

Did prophet leave the world poisoned?

Response:

Muslim scholars have different views about prophet [PBUH]'s demise, many of Shia and Sunni scholars believe that prophet Muhammad [PBUH] was poisoned and it led to his martyrdom.

"Hakim Nishapuri" writes in the book "Mustadrak alaa al-Sahihain":

«ثنا داود بن يزيد الأودي قال سمعت الشعبي يقول والله لقد سم رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم وسم أبو بكر الصديق وقتل عمر بن الخطاب صبيرا وقتل عثمان بن عفان صبيرا وقتل علي بن أبي طالب صبيرا وسم الحسن بن علي وقتل الحسين بن علي صبيرا رضي الله عنهم فما نرجو بعدهم»

"Dawud ibn Yazid" says: I heard from "Shu'bi" who said: swear by god! Prophet Muhammad and "Abu-Bakr" were killed by poison and "Umar", "Uthman" and "Ali bin abi Talib" were killed by sword and "Hasan bin Ali" by poison and "Husayn bin Ali" were murdered by sword.

"Hakim Nishapuri", Mustadrak alaa al-Sahihain- v 3, p 61, Hadith No. 4395

And in another narrative he quotes:

«ثنا السري بن إسماعيل عن الشعبي أنه قال ماذا يتوقع من هذه الدنيا الدنية وقد سم رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم وسم أبو بكر الصديق وقتل عمر بن الخطاب حتف أنفه وكذلك قتل عثمان وعلي وسم الحسن وقتل الحسين حتف أنفه.»

"Ibn Isma'il" has quoted from "Shu'bi" who said: what expectation do you have from this mean world, while prophet Muhammad was poisoned, "Umar bin Khattab", "Uthman" and "Ali" [AS] were killed, "Hasan" [AS] was poisoned and "Husayn" [AS] was suddenly killed.

"Al-Hakim Nishapuri", Mustadrak alaa al-Sahihain, v 3, p 67, Hadith No. 4412

And many of Sunni elders have quoted this issue from "Abdullah ibn Mas'ūd":

«حدثنا عبد الله حدثني أبي ثنا عبد الرزاق ثنا سفيان عن الأعمش عن عبد الله بن مرة عن أبي الأحوص عن عبد الله قال لأن أخيف تسعاً أن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم قُتِلَ قَتْلًا أَحَبُّ إِلَيَّ مِنْ أَنْ أَخِيفَ وَاحِدَةً إِنَّهُ لَمْ يُقْتَلْ وَذَلِكَ بِأَنَّ اللَّهَ جَعَلَهُ نَبِيًّا وَاتَّخَذَهُ شَهِيدًا»

It's been quoted from "Abdullah bin Mas'ūd " who said: if I swear 9 times that messenger of god has been killed, I'll like it more to swear once that he wasn't killed, because god has put him prophet and martyr.

"Al-San'ani"- 'Abd ar-Razzaq- Musnaf, v 5, p 268, Hadith No. 9571

"Muhammad bin Hanbal"- Musnad Ahmad bin Hanbal, v 1, p 408, Hadith No. 3873

"Ibn Kathir Damascu", Al-Bidayah wa Al-Nihaya- v 5, p 227

"Ibn Kathir Damascus", al-Sira Al-Nabawiyya, v 4, p 449

After quoting this narrative, "al-Haythami" says:

"Ahmad" has quoted it and its narrators are the narrators in "Sahih Bukhari".

"Al-Haythami", Majma' al-Zawa'id wa Manba' al-Fawa'id- v 9, p 34

After quoting this narrative, "Al-Hakim Nishapuri" says:

"هذا حديث صحيح علي شرط الشيخين ولم يخرجاه"

According to conditions that "Muslim bin Hajjaj" and "Bukhari" consider for the validity of narrative, this narrative is authentic; but they've not quoted it.

"Al-Hakim Nishapuri"- al-Mustadrak alaa al-Sahihain have - v 3- p 60, Hadith No, 4394

Amongst Shia scholars, Shaykh Mufid writes:

**"رسول الله صلي الله عليه وآله محمد بن عبد الله... وقبض بالمدينة مسموما يوم الاثنين
ليلتين بقيتا من صفر...."**

Messenger of god [PBUH] left the world poisoned, in "Medina", on Monday, "Safar" 28, {Safar is the second month in the Islamic calendar}

"Al-Shaykh Al-Mufid", Al-Muqna'a- p 456

Late Shaykh "Tusi" writes in the book "Tahdhib al-Ahkam":

**"محمد بن عبد الله... وقبض بالمدينة مسموما يوم الاثنين ليلتين بقيتا من صفر سنة
عشرة من الهجرة"**

"Muhammad bin Abdullah" [PBUH]... Left the world poisoned, on Monday, "Safar" 28, Year 10 AH.

