

IN THE NAME OF ALLAH, THE COMPASSIONATE
THE MERCIFUL

HAS THE HOLY PROPHET OF GOD BEEN BURIED IN THE ROOM OF AYESHAH?

THE BOARD OF NABOVAT (THE PROPHECY)

A QUESTION BY; SAEED SAJAD

THE BRIEF RESPONSE

1, there are disagreements pertaining to the buried place of the holy prophet of GOD (peace and bless of GOD be upon him and his progeny)

2, the Sunnites believe that the holy prophet of GOD has been buried in the room of Ayeshah

3, but some of the Shiite researchers believe that with respect to the Sunnite authentic proofs and documents from their books what is certain that His Holiness was not buried in the room of Ayeshah and in this direction they present a proof which will be discussed in the detailed response section

4, an amazing debate which has been occurred between Fazzal the pupil of Imam Sadeq's school of thought with Abu Hanifah and in that debate it has been referred to the unlawful buried place of Abu Bakr and Omar

THE DETAILED RESPONSE

There are disagreements pertaining to the buried place of the holy prophet of GOD (peace and bless of GOD be upon him and his progeny)

1, the Sunnite standpoint

What is popular among the Sunnites is this point that His Holiness has been buried in the room of Ayeshah and make reference to the quotation

from Ayesah which narrated by Bokhari in order to prove their own claim that;

قَالَتْ عَائِشَةُ لَمَّا ثَقُلَ النَّبِيُّ ﷺ - صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ - وَاشْتَدَّ وَجَعُهُ اسْتَأْذَنَ
أَزْوَاجَهُ أَنْ يُمَرَّضَ فِي بَيْتِي فَأُذِنَ لَهُ ، فَخَرَجَ بَيْنَ رَجُلَيْنِ تَخَطُّ رِجْلَاهُ الْأَرْضَ ، وَكَانَ بَيْنَ
الْعَبَّاسِ وَرَجُلٍ آخَرَ . قَالَ عُبَيْدُ اللَّهِ فَذَكَرْتُ ذَلِكَ لِابْنِ عَبَّاسٍ مَا قَالَتْ عَائِشَةُ فَقَالَ لِي
وَهَلْ تَدْرِي مَنْ الرَّجُلُ الَّذِي لَمْ تُسَمِّ عَائِشَةُ قُلْتُ لَا . قَالَ هُوَ عَلِيُّ بْنُ أَبِي طَالِبٍ .

-Sahih Al-Bokhari, v 1 p 162, hadith 665

And when the holy prophet of GOD (peace and bless of GOD be upon him and his progeny) felt sick and his pain increased then His Holiness asked his own other wives to let him to stay in my house and they accepted that and then His Holiness left there while he put his hands of the shoulder of Abbass and the other man and his legs were moving on the ground

Abd Allah Ibn Abbass says that; when I quoted the narration of Ayeshah to Ibn Abbass then he said to me do you know the man that Ayehsah did not say his name? I said; No he responded; he was Ali Ibn Abi Taleb

Of course Bokhari has quoted this point in some cases in his own book Sahih which all of them have been quoted from Ayeshah and in order to prove his own claim mentioned some other points that we can figure out some paradoxes among these statements which cause to weaken this narration but it goes beyond our discussion here

And in this point it is worth-mentioning that from this narration we can find out that Ayeshah was reluctant to mention the name of the commander of the faithful Ali Ibn Abi Taleb (peace be upon them) as Ahmad Ibn Hanbal quoted that

هُوَ عَلِيٌّ وَلَكِنَّ عَائِشَةَ لَا تَطِيبُ لَهُ نَفْسًا .

That man (that has not been referred to his name in the narration of Ayeshah) is Ali Ibn Abi Taleb that Ayeshah was not willing to mention His Holiness's name

-Mosnad Ahmad Hanbal, v 6 p 228

And also Ibn Sad has mentioned in the book Tabaqat that

هو علي ، إن عائشة لا تطيب له نفسا بخير .

