

isn't the narration «فَنظَرَ امِيرَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ (ع) بَيْنَ فَخْدَيْهَا» in contrast with the Immaculateness of Imam Ali (peace be upon him)?

This question has been come up by: Farhad . F

The explanation of the question

The Sunni scientists have doubted that the narration

«فَنظَرَ أَمِيرُ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ إِلَى بَيَاضٍ عَلَى ثَوْبِ الْمَرْأَةِ وَبَيْنَ فَخْدَيْهَا»

Is in contrast with the immaculateness of Amir Momenan (peace be upon him).
How can we answer this doubt?

Answer

The main narration:

علي بن إبراهيم عن أبيه عن ابن أبي عمير عن عمر بن يزيد عن أبي المعلى عن أبي عبد الله عليه السلام قال أتيت عمر بن الخطاب بامرأة قد تعلقت برجل من الأنصار وكانت تهواه ولم تقدر له على حيلة فذهبت فأخذت بيضة فأخرجت منها الصفرة وصبت البياض على ثيابها بين فخذيهما ثم جاءت إلى عمر فقالت يا أمير المؤمنين إن هذا الرجل أخذني في موضع كذا وكذا ففضحني قال فهم عمر أن يعاقب الأنصاري فجعل الأنصاري يحلف وأمير المؤمنين عليه السلام جالس ويقول يا أمير المؤمنين تنبت في أمري فلما أكثر الفتى قال عمر لأمير المؤمنين عليه السلام يا أبا الحسن ما ترى فنظر أمير المؤمنين عليه السلام إلى بياض على ثوب المرأة وبين فخذيهما فاتهمها أن تكون احتالت لذلك فقال انثوني بماء حار قد أغلي غليانا شديداً ففعلوا فلما أتني بالماء أمرهم فصبوا على موضع البياض فاشتوى ذلك البياض فأخذه أمير المؤمنين عليه السلام فألقاه في فيه فلما عرف طعمه ألقاه من فيه ثم أقبل على المرأة حتى أقرت بذلك ودفع الله عز وجل عن الأنصاري عقوبة عمر.

Imam Sadegh(Peace be upon him) said " a woman came to Umar that had fallen in love with a man from the Ansar Tribe and she liked him. But however much he tried to take the attention of the youth, he could not. She broke an egg and made her clothes (between two thighs) dirty with egg white and in this way, he made the youth accused. She took him to Umar and said " O' caliph! This youth has disgraced me". Therefore, Umar decided to punish the man from the Ansar Tribe. The man regularly swore that he did not commit prostitution and wanted Umar to research about his action. Umar looked at Amir Momenin (peace be upon him) that attended there and said " O' Ali! What is your idea about this story?"

Imam Ali (peace be upon him) looked at egg white spilled on her clothes, made her accused and said " pour hot water on it". After it was poured on it, the white part of the clothes removed. Then Imam Ali (peace be upon him) (in order to inform the present persons there) tasted some of it and afterwards, he looked at the woman and rebuked her until the woman confessed her sin. In this way, the trick of the woman revealed and because of the favor of Imam Ali (peace be upon him), the man from the Ansar Tribe got rid of trouble.

Al-Kolini Al-Razi, Abu Jafar Muhammad Ben Yaghub Ben Eshagh (died in 328 hejira), Al-Kafi, v 7 p 422, Published by: Eslamiye, Tehran ,Second Edition, 1362 Hejir

In addition to the book " Kafi", this narration has been said in the book " Kafi"

Al-Tusi, Abi Jafar Muhammad Ben Al-Hasan (died in 460 Hejira), Tahzib Al-Ahkam Fi Sharh Al-Al-Moghaneat lel Sheikh Al-Mofid, v 6, p 304, chapter 92: Min Al-Ziyadat Fi Al-Ghazaya, Researched by: Al-Seyed Hasan Al-Musavi Al-Khorasan, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Eslamiye, Tehran, Bazar Soltani, Corrected by: Al-Sheikh Muhammad Al-Akhundi, 1390 hejira

Al-Hor Al-Amoli, Muhammad Ben Al-Hasan (died in 1104 hejira), Vasael Al-Shiat Ela Tahsil Masael Al-Shariat, v 27 p 281, chapter 21: Jomlat Min Al-Ghazaya va Al-Ahkam, Researched and Published by: Ale Al-Beit Le Ehya Al-Torath Institute, Qom Al-Moshrefat, Second Edition, Jamadi Al-Akher, 1414 hejira

Al-Nuri Al-Tabarsi, Mirza Hossein (died in 1320 hejira), Mostadrak Al-Vasael va Mostanbat Al-Masael, Published by: Ale Al-Beit Le Ehya Al-Torath Institute, Beirut, Lebanon, v 17 p 387, chapter 17: Jomlat Min Al-Ghazaya va Al-Ahkam, Published by: Ale Al-Beit Le Ehya Al-Torath Institute, Second Edition, 1408, 1988

Al-Majlesi, Muhammad Bagher (died in 1111 hejira), Bahar Al-Anvar, Researched by: Muhammad Al-Bagher Al-Behbudi, v 40, p 303, chapter 97: Ghazayah Salavatollah Alaihe va Ma...., Published by: Al-Vafa Institute, Beirut, Lebanon, Second Edition, Al-Mosahahat, 1403- 1983

This narration can be analyzed from several aspects which we will refer to it:

The first remark: analyzing the document of the narration

This narration has some faults from the aspect of document because the name " Abu Yala or Abu Al-Moala" that is unknown has been mentioned as Alame Ma Maghani has written about his biography in the book " Tanghah Al-Moghal"

أبو المعلى روي في باب النوادر من كتاب الأحكام من الكافي عن عمر بن يزيد عنه عن

أبي عبد الله عليه السلام ولم أقف على اسمه ولا حاله.

