him)'s martyrdom, we are going to suggest some of Wahhabi doubts about him. Ibn Timiye, Dehlavi, and others have suggested about 56 doubts about Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) and his scientific school. We need one or two years at least to discuss about them, but discussing about some of them is more necessary:

Part one: Ibn Timiye's criticism of Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him)

All Shias, Sunnis, Muslims, and none Muslims agree that Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) was the founder of scientific movement in the history of Islam. However, Ibn Tamiya denies this:

Ibn Timiye's criticism of Allame Helli speeches

Ibn Timiye has criticized this issue and has quoted from Allame Helli that:

اما قوله: «هو الذي نشر فقه الامامية و المعارف الحقة و العقائد اليقينية»، فهذا كلام يستلزم أحد أمرين : إما أنه ابتدع في العلم ما لم يكن يعلمه من قبله و أما أن يكون الذين قبله قصرّوا فيما يجب عليهم من نشر العلم و هل يشك عاقل أن النبي (ص) بين لأمته المعارف الحقيقية و العقائد اليقينية أكمل بيان؟ و أن الصحابة تلقوا ذلك عنه و بلغوه إلى المسلمين؟! و هذا يقتضي القدح إما فيه و إما فيهم.

The word of Allame Helli which has said: “Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) is the one who distributed Imamiye Feghh, maaref Haghe, and certain believes” requires two things: 1. Either there is a problem with Imam Sadegh that made some innovations by establishing some sciences that the ancestors were unaware of them, 2. Or the problem was with companions and the followers that did not

publish religious educations and did not release religious facts and Imam Sadegh did not stated them. Does anybody have doubt that the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family) stated all religious facts completely for the people? _ Because Quran states:اليوم أكملت لكم دينكم و أتممت عليكم نعمتي:

And the companions took all of these sciences from the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family) and transferred in to others. As a result, the word of Allame Helli is either disapproving Imam Sadegh or disapproving the companions.¹

Answering the criticism of Ibn Timiye

In response, we should say: both aspects are true. It means that we will prove that Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) established and innovated some new sciences that neither the companions nor did the followers knew about them before and we also will prove that the companions did not stated these sciences well.

First issue: Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him)'s new materials

A .Ibn Timiye's opinion about Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him)'s science

Ibn Timiye himself denies this problem. Since the liar has weak memory, he says about 70 pages after his own criticism:

فإن جعفر بن محمد لم يجيء بعد مثله و قد أخذ العلم عنه هؤلاء الأئمة كمالك و ابن عيينة و شعبة و الثوري و ابن جريج و يحيى بن سعيد و أمثالهم من العلماء المشاعير الأعيان²

No one has been born like Ja'afar Ibn Muhammad in knowledge and science. Great scholars such as Malek, Ibn Eine, Sha'abe, Thouri, Ibn Jarij, Yahya Ibn Saeed, and other known scientists learned their own sciences from Ja'afar Ibn Muhammad.

B .Sunni scholars' ideas about Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him)'s knowledge

Sunni great scholars have said that Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) did a unique and especial work in the area of science:

1. Ibn Hajar Heithami _Makki_ died in 974 AH:

1. Menhaj al-Senah Libn Timiye, vol. 4, p. 53 to 54

2. Menhaj al-Senah Libn Timiye, vol. 4, p. 126

He has written in the introduction of al-Savaegh al-Mahrooghat book _which was originally written to combat Shiism: I saw many young people in Mecca and around Mecca who turned to Shiism so I wrote this book to prevent them from being Shia:

و فجّر الإمام الصادق ينابيع العلم و الحكمة في الأرض و فتح للناس أبواباً من العلوم لم يعهدوها من قبل و قد ملأ الدنيا بعلمه كما قال الجاحظ و نقل عنه الناس من العلوم ما سارت به الركبان و انتشر صيته في البلدان.¹

Imam Sadegh ran the springs of knowledge and wisdom on earth and opened those doors of knowledge which were closed to people before him and filled the world with his knowledge. Jahez _the owner of al-Othmaniyah book_ has said: Groups of scholars came to him from all over the world to learn from him and distributed it worldwide. He was famous all around the world.

Mr. Ibn Timiye! You are the one who said Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) has innovated in Haghe educations!

Jahez_ died in 255 AH:

Among all the books which are written against Shiism, al-Osmaniyah book written by Jahez is the first one. He has spoken badly about Amir al-Momenin (Peace be upon him) and has denied his bravery. The content of this book caused many Sunni scholars like Eskafi and tens of others to write books to reject it. Also Jahez himself wrote something to reject his book. It is what we should do it to reject Wahhabism. Jahez says about Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him):

جعفر بن محمد الذي ملأ الدنيا علمه و فقهه و يقال : إن أبا حنيفة من تلامذته و كذلك سفيان الثوري و حسبك بهما في هذا الباب²

The knowledge and the science of Ja'afar Ibn Muhammad have filled the word as Abu Hanife and Abu Sofyan Thouri were his students and this is enough to prove this claim.

