

Did Aeshe have harsh behavior towards the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants)?

The group of Sunni scientists

This question has been come up by: Soleiman Amiri

Answer:

There are narrations in the Sunni sources that demonstrate that Aeshe, the wife of the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) had harsh behaviors with the prophet. Sometimes, even they threatened the prophecy of the prophet and she transferred this matter to Hazrat Muhammad harshly.

These behaviors were as harsh as even her father, Abu Bakr, made angry and in some cases, Abu Bakr hit Aeshe. A lot of cases can be referred to prove this matter which we will refer to cases that the Sunni scientists confirmed their validity due to briefness.

The harsh behavior of Aeshe with the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) in Hajj Al-Veda?

Abu Yala Museli , one of the Sunni dignitaries, has written in the book " Mosnad"

حدثنا الحسن بن عمر بن شقيق بن أسماء الجرمي البصري حدثنا سلمة بن الفضل عن محمد بن إسحاق عن يحيى بن عباد بن عبد الله بن الزبير عن أبيه عن عائشة أنها قالت : وكان متاعي فيه خف وكان على جمل ناج وكان متاع صفية فيه ثقل وكان على جمل ثقال بطيء يتبأ بالركب . فقال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم: حولوا متاع عائشة على جمل صفية وحولوا متاع صفية على جمل عائشة حتى يمضي الركب. قالت عائشة: فلما رأيت ذلك قلت يا لعباد الله غلبتنا هذه اليهودية على رسول الله . قالت : فقال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم: يا أم عبد الله إن متاعك كان فيه خف وكان متاع صفية فيه ثقل فأبأ بالركب فحولنا متاعها على بعيرك وحولنا متاعك على بعيرها .

قالت: فقلت: أأست تزعم أنك رسول الله؟ قالت: فتبسم قال: أو في شك أنت يا أم عبد الله ؟ قالت : قلت: أأست تزعم أنك رسول الله؟ أفهلا عدلت؟ وسمعني أبو بكر وكان فيه غرب أي حدة فأقبل علي فلطم وجهي. فقال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم: مهلا يا أبا بكر. فقال: يا رسول الله أما سمعت ما قالت؟ فقال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم: إن الغيرى لا تبصر أسفل الوادي من أعلاه.

Abdullah Ben Zobeir has from Aeshe that she said " in the journey of Hajj Al-Veda, my luggage was lighter and my camel was speedy as well, but the luggage of Safie was heavier and her camel was slower which had made caravan move slowly. The messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) bade " put the luggage of Aeshe on the camel of Safie and the luggage of Safie on the camel of Aeshe so that the caravan could move more quickly. Aeshe says " when I saw such thing, I said " woe us; this Jewish woman is more beloved for the prophet than us". The messenger of God bade " O' Um Abdullah! (The title of Aeshe) your luggage is lighter, but the luggage of Safie is lighter. This has made the caravan move slowly and we put her luggage on your camel and your luggage on her camel. Aeshe says that I said " don't you imagine that you are the prophet of God? The messenger of God smiled and bade " are you doubtful about this matter?". Aeshe says " I said again " don't you imagine that you are the prophet of God? Therefore, why don't you perform justice? Abu Bake that had bad-tempered personality came closer to me and slapped on my face. The messenger of God bade " O'Abu Bakr! Wait. Abu Bakr said " O' the prophet of God! Didn't you hear what he said?". The messenger of God bade " when the bias of men is provoked, they cannot recognize the bottom of valley from its top".

Abu Yali Al-Movaseli Al-Tamimi, Ahmad Ben Ali Ben Al-Mothana (died in 307 hejira), Mosnad Abi Yali, v 8 p 129, hadith 4670, Researched by: Hossein Salim Asad, Published by: Dar Al-Mamun lel Torath, Damascus, First Edition, 1404 Hejira- 1984

Ibn Hajar Asghalani in the book " Al-Mataleb Al-Alie" and Halabi in the book " Sire" have narrated

Al-Asghalani Al-Shafei, Ahmad Ben Ali Ben Hajar Abu Al-Fazl (died in 852 hejira), Al-Mataleb Al-Aliye Bezavaed Al-Masanid Al-Thamaniye, v 8 p 188, hadith 1599, Researched by: D. Sad Ben Naser Ben Abd Al-Aziz Al-Shatari, Published by: Dar A-Aseme/ Dar Al-Gheith, First Edition, Saudi Arabia, 1419 Hejira

