

Responding doubts related to the murdering of Uthman

Mr. "Yasisni":

After seeing Shias fierce reaction towards his controversial talks against Shia, Mr. "Kalbani" has expressed surprise and said again:

Shias are infidel, I'm really surprised that why Shias think that it's weird thing. Their infidelity is not a new thing and Sunni scholars and caliphs {Abu-Bakr- Umar and Uthman} have said years ago that the one who becomes Shia is infidel.

Please explain about it.

Master "Qazvini":

While getting perplexed of Shia elders' reaction, he has even claimed that Sunni elders and caliphs believed that Shias are infidel. Dear viewers, know that it's a clear lie and slander. From one side they believe that Shia was founded at the time of "Uthman" [third caliph] and from another side he says that caliphs believed that Shias are infidel. He can't even bring one sentence said by caliphs about Shias.

Mr. "Yasisni":

Wahhabis say that "Abdullah bin Saba" is the founder of Shia and believe that he's assassinated "Uthman". In previous sessions we proved that no one caused his death other than "Sahabah" {The term *ṣaḥābah* (Arabic: الصحابة meaning "the companions", from the verb meaning "accompany", "keep company with", "associate with") refers to the companions, disciples, scribes and family of the Islamic prophet Muhammad.}

Is there any issue in Sunni books showing that "Zubayr" was involved in the murdering of "Uthman" or not?

Master "Qazvini":

Wahhabis insist that "Abdullah bin Saba" is the founder of Shia faith and as I said before they see that some incidents happened in the beginning of Islam and these incidents question the just and sanctity of Sahabah, that's why they turn devastation back to "Abdullah bin Saba" saying that he's played the main role in assassinating "Uthman" – while Sahaba did so--

I said issues from the book "the History of Tabari" and "that the complete history" that "Sahaba" wrote letter to all "Sahhab" out of "medina" and invited them to arise against "Uthman" and they surrounded Uthman's house that ended up his murdering.

In the previous session, I quoted issues from Sunni books that "Talhah"-- who was one of the flag holders of the battle of "Jamal" occurred under the pretext of revenging Uthman's death-- was among those who caused Uthman's death

But if "Zubayr" was involved in killing "Uthman" or not, It's written in the book "Tarikh al-Ya'qubi", v 2, p 175:

"و كان أكثر من يؤلب عليه طلحة و الزبير و عائشة"

"Talhah", "Zubayr" and "Ayesha" would incite people against "Uthman".

Mr."Ibn Hajar Asqlani" quotes that "Mutarraf bin Abd Allah" says:

"قلنا للزبير يعني في قصة الجمل: يا أبا عبد الله! ما جاء بكم ضيعتم الخليفة الذي قتل يعني عثمان بالمدينة ثم جئتم تطلبون بدمه يعني بالبصرة؟ فقال الزبير: أنا قرأنا علي عهد رسول الله صلي الله عليه و سلم: «و اتقوا فتنة لا تصين الذين ظلموا منكم خاصة» لم نكن نحسب أنا أهلها حتي وقعت منا حيث وقعت"

What made you to humiliate and kill Muslims' caliph -Uthman- and now you've come to "Basra" revenging his death? "Zubayr" said: we'd read this verse at the time prophet [PBUH], Quran says: "And be cautious against a sedition that will not smite the harm doers alone. Know that the punishment of Allah is Stern" and didn't believe that this verse contains us until that incident occurred and led to his assassination and we found out that this verse contains us.

"Ibn Hajar"- Fath al-Bari- v 13, p 2, // "Al-Dhahabi", the History of Islam, v 3, p 504- /// Musnad Ahmad bin Hanbal"-, v 1, p 165 // "Tafsir ibn Kathir", , v 2, p 311 /// "Suyuti", Dur al-Manthur, v 3, p 177 /// "al-Shukani", Fath al-Ghadir, v 2, p 300

It's written in the book "Al-Futūḥ" from "Ibn A'tham":

"و أقبل طلحة و الزبير حتي دخلا علي عثمان، ثم تقدم إليه الزبير ... ، قال الزبير: فلم استعملت الوليد بن عقبة علي الكوفة؟ قال عثمان: استعملته كما استعمل عمر بن الخطاب عمرو بن العاص والمغيرة بن شعبة ، ... ، قال: فلم تشتم أصحاب رسول الله

