

Is the story of preventing Abu Bakr and Umar from sermonizing by Imam Hasan and Imam Hussein (peace be upon him) valid?

The group of Imamate and caliphate

This question has been come up by: Alireza

Answer:

Narrations with valid document have been narrated that Imam Hasan went to the mosque in the time of Abu Bakr and he made him leave the pulpit when he was sermonizing.

In addition, other narrations with valid document have been narrated that express that this story happened in relation to Imam Hussein (peace be upon him) in the time of Umar Ben Al-Khetab

Preventing Abu Bakr from sermonizing:

Almae Balazeri has written in the book " Ansab Al-Ashraf"

وحدثني عبد الله بن صالح عن حماد بن سلمة عن هشام بن عروة عن عروة قال: خطب أبو بكر يوماً فجاء الحسن فقال: انزل عن منبر أبي. فقال علي: ليس هذا عن ملأ منا.

One day, Abu Bakr was sermonizing, Imam Hasan (peace be upon him) came and bade " leave my pulpit". Imam Ali (peace be upon him) said " we did not order him to this action".

Al-Balazeri, Ahmad Ben Yahya Ben Jaber (died in 279 hejira), Ansab Al-Ashraf , v 1 p 383, according to the software of Jamat Al-Kabir

Analyzing the document of the narration:

Abdullah Ben Saleh:

عبد الله بن صالح بن مسلم العجلي ثقة من التاسعة.

Abdullah Ben Saleh was reliable and he was from the ninth rank of Rvat.

Al-Asghalani Al-Shafei, Ahmad Ben Ali Ben Hajar Abu Al-Fazl (died in 852 hejira), Taghrib Al-Tahzib, v 1 p 308, no 3389, Researched by: Muhammad Ovame, Published by: Dar Al-Rashid, Syria, First Edition, 1406- 1986

Hemad Ben Salame:

حماد بن سلمة بن دينار الإمام أبو سلمة أحد الأعلام...

Hemad Ben Salame was Imam and one of notables.

Al-Zahabi Al-Shafei, Shams Al-Din Abu Abdullah Muhammad Ben Ahmad Ben Osman (died in 748 hejira), Al-Kashef Fi Marefat Min Lah Ravayat Fi Al-Kotob Al-Sonat, v 1 p 349, no 1220, Researched by: Muhammad Ovame, Published by: Dar Al-Gheble Lel Thaghafe Al-Eslamiye, Olov Institute, Jadde, First Edition; 1413 Hejira- 1992

Hesham Ben Arve:

هشام بن عروة أبو المنذر وقيل أبو عبد الله القرشي أحد الأعلام ... قال أبو حاتم ثقة إمام في

الحديث.

Hesham Ben Arve is one of notables of science. Abu Hatam has said " he was reliable and was Imam in the science of Hadith.

Al-Kashef, v 2 p 337, 5972

Arve Ben Zobeir:

عروة بن الزبير أبو عبد الله ق.. قال بن سعد كان فقيها عالما كثير الحديث ثبتا مأمونا.

Ibn Sad has said " Urve Ben Zobeir was jurisprudent, scientist, a reliable person in narrating narration and a trustee person. He narrated a lot of narrations.

Al-Kashef, v 2 p 3772, 3775

Hence, the document of the narration is completely valid and its narrators from the Sunni narrators.

Ibn Juzi Hanafi in the book " Al-Montazam", Abu Saeid Abi in the book " Nasr Al-Dorer", Moheb Al-Din Tabari in the book " Al-Riyaz Al-Nazare" and Jalal Al-Din Siuti in the book " Jame Al-Ahadith" have written

حدثنا هشام بن عروة عن أبيه قال: قعد أبو بكر على منبر رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم فجاءه الحسن بن علي فصعد المنبر وقال أنزل عن منبر أبي فقال له أبو بكر منبر أبيك لا منبر أبي فقال علي رضي الله عنه وهو في ناحية القوم إن كانت لعن غير أمري.

When Abu Bakr had sat on the pulpit of the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants), Hussein Ben Ali (peace be upon him) came, assented the pulpit and bade " descend the pulpit of my father". Abu Bakr said " you are right; this is the pulpit of your father not the pulpit of my father. Imam Ali (peace be upon him) that had sat among people on a corner bade " this action was not according to my order".