That man (that has not been referred to his name in the narration of Ayeshah) is Ali Ibn Abi Taleb that Ayeshah was not willing to mention His Holiness's name in a good manner

-Al-Tabaghat Al-Kobra, v 2 p 232

2, The Shiites viewpoint

The view of some of the Shiites researchers is that the holy prophet of GOD was not buried in the room of Ayeshah since

At first; in each time when it has been said that; Bayt Al-Nabi (the house of the prophet), Hojrat Al-Nabi (the room of the prophet) and Dar Al-Nabi (the house of the prophet) the real intent is His Holiness special house and room unless it has to be said with respect to the name of one of His Holiness' wives such as the house of Ayeshah or the house of Ome Salamah and the others

أَنَّ النَّبِيَّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ كَانَ يُصَلِّي ذَاتَ لَيْلَةٍ فِي حُجْرَتِهِ فَجَاءَ أَنَسٌ
فَصَلَّوْا بِصَلَاتِهِ فَخَفَّفَ فَدَخَلَ السَّنَةَ

One night the holy prophet of GOD was praying in his own Hojrah (room) and some men came and began to perform the prayer behind His Holiness and for this reason the holy prophet of GOD performed his prayer more quickly and went into his house

-Mosnad Ahmad, v 3 p 103, hadith 11567

عن ربيعة بن كعب الأسلمي : كنت أست عند حجرة النبي فكنت أسمعه إذا
قام من الليل يقول : سبحان الله رب العالمين .

Rabiah says that; I spent a night in the room of the holy prophet of GOD

-Sonan Al-Nesai, v 3 p 209

Secondly; the nearest house to the house of the holy prophet of GOD (peace and bless of GOD be upon him and his progeny) was His Holiness Imam Ali's house (peace be upon him) that its door was beside the door of the house of the holy prophet of GOD (peace and bless of GOD be upon him and his progeny)

جاء رجل إلى ابن عمر فسأله عن عثمان ... ثُمَّ سَأَلَهُ عَنْ عَلِيٍّ ، فَذَكَرَ
مَحَاسِينَ عَمَلِهِ قَالَ هُوَ ذَاكَ ، بَيْتُهُ أَوْسَطُ بُيُوتِ النَّبِيِّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ - . ثُمَّ
قَالَ لَعَلَّ ذَاكَ يَسُوؤُكَ . قَالَ أَجَلٌ . قَالَ فَأَرُغَمَ اللَّهُ بِأَنْفِكَ ، أَنْطَلِقُ فَاجْهَدْ عَلَيَّ جَهْدَكَ .

A man came to Ibn Omar and asked about Othman and then asked him pertaining to Ali and he talked about the virtues and the good deeds of His Holiness and added that; the house of Ali was the nearest house to the holy prophet of GOD's house and asked him; maybe you do not like this point and he said; Yes, then he said that; it is the truth even you dislike that

-Sahih Bokhari, v 4 p 208, hadith 3704

رواية العلاء بن عيزار قال : سألت ابن عمر عن علي . فقال : انظر الي منزله
من نبي الله ليس في المسجد غير بيته .

Ala Ibn Ayzar says that; I asked the son of Omar pertaining to Ali and he said that; look at the house of Ali and see that there is no house near to the house of the holy prophet of GOD than that house

-Fatah Al-Bari, v 7 p 59

ثُمَّ قَالَ إِلا أَحَدْتُكَ عَنْ عَلِيٍّ ؟ هَذَا بَيْتُ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ فِي الْمَسْجِدِ وَهَذَا بَيْتُ
عَلِيٍّ .

-Mostadrak Hakem Neishaburi, v 3 p 51

Thus we reach to this conclusion that the house of His Holiness Ali (peace be upon him) and Her Holiness Fatima (peace be upon her) was the nearest house to the house of the holy prophet of GOD (peace and bless of GOD be upon him and his progeny) and of course there was a single room in the house of the holy prophet of GOD (peace and bless of GOD be upon him and his progeny) for Her holiness Fatima (peace be upon her) which is still remained with Her name in Masjed Al-Nabi until now

Thirdly; with referral to the Sunnite sources the demise of the holy prophet of GOD has occurred in his personal room and in His Holiness' house

In the narration of Omar it has been mentioned pertaining to the place of demise of the holy prophet of GOD

فبينما نحن في منزل رسول الله إذا رجل ينادي من وراء الجدار أن أخرج إليّ يا ابن الخطاب . . . فإن الأنصار اجتمعوا في سقيفة بني ساعدة ، فأدركوهم قبل أن يحدثوا أمرا . . .