صلي الله عليه و سلم و لست بخير منهم؟ قال عثمان: أما أنت فليست أشتمك و من شتمته فما كان به عجز عن شتمي، فقال: مالك و لعبد الله بن مسعود هجرت قراءته و أمرت بدوس بطنه، ... ، فما لك و لعمار بن ياسر أمرت بدوس بطنه حتي أصابه الفتق؟ ... ، فما لك و لأبي ذر حبيب رسول الله صلي الله عليه و سلم، سيرته حتي مات غريبا طريدا؟ ... فقال الزبير: يا عثمان! إن هذه الاحداث التي عدتها عليك هي أقل أحداثك و لو شئت أن أرد عليك جميع ما تحتج به لفعلت و أراك تقرأ صحيفتك من حيث تريد و أخاف عليك يوما له ما بعده من الأيام”

“Talhah” and “Zubayr” went to Uthman’s house and protested to him..., “Zubayr” said to “Uthman”: why did you appoint “Walid bin Uqbah” as “Kufa” ruler? “Uthman” said: “Umar bin Khattab” had appointed “Amr bin `As” and “Mughira bin Shu’ba” as ruler either,. “Zubayr” said: why do you swear companions of prophet [PBUH] while you’re not better than them? “Uthman” said: I don’t swear you, and anyone that I swear, deserve more than my swearing. “Zubayr” said: why did you order them to isolate “Abd Allah bin Masu’d” from the society and not let people to read “Quran” like him and ordered him to be beaten up in belly, why did you order them to kick “Ammar bin Yasir” in belly?... why did you order “Abu Dhar”, friend of prophet [PBUH] to be exiled and he died in there? “Zubayr” said: these treasons and innovations {something which is not in religion, we ascribe it to religion} that I said are just part of your crimes. If I want, I can say more either. Take a look at what you did. I’m afraid that a day comes up that you can’t show any reaction.

“A ‘tham al-Kūfi”- Kitab al-Futūḥ, v 2, p 393

Mr. “Yasisni”:

Was “Muawiyah” involved in assassinating “Uthman”?

Master “Qazvini”:

It’s amongst precise points. What I want to say is may be new for Sunni youth. But I ask viewers to note addresses that I say, if they prove that one of documents that say is lie, I’ll reward and apologize on this channel and say that I was wrong.

But as for the role of “Muawiyah” in assassinating “Uthman”, Mr. “Ibn Qutaybah Dinwari” writes in the book “Imamate and policy”, v 1, 54, searched by “Shiri”:

”و كتب إلي أهل الشام عامة و إلي معاوية و أهل دمشق خاصة: ... فيا غوثاه يا غوثاه و لا أمير عليكم دوني، فالعجل العجل يا معاوية و أدرك ثم أدرك و ما أراك تدرك”

”Uthman” sent letter to people of ”Sham”, ”Muawiyah” and people of ”Damascus”:... help me! People of ”Medina” want to kill me. Hurry up! Hurry up! ”Mu’wawiyah”, help me out, help me out, I don’t think that you help me.

It’s written in the book ”Tarikh Ya’qubi”, v 2, p 175:

”Mu’awiyah” moved from ”Sham” to ”Medina” along with 12 thousand troops helping ”Uthman”. 30 kilometers to Medina, he stopped the army going to ”Medina” getting news. When he went to Medina, ”Uthman” told him: where are you troops? ”Muawiyah” said: I’ve come here to see what’s going on. ”Uthman” said: I explained everything in the letter. After altercation, ”uthman” said:

”لا والله و لكنك أردت أن أقتل فتقول: أنا ولي الثأر. إرجع، فجئني بالناس! فرجع، فلم يعد إليه حتي قتل”

Swear by god! You want me to be killed to arise under the pretext of revenging me, go and return with your troops, ”Muawiyah” left and didn’t return and ”Uthman” was assassinated.

Mr.”Baladhuri” says in the book ”Genealogies of the Nobles”, v 6, p 188:

”Muawiyah”, didn’t take his troops to ”Medina” and waited them half a way, because:

”و إنما صنع ذلك معاوية ليقتل عثمان، فيدعو إلي نفسه”

”Muawiyah” wanted ”Uthman” to be killed so that he calls upon people to swear allegiance with him.

Mr.”Tabari” quotes in his ”history” book from ”Shabth bin Rabie”:

”Muawiyah” was told:

”و قد علمنا أن قد أبطأت عنه بالنصر و أحببت له القتل لهذه المنزلة التي أصبحت تطلب”

We know that you didn’t help ”Uthman” and wanted him to be killed to become caliph.