1. al-Savaegh al-Mahrooghah Libn Hajar, p. 120

2. al-Imam al-Sadegh Le Asad Heidar, vol. 1, p. 55_ Naghlan A'an Rasael al-Jahez, p. 106

3. Yafeii_ died in 768 AH:

الإمام السيد الجليل سلالة النبوة و معدن الفتوة أبو عبد الله جعفر الصادق (ع) ... و إنما لقب بالصادق لصدقه في مقالته و له كلام نفيس في علوم التوحيد و غيرها و قد ألف تلميذه جابر بن حيان الصوفي كتاباً يشتمل على ألف ورقة يتضمّن رسائله و هي خمسمائة رسالة¹

... Due to him honesty and valuable words that he had in theism sciences and other sciences he was nicknamed as Sadegh...

C .Many Sunni scholars were the students of Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him)

Sofyan Thouri had Feghh school before Abu Hanie. Also the schools of Sha'abe, Muhammad Ibn Ishagh, and Yahya Ibn Saeed had some followers before seventh century. As we mentioned before the four religions were made in the form of four ones in 676 AH and before that there were many Fegghi religions. Some were the followers of Aisha's Fegghi School, some were the followers of Hassan Basari, some were the followers of Sofyan Thouri, and some were the followers of Ibn Eyne or the other people. In seventh century, the king of Egypt felt that the multiplicity of religions causes some problems. For example in court, the judge had a religion, the plaintiff had another religion, and the accuser had another religion and each one claimed that he did the right act based on his own religion, but it was against the other religion. As a result, all of religions were collected in four religions. One of the conditions of being judge was having one of these four religions: Hanafi, Maleki, Shafeii, and Henbali.

Although there were many scholars at the time of Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him), Sunni scholars learned from him more and more because they felt what they learn from Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) they cannot learn from any other person. Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him) has also said in a narration:

شَرِّقًا وَ غَرْبًا فَلَا تَجِدَانِ عِلْمًا صَحِيحًا إِلَّا شَيْئًا خَرَجَ مِنْ عِنْدِنَا أَهْلَ الْبَيْتِ.²

1. Mera'at al-Janan va Ebrat al-Yaghzan, vol. 1, p. 238, Ahdath Senat 48 AH, published by: Dar al-Kotob al-Elmiyat_ Vafiyat al-A'ayan, vol. 1, p. 327

2. al-Kafi Lilsheikh al-Koleini, vol. 1, p. 399_ Vasaal al-Shia (Al al-Beit) Lelhor al-Ameli, vol. 27, p. 43

If you cross the east and west of the universe, you will learn Islamic sciences through no one but Ahle Bait (Peace be upon them).

Ibn Timiye that says: “Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him)’ s new subjects in an innovation in scientific movement”, is against the idea of Shia. Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) stated some subjects that had not stated before him.

Second issue: the companions did not distribute Islamic educations well

A .the companions did not pay attention to the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family)’s narrations

Ibn Timiye has said:

If Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) was the distributor of Islamic culture, the problem is with the companions.

Yes, the companions and the followers did not take the lessons of the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family) well and did not distribute the Islamic educations well. These materials were not suggested until the time of Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him). He emerged and posed them.

1. Abu Hurairah ‘s confession

We say to Mr. Ibn Timiye to read Sahih Bukhari some more times to know that the how weak companions that you talk about them act in taking Islamic educations from the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family). Mr. Abu Hurairah quotes that:

يقولون ما للمهاجرين و الأنصار لا يحدثون مثل أحاديثه و إنّ إخوتى من المهاجرين كان يشغلهم الصفق
بالأسواق و إنّ إخوتى من الأنصار كان يشغلهم عمل أموالهم و كنت إمراً مسكيناً ألزم رسول الله صلى الله
عليه و سلم على ملء بطني¹

People say: why Muhajerin and Ansars do not have the narrations from the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family) as many as Abu Hurairah has?

1. Sahih Bukhari, vol. 3, p. 74, H. 2350 and vol. 8, p. 185, H. 7354_ Sahih Moslem, vol. 7, p. 166, H. 6294_ Mosnad Ahmad, vol. 2, p. 240

Because our Muhajer brothers were busy with business in the market and our Ansar brothers were engaged in financial and material issues and they did not try to take hadiths from the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family). But I was a

poor man and I was content with some food and I was always with the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family).

Bukhari himself quoted from Abu Hurairah that the companions and Muhajerin and Ansars did not have anything to do with the hadiths of the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family) and they did not try to learn Islamic educations from the holy prophet (Peace be upon him and his family). They were engaged in business. If you accept this narration, it is ok. If you do not accept this narration, it is from your own Sahih Bukhari that says:

Somebody who conflicts with the hadiths of Sahih Bukhari is heretic.