"Al-Tusi", Tahdhib al-Ahkam, v 6, p 2

And late Allamah "Helli" says in "Tahrir al-Ahkam":

"محمد بن عبد الله... وقبض بالمدينة مسموما يوم الاثنين لليلتين بقينا من صفر سنة عشرين من الهجرة"

But it's not clear to us who poisoned him or when he was poisoned. "Muhammad ibn Ismā'il ibn Bukhari" writes in his book "Sahih":

قالت عَائِشَةُ رضي الله عنها كان النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم يقول في مَرَضِهِ الذي مات فيه يا عَائِشَةُ ما أَزَالُ أَجِدُ أَلَمَ الطَّعَامِ الذي أَكَلْتُ بِخَيْبَرَ فَهَذَا أَوَانٌ وَجَدْتُ انْقِطَاعَ أَنبَهْرِي من ذلك السُّمِّ.

"Ayesha" has said that prophet would say during his illness {that led to his demise}: since the battle of "Kheibar", I've been feeling the pain made by the food I ate in "Kheibar" and now I'm feeling that my heart blood vessels have been ripped.

"Al-Bukhari Ju'fi"- Sahih Bukhari, v 4, p 1611

Some may say it is unlikely that a poison effects on the body after four years, meanwhile prophet [PBUH] was notified in the battle of "Kheibar" that meat is poisonous and stopped eating, as "ibn Kathir Damascus" writes:

"وفي صحيح البخاري «عن ابن مسعود قال: لقد كنا نسمع تسبيح الطعام وهو يؤكل» يعني بين يدي النبي وكلمه ذراع الشاة المسمومة وأعلمه بما فيه من السم"

It's been quoted from "Ibn Masud" in "Sahih Bukhari": "we'd hear the sound of the food praising when prophet was eating it." It means that poisonous meat talked to prophet and notified him that I'm poisonous.

"Ibn Kathir Damascus", Al-Bidayah wa'l-Nihaya, v 6, p 286

Thus, it's not clear to us exactly that who has poisoned prophet and when it happened.

"Muhammad bin Isma'il" and "Muslim ibn Hajjaj" and many other Sunni scholars have written:

“قَالَتْ عَائِشَةُ لَدَدْنَاهُ فِي مَرَضِهِ فَجَعَلَ يُشِيرُ إِلَيْنَا أَنْ لَا تَلْدُونِي فَقُلْنَا كَرَاهِيَةَ الْمَرِيضِ لِلدَّوَاءِ فَلَمَّا أَفَاقَ قَالَ أَلَمْ أَنْهَكُمُ أَنْ تَلْدُونِي قُلْنَا كَرَاهِيَةَ الْمَرِيضِ لِلدَّوَاءِ فَقَالَ لَا يَبْقَى أَحَدٌ فِي الْبَيْتِ إِلَّا لُدَّ وَأَنَا أَنْظَرُ إِلَّا الْعَبَّاسَ فَإِنَّهُ لَمْ يَشْهَدْكُمْ”

“Ayesha” said: when prophet was sick we poured medicine into his mouth by force, then prophet mentioned us no to give him medicine, we thought it’s because patient doesn’t like medicine, when prophet was healed, he told us? Didn’t I forbid you of giving medicine to me? Then he said: medicine must be poured in the mouth of anyone who is in this house, other than “Ibn Abbas” who wasn’t there and didn’t see what happened.

“Al-Bukhari Ju’fi”, Sahih Bukhari, v 4, p 1618, Hadith No. 4189

“Muslim bin Hajjaj”- Sahih Muslim, v 4, p 1733, Hadith No. 2213

“Ibn Hajar Asqalani” writes about this narrative:

(قوله لددناه) أي جعلنا في جانب فمه دواه بغير اختياره وهذا هو اللدود.

She’s said: “لددنا”, it means that we poured medicine in prophet [PBUH]’s mouth by force.

Now we have some questions from Sunni brothers, we hope that they response:

1: why didn’t “Ayesha” and those who were there listen to prophet [PBUH] and despite his prohibition they poured the medicine into his mouth by force? while Quran says:

“وَمَا آتَاكُمُ الرَّسُولُ فَخُذُوهُ وَمَا نَهَاكُمُ عَنْهُ فَانْتَهُوا”

Whatever the Messenger gives you, accept it; and whatever he forbids you, abstain. And fear Allah; surely, Allah is Stern in retribution

Sura AL-HASHR, verse 7

2: why does “Ayesha” treat prophet like other patients? While “Quran” says about prophet:

“وَمَا يَنْطِقُ عَنِ الْهَوَىٰ. إِنْ هُوَ إِلَّا وَحْيٌ يُوحَىٰ”

Nor does he speak out of desire {3} Indeed it is not except a Revelation which is revealed {4}

Sura AN-NAJM/ verses 3 - 4

Why did she think that each patient even prophet [PBUH] doesn’t like taking medicine?

Couldn't prophet [PBUH] realize as much as people around him that what's good or bad for him? Or by this act, people around him wanted to repeat the saying of those who said that he's hallucinating when prophet [PBUH] asked them to give him pencil and paper?

And oddly enough it's been quoted that when prophet came in, he ordered some to pour medicine in the mouth of those who gave him medicine by force, other than his uncle "Abbas"! why did prophet [PBUH] punish all of them? Doesn't "Quran" say:

"وَلَا تَزِرُ وَازِرَةٌ وِزْرَ أُخْرَىٰ"

"Every soul earns only to its account no soul shall bear another's burden"

Sura AL-ANAAM/ verse 164 /// Sura AL-ISRA/ verse 15