The History of Tabari, v 3, p 570 /// ”Ibn Athir”, ”the complete history”, v 3, p 286

"Abu Tufayl" was one companions of prophet [PBUH], "Muawiyah" told him:

Why didn't you help "Uthman"? He said

"ما منعك من نصره أو تربصت به ريب المنون و كنت في أهل الشام و كلهم تابع لك فيما تريد؟ قال معاوية: أو ما تري طلبي بدمه؟ قال: بلي، و لكنك كما قال أخو جعفي:

"لا ألعينك بعد الموت تندبني و في حياتي ما زودتني زادي"

Why didn't you help him? You were in Sham and all would follow you. "Muawiyah" said: don't you see that I arose to revenge Uthman's killing? "Abu Tufayl" said: yes I do, but as poet says:

When I was alive, you didn't visit me even once

But after my death, you wail and beat your head and chest?!

"Ibn Athir"- Asad al-Ghaba, v5, p 234 /// "Ibn Abd birr", "Al-isti'ab", v 4, p 1697 /// "Ibn Asakir" the history of Damascus, v 26, p 116 /// "Ibn Qutaybah Al-Dinwary" Imamate and policy, searched by Shiri, v 1, p 215

It means you did nothing when "Uthman" was alive, but now you shout:

وا مظلوما؟!

There was such altercation between "Amr bin 'As" and "Muawiyah", and he to "Muawiyah":

You were the real assassin of "Uthman".

"Al-Baladhuri"- Genealogies of the Nobles, p 288 /// "Ibn Qutaybah", Imamate and policy, searched by "Zaini", v 1, p88

Commander of the faithful Ali [AS] says in "Nahj al-Balagha":

O "Muawiyah" you were the real assassin of "Uthman".

"فأما إكثارك الحجاج في عثمان و قتلته، فإنك إنما نصرت عثمان حيث كان النصر لك و خذلته حيث كان النصر له"

When your assistance could be useful for "Uthman" you didn't help him.

"Nahj al-Balagha", letter No. 37

It's written in the book "Al-Aqd al-Farid", v 3, p 33 that "Ali" [AS] said in his letter to "Muawiyah"

"فوالله ما قتل ابن عمك غيرك"

No one was the assassin of "Uthman" other than you.

Commander of the faithful says in the book "Nahj al-Balagha", letter No. 10:

"و لعمرى! ما قتله غيرك"

Cross my heart! No one killed "Uthman" other than you.

It means you didn't help him and people killed him.

Mr. "Yasini":

It's said that "Muawiyah" killed number of companions of prophet [PBUH] under the pretext of assassinating "Uthman", is there anything in this regard in Sunni books?

Master "Qazvini":

Sunni resources are filled with such issues. I'll say some of them and explain about it comprehensively later on:

1: "Amr bin Hamiq":

One of guys who was involved in assassinating "Uthman" was "Amr bin Hamiq", companion of prophet Muhammad [PBUH] who converted to Islam at the year of "The farewell Hajj" {the last hajj performed by prophet} or after "Hudaybiyyah" treaty.

"Asad al-gāba", v 4, p 100

It's written in Sunni resources:

"و أما عمرو بن الحمق فوثب علي عثمان فجلس علي صدره و به رمق فطعنه تسع طعنات و قال أما ثلاث منهن فإني طعنتهن لله و أما ست فإني طعنت إياهن لما كان في صدري عليه"

"Amr bin Hamiq" sat on Uthman's chest and stabbed through his body for 9 times and said: 3 strikes were for the sake of god and 6 other strikes for the grudge I had towards him.

“Ibn Sa’d”, al-Tbaqat al-Kubra, v 3, p 74 /// “Ibn Asakir”, the history of Damascus, v 39, p 409 // “the History of Tabari”- v 3, p 424 and...

It’s written in the book “History of Tabari”:

“فاطعنه تسع طعنات كما طعن عثمان، فأخرج فطعن تسع طعنات، فمات في الأولي
منهن أو الثانية”

“Muawiyah” ordered them to capture “Amr bin Hamiq” and said to executor: stab him 9 times as he did so to “Uthman”, “Umar bin Hamiq” was killed by first or second strike.

“History of Tabari”, v 4, p 197, “Ibn Athir”, the complete history, v 3, p 477 /// the history of Damascus, v 45, p 499

“Shu’bi”-- amongst the founders of Sunni Jurisprudential issues -- says:

“أول رأس حمل في الإسلام رأس عمرو بن الحمق”

The first head that was cut out in Islam and sent back to the city was the head of “Amr bin Hamiq”.