While we were in the house of the holy prophet then a man called His Holiness from behind the wall of the house; O Omar Ibn Khatab get outside, that Ansars (the people of Medina) have gathered in Saqifah Bani Saedah and join them before any event happens

-Fath Al-Bari, v 7 p 23, Tarikh Damascus, v 30 p 282, va Fi Ravayat Ibn Haban, v 2 p 155

Fourthly; the acknowledgment of Ayeshah pertaining to the point that implies in the demise of the holy prophet of GOD in other place except the hous of Ayeshah

« لقد نزلت آية الرجم ورضاعة الكبير عشرا ولقد كانت في صحيفة تحت سريري ، فلما مات رسول الله وتشاغلنا بموته دخل داجن فأكلها ! »

The verse of Rajm and Riza pertaining to the ten times of lactation have been revealed and I kept that on a piece of a paper under my bed but in the day in which we were busy to the burial ceremony of the holy prophet of GOD then a sheep entered the house and ate that

-Sonan Ibn Maje, v 1 p 625, Aowsat Al-Tabarani, v 8 p 12, Mosnad Abi Yali, v 8 p 64, Al-Mahali, v 11 p 236, va Ghal: Haza Hadith Sahih, va Fi Lisan Al-Arab, v 7 p 33, Nahayat Ibn Al-Athir, v 2 p 87

And we can realize from the above-mentioned text that if the sickness and the demise of the holy prophet of GOD have occurred in the room of Ayeshah then it was not possible that in the day that the room was full of the people a sheep entered the house and ate that piece of paper

Fifthly; different texts imply in this point that the room of the holy prophet of GOD had two doors and when the Moslems wanted to perform prayer over the blessing and pure body of the holy prophet of GOD they entered from

one door and exited from the other door in groups while it will be evident in the next reason the house of Ayesah had only one door and that door was not in the direction of the special house of the holy prophet of GOD

قَالُوا كَيْفَ نُصَلِّيَ عَلَيْهِ قَالَ ادْخُلُوا أَرْسَالَ أَرْسَالَ قَالَ فَكَانُوا يَدْخُلُونَ مِنْ هَذَا
الْبَابِ فَيُصَلُّونَ عَلَيْهِ ثُمَّ يَخْرُجُونَ مِنَ الْبَابِ الْآخَرَ .

And when the holy prophet of GOD passed away some men said that; how should we perform prayer over His Holiness' body? And in response they said that; in groups we should enter from this door and exit from the other door

-Mosnad Ahmad, v 5 p 81, hadith 19838, Tarikh Damascus, v 4 p 296, Asad Al-Ghabat, v 5 p 254

Haytahmi says after the quotation of the narration that

ورجاله رجال الصحيح .

And the narrators of this saying are authentic ones

-Majma Al-Zavaed, v 9 p 37

Sixth; the room of Ayesah had one door in the contrary to the house of the holy prophet of GOD and that door was in the direction of Sham (Syria) and its door was that direction as well (it means it was situated in the south direction of the mosque and in the direction of Qeblah that its door was opened toward the mosque

فسألته عن بيت عائشة فقال : كان بابه من وجهة الشام فقلت : مصراعا
كان أو مصراعين ؟ قال : كان بابا واحدا . قلت : من أي شيء كان ؟ قال : من عرعر
أو ساج .