2. The second caliphs' s confession

Abu Musa Ashari quoted a narration by the second caliph and the second caliph said:

You should bring some witnesses to prove that you have heard it from the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family) otherwise I will whip your back as many as it bleeds.

Abu Musa Ashari went around finding some witnesses to come to the second caliph and prove that the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family) has stated this hadith. When they came and proved it, the second caliph himself said:

خَفِيَ عَلَيَّ هَذَا مِنْ أَمْرِ النَّبِيِّ صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ، أَلْهَانِي الصَّفَقُ بِالْأَسْوَاقِ.¹

Since I was engaged in business and dealing, I have not heard the narration that Abu Musa Ashari quoted from the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family).

If you believe that it was the companions' fault that did not publish this material,

1. Sahih Bukhari, vol. 8, p. 157, H. 7353, al-E'tesam Belketab va al-SEnat book, chapter: الحجة على من قال إن أحكام النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم كانت ظاهرة و ما كان يغيب بعضهم عن مشاهد النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم و أمور الإسلام, vol. 6, p. 179, H. 5524, al-Adab book, chapter: الإستئذان

It is not our business. It is yours because you have mentioned it in your books. Mr. Ibn Timiye! It is your narrations which indicate that the companions, Muhajerin, Ansars, and the second caliph were busy with business and did not pay attention to

the hadiths of the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family). So they were unaware of his hadiths and could not quote them.

3. The confession of Abu Hurairah about Aisha

You say clearly that the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family) stated:

خذوا نصف دينكم عن الحميراء¹

Take half of your religion from Aisha.

خذوا شطر دينكم عن الحميراء.²

Take some part of your religion from Aisha.

But Mr. Hakem Neishaburi has quotes in al-Mostadrak al-Sahihein with true evidence:

عن عائشة إنها دعت أبا هريرة، فقالت له : يا أبا هريرة ! ما هذه الأحاديث التي تبلغنا؟ إنك تحدث بها عن النبي صلى الله عليه و آله، هل سمعت إلا ما سمعنا؟ و هل رأيت إلا ما رأينا؟ قال : يا أمه ! إنه كان يشغلك عن رسول الله صلى الله عليه و آله المرأة و المكحلة و التصنع لرسول الله صلى الله عليه و آله و إني والله ! ما كان يشغلني عنه شيء³

O Abu Hurairah! Where have you brought all those narrations that you quote from the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family)? Have you ever heard something other than what we heard from the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family)? Abu Hurairah answered: O Mother! Wearing make-up and coquetry for the sake of the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family) prevented you from learning hadiths, but I was not busy with anything and I was just learning his hadiths.

1. Azva'a Ala al-Senat al-Mohamadiyat Limahmood Abouriyat, p. 127_ al-Mo'jam al-Vasit, vol. 1, p. 411

2. al-Bedayat va al-Nahayat Libn Kathir, vol. 3, p. 159_ al-Mabsoot Lilsarakhsi, vol. 10, p. 163_ Tafsir al-Razi, vol. 4, p. 32

3. al-Mostadrak al-Sahihein Lilhakem al-Neishaburi, vol. 3, p. 509

These are your hadiths and we only quote them from your books and also we do insult the companions. We state the truth to defend the prophet (Peace be upon them). There is no limitation for expressing the historical facts.

Ok! Mr. Ibn Timiye! You say that the companions learnt all Islamic educations and transferred it to the others, but Abu Hurairah does not say so.

B .the companions' prevention from quoting and compiling the hadiths of the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family)

You say that: the ancestors did not distribute Islamic educations before Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) and now that it is Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him)'s turn, it is the fault of the ancestors:

1. The first caliph's prevention from quoting the hadiths of the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family)

When the first caliph became the caliph, said:

فلا تحدثوا عن رسول الله شيئاً! فمن سألكم فقولوا: بيننا و بينكم كتاب الله، فاستحلوا حلاله و حرّموا حرامه.¹

Nobody dares to quote hadith from the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family). If somebody asked, tell him: there is the book of God between you and me. Count the legal issue legal and illegal issue illegal.

The second and the third caliphs continued the same policy. ²

Mr. Muhammad Abu Zahv _one of the contemporary famous Sunni scholars_ writes:

و قد تتابع الخلفاء على سنة عمر ... فلم يشأ أحدهم أن يدون السنن و لا أن يأمر الناس بذلك، حتى جاء عمر بن عبد العزيز.³

1. Tazkerat al-Hefaz Lilzahabi, vol. 1, p. 3

2. Akhbar al-Madinah al-Monavarat Libn Shabah, vol. 3, p. 200_ Tagheed al-Elm Lilkhatib al-Baghdadi, pp. 49 and 53_ al-Tabaghat al-Kobra Libn Sa'ad, vol. 2, p. 100_ Mosnad Ahmad, vol. 1, p. 363_ the history of Medina Libn Asaker, vol. 3, p. 160

3. al-Hadith va al-Mohadethoun Le Dr. Muhammad Muhammad Abu Zahv, p. 127

Following the method of Omar Ibn Khattab, the Islamic caliphs prevented people from compiling the tradition of the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family) and did not let anyone to do it until Omar Ibn Abd al-Aziz _ in 98 AH_ became caliph and ordered to collect and compile the tradition of the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family).