“ibn sa’d” Tabaqat al-Kubra, v 6, p 25 /// “Ibn Athir”, the complete history, v 4, p 83 /// “Al-Duhahabi”, the history of Islam /// “Al-Baladhuri”, Genealogies of the Nobles, v 5, p 282 // “Ibn Asakir”, history of Damascus, v 45, p 503 /// “Ibn Abi Shaybah”, Musnaf, v 8, p 357

“ibn Hajar Asqalani”

“و بعث برأسه إلي معاويه”

Amr bin Hamiq’s head was taken to “Muawiyah”.

“Tahzib al-Tahzib”, v 8, p 22

“Ibn Kathir Damascus”:

“فكان أول رأس طيف به”

Amr bin Hamiq’s head was the first cut head that was bought to the city.

“ibn Kathir”, Al-Bidaya Wa’l-Nihaya , v 8, p 52

“ibn Kathir” and “Ibn Athir” say:

They had imprisoned the spouse of "Amr bin Hamiq", and when they brought the cut head of her husband to "Sham", "Muawiyah" ordered them to give the cut head to her.

"حتي وجه إليها رأس عمرو بن حمق، فألقي في حجرها، فارتاعت لذلك، ثم وضعته في حجرها و وضعت كفها علي جبينه، ثم لثمت فاه، ثم قالت: غيتموه عني طويلا ثم أهديتموه إلي قتيلا، فأهلا بها من هدية"

When she saw her husband's head got upset and shocked and put it in front of her and touched the cut head and removed the blood on the lips and said: you hid my husband from me for a while and today you've brought his cut head as gift. What a beautiful gift it was that "Muawiyah" brought for me.

"Ibn Athir", Al-Bidaya wa'l-Nihaya, v 8, p 52 /// "Ibn Asakir", history of Damascus, v 69, p 40

2: "Abd al-Rahman bin Udeis":

He was involved in the assassination of "Uthman" either, and "Muawiyah" ordered to arrest him and he was martyred in charge of being involved in killing "Uthman".

"Ibn Asakir", history of Damascus, v 35, p 108

3: Muhammad bin Abi Hudayfah":

He was amongst the assassins of "Uthman" and was the companion of prophet [PBUH] and "Muawiyah" ordered him to be killed in charge of killing "Uthman".

"Ibn Hajar", al-Isabat, v 6, p 9

Mr."Yasisni":

Many were involved in Uthman's assassination, who was the first guy who paved the way for his assassination?

Master "Qazvini":

One of companions of prophet [PBUH] named "Jabala bin Amr Saedi", he was amongst "Ansar" and attended battle of "Badr", he had a chain in his hand, "Uthman" was passing by, he said to "Uthman":

Swear by god, one day I'll hang this chain on your neck, unless you remove traitors who were given high position by you. "Uthman" said:

“أي بطانة فوالله إنني لأتخير الناس، فقال: مروان تخيرته و معاوية تخيرته و عبد الله ابن عامر بن كريز تخيرته و عبد الله بن سعد تخيرته، منهم من نزل القرآن بدمه و أباح رسول الله صلي الله عليه و سلم دمه، قال: فانصرف عثمان فما زال الناس مجترئين عليه إلي هذا اليوم”

I didn't appoint any traitor as official. I appointed good people and companions of prophet [PBUH] as official. "Jabala bin Amr" said: you appointed "Marwan", "Abd Allah bin Amir" and "Abdallah bin Sa'd", all of them have done crime Among those who were appointed by you, are guys that "Quran" says "they deserve to be killed". "Uthman" left, after this incident people dared protesting "Uthman"

“The history of Tabary”, v 3, p 400 /// “Ibn Kathir”, Al-Bidaya wa'l-Nihaya, v 7, p 197

“Jabala bin Amr” is amongst guys who didn't let Uthman to be buried in Muslims cemetery and “Uthman” was buried in Jewish people's cemetery:

“لما أرادوا دفن عثمان فانتهوا إلي البقيع فمنعهم من دفنه جيلة بن عمرو الساعدي فانطلقوا إلي حش كوكب”

“Ibn Hajar” Al-Isabat, v 1, p 566

Mr. “Yasisni”:

One of issues written in Sunni resources about “Uthman” is that “Uthman” would say that people of “Medina” are infidel and that he had cursed companions. Is this true?

Master “Qazvini”:

It's written in the book “The history of Tabari” in this regard- the same book that they quote the incident of “AbdUllah Saba” from there- “Uthman” wrote a letter to “Muawiyah”:

“بسم الله الرحمن الرحيم أما بعد فإن أهل المدينة قد كفروا و أخلفوا الطاعة و نكثوا البيعة”

People of “Median” have all become infidel....

