

Did Umar Ben Khatab only threaten?

The group of the beliefs of Shias

Doubt

What is proved from the narrations is no burning of the house of Hazrat Zahra (peace be upon her) by Hazrat Umar Farugh (may God be well pleased with him) and the satisfaction of Hazrat Umar Farugh (peace be upon him) with the threat.

Burning the house of Hazrat Zahra (may God be well pleased with him) has been mentioned clearly in none of valid narrations and if threat is supposed to be like burning the house of Hazrat Zahra , threats narrated by the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) should come true as he said

إِنَّ اللَّهَ أَمَرَنِي أَنْ أُحَرِّقَ قُرَيْشًا.

God has ordered me to burn the Ghoreish Tribe.

Al-Neishaburi, Moslem Ben Al-Hajaj Abu Al-Hossein Al-Ghashiri (died in 261 hejira), v 4 p 2197, hadith 2865, chapter Al-Sefat Alati Yoraf Baha Fi Al-Donya Ahl Al-Janat va Ahl Al-Nar, Ketab Al-Iman, chapter Bayan Al-Kabaer Akbarha, Researched by: Muhammad Foad Abd Al-Baghi, Published by: Dar Ehya Al-Torath Al-Arabi, Beirut

عن أبي هُرَيْرَةَ أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ قَالَ وَالَّذِي نَفْسِي بِيَدِهِ لَقَدْ هَمَمْتُ أَنْ أَمُرَّ بِحَطَبٍ فَيُحْطَبَ ثُمَّ أَمُرَ بِالصَّلَاةِ فَيُؤَدَّنَ لَهَا ثُمَّ أَمُرَ رَجُلًا فَيَوْمَّ النَّاسِ ثُمَّ أَخَالَفَ إِلَى رَجَالٍ فَأَحْرَقَ عَلَيْهِمْ بُيُوتَهُمْ وَالَّذِي نَفْسِي بِيَدِهِ لَوْ يَعْلَمُ أَحَدُهُمْ أَنَّهُ يَجِدُ عَرَقًا سَمِيئًا أَوْ مَرْمَاتَيْنِ حَسَنَتَيْنِ لَشَاوَى الْعِشَاءَ

I swear to God that my life is in His power; I have decided to order to accumulate woods and then I will ask Muezzin to say call to prayer and will appoint a person as the Imam of people. Afterwards, I will go to the houses of transgressors in order burn their houses.

Al-Bokhari Al-Jaafi, Muhammad Ben Esmaeel Abu Abdullah (died in 256 hejira), Sahih Al-Bokhari, v 1 p 231, 618, Ketab Al-Jamaat va Al-Emamat,

chapter Vojub Salat Al-Jamaat, Researched by: D. Mostafa Deib Al-Bagha,
Published by: Dar Ibn Kathir, Al-Yamame, Beirut, Third Edition, 1407- 1987

No wise person reasons to the previous narrations narrated by the prophet of the Islam (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) about burning the houses of the Ghoreish Tribe and the transgressors of the group prayer and they know that the meaning of the prophet (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) is the importance of invitation to monotheism and the group prayer. Hence, the emphasis on burning the house of Hazrat Zahra (peace be upon her) by Umar Farugh is far from fairness and it is based on bias.

Criticism and analysis

Comparing these two threats with each other is the comparison of Ma Al-Faregh because there is no similarity between the threat of burning the house of Hazrat Fateme (peace be upon her) and the threat of the messenger of God about the transgressors of the group prayer because:

First: this narration has been said in your books and you should reason to things that are reason for us;

Second: it is impossible to accept its reasons because it is far from good behaviors of the prophet and he threatened to fire people because of a mostahab action not necessary. When God has not threatened such thing, can the prophet threaten human to be fired because of not participating in the group prayer? Lack of acting to a mostahab action should not be threatened to firing and it is in contrast with the basis of the religion.