Also he says:

كاد القرن الأول ينتهى و لم يصدر أحد من الخلفاء أمره الى العلماء بجمع الحديث، بل تركوه موكولاً الى حفظهم و مرور هذا الزمن الطويل كفيل بأن يذهب بكثير من حملة الحديث من الصحابة و التابعين¹

One century passed from the immigration, but none of caliphs ordered the scholars to collect the hadiths. They only trusted their memories. During this time, many of the companions who were hadiths keeper died.

They did not fulfill the order of Omar Ibn Abd al-Aziz and did not collect the hadiths until 130 OR 140 AH.

2. burning the hadiths of the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family)

You said that the first caliph gathered all of hadith and burnt. Aisha says:

جمع أبي الحديث عن رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم و كانت خمسمائة حديث، فبات ليلته ... فلما أصبح، قال: أي بنية هلمي الأحاديث التي عندك، فجننته بها، فدعا بنار فحرقها.²

My father, Abu Bakr, gathered all of hadiths which the number of them was five hundred. He slept and when he got up in the morning, said to me: bring me the hadiths. I brought them. He asked me to bring fire. Then he burnt all of hadiths.

If we say that Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) was the publisher of Islamic educations, our purpose is the educations that they did not let to be compiled before.

The third issue: the scholars prove that the narrations are few

1. al-Hadith va al-Mohadethoun Le Dr. Muhammad Muhammad Abu Zahv, p. 127

2. Tazkerat al-Hefaz Lilzahabi, vol. 1, p. 5

You say:

How could Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) launch scientific movement and publish some educations in the second century that nobody could do it before!

Your great scholars say:

The narrations which we have taken from the ancestors are few. They are as a little drug which is enough to be used in the eye. We point to the following cased to prove this claim:

1. Shafeii

Mr. Shafeii _the leader of Shafeii people_ says:

أنه لم يصل إلى الأمة سوى خمسمائة حديث في أصول الأحكام و مثلها في أصول السنّة¹

Only five hundred narrations about the rules of Islam and the tradition have left from the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family).

Mr. Ibn Timiye! Do you tell the truth or Mr. Shafeii?! You lived in eighth century and Mr. Shafeii lived in the second century.

2. Ahmad Ibn Henbal

Ahmad Ibn Henbal says:

الأصول التي يدور عليها العلم عن النبي (صلى الله عليه و سلم) ينبغي أن تكون ألفا و مائتين²

All of hadiths which are the base of religious educations_ faith, Feghh, Tafsir, history, ethnics, etc._ are not more than 1200 hadiths.

3. Malek Ibn Anans

Ibn Khaldoon says:

و مالك رحمه الله إنما صحّ عنده ما في كتاب الموطأ و غايتها ثلاثمائة حديث أو نحوه³

1. Managheb al-Shafeii, vol. 1, p. 419_ al-Vahy al-Muhammadi Limuhammad Rashid Reza, p. 243

2. al-Taghrir va al-Tahbir, vol. 3, p. 389_ al-Bahr al-Mohit fi Osoul al-Feghh Lilzarkashi, vol. 4, p. 491_ Ershad al-Fahoul, p. 251

3. Ibn Khaldoon history, vol. 1, p. 444

All of true hadiths which are written in Movatta book are not more than about three hundred narrations.

4. Abu Hanife

Ibn Khaldoon writes:

فأبو حنيفة رضي الله عنه يقال: بلغت روايته إلى سبعة عشر حديثاً أو نحوها¹

The whole narrations which are acceptable and proved by Abu Hanife are about seventeen narrations.

Khatib Baghdadi writes:

جميع ما روى أبو حنيفة من الحديث مائة و خمسون حديثاً، أخطأ - أو قال غلط - في نصفها.²

The whole narrations quoted by Abu Hanife are 150 that half of them are wrong.

Ok! Mr. Ibn Timiye! You who criticize Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him), look at your narrations! How do you respond us?

It was the first doubt that we answered.

The second part: Ehsan Elahi Zahir doubt

This part is allocated to the doubt which is posed by Ehsan Elahi Zahir. He is one of Wahhabi leaders and most of Wahhabis who write books or write articles in websites or satellite channels and pose doubts are working under his control. He has a book entitled as “Bein al-Shia va Ahl al-Sunnat”. He says:

ما روي عن جعفر عن الباقر عن زين العابدين عن الحسين عن علي فهو أقل القليل و صحاحهم الأربعة و كتبهم في الحديث تشهد بذلك³

The narrations that Ja’afar has quoted from Bagher, Bagher has quoted from Zein al-Abedin, Zein al-Abedin has quoted from Hussein, and he has quoted from Ali are very few. Shias’ four book and other Shias’ hadith books prove this case.