Abu Moala has narrated narrations from the book " Forugh Kafi" (chapter: Navader) from Umar Bin Yazid and Abu Abdullah, but I did not find his name and biography.

Al-Mamaghani, Al-Sheikh Abdullah, Tanghih Al-Maghal, v 3, chapter Al-Mim Min Fasl Al-Kani, p 35, Tab Fi Al-Matbaat Al-Mortazaviye, Al-Najaf Al-Ashraf, 1352 Hejira

Consequently, this narration has no worth in reference and reason.

The second remark: analyzing the reference of the narration

The opponents of Ahle Beit (peace be upon them) have misused this narration that Amir Momenan (peace be upon him) looked between two thighs. Consequently, it is in contrast with the immaculateness of Imam Ali (peace be upon him) because it is impossible that an innocent person that looks at between thighs in a woman.

However, analyzing the text of the narration, we can understand that Imam Ali (peace be upon him) did not look at between two thighs, but he looked at the clothes of the woman between her two thighs and the spoiling water spilled on her clothes. We will mention documents available in the main narration.

a. egg has been spilled on clothes

It has been said in a narration

«وَصَبَّتِ الْبَيَاضَ عَلَى ثِيَابِهَا بَيْنَ فَخْذَيْهَا».

Egg white spilled on her clothes (not her thighs) between two thighs.

It has been said in a narration that the egg spilled on his clothes not his thighs and Imam Ali (peace be upon him) looked at egg spilled on clothes not her thighs.

فَنَظَرَ أَمِيرُ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ إِلَى بَيَاضٍ عَلَى ثَوْبِ الْمَرْأَةِ وَبَيْنَ فَخْذَيْهَا ...

Then Amir Al-Momenin looked at egg spilled on the clothes of the woman between two thighs.

Then Imam Ali (peace be upon him) said

فَقَالَ انْتُونِي بِمَاءٍ حَارٍّ قَدْ أُغْلِيَ عَلَيْنَا شَدِيدًا فَفَعَلُوا ...

Bring me some boiling water. They brought some boiling water. Then Imam Ali(peace be upon him) ordered to pour the boiling water on the white part that the woman claimed that was the water of the sperm of a man and then it turned out that it was white egg.

It can be understood from this part of the narration that the body of the woman was never naked. Consequently, Imam Ali (peace be upon him) did not look at her naked body, but he looked at egg spilled on the clothes.

It should be taken into consideration that the spoiling water spilled was not on the body of the woman, but it was not on the body of the woman; otherwise, the spoiling water burned his feet and no king is allowed to hurt the person that has asserted.

This matter is another document that Amir Momenan (peace be upon him) did not look at the body.

b. the narration is related to punishment

This narration is not related to the discussion of incest. Analyzing the text of the narration demonstrates that the woman has claimed that this man from the

Ansar Tribe grasped me in such and such a place and stigmatized me. Then she came to the caliph. Immediately, she came to the caliph to complain about the youth from the Ansar Caliph.

The document for this matter is that the word " punishment " has been used not the word " religious punishment". If incest had happened, he should have been punished according to the religious rules.

c. the word " Fakhzie" does not refer to naked thighs

The word " Fakhzie" does not refer to naked thighs. Similarly, this text has been said in the Sunni books

حدثنا موسى بن إسماعيل حدثنا حماد بن سلمة عن عبيد الله بن عمر عن القاسم : أن عمر طلق جميلة فجاءت أمها فذهبت بابنه عاصم فجاء عمر فأخبر فرفع فرسه فلحقها فضمته بين فخذيهما.

Umar divorced Jamile. She came back to her mother and took her son, Asem, with her. Umar came and informed it. Immediately, he rode his horse and sought for him. But the woman put the son between her thighs.

Abu Eshagh Al-Harabi, Ebrahim Ben Eshagh (died in 285), Gharib Al-Hadith Lel Harabi, v 1 p 200, Published by: Ameet Om Al-Ghora, Mecca, 1405, First Edition, Researched by: D. Soleiman Ebrahim Muhammad Al-Ayed

Clearly, it can be understood that Umar did not put his child between his thighs while he was naked.

Does someone say about the translation of the narration that between two thighs should stick to skin?

These documents demonstrate that it cannot be said about the translation of the narration definitely " " Imam Ali (peace be upon him) looked at the skin of

the thigh of that woman and there is fault about it. But what is clear from the narration is that Imam Ali (peace be upon him) looked at the cloth between two thighs. Another probability in the translation can remove faults.