Third: according to the narration of Tabari and Ibn Abi Sheibe, Umar swears " if people gathering in the house of Amir Momenan (peace be upon him) do not leave there in order to swear allegiance with Abubakr, he will fire the house and its household. Hazrat Zahra (peace be upon her) reminded the remark of Umar for Amir Momenan (peace be upon him) and Zobeir and she swears to God that he will act to his swear:

وَأَيْمُ اللَّهِ مَا ذَاكَ بِمَانِعِيَّ إِنِ اجْتَمَعَ هَؤُلَاءِ النَّفَرُ عِنْدَكَ أَنْ أَمَرَ بِهِمْ أَنْ يُحْرَقَ عَلَيْهِمُ الْبَيْتُ، قَالَ فَلَمَّا خَرَجَ عُمَرُ جَاؤُوهَا فَقَالَتْ: تَعْلَمُونَ أَنَّ عُمَرَ قَدْ جَاءَنِي وَقَدْ حَلَفَ بِاللَّهِ لِنِ عُنْتُمْ لِيُحْرَقَنَّ عَلَيْكُمُ الْبَيْتُ، وَأَيْمُ اللَّهِ لِيُْمْضِينَ مَا حَلَفَ عَلَيْهِ.

I swear God that the presence of these persons in your house never prevents from firing the house. When Umar went, Imam Ali (peace be upon him) and

Zobeir came back to their house. The daughter of the prophet said to Ali and Zobeir " Umar came to me and swore " if you gather again, I will burn the house when you are there". I swear God that he will do what he has sworn.

Ibn Abi Sheibe Al-Kufi, Abubakr Abdullah Ben Muhammad (died in 235 hejira), Al-Ketab Al-Mosnef Fi Al-Ahadith Al-Athar, v 7 p 432, hadith 37045, Ketab Al-Maghazi, chapter Ma Jaa Fi Khalafat Abibakr va Sirat Fi Al-Rod, Researched by: Kamal Yusef Al-Hout, Published by: Maktab Al-Roshd, Al-Riyadh, First Edition, 1409 hejira

Muhammad Ben Ismaeil Bokhari has written

فَوَجَدَتْ فَاطِمَةَ عَلَى أَبِي بَكْرٍ فِي ذَلِكَ فَهَجَرَتْهُ، فَلَمْ تُكَلِّمَهُ حَتَّى تُوقِّيَ تَهُ، وَعَاشَتْ بَعْدَ النَّبِيِّ، صَلَّى
الله عليه وسلم، سِنَةً أَشْهُرًا... وَلَمْ يَكُنْ يُبَايِعُ تِلْكَ الْأَشْهُرَ.

Hazrat Fateme became angry from Abubakr and she was not on speaking terms with him. Hazrat Fateme (peace be upon her) lived six months after the prophet (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants). Imam Ali (peace be upon him) did not swear allegiance with Abubakr.

Al-Bokhari Al-Jaafi, Muhammad Ben Esmaeel Abu Abdullah (died in 256 hejira), Sahih Al-Bokhari, v 4 p 1549, hadith 3998, Ketab Al-Maghazi, chapter Ghazvat Kheibar, Researched by: D. Mostafa Deib Al-Bagha, Published by: Dar Ibn Kathir, Al-Yamame, Beirut, Third Edition, 1407- 1987

Al-Neishaburi, Moslem Ben Al-Hajaj Abu Al-Hossein Al-Ghashiri (died in 261 hejira), v 3 p 1380, hadith 1759, Ketab Al-Jahad Al-Seir, chapter Ghaol Al-Nabi La Nureth, Researched by: Muhammad Foad Abd Al-Baghi, Published by: Dar Ehya Al-Torath Al-Arabi, Beirut

Hence, the swear of Umar " I will fire the house and its household" is certain.

On the other hand, Amir Momenan (peace be upon him) did not swear allegiance with Umar; therefore, Umar implemented his threat and fired the house.

Another witness of this matter is the narration that Balazeri narrates about this matter

فلم يبایع، فجا عمر و معه فتيلة . فتلقته فاطمة علي الباب فقالت فاطمة : يا بن الخطاب! أتراك
محرقا علي بابي؟! قال: نعم.

Because Imam Ali (peace be upon him) did not swear allegiance with Abubakr , Umar went toward the house of Fateme (peace be upon her) with fire. Fateme (peace be upon her) came behind the door and said " O' the son of Khatab!do you want to fire my house? " Umar answered " Yes".