1. Ibn Khaldoon history, vol. 1, p. 444

2. The history of Bagdad LilKhatib al-Baghdadi, vol. 13, p. 418, H. 123

3. Bein al-Shia va Ahle al-Sunnat Li Ehsan Elahi Zahir, p. 108

Responding to Ehsan Elahi Zahir ‘s doubt

To answer above mentioned doubt I have several things to say which are among key answers and we must memorize and keep them like Hamd and Touhis Sourahs and as great Ayatollah Sobhani says: we should have this answer always ready to use it whenever it is needed.

This doubt may consist of two forms:

1. Maybe his purpose is that:

The proved narrations that Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) quoted from Amir al-Momenin (Peace be upon him) are very few and his other narrations are Morsal and Morsal narrations are value less.

Mostly his purpose was this case because one of their doubts about Shias today is:

All the narrations from Imams (Peace be upon them) which are in your hands are Morsal. Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) was killed in 148 AH and he has many narrations from the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family) are Morsal? Do not we know who is go-between Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) to the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family)? You have many narrations from Imam Reza (Peace be upon him) while he died in 202 AH and his distance with the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family) was many years. Other Imams (Peace be upon them) had a long distance with the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family).

Four years ago, in a debate which was held by al-Mostaghele satellite channel, the most important criticism of one of Wahhabi leaders named Osman al-Khamis was as mentioned above. Unfortunately, our Shia friends did not have any answer for him while the answer is easy.

A .Imams' narrations from their ancestor, the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family)

There are about 40 narrations _Late Ayatollah Borujerdi has also written them in Jame' al-Ahadith al-Shia_ that Imam Bagher (Peace be upon him) and Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) says:

حديثي حديث أبي و حديث أبي حديث جدي و حديث جدي حديث الحسين و حديث الحسين حديث الحسن و حديث الحسن حديث أمير المؤمنين عليه السلام و حديث أمير المؤمنين حديث رسول الله صلى الله عليه و آله و حديث رسول الله قول الله عز وجل¹

Each hadith that we quote is not from ourselves. I quote it from my father and my father quoted it from Hassan and Hussein and Hassan and Hussein quoted it from Amir al-Momenin (Peace be upon him) and he quoted it from the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family).

This is a general rule among Imams (Peace be upon them). They only have one way to quote hadiths. When there is just one way, there is no need to mention the way. The way of narrating is clear.

Late Mazandarani has described this hadith in details in Sharh Kafi.

We have some evidences known as Selselat al-Zahab _Golden evidence.

This golden evidence is very evident in Imam Reza (Peace be upon him)'s hadiths. When was going to Toos, the people asked him to state them some hadith in Neishabur. More than 20 thousand people were waiting to write the hadith of Imam Reza (Peace be upon him). Ibn Hajar has mentioned that Imam Reza (Peace be upon him) stated there:

حدثني أبي موسى الكاظم عن أبيه جعفر الصادق عن أبيه محمد الباقر عن أبيه زين العابدين عن أبيه الحسين عن أبيه علي بن أبي طالب رضي الله عنهم قال حدثني حبيبي وقرّة عيني رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم قال (حدثني جبريل قال سمعت رب العزة يقول لا إله إلا الله حصني فمن قالها دخل حصني ومن دخل حصني أمن من عذابي)²

In another narration he stated:

عن علي بن موسى الرضا عن موسى بن جعفر عن جعفر بن محمد عن محمد بن علي عن علي بن الحسين عن الحسين بن علي عن الحسن بن علي عن علي بن أبي طالب عن النبي صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم عن جبريل عن ميكائيل عن اسرافيل عن اللوح عن القلم قال: يقول الله عزوجل: ولاية علي بن أبي طالب حصني فمن دخل حصني أمن من عذابي.

After telling this hadith, he moved and after a while he stood and stated:

1. al-Kafi Lil Sheikh al-Koleini, vol. 1, p. 53

2. al-Heithami, Abu al-Abbas Ahmad Ibn Muhammad Ibn Ali Ibn Hajar (died in 973 AH), al-Savaegh al-Mahreghat Ala Ahle al-Rafz va al-Zalal va al-Zandeghat, vol. 2, p. 595, research by: Abd al-Rahman Ibn Abdullah al-Torki_ Kamel Muhammad al-Kharat, Publisher: al-Resalat institution_ Lebanon, first edition, 1417 AH_ 1997 AD.

بشرطها و شروطها و أنا من شروطها

Both narrations are true and have mentioned in Shia and Sunni sources. ولاية علي بن أبي طالب has not mentioned in Sunni sources, but it is mentioned in Shia books.

