

## Why did Imam Hassan (peace be upon him) ended in peace with Mu'awiya

---

### and gave him Imamate?

Questioner: Ahmad Jalali Pindari

In order to prove that imam Hassan (peace be upon him) Sunnis people need to prove 4 Contents:

1. They have to prove that Allegiance between Muawiyah and imam Hassan was an actual Allegiance not a fake one or for Appearance
2. Imam Hassan (peace be upon him) gave up the imamate for Muawiyah
3. Imam Hassan pledged allegiance by his choice and there wasn't any force for Allegiance
4. If imam Hassan pledged allegiance under circumstances they have to prove that Muawiyah has Acted on conditions

Certainly they cannot do this

However, we have to mention couple points about Imam Hassan's peace:

#### **First point:**

In historical Sources instead of Allegiance, it has written Convention and peace. Convention and peace are way different with Allegiance:

Said Joseph Ibn Mazan Arrasebi : I heard from Ghasem Ibn Mahyame saying : Muawiyah didn't act on his words that he had promised to Hassan Ibn Ali

**Elal Alsharaye , volume 1 , page 200**

In the words of Imam with Zayd Ibn Wahb, it is stated that he said: I swear to God if I take a promise that I protect my blood and my household with it, is better than getting assassinated

Al-Ihtijaj, volume 2, page

It has been recorded from his speeches with zaid ibn vahab: I swear to God if I pledge an allegiance with him

Al-ihitijaj, volume 2, page 69

When the peace treaty was completed, Mu'awiyah set out to reach Nakhila.

Al-irshad le al mofid , volume 2, page 14

And...

And from the Contents that it Confirms Shias idea is the speech of all historians When mentioning the events of the year 41 which they say: "Hassan's peace" they don't say "Hassan's allegiance"

### **Second point :**

The difference between Worldly rule over the people and Imamate of God is clear. So even if we assume that imam Hassan (peace be upon him) has Assigned the worldly rule to Muawiyah based on some reasons, this won't mean withdrawal of him from imamate of God, but he can't dismiss himself from this Maqam or put on the field somebody else instead of himself , this is a Maqam which God gives it to anyone he seems to worth it.

From the holy quotes (hadith) that they clearly mention this point, this quote is famous between them:

Husain and Hassan are Imams, if they rise or not

Elal-alsharaye,volume 1,page 211

### **Third point :**

This is a point that in case of proof it can leads us to this Case which is that imam Hassan (peace be upon him)was forced to pledge an allegiance with Muawiyah. If this thing is proved then Mu'awiyah's caliphate can no longer be considered legitimate with this allegiance

Like we said hadith for the first point Here we mention it appropriately too

In his speech with Zaid Ibn Jahni ; he said : : I swear to God if I take a promise that I protect my blood and my household with it, is better than getting assassinated

[Al-ihitijaj, volume 2, page 69](#)

### **Forth point :**

One of The oppression that has been done to history is that Provisions of the peace treaty aren't completely mentioned but by checking history sources we have collected some of it. The same amount can show us the nature of this contract

1. Muawiyah didn't named himself Amir-Al-Momenin

[Elal-al-sharaye ; volume 1 ; page 200](#)

2. Assassination (shahadat) don't take place Do not stand in front of him < That means, he is not the ruler of Sharia>

[Elal\\_al-sharaye: volume 1: page 200](#)

3. He hasn't this right to arrest or capture shia and prison them

4. Sharing 1 million derhams between children of killed people in Saffin and Jamal war

[Elal-al-sharaye ; volume 1 ; page 200 / - al-kamel fi-al-tarikh 3/ year 41](#)

5. Not to curse Imam Ali(peace be upon him)

[Al-kamil-fi-al-tarikh volume 1/ year 41](#)

And this is apart from the testimony of history that Mu'awiyah did not act on these conditions

Therefore we cannot take imam Hassan (peace be upon him) as a meaning of Withdrawal of imam Hassan (peace be upon him) from imamate or even Caliphate and giving it to muawiyah

Good luck