

## Is there a narrative in the book "Al-Kafi" implying that Imam "Mahdi" wasn't born?

### Description:

According to what is written in the book "Al-Kafi", Hadrat "Mahdi" [AS] wasn't born. Because after the martyrdom of Imam "Hasan Askari" [AS], sign of pregnancy wasn't seen in not of his wives, in another word, because sign of pregnancy wasn't seen in his wives, It's been said that Imam "Mahdi" [AS] wasn't born. that part that is related to question is as follow:

لَمَّا دُفِنَ أَخَذَ السُّلْطَانُ وَ النَّاسُ فِي طَلَبِ وَلَدِهِ وَ كَثُرَ التَّغْيِيشُ فِي الْمَنَازِلِ وَ الدُّوَرِ وَ تَوَقَّفُوا عَنِ قِسْمَةِ مِيرَاثِهِ وَ لَمْ يَزَلِ الَّذِينَ وَكَلُوا بِحِفْظِ الْجَارِيَةِ الَّتِي نُؤْهِمُ عَلَيْهَا الْحَمْلَ لِأَزْمِينِ حَتَّى تَبَيَّنَ بُطْلَانُ الْحَمْلِ فَلَمَّا بَطَلَ الْحَمْلُ عَنْهُنَّ قُسِمَ مِيرَاثُهُ بَيْنَ أُمَّهِ وَ أَخِيهِ جَعْفَرٍ وَ ادَّعَتْ أُمَّهُ وَصِيَّتَهُ.

When {Imam "Askari"} was buried, ruler and people searched to find his son and many houses were searched and they stopped dividing the legacy of Imam "Hasan Askari" [AS] and some guys were always watching a maid thought to be pregnant until they found out that she's not pregnant. When it was proved that she's not pregnant, Imam "Askari" [AS]'s property was divided between his mother and brother.

"Al-Kullayni al-Razi"- al-Usul al-Kafi- v 1, p 505

### Short response:

1: basically, this question is an incorrect question, because it was made on wrong assumption, because Imam "Mahdi" [AS] was born about five years before his father, Imam "Askari" [AS]'s martyrdom, not after his martyrdom.

2: narrative that questioner has relied on is not Shia idiomatic narrative that its first narrator is infallible Imam [AS], but it's merely a story that its first narrator is a "Nasibi", a guy who is the enemy of "Ahlal-Bayt" [AS], so quoting a story by him is worthless to Shia.

3: the birth of Imam "Mahdi" [AS] has been restated in the book "Al-Kafi" in a separated chapter named "The birth of Imam Mahdi" in which more than 30 narratives have been quoted proving the birth of Imam "Mahdi" [AS]. Furthermore, many Sunni scholars believe in the birth of Imam "Mahdi" [AS].

On the other hand, according to question and its reasoning, lack of birth of Imam "Mahdi" [AS] is because sign of pregnancy wasn't seen in his mother and this reasoning is disaffirmed by two issues:

First: the birth of Hadrat "Moses", second: the birth of Prophet Muhammad [PBUH]; because according to Sunni resources, the sign of pregnancy wasn't seen in their mother.

### **Detailed response:**

#### **1: Imam "Mahdi" [AS] was born five years before the martyrdom of Imam "Askari" [AS]:**

It's been said in mentioned story that after Imam "Hasan Askari" [AS]'s martyrdom, the sign of pregnancy wasn't seen in not of his wives, but this matter isn't in contradictory with Imam "Mahdi" [AS]'s birth, because according to numerous narratives accepted by Shia scholars, Hadrat "Mahdi" [AS] was born about five years before his father [AS]'s martyrdom, in year 255 AH.

Shia big muhaddith, Shaykh "Kulayni" writes:

**"ولد عليه السلام للنصف من شعبان سنة خمس وخمسين ومائتين"**

Hadrat "Mahdi" [AS] was born on "Sha'ban"15<sup>th</sup>, year 225 AH. {Sha'ban is the eighth month of the Islamic calendar}

**"Al-Kulayni Al-Razi"- al-Usul al-Kafi – v 1, p 514**

Shaykh "Mufid" says in this regard:

**"و كان مولده عليه السلام ليلة النصف من شعبان ، سنة خمس و خمسين و مائتين"**

Hadrat "Mahdi" [AS] was born on "Sha'ban"15<sup>th</sup> , year 225 AH.

**Shaykh Mufid – Al-Irshād fī ma'rifat ḥujaj Allāh 'ala l-'ibād – v 2, p 339**

Shaykh "Tabarsi" has restated on such issue:

**ولد عليه السلام بسر من رأى ليلة النصف من شعبان قبل طلوع الفجر سنة ٢٥٥ خمس و خمسين ومائتين من الهجرة**

Imam "Mahdi" [AS] was born on "Sha'ban" 15<sup>th</sup> , before sun rise, year 225 AH

And that quoted story in the book "Al-Kafi" doesn't deny the birth of Imam "Mahdi" [AS] after his father's martyrdom.

we believe as well that there isn't any reason to show that a child was born for Imam "Askari" [AS] after his martyrdom, but we believe that Imam "Askari" [AS]'s child was born when he was alive and this birth was secretly and other than some certain Shias, no one was notified.