The third remark: the necessity of observing the rules of attestation and specialty in the Islam

Even if we suppose that purpose is looking at skin and between two thighs, this matter is not only necessary, but it is also necessary from the aspect of judgment. Hence, it has been said in the story of Moghayere

Umar asked from each and every witness that had reported him the event in the presence of Moghayere. Abubakre said

«... أنه رآه بين رجلي أم جميل وهو يدخله ويخرجه كالميل في المكحلة».

(We cannot translate the above sentences).

Shabal and Nafe repeated such narrations. Their fourth brother (Ziyad) martyred and he entered through the door. As soon as Umar saw him, he said

«فلما نظر إليه عمر قال أما إنني أرى وجه رجل أرجو أن لا يرجم رجل من أصحاب رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم على يده ولا يخزي بشهادته»

I can see the face of a man and I hope that he is not stoned to death and a man from the companions of the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) helps him and he is not humiliated because of his martyrdom.

Al-Balazari, Ahmad Ben Yahya Ben Jaber (died in 279), Fotuh Al-Boldan , v 1 p 340, Researched by: Rezvan Muhammad Rezvan, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut, 1403

When he was asked whom he had seen, Ziyad said "

قال رأيته جالسا بين رجلي امرأة فرأيت قدمين مخضوبتين تخفقان واستنين مكشوفتين وسمعت خفزاننا شديدا.

I saw him sit between two thighs of a woman.

Umar said " did you see him?"

«... رأيت كالميل في المكحلة قال لا قال فهل تعرف المرأة قال لا...»

Then he said " no".

Al-Tabari, Abi Jafar Muhammad Ben Jarir (died in 310 hejira), Jame Al-Bayan An Taval Ayal Quran, v 2 p 493, Published by: Dar Al-Fekr, Beirut, 1405

Because Ziyad Bin Mabad had not seen this scene like others, the main condition of the attestation of the incest did not come true and Moghayere was

not punished. Three other brothers were accused of unfair attestation in order to dishonor a Muslim and Umar ordered to hit them a hundred lashes.

After Abubakr was punished, he said " I attest two times that Moghayere has done this action. Umar wanted to punish him again, but Imam Ali (peace be upon him) prevented him and said " if you punish him, I will punish your friend, Moghayere".

فقال أبو بكر بعد أن ضرب فإني أشهد أن المغيرة فعل كذا وكذا فهم عمر بضربه فقال له علي

عليه السلام إن ضربته رجمت صاحبك ...

Abu Al-Faraj Al-Asbahani (died in 356 hejira), Al-Aghani, v 16 p 108,
Published by: Dar Al-Fekr Lel Tabaat va Al-Nashr, Lebanon, Researched by:
Ali Mohana and Samir Jaber

Ibn Manzur, Muhammad Ben Mokaram Al-Afrighi Al-Mesri (died in 711
hejira), Mokhtasar Tarikh Damascus, v 7 p 382.

Umar confessed this matter in the rituals of Hajj that the attestation of Abubakr was right. Hence, he said to Moghayere

...والله ما أظن أبا بكره كذب عليك وما رأيته إلا خفت أن أرمى بحجارة من السماء .

I swear God that we were sure that Abubakr told the truth. I understood that you scared that a stone descended from the sky on you head.

Abu Al-Faraj Al-Asbahani (died in 356 hejira), Al-Aghani, v 16 p 109,
Published by: Dar Al-Fekr Lel Tabaat va Al-Nashr, Lebanon, Researched by:
Ali Mohana and Samir Jaber

Expertise is one of the most important reasons in proving and it can be referred in most of discussions and all of discussions about specialized topics need technical analysis by an expertise. Hence, referring to an expertise is very common in dealing with struggles.

Most of juridical opinions are based on the expertise opinion. Even if they donot accept the previous opinion and say that Hazrat Ali (peace be upon him) looked at the thighs of that woman, we believe that the special importance of expertise in dealing with struggles made Umar ask Imam Ali (peace be upon him) as an expertise to express his opinions in the story of Moghayer and Jamil. According

to the scene of the immoral story of Moghayer was reported in the presence of Umar as a document and from the point of view of retributive jurisprudence foundation of the Islam, seeing the scene of crime and restating it as an expertise and a document is not only haram, but it is also necessary. In addition, if seeing the scene of crime had had problem for an expertise and a witness from the point of view of jurisprudence, the caliph should not have inquired the witnesses and asked the opinion of Imam Ali (peace be upon him) as the fairest expertise.

Conclusion

This narration has a weak document and its narrator is weak because there is Abi Al-Ala or Abi Al-Moala in his document that has not been Tosikh in any Sunni valid books.

It includes two answers from the aspect of reason:

1. Persons that have doubted have made mistakes about the translation of this narration " he looked at clothes between two thighs not the skin of thigh.
2. Looking at pudenda carefully is not only accepted, but it is also necessary from the aspect of judge.

Good luck

The group in charge of answering doubts

Research centre of Hazrat Valiasr