Ibn Al-Jozi Al-Hanbali, Jamal Al-Din Abu Al-Faraj Abd Al-Rahman Ben Ali Ben Muhammad (died in 597 hejira), Al-Montazem Fi Tarikh Al-Moluk va Al-Omam, v 4 p 70, Published by: Dar Al-Sader, Beirut, First Edition, 1358

-Al-Abi, Abu Sad Mansur Ben Al-Hossein (died in 421 hejira), Nathr Al-Dor Fi Al-Mohazerat, v 1 p 227, Researched by: Khaled Abd Al-Ghani Mahfuz, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut/ Lebanon, First Edition, 1424 Hejira- 2004

-Al-Tabari, Abu Jafar Moheb Al-Din Ahmad Ben Abdullah Ben Muhammad (died in 694 hejira), Al-Riyaz Al-Nozerat Fi Managheb Al-Asharat, v 2 p 148, Researched by: Isa Abdullah Muhammad Mane Al-Hamiri, Published by: Dar Al-Gharb Al-Eslami, Beirut, First Edition,1996

-Al-Siuti, Jalal Al-Din Abd Al-Rahman Ben Abibakr (died in 911 hejira), Jame Al-Ahadith (Al-Jame Al-Saghir va Zavaed va Al-Jamae Al-Kabir), v 13 p 93, according to the software of Jamat Al-Kabir

Preventing Umar from sermonizing by Imam Hussein (peace be upon him):

حدثنا أبو مسلم حدثني أبي أحمد حدثنا سليمان بن حرب ثنا حماد بن زيد عن يحيى بن سعيد عن عبيد بن حنين عن حسين بن علي قال صعدت إلى عمر رضي الله عنه وهو على المنبر فقلت إ نزل عن منبر أبي واذهب إلى منبر أبيك قال من علمك هذا قلت ما علمني أحد قال منبر أبيك والله منبر أبيك والله وهل أنبت الشعر على رؤوسنا إلا أنتم جعلت تأتينا جعلت تغشانا.

It has been narrated from Hussein Ben Ali (peace be upon him) " I descended the pulpit when Umar was sermonizing I said to him " descended the pulpit of my father and ascend the pulpit of your father". U mar said "who has taught you

this remark? " I said " no one has taught me". Umar said " it is the pulpit of your father. I swear God that it is the pulpit of your father. Is there anybody else except you, that has grown hair on our head? How decent it is you come and see us!

Al-Ajali, Abi Al-Hasan Ahmad Ben Abdullah Ben Saleh (died in 261 hejira), Marefat Al-Thaghat Min Rejal Ahl Al-Elm Al-Hadith Min Al-Zoafa va Zakara Mazahebehom va Akhbarehom, v 1 p 301, no 310, Researched by: Abd Al-Alim Abd Al-Azim Al-Bastavi, Published by: Maktab Al-Dar, Medina, Saudi Arabia , First Edition, 1405- 1985

It is interesting that Umar claims

وهل أنبت الشعر على رؤوسنا إلا أنتم

Is there anybody else except you, that has grown hair on our head?

It has been said in a narration that Zahabi and others have narrated

وهل أنبت على رؤوسنا الشعر إلا الله ثم أنتم.

Isn't it right God has grown hair on our head and then you have fostered it?

Al-Zahabi Al-Shafei, Shams Al-Din Abu Abdullah Muhammad Ben Ahmad Ben Osman (died in 748 hejira), Seir Alam Al-Nobala, v 3 p 285, Researched by: Shoaib Al-Arnawt, Muhammad Naeem Al-Araghsusi, Published by: Resalat Institute, Beirut, Ninth Edition, 1413 Hejira

This means the acceptance of the incipient guardianship of Ahle Beit (peace be upon them) by Umar Ben Al-Khatab.

The guardianship of the messenger of God and Ahle Beit include two types:

First: the inner, spiritual and natural guardianship that is a favor from God and its necessity is mediation in the incipient blessings of God and possession and guardianship in the worldly affairs.

Ayatollah Javadi Amoli has written about the incipient guardianship

The incipient guardianship means the guardianship of the creatures of the world and the word beyond sight such as the guardianship of human soul over the inner forces. Each person has guardianship over understanding forces such as fancy forces and his provocative forces such as lust and anger. He also has

guardianship over body parts. If he orders his eyes to see, his eyes will obey it and if he orders his ears to hear, his ears will obey it. And if he orders his hands to pick up something, his hands will obey it. Of course, accepting these orders happens when there is no problem in these body parts. The incipient guardianship refers to cause and effect. This kind of guardianship happens only between cause and effect.

Javadi Amoli, Abdullah, Velayat Faghih, p 123, Published by: Markaz Nashr Asra

This kind of guardianship is a God favor; it is not Tashrie and it is always left to the guardian of God and it is from its effects.

Second, the Tashrie unknown general guardianship is a God rank and it is left to a person in the time of his life and its effects include the necessity of obey, attestation to the deeds and beliefs of God human and ...