## **2: the narrator of mentioned story is not infallible Imam but he's "Nasibi":**

1: the saying of infallible Imam [AS] is proof to us not the saying of a person other than Infallible Imam and this saying of Imam [AS] must be proved to us, it means that we should make sure through the principles of "Diraya" and "Rijal" sciences that infallible Imam [AS] has said such thing.

2: what is written in the book "Al-Kafi" is not only the saying of Imam [AS], but as the narrators of story have restated, this story has been quoted from a "Nasibi", the enemy of "Ahl al-Bayt", so it's not valid to us. As it's written in the beginning of this story:

الحسين بن محمد الأشعري و محمد بن يحيى وغيرهما قالوا : كان أحمد بن عبيد الله بن خاقان على الضياع والخراج بقم فجرى في مجلسه يوما ذكر العلوية و مذاهبهم و كان شديد النصب فقال: ...

"Husayn bin Muhammad As'ari" and "Muhammad bin Yahya" and others have said: "Ahmad bin Ubayd Allah bin Khaqan" was the tax agent in "Qom" {city in Iran}, in his ceremony, some talked about Shias and their sects while he was an extreme "Nasibi" -- the enemy of "Ahl al-Bayt" [AS]-- then he said....

## **3: the birth of Imam "Mahdi" [AS] has been restated in the book "Al-Kafi":**

After mentioned story in the book "Kafi", there is a chapter that its title is as follow:

مولد الصاحب عليه السلام» ولد عليه السلام للنصف من شعبان سنة خمس وخمسين ومائتين.

The birth of Imam "Mahdi" [AS], he was born on "Sha'ban" 15, year 225 AH.

"Al-Kulayni" – al-Usul al-Kafi- v 1, p 514

In this chapter, more than 30 narratives have been quoted in which the birth of Imam "Mahdi" [AS] has been proved.

So, it's quite clear that what a ridiculous doubt it is, because whether questioner has just selected this part of the book "Al-Kafi" Deliberately and has closed his eyes on detailed chapter in which the birth of Imam "Mahdi" [AS] has been proved or he's so poor scientifically that he didn't bother himself to read next pages.

### **The confession of many of Sunni scholars to Hadrat "Mahdi" [AS]'s birth**

In addition to the Book "Al-Kafi" and many of Shia books in which the birth of Imam "Mahdi" [AS] has been restated as a certain matter, amongst Sunni, many of scholars believe in Hadrat "Mahdi" [AS]'s birth, such as: "Al-Duhahabi", "Ibn Hajar Asqalani", "Ibn Hajar Haythami", "Ibn Athir Jazari", "Abd al-Wahhab Shi'rani", "Fakhr Razi", "Sibt al-Juwzi", "Masudi Shafi'i", "Ibn Khalkan" and ...

So, this is certain and proved matter amongst Shia that Imam "Mahdi" [AS] was born about five years before Imam "Askari" [AS]'s martyrdom that even Sunni scholars have confessed to it. And quotation that was discussed by questioner has got nothing to do with this matter, on the other hand narrator was "Nasibi" -- enemy of "Ahl al-Bayt" [AS] –

Questioner said: the reason that Imam "Mahdi" [AS] wasn't born is that the sign of pregnancy wasn't seen in Imam "Askari" [AS]'s slave while lack of seeing the sign pregnancy doesn't show lack of pregnancy and lack of birth, as it'll be said. As History has restated, mother of Hadrat "Moses" and mother of Prophet Muhammad [PBUH] didn't have sign of pregnancy.

### **Mather of Hadrat "Moses" [AS]:**

As Sunni scholars and "Mufassirs" have admitted, the birth of Hadrat "Moses" [AS] was done secretly and sign of pregnancy wasn't seen in "Moses" [AS]'s mother at all. "Ibn Kathir" says about this verse «...ان فرعون علا في الارض» and its next verses {Sura AL-QASAS, verses 4 to 84} in his "Tafsir" book:

**و ولد موسى، عليه السلام، في السنة التي يقتلون فيها الولدان و كان لفرعون أناس موكلون بذلك و قوايل يدْرَنَ على النساء، فمن رأيتها قد حملت أحصوا اسمها، فإذا كان وقت ولادتها لا يقْبَلُها إلا نساء القبط، فإذا ولدت المرأة جارية تركنها وذهبن، وإن ولدت**

غلامًا دخل أولئك الذبّاحون، بأيديهم الشغار المرهفة، فقتلوه ومضوا فَبَحَّهم الله. فلما حملت أم موسى به، عليه السلام، لم يظهر عليها مخايل الحمل كغيرها، ولم تفتن لها الدايات.

And Hadrat "Moses" was born in the year that "Pharaoh" would kill boys and "Pharaoh" had left some guys in charge of doing so. They had the name of any woman who would give birth to kid, if that woman wanted to give birth to a kid, just women whom were appointed by "Pharaoh" would help her. Then if that child was a girl, they would leave her otherwise the agents who were in charge of killing infant would enter the house with sharp dagger in their hand to kill the boy. When mother of Moses got pregnant, the sign of pregnancy wasn't seen in her and not of those who were appointed by "Pharaoh" could find out that she's pregnant.

