

Did Imam Hassan [AS] know that milk or water bowl is poisonous?

“Sayed Murtada”- one of the greatest Shia scholars and theologians- has said about Imam [AS]’s knowledge:

It’s not necessary that Imam knows foreknowledge and what has ever happened or will happen because such view requires following things:

1: Imam is partner with god in all the knowledge {anything that god knows, he knows as well} 2: Imam has eternal knowledge 3: Imam’s knowledge is from himself {not that god has given it to him}.

Not of above issues are acceptable, because:

1: Imam doesn’t know anything that god knows 2: Imam’s knowledge is not eternal 3: it’s been proved via various reasons that Imam’s knowledge is from god.

Thus, it’s no necessary that we believe that Imam [AS] knows about the time of his demise or martyrdom or the way murdering in detail.

There are many narratives about commander of faithful Ali [AS] that he knew about the time of his martyrdom and his assassin; but we don’t accept that he definitely knew the time of his martyrdom because if he knew, it’d be obligatory for him to keep the assassin away and not to get himself killed.

Al-Shaikh “Al-Mufid” says about Shia scholars’ consensus about Imam’s knowledge over all the events:

There’s no consensus amongst Shia that Imam knows everything, though, there is a consensus that Imam [AS] knows the decree of anything that happens not that he’s aware of all incidents and events or knows them in detail; of course, It’s not big deal that Imam [AS] knows the generalities of the events and this knowledge is from god. We can’t accept this view that Imam [AS] knows the occurrence of any event in detail because it’s a groundless claim.

Secondly: as for this matter That Imam “Ali” [AS] knew about the time of his martyrdom and his assassin, we have some narratives that say: Imam “Ali” [AS] knew about his

martyrdom and assassin, but that he knew the time of his martyrdom in detail, we don't have any narrative about it.

We realize from above issues that:

Now that Imam [AS] has foreknowledge, that doesn't mean that he's aware of the way of his martyrdom and its time in detail. There are narratives regarding Imam's knowledge that prove this view, such as:

1: it's been quoted from Imam "Sadiq" [AS] that whenever Imam wants to know something, god will teach him;

2: Imam "Sadiq" [AS] says: Imam will find out whenever he wants;

It's written in some quotations that whenever Imam [AS] wants to know, he'll be notified.

3: "Mua'mmar" asked Imam "Sadiq" [AS]: Do you have foreknowledge? Imam [AS] said: sometimes doors of knowledge are opened to us, so we know, and sometimes doors of knowledge are shut, so we don't know.

Contents of the narrative are as follow:

1: Imam [AS]'s foreknowledge isn't permanent and he knows whenever he wants.

2: Imam [AS] doesn't know unnecessary occult news.

Imam [AS]'s awareness of the way and the time of his martyrdom aren't out of one of above issues.

Conclusion:

According to the narratives and scholars' opinion, this idea that Imam "Hassan" [AS] knew in detail that food or water bowl is poisonous, is incorrect.

Another opinion amongst Shia scholars is that basically Imams [AS] weren't obligated to use foreknowledge for daily activities but they were obligated to live like average people and seek knowledge, information and news and livelihood like other people.

So, although, Imams [AS] could know occult events and news whenever they wanted, but they didn't will to have foreknowledge in affairs that they're obligated to gain usual knowledge and formal methods to get information and news.

Good luck.