“The history of Tabari”, v 3, p 402

As for his cursing, "Ibn Sa'd" says:

When people surrounded Uthman's house, he said:

**"يا قوم! لا تقتلوني، فإني وال و أخ مسلم، فلما أبوا، قال: اللهم أحصهم عددا و اقتلهم
بددا و لا تبق منهم أحدا"**

O people! Don't kill me, I'm your ruler and religious brother. When people attempted to kill him, "Uthman" cursed companions of prophet: god! Fall your disasters upon them and face them the worst death and kill them all.

"Ibn Sa'd", al-Tabaqat al-Kabir, v 3, p 67

Mr. "Mujahid"- Sunni big Quran interpreter- says:

Uthman's cursing towards companions of prophet [PBUH] was fulfilled and:

**"فقتل الله منهم من قتل في الفتنة و بعث يزيد إلى أهل المدينة عشرين ألفا فأباحوا
المدينة ثلاثا يصنعون ما شاؤوا"**

God killed some of "Sahaba" due to Uthman's cursing. When "Yazid bin Muawiyah" sent 20 thousand troops to "Medina" attending battle of al-Harrah, he ordered that men's spouses, sisters and mothers are "Halal" for his troops and they did what they wanted.

"Ibn Sa'd", al-Tabaqat al-Kabir, v 3, p 68

"Ibn Kathir" says:

700 of "Ansar" and "Muhajerin" --who migrated to medina with prophet [PBUH]-- were killed when Yazid's army attacked "Medina", as well 10 thousand of average people were killed and 1000 illegitimate children were born in that year after battle of "Harrah, because Yazid's troops raped men's spouses, sisters and mothers.

"Ibn Kathir", al-Bidaya wa'l-Nihaya, v 8, p 241

I think it can be interesting joke for the viewers. It means that "Uthman" curses and god forces "Yazid" to attack so that 700 of "Muhajerin" and "Ansar" {inhabitants of Medina who became Muslim, after Prophet [PBUH] migrated to Medina} are killed and women are raped.

Dears! Brothers and sisters! Dear Sunnis, youth and Wahhabis who can hear me! See if such brutality has ever happened during the history? From Hadrat "Adam" until now, the most savage armies in the world wouldn't dare to do so but these guys call it curse of third caliph!

Mr."Yasini":

What is the motive behind assassinating "Uthman" in the perspective of Sunni?

Master "Qazvini":

Since it takes long time if I want to look into this matter comprehensively, I say briefly what Sunnis have said in their books in this regard:

"Talhad" said to "Uthman":

"إنك أحدثت أحداثا لم يكن الناس يعهدونها"

You invented things {you ascribed to Islam what were not in Islam} that were unprecedented.

"Al-Baladhuri", Genealogies of the Nobles, v 5, p 29

"Zubayr" says about "Uthman":

"اقتلوه فقد بدّل دينكم"

Kill him, he changed your religion.

"Ibn Abi'l-Hadid ", description of Nahj al-Balagha, v 9, p 36

"Abdallāh ibn Mas'ūd" says:

"ما أرى صاحبكم إلا وقد غير و بدّل"

"Uthman" changed and converted divine religion. {Islam}

"Al-Baladhury", Genealogies of the Nobles, v 5, p 36

"Abdallāh ibn Mas'ūd" says:

"إن دم عثمان حلال"

Uthman's blood is "Halal". {We can kill him}

"The history of Tabari"- v 3, p 341

"Ammar" was told:

"أراد أن يغير ديننا فقتلناه"

"Uthman" wanted to change our religion, so we killed him.

"Ibn Abi'l-Hadid"- description of "Nahj al-Balagha", v 8, p 22

"Sa'd bin Abi Waqqas" says:

"عثمان غيّر و تغيّر"

"Uthman" changed and changed divine religion.

"Ibn Qutaybah Dinwari", Imamate and policy, searched by al-Zeini, v 1, p 48

"Hasim Mirqal" says:

"أحدث الأحداث و خالف حكم الكتاب"

He made inventions and opposed with divine orders.