Al-Halabi, Ali Ben Borhan Al-Din (died in 1044 hejira), Al-Sirat Al-Halabiye Fi Sirat Al-Amin Al-Mamun, v 3 p 313, Published by: Dar Al-Marefat, Beirut, 1400

Al-Ghazali, Muhammad Ben Muhammad Abu Hamed (died in 505 hejira),
Ehya Olum Al-Din , v 2 p 418, Published by: Dar Al-Marefat, Beirut

The validity of the document of the narration:

Asemi Maki in the book " Samt Al-Nejum Al-Avali" has considered this narration good one

وروى أبو يعلى وأبو الشيخ ابن حيان وسنده حسن عن عائشة قالت كان متاعي فيه خفة وكان على جمل قارح....

Abu Yala and Abu Al- Sheikh Ibn Hayan have narrated this narration from Aeshe with good document " my luggage was lighter and it was on a speedy camel...

Al-Asemi Al-Maleki, Abd Al-Malek Ben Hossein Ben Abd Al-Malek Al-Shafei (died in 1111 hejira), Samt Al-Nojum Al-Avali Fi Anba Al-Avail Al-Tavali, v 1 p 451, Researched by: Adel Ahmad Abd Al-Mojud, Ali Muhammad Moavez, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie

Salehi Shami has said about this narration

وروى أبو يعلى بسند لا بأس به وأبو الشيخ بن حيان بسند جيد قوي عن عائشة - رضي الله تعالى عنها قالت كان في متاعي خف وكان على جمل ناج ... ورواه الامام أحمد بسند لا بأس به عن صفية رضي الله تعالى عنها.

Abu Yala with document that has no fault and Abu Al-Sheikh with good and strong document have narrated from Aeshe " my luggage was lighter and it was on a speedy camel...

Al-Salehi Al-Shami, Muhammad Ben Yusef (died in 942 hejira), Sabal Al-Hoda Al-Reshad Fi Sirat Kheir Al-Ebad, v 9 p 71, Researched by: Adel Ahmad Abd Al-Mojud, Ali Muhammad Moavez, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut, First Edition, 1414 Hejira

And he has narrated in another book

الرابع والثلاثون: في غيرتها. روى أبو يعلى وأبو الشيخ وابن حبان بسند جيد عن عائشة رضي الله تعالى عنها قالت: كان متاعي فيه خف، وكان على جمل ناج....

Abu Yala and Abu Al- Sheikh Ibn Hayan have narrated this narration from Aeshe with good document " my luggage was lighter and it was on a speedy camel...

Al-Salehi Al-Shami, Muhammad Ben Yusef (died in 942 hejira), Sabal Al-Hoda Al-Reshad Fi Sirat Kheir Al-Ebad, v 11 p 182, Researched by: Adel Ahmad Abd Al-Mojud, Ali Muhammad Moavez, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut, First Edition, 1414 Hejira

Analyzing the narration:

Whatever this narration with valid document proves is " Aeshe, the wife of the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants)hesitated about the prophecy of Hazrat Muhammad and said to him harshly

«أألسنت تزعم أنك رسول الله؟»

Aren't you the same person that claims is the prophet of God?

This matter was as unpleasant as her father, Abu Bakr, angry as much as he invaded Aeshe and slapped on her face.

We would like to ask the Sunni scientists " what is the rule of hesitating about the prophecy of the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants), especially the women that is his wife and lived with him for many years.

In addition, according to this narration, Aeshe hesitated about the justice of the messenger of God and accused the prophet of God as an unfair person.

If the messenger of God is not fair, who can perform justice?

If someone else accused the messenger of God as an unfair person, what would the Sunni scientists judge about him or her?

It has been said in this narration that Aeshe refused to mention the name of Safie and interpreted her as a Jewish Woman.

Hadn't Aeshe heard this verse of the Quran?

وَلَا تَنَابَزُوا بِاللِّقَابِ بِنَسِ الْإِسْمِ الْفُسُوقِ بَعْدَ الْإِيمَانِ وَمَنْ لَمْ يَتُبْ فَأُولَئِكَ هُمُ الظَّالِمُونَ

Al-Hojorat/ 11

Nor defame nor be sarcastic to each other, nor call each other by (offensive) nicknames: Ill-seeming is a name connoting wickedness, (to be used of one) after he has believed: And those who do not desist are (indeed) doing wrong.

Does the Islam spoil all of good records of a person?

If someone else had insulted one of wives of the messenger of God, what would the Sunni scientists have judged about him or her?