We had a professor in Ghazvin. He recommended us to memorize some of prayers including Ja'ame Kabireh and Ziyarat Ashoora. I bet myself to read them every day. My professor told me that he was going to give me a gift as a memento. He stated:

I give you Selselat al-Zahab hadith and I let you to quote it for others. If you read it for a sick person whose death is not determined, he will improve and get up as soon as you read it for him. I'm ready to compete with any scholar of any age and I read it to any sick person who they want and bring it.

He gave me this narration and I myself experienced it many times. I had a house in Ghom Nou in 1352. One of my friends came to me and said that his first child was sick and the doctors had gotten disappointed with the cures. He said that he was hospitalized in Nekooyi hospital. I swear to the soul of Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) that I went there and read this hadith 40 times for him. Swear to God that the child woke up, sat, and said: Mom! I'm hungry. His parents did not know what to do because of great happiness. The father of the child who was a clergy man went to the doctor and told the story to the doctor surprisingly. After one hour, the child left the hospital and he was taken home.

This is the narration:

عن علي بن موسى الرضا عن موسى بن جعفر عن جعفر بن محمد عن محمد بن علي عن علي بن الحسين عن الحسين بن علي عن الحسن بن علي عن علي بن ابي طالب عن النبي صلي الله عليه و آله و سلم عن جبريل عن ميكائيل عن اسرافيل عن اللوح عن القلم قال: يقول الله عزوجل: ولاية علي بن ابي طالب حصني فمن دخل حصني أمن من عذابي.

Ibn Hajar Heithami has quoted from Ahmad Ibn Henbal in al-Savaegh al-Mahreghat book _which is written to reject Shias:

و في رواية أن قال أحمد: لو قرأت هذا الإسناد على مجنون لبريء من جنته¹

Ahmad Ibn Henbal says: if you read this narration to someone, he will improve

1. al-Savaegh al-Mahreghat Ala Alhe al-Rafz va al-Zelal va al-Zandeghat, vol. 2, p. 595, published in Saudi Arabia.

even if he has insanity.

It is mentioned in another narration:

قال محمد بن الحسن الصفار : حدثنا ابراهيم بن هاشم عن يحيى بن ابي عمران عن يونس عن عنبسة قال :
سأل رجل أبا عبد الله عليه السلام عن مسألة فأجابها فيها؛ فقال : إن كان كذا و كذا ما كان القول فيها، فقال له :
مهما أجبته فيه بشيء فهو عن رسول الله لسنا نقول برأينا من شيء¹

Muhammad Ibn Saffar has quoted: Ibrahim Ibn Hashem has quoted from Yahya Ibn Abi Omran from Younes from Anbasah: someone asked Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) about something and Imam (Peace be upon him) answered him. He said: if it was so, what would happen? Hazrat stated: all I told you was what the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family) had told us. We do not say something by ourselves.

The same narration is quoted by Late Koleini with true evidence:

على عن محمد بن عيسى عن يونس عن قتيبة قال: سألت رجلاً أبا عبد الله عن مسألة فأجابته فيها؟ فقال: الرجل أرايت إن كان كذا و كذا ما يكون القول فيها، فقال له: مه! ما أجبتك فيه من شيء فهو عن رسول الله لسنا من أرايت في شيء²

Ali has quoted from Muhammad Ibn Isa from Younes from Ghatibe: someone asked something from Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) and Imam (Peace be upon him) answered. He said: what if it wasn't so? Hazrat stated: all I told you in the response of your question was from the prophet (Peace be upon him and his family) and we do not say anything from ourselves.

The men in the evidence of above mentioned narration

A .the man in Hassan Ibn Saffar evidence

al-Saffar

هو محمد بن الحسن بن فروخ الصفار.

قال النجاشي: كان وجهاً في أصحابنا القميين، ثقة، عظيم القدر، راجحاً قليل السقط في الرواية و ذكر له كتب كثيرة و في جملتها هذا الكتاب و هو بصائر الدرجات.³

1. Basaer al-Darajat LiMuhammad Ibn al-Hassan al-Safar, p. 321, Chapter: 14 في الأئمة أن عندهم أصول العلم ما ورثوه عن النبي (ص) لا يقولون برأيهم

2. al-Kafi LilSheikh al-Koleini, vol. 1, p. 58

3. Rejal al-Najashi, p. 354

Ibrahim Ibn Hashem

هو أبو علي بن ابراهيم من أكابر و أجلاء علماء الحديث عند أصحابنا، كثير الحديث، قال النجاشي : أول من نشر حديث الكوفيين بقم¹

قال السيد الخوئي: لا ينبغي الشك في وثاقة ابراهيم بن هاشم، واستدل ذلك بعدة امور²

Yahya Ibn Abi Omran

قال السيد الخوئي: ثقة، لكونه من رجال تفسير علي بن ابراهيم القمي³

قال المامقاني: ثقة على الأقوى⁴

Younes

هو يونس بن عبد الرحمان مولى علي بن يقطين، قال النجاشي: كان وجهاً في أصحابنا متقدماً عظيم المنزلة.⁵