"the history of Tabari", v 4, p 30 /// "Ibn Muzahim", Battle of Siffin- v 354

"Ayesha":

"فرفعت نعل رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم و قالت: تركت سنة رسول الله"

Lift up prophet [PBUH]'s slipper and said: "Uthman"! you abandoned prophet [PBUH]'s Sunna { the traditional portion of Muslim law based on Muhammad's words or acts, accepted (together with the Koran) as authoritative by Muslims and followed particularly by Sunni Muslims}

But what is very important is that:

People of "Egypt" went to "Medina" and complained of "Egypt" ruler to "Uthman" that he's killed one of "Sahaba" and committed crime. People assaulted Uthman's house and first surrounding began till "Uthman" gave in after commander of faithful Ali [AS], "Talhah" and "Zubayr" mediated, he sent letter and removed "Egypt" ruler and replaced him by "Muhammad bin Abu-Bakr". People were returning to "Egypt" happily, suddenly they saw an express messenger going through the desert and mountain. "Muhammad bin Abu-Bakr"

ordered him to be stopped, they asked him: where are you off to? He said: "Egypt", they said: why? He answered: I can't say.

They searched his body but found nothing other than an empty water skin, letter was in there, "Uthman" had written a letter to "Egypt" ruler and sealed it:

If "Muhammad bin Abu-Bakr and ... come there, kill them as bad as possible, same goes for those who complain of me and protest to me.

Those who were going to "Egypt" got surprised and returned to "Medina" and said to commander of faithful [AS]: you mediated, so what's this letter? They went to "talhah" and "Zubayr", they all went to "Uthman" and said:

What's this? "Uthman" said: I don't know. They said: isn't he your slave? He said: Yes, he is. They said: is this camel yours that he's riding? He said: Yes, it's, they said: is this seal on the letter yours or not? He said: its seal is mine, but I don't know about this letter.

That's why after this event people found out that "Uthman" couldn't be changed and decided to kill him.

"Ibn Sa'd", Al-Tabaqat al-Kubra, v 3, p 65 /// "Ibn Asakir", The history of Medina- v 39, 323 // The history of Tabari- v 3, p 401

Viewers' question:

1: Hadrat "Ali" [AS] said to "Muawiyah":

Those who swore allegiance with "Abu-Bakr", "Umar" and "Uthman", swore allegiance with me.

Couldn't it be confirming caliphs?

Response:

One of issues that they rely on saying that commander of faithful [AS] would believe that caliphs' caliphate is legitimate is his letter to "Muawiyah":

"إنه بايعني القوم الذين بايعوا أبا بكر و عمر و عثمان علي ما بايعوهم عليه"

The same guys swore allegiance with "Abu-Bakr", "Umar" and "Uthman", swore allegiance with me.

“Nahg al-Balaghah”, letter 6

“إنه بايعني القوم الذين بايعوا أبا بكر و عمر و عثمان علي ما بايعوهم عليه”

One of issues that Sunni and Wahahbis on the satellite channel keep talking about is that commander of faithful Ali [AS] would believe that caliphs' caliphate is that legitimate. I promise viewers to talk about Nahg al-Balagha letter 6 comprehensively in another session. These guys are wrong. What “Ali” [AS] said to “Muawiyah” in his letter is one of instances of this verse:

“ادْعُ إِلَى سَبِيلِ رَبِّكَ بِالْحُكْمَةِ وَالْمَوْعِظَةِ الْحَسَنَةِ وَجَادِلْهُمْ بِالَّتِي هِيَ أَحْسَنُ إِنَّ رَبَّكَ هُوَ
أَعْلَمُ بِمَنْ ضَلَّ عَنْ سَبِيلِهِ وَهُوَ أَعْلَمُ بِالْمُهْتَدِينَ”

“Call to the Path of your Lord with wisdom and fine admonition. dispute with them in the best manner. Your Lord is well aware of those who have gone astray from His Path and He is well aware of those who are guided.

Sura AN-NAHL / verse 125

And he says to “Muawiyah”:

You who accepted the caliphate of “Abu-Bakr”, “Umar” and Uthman” because people swore allegiance with them, now that these people swore allegiance with me, why don't you accept? If you tell me that you don't accept that prophet [PBUH] appointed me as caliph, at the least you should accept me as caliph because those who accepted them {Abu-Bakr and...} as caliph, have accepted me as caliph either, so why don't you accept my caliph?

What's interesting is that it's written at the beginning of the letter:

“إن بيعتي بالمدينة لزمك و أنت بالشام”

As they swore allegiance with “Abu-Bakr” in “Medina” and people in all Islamic cities and countries accepted his allegiance {accepted him as caliph}, now that people of “Medina” swore allegiance with me and you're in “Sham”, you should accept my allegiance.

“Ibn Muzahim”- battle of Siffin- p 29

God willing, we'll talk about it later on.

Question:

I read somewhere:

"Abu-Bakr", "Umar" and "Uthman" were exiled by prophet [PBUH].

Prophet [PBUH] said to Hadrat "Ali" [AS]:

These three guys have converted to Islam apparently, {they're not real Muslims}:

Is that true?