The harsh talk of Aeshe with the messenger of God:

Abu Taleb Maki, one of Sunni scientists in the third century, has written in the book " Ghut Al-Gholub"

وقالت له مرة في كلام غضبت عنده : أنت الذي تزعم أنك نبي؟ فتبسم رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم حليماً وكرماً، وكان رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم يقول لعا نثشة رضي الله عنها : إني لأعرف غضبك من رضاك قالت : وكيف تعرف ذلك؟ قال : **إن رضيت قلت : لا وإله محمد وإذا غضبت قلت : لا وإله إبراهيم** قالت: صدقت إنما أهجر اسمك.

Aeshe that had been angry said to the messenger of God " who are you that imagine that is the prophet of God? The messenger of God smiled in her answer since he was a patient and merciful person. The messenger of God said to Aeshe " I recognize your sadness from your satisfaction". Aeshe said " how did you do that?" the messenger of God bade " when you are satisfied, you say " I never swear the God of Muhammad", but when you are angry, you say " I never swear the God of Ibrahim". Aeshe said " you are right as you said and there is nothing more to refuse to mention your name".

Al-Harethi, Muhammad Ben Ali Ben Atiye known as Abi Taleb Al-Maleki (died in 286 hejira),Ghovat Al-Gholub Fi Moamelat Al-Mahbub va Vasf Tarigh Al-Morid Ela Magham Al-Tohid, v 2 p 418, Researched by: D. Asem Ebrahim Al-Kiyali, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut, Lebanon, Second Edition, 1426 Hejira- 2005

Ghazi Shafei, one of other Sunni dignitaries, has narrated this matter in this way

وقالت له مرة وقد غضبت: أنت الذي تزعم أنك نبي الله؟ فتبسم رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم واحتمل ذلك حليماً وكرماً، وكان يقول لها إني لأعرف إذا كنت عني راضية وإذا كنت علي غضبي قالت: وكيف تعرف ذلك؟ قال: إذا رضيت قلت لا وإله محمد وإذا غضبت قلت لا وإله إبراهيم.

Aeshe that had been angry said to the messenger of God " who are you that imagine that is the prophet of God? The messenger of God smiled in her answer since he was a patient and merciful person.

Sometimes, the messenger of God said to Aeshe " I recognize your sadness from your satisfaction". Aeshe said " how did you do that?"

The messenger of God bade " when you are satisfied, you say " I never swear the God of Muhammad", but when you are angry, you say " I never swear the God of Ibrahim".

Al-ghazi Al-Shafei, Abu Al-Barakat Badr Al-Din Muhammad Ben Muhammad (died in 984 hejira), Al-Marah Fi Al-Mezah, v 1 p 108, Researched by: Basam Abd Al-Vahab Al-Jabi, Published by: Dar Ibn Hazam, Beirut, First Edition, 1418 Hejira-1977

Analyzing the narration:

In addition to proving the hesitation of Aeshe about the prophecy of the prophet, this narration also proves that Aeshe, the wife of the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) became angry of the messenger of God and angered him which even she refused to mention the sacred name of Hazrat Muhammad.

The prophet whose remarks and behaviors were according to revelation and God introduced as a great creation.

Is it appropriate for the wife of the messenger of God and a person that lived with Hazrat Muhammad for years behave with the prophet in such a way?

if someone asks the Sunni scientists about the rule of anger to the prophet of God, what will they answer?

The objection of Aeshe to this matter'' why do you like Ali and Fateme more than my father and I?

There are narrations in the Sunni sources with valid document that Aeshe, the wife of the messenger of God talked to Hazrat Muhammad with high voice because the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) liked Amir Momenan (peace be upon him) more than Aeshe and her father.

Ahmad Ben Hanbel has written in his book " Mosnad"

حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو نُعَيْمٍ حَدَّثَنَا يُونُسُ حَدَّثَنَا الْعِيزَارُ بْنُ حُرَيْثٍ قَالَ قَالَ النُّعْمَانُ بْنُ بَشِيرٍ قَالَ اسْتَأْذَنَ أَبُو بَكْرٍ عَلَى رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ فَسَمِعَ صَوْتَ عَائِشَةَ عَالِيًا وَهِيَ تَقُولُ وَاللَّهِ لَقَدْ عَرَفْتُ أَنَّ عَلِيًّا أَحَبُّ إِلَيْكَ مِنْ أَبِي وَمَنِّي مَرَّتَيْنِ أَوْ ثَلَاثًا فَاسْتَأْذَنَ أَبُو بَكْرٍ فَدَخَلَ فَأَهْوَى إِلَيْهَا فَقَالَ يَا بِنْتَ فُلَانَةَ أَلَا أَسْمَعُكَ تَرْفَعِينَ صَوْتَكِ عَلَى رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ.