قال الشيخ: طعن عليه القميون و هو عندي ثقة⁶

Anbasadt

هو عنبة بن بجاد العابد، قال النجاشي: كان قاضياً، ثقة⁷

روى الكشي عن حمدويه أنه قال: سمعت أشياخي يقولون عنبة بن بجاد كان خيراً فاضلاً⁸

A .Men in Koleini narration evidence:

Ali

1. Rejal al-Najashi, p. 16_ al-Fehrest Lilsheikh al-Toosi, p. 36_ Kholasat al-Aghval Lelalame Helli, p. 49_ Rejal Ibn Davood, p. 34

2. Mo'jam Rejal al-Hadith Lilseyed al-Khuyi, vol. 1, p. 291, No. 332

3. Mo'jam Rejal al-Hadith Lilseyed al-Khuyi, vol. 21, p. 28, No. 13472

4. Tanghih al-Maghal Lilmamaghani, vol. 1, p. 7, No. 226

5. Rejal al-Najashi, p. 446, No. 1208

6. Rejal Lisheikh al-Toosi, p. 368, No. 5478

7. Rejal al-Najashi, p. 302, No. 822

8. Rejal al-Kashi, p. 372, No. 697

هذا، هو علي بن ابراهيم بن هاشم بقرينة كثرة روايته عن م حمد بن عيسى، قال النجاشي فيه : ثقة في الحديث، ثبت، معتمد، صحيح المذهب، سمع فأكثر و صنف كتباً¹

Muhammad Ibn Isa

قال النجاشي: جليل في أصحابنا، ثقة، عين، كثير الرواية، حسن التصانيف²

و أمّا تضعيف الشيخ له، فلا أساس له، كما ذهب إليه المحققين من أصحابنا كالسيد الخوئي و المحقق التستري فلا معارض في البين³

مضافاً إلى أن تضعيف الشيخ كما هو صريح كلامه هنا و في فهرسته، مبني على استثناء الصدوق و ابن الوليد آياه، من جملة الرجال الذين روى عنهم صاحب نواذر الحكمة⁴

قال السيد الخوئي: و الذي ظهر لنا من كلاهما أنّهما لم يناقشا في محمد بن عيسى بن عبيد نفسه، فأنما ناقشا في روايته عن خصوص يونس فيما يرويه عنه باستثناء منقطع مرسل، كما في رواية الإستبصار المتقدمة أو فيما ينفرد برواية محمد بن عيسى، عن يونس و أمّا في غير ذلك فلم يظهر من ابن الوليد و لا من الصدوق، ترك العمل بروايات محمد بن عيسى بن عبيد⁵

Younes

فهو يونس بن عبد الرحمان.

It was mentioned before.

Ghatibah

هو قتيبة بن محمد الأعشي، قال النجاشي: ثقة، عين.⁶

b.Imams' (Peace be upon them) narrations are more than the companions' narrations

Ehsan Elahi Zahir says:

Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him)'s narrations are very few (أقل قليل).

1. Rejal al-Najashi, p. 260, No. 680
2. Rejal al-Najashi, p. 333. No. 896
3. Mojam Rejal al-Hadith Lilseyed al-Khouyi, vol. 17, p. 118, No. 11509_ Ghamoos al-Rejal Liltestari, vol. 9, p. 499, No. 7154
4. al-Fehrest Lilitoosi, p. 140, No. 601_ al-Estebzar, vol. 3, p. 156, No. 568
5. Mojam Rejal al-Hadith Lilseyed al-Khouyi, vol. 17, p. 116, No. 11507
6. Rejal al-Najashi, p. 317, No. 869_ Kholasat al-Aghval Lilalamah al-Helli, p. 232, No. 2

The narrations which are existed from Imams (Peace be upon them) are more than the number of narrations from the companions. You are proud of Sehad Sete _ Sahih Bukhari, Sahih Moslem, Sahih Tarmazi, Sunnan Nesayi, Sunnan Abi Davood, Sunnan Ibn Maje or Movata Malek_ , but if you count all of their narrations, you will see how few narrations you have. Ibn Athir Jazari removed the repeated narrations in Sehad Sete and then counted them. In Jame al-Osoul book, he reported the whole number of their hadiths 9483 while just in Kafi book we have 16199 hadiths (i.e. almost twice as what you have in all your Sehadhs). Late Sheikh Sadoogh has written 5963 hadiths in Man La Yahzaroho al-Faghih book. Late Sheikh Toosi has mentioned 13590 hadiths in Tahzib al-Ahkam book.

In Vasael al-Shia, Late Sheikh Hor Ameli has reported the whole number of narrations of four books as 35868 hadiths.

Late Mirza Noori counted all of narrations which have the quality of four books in Mostadrak al-Vasael, but the whole number of them reached to 23129 hadiths.

Ok, that is your narrations statistics and this is ours.