Response:

We don't have such narrative, commander of faithful [AS] hasn't denied the Islam and faith of "Abu-Bakr", "Umar" and "Uthman". Commander of faithful [AS]'s logic is the logic of Quran and prophet [PBUH] and the one who says "Shahadatayn" { the two declaration of faith} is Muslim and respectable.

“أشهد أن لا إله إلا الله وأشهد أن محمداً رسول الله”

I bear witness that none is worthy of worship except Allah and that Muhammad is His Messenger.

Commander of faithful [AS]criticizes explicitly, It's written in the book "Sahih Bukhari", that second caliph {Umar} himself said:

Commander of faithful [AS]'s opinion was that "Abu-Bakr" and "Umar" are liar- traitor and tricky and sinful.

Sahih Bukhary"- v 5, p 152

Question:

Hadith of "Thaqalayn" has been accepted by most of Sunni scholars and companions of prophet [PBUH] would live at that time so what happen that they didn't accept him as caliph?

Response:

Commander of the faithful [AS] himself has said about it in the book "Nahj al-Balagha" sermon 162. Someone from "bani Asad" tribe asked "Ali" [AS]:

“كيف دفعكم قومكم عن هذا المقام و أنتم أحق به؟ فقال: يا أبا بني أسد! ... ، أما الاستبداد علينا بهذا المقام و نحن الأعلون نسبا و الأشدون برسول الله صلي الله عليه و آله نوطا، فإنها كانت أثرة شحت عليها نفوس قوم و سخت عنها نفوس آخرين”

Why did they put you aside {select another guy as caliph} while you deserved it? “Ali” [AS] said: ... , those who oppressed me and went to another guy, ... , it was because some put me aside because of selfishness and some were indifferent magnanimously and didn't defend me.

And prophet [PBUH] said:

“يا علي! ضغائن في صدور اقوام لا بيدونها لك إلا من بعدي”

Dear “Ali”! I see grudges in people's heart that they will show later.

“Al-Haythamy”- Majma' al-Zawa'id—v 9, p 118 // “Ibn abi al-Hadid”, description of “Nahj al-Balagha”, v 4, p 107 /// “Kharazmi”, p 65 // and...

“Hakim Nishapuri” quotes from commander of faithful [AS]:

“مما عهد إليّ النبي أن الأمة ستغدر بي بعده”

Prophet [PBUH] told me: after me, my nation will betray you and plot against you.

Then “Hakim Nishapuri” says:

“هذا حديث صحيح الاسناد”

The document of this Hadith is valid.

“Hakim Nishapuri”, Mustadrak alaa al-Sahihayn, v3, p 140

Question:

A Sunni said:

Hadrat “Ali” [AS] who was so strong, what happened that he didn't say anything when his wife was insulted?

Please explain about it.

Response:

We already proved with valid-document Hadiths that second caliph assaulted "Ali" [AS]'s house and vowed that if you don't come out I'll set fire on your house. Why didn't "Ali" [AS] defend because of this assault? Answer us.

Commander of faithful [AS] has defended and we said narratives in this regard from the book "Ruh al-Ma'ani" – Tafsir book- from "al-Ālūsī" and other books.

Commander of faithful [AS] would think of Islam and knew that if he wants kill them by sword, several Muslims that would live at time will be removed and hypocrites will dominate on Islamic society and knew that suffered Jews and western Rome government and eastern Iran government are waiting for an opportunity to root out Islam religion and if it happens there will neither be Islam nor Hadrat "Ali" [AS].

Question:

A friend of mine who studies about Islam history, said:

Among those who wanted to assassinate prophet [PBUH], were some elders of companions including caliphs {Abu-Bakr- Umar and "Uthman}.

Were caliphs amongst them?

Response:

Mr."Ibn Hazm" says in the book "Al-Muhalla" quotes:

ان أبا بكر و عمر و عثمان و طلحة و سعد بن أبي وقاص رضي الله عنهم أرادوا قتل النبي
صلي الله عليه و سلم و إلقاءه من العقبة في تبوك"

"IbnHazm", Al-Muhalla, v 11, p 224

A bad penny always comes back. Of course "Ibn Hazm" defends them either.

Question:

It's said in "mazar-i- Sharif" a lot that:

Shias don't follow "Quran"; particularly about the times of {five} daily prayers.

I look into Quran, I just found about "Fajr" {dawn}, "Zuhr" {noon}, and "Maghrib" prayers and didn't find anything about "Asr" prayer. Please explain about it.