Naman Ben Beshir has narrated that on one of days, when Abu Bakr wanted to get permission to visit the prophet (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants), he heard Aeshe screaming. I swear God that I understood that Imam Ali (peace be upon him) more beloved than my father and me for you and she repeated it two or three times.

After Abu Bakr entered the house, he invaded Aeshe and said " I never hear you raise your voice and scream over the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants).

Al-Sheibani, Ahmad Ben Hanbal Abu Abdullah (died in 241 hejira), Mosnad Ahmad Ben Hanbal, v 4 p 275, h 18444, Published by: Ghartabat Institute, Egypt

Harsh objection of Abu Bakr toward Aeshe:

Nesae has narrated that Abu Bakr invaded Aeshe and he wanted to slap on his face

أخبرني عبدة بن عبد الرحيم المروزي قال أخبرنا عمرو بن محمد قال أخبرنا يونس بن أبي إسحاق عن العيزار بن حريث عن النعمان بن بشير قال استأذن أبو بكر على النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم فسمع صوت عائشة عاليا وهي تقول والله لقد علمت أن عليا أحب إليك من أبي فأهوى إليها أب و بكر ليلطمها وقال يا ابنة فلانة أراك ترفعين صوتك على رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم فأمسكه رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم وخرج أبو بكر مغضبا

Naman Ben Beshir has narrated that on one of days, when Abu Bakr wanted to get permission to visit the prophet (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants), he heard Aeshe screaming. I swear God that I understood that Imam Ali (peace be upon him) more beloved than my father and me for you.

Abu Bakr invaded his daughter, Aeshe, to slap on her face and said to her " O' daughter! I see you screaming over the messenger of God. The messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) prevented Abu Bakr

from slapping on her face. Therefore, Abu Bakr got angry and left the house.

Al-Nesai, Abu Abd Al-Rahman Ahmad Ben Shoaib Ben Ali (died in 303 hejira), Khasaes Amir Al-Momenin Ali Ben Abi Taleb, v 1 p 126, Researched by: Ahmad Mirin Al-Balushi, Published by: Maktab Al-Moala, Kuwait, First Edition, 1406 Hejira

The validity of the document of the narration:

Ibn Hajar Asghalani has said about this narration

واخرج أحمد وأبو داود والنسائي بسند صحيح عن النعمان بن بشير قال استأذن أبو بكر على النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم فسمع صوت عائشة عاليا وهي تقول والله لقد علمت ان عليا احب إليك من أبي الحديث.

Ahmad, Abu Davud and Nasaei have narrated from Naman Ben Bashir with valid document that Abu Bakr wanted to get permission to enter...

Al-Asghalani Al-Shafei, Ahmad Ben Ali Ben Hajar Abu Al-Fazl (died in 852 hejira), Fatah Al-Bari Sharh Sahih Al-Bokhari, v 7 p 27, Researched by: Moheb Al-Din Al-Khatib, Published by: Dar Al-Marefat, Beirut

Heisami has said after narrating this narration

رواه البزار ورجاله رجال الصحيح.

Al-Heithami, Abu Al-Hasan Ali Ben Abibakr (died in 807 hejira), Majma Al-Zavaed Manba Al-Favaed, v 9 p 127, Published by: Dar Al-Riyan Leltorath/ Dar Al-Kotob Al-Arabi, Cairo, Beirut, 1407 Hejira

Other Sunni scientists and Mohadesan have narrated this narration and we will mention their addresses.