"Ibn Kathier Damascene", Tafsir al-Quran al-Azim- v 6, p 221, 222

According to above narrative, the birth of Imam "Mahdi" [AS] had two common points with the birth of Hadrat "Moses" [AS]:

1: fear of being killed by tyrant ruler 2: lack of appearing the signs of pregnancy in his mother during pregnancy.

If someone denies such mater, he should deny the birth of "Moses" [AS] and his miraculous birth at the time of "Pharaoh".

### **Mother of Prophet Muhammad [PBUH]:**

Prophet [PBUH]'s mother had no sign of pregnancy when she was pregnant with prophet [PBUH], as it's written in the book "Uyun al-Athar":

و من طريق محمد بن عمر عن علي بن زيد عن عبد الله بن وهب بن زمعه عن أبيه عن عمته قالت: كنا نسمع أن رسول الله صَلَّى الله عليه و سلّم لما حملت به أمه آمنه بنت وهب كانت تقول: ما شعرت بأني حملت به و لا وجدت له ثقله كما يجد النساء .... و ربما كانت تقول: و أتاني آت و أنا بين النائم و اليقظان فقال: هل شعرت أنك حملت؟ فكأنني أقول ما أدري، فقال: إنك قد حملت بسيد هذه الأمة و نبيها، .... و عن الزهري قال: قالت آمنه: لقد علقت به فما وجدت له مشقة حتي وضعته.

"Abd Allah bin Wahab bin Za'mah" has quoted from his father and him from his aunt who said: we heard of prophet [PBUH] who said: my mother "Aminah bint Wahb" would say:

unlike other women, I didn't feel pregnancy and heaviness {due to pregnancy} when I was pregnant with Muhammad.... And my mother would sometimes say: when I was sleeping, I saw that an angel came to me and said: do you feel that you're pregnant? It seems like I told her: I don't know, then she told me: you're definitely pregnant with the prophet of this nation.... And it's been quoted from "Zuhri" who said: lady "Aminah" said: I was pregnant with "Muhammad" [PBUH] but I felt no difficulty and pressure until I gave birth to him.

"Halabi" has restated this issue in his book "Al-Sirah":

قالت آمنة لقد علقت به صلى الله عليه و سلم فما وجدت له مشقة حتى وضعته و عنها أنها كانت تقول ما شعرت بأني حملت به و لا وجدت له ثقلا كما تجد النساء .... قالت آمنة وأتاني أت (أي من الملائكة) و أنا بين النائمة و اليقظة فقال هل شعرت أنك قد حملت بسيد هذه الأمة و نبيها.

أقول ظاهر هذا السياق أنها لم تعلم بحملها إلا من قول الملك لأنها لم تجد ما تستدل به على ذلك لأنها لم تجد ثقلا.

Lady "Aminah" {mother of prophet Muhammad} said: I was pregnant with "Muhammad", but I didn't feel any pressure and it's also been quoted from lady "Aminah" who said: unlike other women, I didn't feel that I'm pregnant with my son Hadrat "Muhammad" [PBUH], I never felt heaviness due to pregnancy.... She also said: I was sleeping that an angel came to me and said: do you know that you're pregnant with the lord and prophet of this nation?

I {Halabi} say that the lady "Aminah" didn't know that she's pregnant with Prophet Muhammad [PBUH] until that angel notified her, because she hadn't felt any heaviness due to pregnancy.

"Al-Halabi"- al-Sirah al-Halabiyyah fi sirat amin al-Ma'mun- v 1, p 75

As it was told, mothers of these two divine prophets didn't have sign of pregnancy, if we want move ahead based on questioner's logic, we should say that these two prophets weren't born because sign of pregnancy wasn't seen in their mothers, while as it's written in history and Quran restates the birth of Hadrat "Moses" [AS] and prophet Muhammad is a definitive matter.

**Conclusion:**

According to what was told responding the question, it's proved that such question or doubt is baseless, because questioner has made part of story that its narrator is a "Nasibi", look like a reason which is acceptable by Shia based on his partial and incorrect selection, and he hasn't paid attention to successive and authentic narratives related to Imam "Mahdi" [AS]'s birth and the opinion of some of Sunni scholars who believe in Imam "Mahdi" [AS]'s birth.

Furthermore, no Shia scholar believes in Imam "Mahdi" [AS]'s birth after Imam "Askari" [AS]'s martyrdom, but all of them believe that he was born when Imam "Askari" [AS] was alive. So, lack of seeing the sign of pregnancy in Imam "Askari" [AS]'s wives has got nothing to do with the topic of conversation and birth of Imam "Mahdi" [AS]. On the other hand, lack of seeing the sign of pregnancy in Imam "Mahdi" [AS]'s mother is not impossible and doesn't show lack of birth as it's been proved that mother of "Moses" [AS] and mother Prophet Muhammad [PBUH] didn't have sign of pregnancy.