Saying this sentence and attributing the growth of hair to the will of God and Ahle Beit (peace be upon them), the second caliph proves that there is no doubt about the first kind of guardianship that is same incipient guardianship and intermediate in mercy, let alone to Tashrie guardianship.

Analyzing the document of the narration:

Abu Moslem Al-Hasan Ben Ahmad:

الحسن بن أحمد بن أبي شعيب الحراني... ثقة.

Hussein Ben Ahmad is reliable.

Al-Kashef, v 1 p 321, no 1009

Ahmad Ben Abdullah:

أحمد بن عبد الله بن أبي شعيب مسلم الحراني أبو الحسن مولى قريش ثقة.

Ahmad Ben Abdullah is reliable.

Taghrib Al-Tahzib, v 1 p 81, no 57

Soleiman Bem Harab:

سليمان بن حرب الإمام أبو أيوب الواشحي البصري قاضي مكة... قال أبو حاتم إمام من الأئمة لا يدلّس ويتكلم في الرجال وفي الفقه.

Imam Soleiman Ben Harb was the judge of Mecca and Abu Hatam has said " he was one of leaders that never cheated (try for demonstrating the validity of the weak narrations) and he owned valuable beliefs in the science of Rejal and jurisprudence.

Al-Kashef, v 1 p 458, no 2079

Hemad Ben Zeid:

حماد بن زيد بن درهم الإمام أبو إسماعيل الأزدي الأزرق أحد الأعلام... قال ابن مهدي ما رأيت أحدا لم يكتب أحفظ منه وما رأيت بالبصرة أفقه منه ولم أر أعلم بالسنة منه.

Imam Hemad Ben Zeid was one of notables of science. Ibn Mehdi has said " I did not see any one not write it and she or he be better than him in memorizing them. In addition, I did not see a person more aware than him about the tradition.

Al-Kasef, v 1 p 349, no 1219

Yahya Ben Saeid:

يحيى بن سعيد بن قيس بن عمرو الإمام أبو سعيد الأنصاري قاضي السفاح... حافظ فقيه حجة.

Imam Yahya Ben Saeid was a scientist and Hafez and his remark was reason.

Al-Kashef, v 2 p 366, no 6176

Ubeid Ben Hanin:

عبيد بن حنين... وثقه بن سعد.

Ibn Sad has Tosik Ubeid Ben Hanin.

Al-Kashef , v 1 p 689, no 3613

Shams Al-Din Zahabi in the book " Seir Alam Al-Nobla" and the book " the history of the Islam" have narrated this narration and have said

إسناده صحيح.

Al-Zahabi Al-Shafei, Shams Al-Din Abu Abdullah Muhammad Ben Ahmad Ben Osman (died in 748 hejira), Seir Alam Al-Nobala, v 3 p 285, Researched by: Shoaib Al-Arnawt, Muhammad Naeem Al-Araghsusi, Published by: Resalat Institute, Beirut, Ninth Edition, 1413 Hejira

Al-Zahabi Al-Shafei, Shams Al-Din Abu Abdullah Muhammad Ben Ahmad Ben Osman (died in 748 hejira), Tarikh Al-Eslam Vafiyat Al-Mashahir Al-Alam, v 5 p 100, Researched by: D. Omar Abd Al-Salam Tedmari, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Arabi, Lebanon/ Beirut, First Edition, 1407 Hejira-1987

Al-Namiri Al-Basari, Abu Zeid Omar Ben Shabat (died in 262 hejira), Tarikh Medina, v 2 p 11 hadith 1358, 1359, Researched by: Ali Muhammad Dandal and Yasin Sad Al-Din Bayan, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut, 1417 Hejira- 1996

After narrating this narration, Ibn Hajar Asghalani has said

إسناده صحيح.

Al-Asghalani Al-Shafei, Ahmad Ben Ali Ben Hajar Abu Al-Fazl (died in 852 hejira), Al-Esabat Fi Tamiz Al-Sahabe, v 2 p 78, Researched by: Ali Muhammad Al-Bajavi, Published by: Dar Al-Jeil, Beirut, First Edition, 1412 Hejira-1992

Jalal Al-Din Siuti has narrated this narration with with another document from Ibn Asaker ahd has said

إسناده صحيح.