Al-Tahavi Al-Hanafi, Abu Jafar Ahmad Ben Muhammad Ben Salamat (died in 321 hejira), Sharh Moshkel Al-Athar, v 13 p 334, Researched by: Shoaib Al-Arnawt, Published by: Resalat Institute, Lebanon, Beirut, First Edition, 1408 Hejira- 1987

Abu Al-Hossein Abd Al-Baghi Ben Ghane (died in 351 hejira), Moajem Al-Sahabe, v 3 p 144, Researched by: Salah Ben Salem Al-Mesrati, Published by: Maktab Al-ghoraba Al-Athriye, Medina, First Edition, 1418 Hejira

Abu Al-Mahasen Al-Hanafi, Yusef Ben Musa (died in 803 hejira), Al-Motaser Min Al-Mokhtasar Min Moshkel Al-Athar, v 2 p 355, Published by: Alam Al-Kotob/ Maktab Al-Motenabi/ Maktab Sad Al-Din, Beirut, Cairo, Damascus

Al-Manavi, Muhammad Abd Al-Rauf Ben Ali Ben Zein Al-Abedin (died in 1031 hejira), Feiz Al-Ghadir Sharh Al-Jame Al-Saghir, v 1 p 168, Published by: Al-Maktab Al-Tejariye Al-Kobra, Egypt, First Edition, 1356 Hejira

Distortion of narrations by the Sunni scientists:

Ahmad Ben Hanbal in other books, Abu Davud Sajastani in the book " Sonan" and other Sunni scientists have mentioned the story of screams of Aeshe over the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants). But unfortunately, they have omitted the sentence

«لقد علمت ان عليا احب إليك من أبي»

That demonstrates the reason of sadness of Aeshe.

Al-Sheibani, Ahmad Ben Hanbal Abu Abdullah (died in 241 hejira), Mosnad Ahmad Ben Hanbal, v 4 p 271, h 18418, Published by: Ghartabat Institute, Egypt

Al-Sajestani Al-Azadi, Soleiman Ben Al-Ashath Abu Davood (died in 275 hejira), Sonan Abi Davood, v 4 p 300, h 4999, Researched by: Muhammad Mohai Al-Din Abd Al-Hamid, Published by: Dar Al-Fekr

Al-Jazari, Al-Mobarak Ben Muhammad Ibn Al-Athir (died in 544 hejira), Moajem Jame Al-Osul Fi Ahadith Al-Rasul, v 6 p 497, according to the software of Jamat Al-Kabir

Al-Ashbili Al-Azadi, Abu Muhammad Abd Al-Hagh Ben Abd Al-Rahman Ben Abdullah (known as Ibn Al-Kharat), (died in 581 hejira), Al-Ahkam Al-Shariyat Al-Kobra, v 3 p 166, Researched by: Abu Abdullah Hossein Ben Akashe, Published by: Maktab Al-Roshd, Saudi Arabia/ Riyadh, First Edition, 1422 Hejira- 2001

Ibn Kathir Al-Dameshghi, Esmaeel Ben Omar Abu Al-Feda Al-Gharashi (died in 774 hejira), Al-Badayat Al-Nahayat, v 6 p 46, Published by: Maktab Al-Maaref, Beirut

Al-ghazi Al-Shafei, Abu Al-Barakat Badr Al-Din Muhammad Ben Muhammad (died in 984 hejira), Al-Marah Fi Al-Mezah, v 1 p 47, Researched by: Basam

Abd Al-Vahab Al-Jabi, Published by: Dar Ibn Hazam, Beirut, First Edition, 1418 Hejira-1977

Al-Tabrizi, Muhammad Ben Abdullah Al-Khatib (died in 9999 hejira), Meshkat Al-Masabih, v 3 p 1370, Researched by: Muhammad Naser Al-Din Al-Albani, Published by: Al-Maktab Al-Eslami, Beirut, Third Edition, 1985

Questions that the Sunni scientists should answer:

According to the narrations with valid document, Aeshe talked to Hazrat Muhammad with high voice and harshly. On the other hand, God has bade in the Quran

يَا أَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ ءَامَنُوا لَا تَرْفَعُوا أَصْوَاتَكُمْ فَوْقَ صَوْتِ النَّبِيِّ وَلَا تَجْهَرُوا لَهُ بِالْقَوْلِ كَجَهْرِ بَعْضِكُمْ لِبَعْضٍ أَن تَحْبَطَ أَعْمَالِكُمْ وَأَنتُمْ لَا تَشْعُرُونَ.

O ye who believe! Raise not your voices above the voice of the Prophet, nor speak aloud to him in talk, as ye may speak aloud to one another, lest your deeds become vain and ye perceive not.

Al-Hojorat/ 2

Our question is from the Sunni scientists and dignitaries " is high voice of Aeshe in line to this sacred verse? Aren't only the companions allowed to talk with high voice or the wives of Hazrat Muhammad are not allowed to talk with high voice as well?

We expect that the Sunni scientists and intellectuals present their analysis from the presented narrations and the answer of the presented questions with logic and reason and in a satisfied way.