Response:

I've said multiple times to dear Shias memorizing narratives that I say. Because we were asked such issues a lot. It's written in the "Sahih Muslim" v 2, p 152, Hadith No. 1517, that "Ibn Abbas" says:

”جمع رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم بين الظهر و العصر و المغرب و العشاء بالمدينة في غير خوف و لا مطر.

ال: قلت لابن عباس: لم فعل ذلك؟ قال: كي لا يجرح أمته”

Prophet [PBUH] said "Zuhr" prayer with "Asr" prayer, and "Magrib" prayer with "Isha" prayer in "Medina", neither It was rainy nor there was fear. "Waki"" says: I said to "Ibn Abbas": why did prophet [PBUH] said prayers with each other? "Ibn Abbas" said: because prophet [PBUH] doesn't want his nation to be bothered.

If Shias say prayers in three times {in the morning- at noon and in the evening} it because they're practicing this Sunna of prophet [PBUH]. Why do you Sunnis not practice this Sunna of prophet [PBUH]? Answer us.

And in this verse:

”أَقِمِ الصَّلَاةَ لِدُلُوكِ الشَّمْسِ إِلَى غَسَقِ اللَّيْلِ وَقُرْآنَ الْفَجْرِ إِنَّ قُرْآنَ الْفَجْرِ كَانَ مَشْهُودًا”

Establish the prayer at the decline of the sun till the darkening of the night and the Koran recital at dawn. Surely, the Koran recital at dawn is witnessed.

Sura al-Asra'/ verse 78

”أَقِمِ الصَّلَاةَ لِدُلُوكِ الشَّمْسِ”

Establish the prayer at the decline of the sun

It refers to "Zuhr" and "Asr" prayers

”إِلَى غَسَقِ اللَّيْلِ”

”Till the darkening of the night

It refers to "Magrib" and "Isha" prayers

”وَقُرْآنَ الْفَجْرِ”

The Koran recital at dawn

It refers to "Fajr" {fawn} prayer

"Tafsir Alusi", v 15, p 133

Question:

It's said in some eulogies that:

When Hadrat "Fatimah" [AS] was desecrated, Hadrat "Ali" [AS]'s hands were tied.

Is that true?

Response:

Such thing is not true. Eulogists who say such things are responsible. I say from here that it's not written in Shia valid-document narratives that "Ali" [AS]'s hands were tied or they had tied rope around his neck, etc, it's just written in the book "Nahj al-Balagha" **letter 28** that Imam "Ali" [AS] wrote to "Muawiyah":

"إني كنت أقاد كما يقاد الجمل المخشوش حتي أبايع"

They drag me to the mosque, as camel is dragged to somewhere.

Question":

Sunnis maneuver on this issue a lot:

"Quran" was collected at the time "Uthman" by "Uthman"

Is that true?

I think it shows that Sunnis don't pay attention to their own narratives. It's written "Sahih Bukhary" and "Sahih "Muslim":

"جمع القرآن علي عهد النبي صلي الله عليه و سلم أربعة كلهم من الأنصار، أبي بن كعب و معاذ بن جبل و زيد بن ثابت و أبو زيد"

4 persons collected "Quran" at the time of prophet [PBUH] and all of the were from "Ansar"

Sahih muslom- v 4, p 229 and v 6, p 103, Hadith No. 3857 /// Sahih Muslim, v 7, p 149

This is what's written in these two Sunni famous books, we didn't say this issue from their non-well-known books.

And Sunni elders have written in their books such as: "Allamah Rafi'i" in the book "Quran miracles", p 36 and Mr."Zarqani" in the book "Manahil Al 'Irfan", v 1, p 242 and "Suyuti" in "Al-Itqan", v 1, p 62, that "Quran" was collected at the time of prophet [PBUH].

Question:

As Hadrat "Ali" [AS] was martyred, Hadrat "Uthman" was martyred either. If someone is another guy's enemy and kills him, It'll be called "Murdering". Why don't you use the word "Martyr" about "Uthman"?

Response:

We believe that those who are killed in god's path such as: commander of faithful Ali [AS], Imam "Hussein" [AS] and other Shia Imams [AS] are martyr. The word "Martyr" has not been used in not of Sunni scholars' books that we mentioned, such as: "IbnKathir", "Tabari", "Ibn abd al-Birr", "Al-Dhahabi" and "Ibn Hajar", they've just said:

"قتل عثمان"

It means "Uthman" killed or someone has assassinated him.

If you want to protest, you should protest to your elders that why they didn't use the word "Martyr".

Good luck.