Al-Balazeri, Ahmad Ben Yahya Ben Jaber (died in 279 hejira), Ansab Al-Ashraf, v 1 p 252

Fourth: as it was said, the swear of Umar " I will fire the house and its household" is certain. If Umar has implemented his swear, the remark of Shias will be right. If not, he would have paid penalty for breaking his swear. Can you bring some reasons or find even a weak narration about the fact that Umar paid penalty for breaking his swear.

Fifth: we believe that Umar implemented his threat because Abubakr had ordered to fire and invade the house of revelation. At the end of his life, he had regretted.

قال أبو بكر رضى الله تعالى عنه : أجل إنني لا أسى على شئ من الدنيا إلا على ثلاث فعلتھن وددت أنى تركتھن وثلاث تركتھن وددت أنى فعلتھن وثلاث وددت أنى سألت عنھن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم فأما الثلاث اللاتي وددت أنى تركتھن فوددت أنى لم أكشف بيت فاطمة عن شئ وإن كانوا قد غلقوه على الحرب....

I am regretful of nothing in the world, but I am regretful of three things that I did and three things that I did not do and three things that I wish had asked the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants)" I liked to dishonor the house of Fateme although it was closed to fight.

Al-Tabari, Muhammad Ben Jarir (died in 310 hejira), Tarikh Al-Tabari, v 2 p 353, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut

Al-Zahabi, Shams Al-Din Muhammad Ben Ahmad Ben Osman (died in 748 hejira), Tarikh Al-Eslam va Vafiyat Al-Mashahir Al-Alam, v 3 p 118, Researched by: D. Omar Abd Al-Salam Tedmeri, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Arabi, Lebanon/ Beirut, First Edition, 1407 hejira- 1987

Masudi Shafei says clearly in the book " Esbat Al-Vasie" that Umar has fired the house of Umar

فهموا عليه و أحرقوا بابها و استخرجوا منه كرهاً و ضغطوا سيّدة النساء بالباب حتّى أسقطت

محسناً.

They moved toward the house of Ali, invaded him and fired his house and they brought him out of house by force. They pressed the master of women (Fateme) between wall and door in order abort her child, Mohsen.

Al-Masoodi, Abu Al-Hasan Ali Ben Al-Hossein Ben Ali (died in 346 hejira), Esbat Al-Vasiyat, p 143

Taj Al-Din Sabki has mentioned the name of Masudi as one of scientists of Shafei and he considers him a historian, the owner of fatwa and Alame

على بن الحسين بن على المسعودى صاحب التواريخ كتاب مروج الذهب فى أخبار الدنيا وكتاب ذخائر العلوم وكتاب الاستذكار لما مر من الأعصار وكتاب التاريخ فى أخبار الأمم وكتاب أخبار الخوارج وكتاب المقالات فى أصول الديانات وكتاب الرسائل وغير ذلك . قيل إنه من ذرية عبد الله بن مسعود رضى الله عنه أصله من بغداد وأقام بها زماناً وبمصر أكثر وكان أخبارياً مفتياً علامة صاحب ملح وغرائب.

Ali Ben Al-Hussein Masudi is the writer of the historical books of Meruj Al-Zahb and other books. It has been said that he was one of children of Abdullah Ben Masud. He was originally from Baghdad and he lived there for a while and he resided in Egypt for many years. He was Akhbari, the owner of fatwa and a scientist.

Al-Sobki, Taj Al-Din Ben Ali Ben Abd Al-Kafi (died in 771 hejira), Tabaghat Al-Shafeiyat Al-Kobra, v 3 p 456, Researched by: D. Mahmud Muhammad Al-Tanahi, D. Abd Al-Fatah Muhammad Al-Halav, Published by: Hejr lel Tabaat Al-Nashr Al-Tozi, 1413 hejira, Second Edition

Sixth: if he has only threatened, this threat can deny the legitimacy of the caliphate of the caliphs because it proves that Hazrat Zahra (peace be upon her), Amir Momenan (peace be upon him) and the companions of Imam Ali (peace be upon him) were against the caliphate of Abubakr and this matter denies the fiction of allegiance with Abubakr.

Conclusion

According to the absolute decision of the second caliph, the oaths that he had said and on the other hand, according to documents found in the Sunni books, Umar Ben Al-Khatab did not only threaten, but he also implemented it.

The group in charge of answering doubts

Centre research of Hazrat Valiasr