Al-Siuti, Jalal Al-Din Abd Al-Rahman Ben Abibakr (died in 911 hejira), Tarikh Al-Kholafa, v 1 p 143, Researched by: Muhammad Mohei Al-Din Abd Al-Hamid, Published by: Matbaat Al-Saadat, Egypt, First Edition, 1371 Hejira-1952

Ibn Shebhe Namiri in the book " Tarikh Madine", Aslam Vaseti in the book " history", Dar Ghatani in the book " Fazael Al-Sahabe", Ibn Asaker Shafei in the book " the history of Median and Damascus , Ibn Abi Jarade in the book " Baghie Al-Tolob, Mezi in the book " Tahzib Al-Kamal" , Ibn Hajar Asghalani in the book s" Tahzib Al-Kamal" and " Al-Mataleb Al-Alie", Shams Al-Din Sakhavi in the book " Al-Tohfe Al-Latife" , Jalal Siuti in the book " Jame Al-Ahadith" and ... have narrated this story.

Al-Namiri Al-Basari, Abu Zeid Omar Ben Shabat (died in 262 hejira), Tarikh Medina, v 2 p 11 hadith 1358, 1359, Researched by: Ali Muhammad Dandal and Yasin Sad Al-Din Bayan, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut, 1417 Hejira- 1996

-Al-Vaseti, Aslam Ben Sahl Al-Razaz (died in 292 hejira), Tarikh Vaset, v 1 p 203, Researched by: Korkis Ovad, Published by: Alam Al-Kotob, Beirut, First Edition; 1406 hejira

-Al-Dar Ghatani Al-Baghdadi, Abu Al-Hasan Ali Ben Omar Ben Ahmad Ben Mahdi (died in 385 hejira), Fazaal Al-Sahabe Leldar Ghatani, v 1 p 11, according to the software of Jamat Al-Kabir

-Ibn Asaker Al-Dameshghi Al-Shafei, Abi Al-Ghasem Ali Ben Al-Hasan, Ibn Habatollah Ben Abdullah (died in 571 hejira), Tarikh Medina Damascus va Zakara Fazloha va Tasmiyat Min Haleha Min Al-Amathel, v 14 p 175, v 30 p 307, Researched by: Moheb Al-Din Abi Saeed Omar Ben Gharama Al-Omari, Published by: Dar Al-Fekr, Beirut, 1995

-Ibn Abi Jarade, Kamal Al-Din Omar Ben Ahmad (died in 660 hejira), Baghiyat Al-Talab Fi Tarikh Halab, v 6 p 2584, 2585, Researched by: D. Soheil Zokar, Published by: Dar Al-Fekr

-Al-Mazi, Yusef Ben Zaki Abd Al-Rahman Abu Al-Hojaj (died in 742 hejira), Tahzib Al-Kamal, v 6 p 404, Researched by: D. Bashar Ovad Maruf , Published by: Resalat Institute, Beirut, First Edition; 1400 hejira- 1980

- Al-Asghalani Al-Shafei, Ahmad Ben Ali Ben Hajar Abu Al-Fazl (died in 852 hejira), Tahzib Al-Tahzib , v 2 p 300, Published by: Dar Al-Fekr, Beirut, First Edition, 1404- 1984

- Al-Asghalani Al-Shafei, Ahmad Ben Ali Ben Hajar Abu Al-Fazl (died in 852 hejira), Al-Mataleb Al-Aliye Be Zavaed Al-Masanid Al-Thamaniye, v 15 p 760, Researched by: D. Sad Ben Naser Ben Abd Al-Aziz Al-Shatari, Published by: Dar Al-Aseme / Dar Al-Gheith, First Edition, Saudi Arabia , 1419 Hejira

-Al-Sakhavi, Shams Al-Din Muhammad Ben Abd Al-Rahman (died in 902 hejira), Al-Tohfat Al-Latifat Fi Tarikh Al-Medina Al-Sharifat, v 1 p 295, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut, First Edition, 1414 Hejira- 1993

-Al-Siuti, Jalal Al-Din Abd Al-Rahman Ben Abibakr (died in 911 hejira), Jame Al-Ahadith (Al-Jame Al-Saghir va Zavaed va Al-Jamae Al-Kabir), v 13 p 442, according to the software of Jamat Al-Kabir

- Al-Baghdadi, Ahmad Ben Ali Abubakr Al-Khatib (died in 463 hejira), Tarikh Baghdad, v 1 p 141, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut

What these narrations prove is that Ahle Beit (peace be upon them) have not accepted the legitimacy of caliphate of Sheikhin and they have considered themselves deserved for that rank.

In spite of the disagreement of Ahle Beit (peace be upon them), are there any doubts left in lack of legitimacy of caliphate of Sheikhin the same as the persons that God attested to their purity and his messenger has equalized them with with the Quran?

Good luck

Group answering doubts

Research centre of Hazrat ValiAsr