C. Multiplicity of weak narrations in Sunnis

Your scholars' statistics are available, but we are ashamed of mentioning the numbers. What should we do? You yourself have quoted these statistics.

Mr. Muhammad Ibn Ismael Bukhari _ Died in 256 AH_ says:

When I was going to write my Sahih book, I chose only 2761 narrations out of 600 thousand narrations. ¹

You can know

How bad is the storm in the sea!

If you face a communist or a Jewish or a Christian who asks us that “what has happened to your Islam?”, what will you tell him? Why was quoting hadiths in Sehad Sete books prohibited for 120 years? When they freed it, about 597 thousand false narrations were made.

Mr. Ehsan Elahi Zahir! Do you compare the number of your narrations with the number of narrations from Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him)?

1. the history of Baghdad, vol. 2, p. 8, No. 424_ Irshad al-Sari, vol. 1, p. 50_ Jame al-Osoul Liljazari, vol. 1, p. 109

Mr. Moslem Ibn Hojaj Neishaburi _ Died in 261 AH_ emerged after Bukhari. After years of research, he says:

I studied 300 thousand narrations, but I just quoted 4 thousand narrations. ¹

It means that he has thrown away 296 narrations. So you are right. The number of Imam (Peace be upon them) s' narrations are few against your 600 thousand narrations and 300 thousand false narrations. Not only are these not the source of proud, but also the source of shame. We have some narrators like Moghairat Ibn Saeed who has quoted one hundred thousand narrations and Late Mamaghani has mentioned them in Tanghih al-Maghal. Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) stated:

لعن الله مغيره بن سعيد، فقد دسّ في أحاديث أصحاب أبي ما لم يحدث به قط.

God damn Moghayrat Ibn Saeed! Because he intrigued in the hadiths of my father's companions and he narrated some hadiths that my father had never stated them.

Only this sentence from Imam Sadegh (Peace be upon him) was enough for Shias to ignore all of Moghayrat's narrations. In all of our narrative communications there are even 5 hadiths from him. As a result, all of his narrations are thrown away. Shia is proud that Imams (Peace be upon them) were among people until late

third century. As Sheikh Hor Hameli says in the 30th volume of Vasael al-Shia and apparently in al-Faedah al-Rabeat page 320:

More than 6600 books have been compiled by Imams (Peace be upon them) companions which 400 principles have been taken as Arba'amane principles. Kafi book is the summary of Arba'amane principles.

We are proud of this: everyone is proud of something and we are proud of our Imams (Peace be upon them).

««« و السلام عليكم و رحمة الله و بركاته «««»»»

Dr. Seyed Muhammad Hosseini Ghazvini

1. al-Montazam Libn al-Jozi, vol. 12, p. 171, No. 1667_ Tabaghat al-Hoffaz Lilzahabi, vol. 2, p. 598, No. 1667

Name: Reza Nour

Date: Aban 07, 2009

I studied Savaegh al-Mahreghah book, but there is not narration with this text ولايه علي حصني. The full text is:

حدثني أبي موسى الكاظم عن أبيه جعفر الصادق عن أبيه م حمد الباقر عن أبيه زين العابدين عن أبيه الحسين عن أبيه علي بن أبي طالب رضي الله عنهم قال حدثني حبيبي وقره عيني رسول الله قال حدثني جبريل قال سمعت رب العزة يقول لا إله إلا الله حصني فمن قالها دخل حصني ومن دخل حصني أمن من عذابي ثم أرخى الستر وسار فعد أهل الم حابر والدوى الذين كانوا يكتبون فأنافوا على عشرين ألفا وفي رواية أن الحديث المروي الإيمان معرفة بالقلب وإقرار باللسان وعمل بالأركان ولعلمهما واقعتان قال أحمد لو قرأت هذا الإسناد على مجنون لبريء من جنته ونقل بعض الحفاظ أن امرأة زعمت أنها شريفة بحضرة المتوكل فسأل عن يخبه بذلك فدل على علي الرضى فجاء فأجلسه معه على السرير وسأله فقال إن الله حرم لحم أولاد الحسين على السباع فأتلق للسباع فعرض عليها بذلك فاعترفت بكذبها ثم قيل للمتوكل ألا تجرب ذلك فيه فأمر بثلاثة من السباع فجاء بها في صحن قصره ثم دعا فلما دخل بابها...

Answer:

Hello

Mr Reza Nour

You are right the existing narration in Savaegh al-Mahragha is exactly what you said. Our typist made this mistake. The text was corrected.

Thank you

Good luck

Answering to the doubts group

Name: Reza Nour

Date: Aban 25, 2009

Why are not my other comments recorded???

Answer:

Hello

On top of the main page of the website, there is a part entitled as “comments”. Enter that part and search your name. We appear all of comments.

Good luck

Answering to the doubts group

Name: Reza Nour

Date: Azar 02, 2009

Unfortunately my comments about this article are not recorded while I thought you are trustable. I had sent my comments before above mentioned comment.