I asked him pertaining to the house of Ayesah and he said that; it had only one door and it was in the direction of Sham

-Al-Adab Al-Mofrad lel Bokhari, p 168, Emta Al-Asma, v 10 p 92, Sabal Al-Hoda, v 3 p 349, Samt Al-Nojum Al-Avali, p 218

We can reach to some further points from the above sentence that

A, that section of the narration that says I asked about the place of the house of Ayesah implies in this point that the man who asked that

question was certain that the house of Ayesha was not the place that they know today, as the buried place of the holy prophet of GOD thus he has asked about the house of Ayesha

B, it can be evident from the narration that the direction of Sham of that mosque is the same as the north direction of the mosque

Seventh; the point that has been quoted from Anas Ibn Malek the servant of the holy prophet of GOD by Bokhari, Ahmad and Tabaqat and in which they have described the party and the food in the house of the holy prophet of GOD was concerned with the marriage ceremony of His holiness with Zaynab the daughter of Jahash and we can conclude from that the distance of the ceremony in the special house of the holy prophet of GOD and the house of Ayesha was a considerable distance and the house of Ayesha was situated outside of the mosque and after eating meal the holy prophet of GOD went to the house of Ayesha and then his Holiness found out that some of the guests were stayed and slept in the house of the holy prophet of GOD and for this reason His Holiness came back from the door of the house of Ayesha to the door of His Holiness' personal house and at this time the verse Hejab (the cover) revealed that O the believers, when you have invited to the house of the holy prophet of GOD for party then after eating food leave His Holiness house and return to your house

فَمَشَى رَسُولُ اللَّهِ - صلى الله عليه وسلم - وَمَشَيْتُ مَعَهُ حَتَّى جَاءَ عَتَبَةَ حُجْرَةَ عَائِشَةَ ، ثُمَّ ظَنَّ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ - صلى الله عليه وسلم - أَنَّهُمْ خَرَجُوا فَرَجَعَ وَرَجَعْتُ مَعَهُ ، حَتَّى دَخَلَ عَلَى زَيْنَبَ فَإِذَا هُمْ جُلُوسٌ لَمْ يَتَفَوَّقُوا ، فَرَجَعَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ - صلى الله عليه وسلم - وَرَجَعْتُ مَعَهُ ، حَتَّى بَلَغَ عَتَبَةَ حُجْرَةَ عَائِشَةَ ، فَظَنَّ أَنَّ قَدْ خَرَجُوا ، فَرَجَعَ وَرَجَعْتُ مَعَهُ ، فَإِذَا هُمْ قَدْ خَرَجُوا ، فَأَنْزَلَ آيَةَ الْحِجَابِ ، فَضَرَبَ بَيْنِي وَبَيْنَهُ سِتْرًا

Thus the holy prophet of GOD (peace and bless of GOD be upon him and his progeny) went and I went along with him until we reached to the door of the house of Ayesha

-Sahih Bokhari, v 6 p 26, hadith 6238, Mosnad Ahmad, v 3 p 168, Al-Tabaghat Al-Kobra, v 8 p 104

Eighth; Ayeshah sold her house to Moavia after the demise of the holy prophet of GOD then the house in which the holy prophet of GOD was buried cannot be the same house of Ayeshah since it has been sold

واشترى (معاوية) من عائشة منزلها ، يقولون بمائة وثمانين ألف درهم

ويقال بمائتي ألف درهم وشرط لها سكنها حياتها

Moavia has bought the house of Ayeshah with 180,000 Drachma and some has said with 200,000 Drachma with this condition that Ayeshah remains in that house until the end of her life

-Al-Tabaghat Al-Kobra, v 8 p 165

THE CONCLUSION OF THIS VIEW

The conclusion is that house of the holy prophet of GOD which has been mentioned in the above texts is the same room in His Holiness' house and he passed away in that house and it means that later as the government dominated over Masjed Al-Nabi then it has been controlled by the government as well not to allow Bani Hashem to announce their own aims via that house rather than the daughter of the leader of the government (Ayeshah) has claimed ownership and domination over the room of the holy prophet of GOD and the government accepted her claim as well and they cut the hands of the daughter of the holy prophet of GOD and His Holiness Ali (peace be upon him) off from that while the room of Ayeshah was in her personal house and in other direction namely the direction of Qeblah of the mosque

And the real reason of the silence of the commander of the faithful Ali Ibn Abi Taleb (peace be upon him) and Ahl Al-Bayt (peace be upon them) was not to encourage people against the government pertaining to this case which is as the same as the stance has been taken pertaining to the issue of the Caliphate and government by them that means, the order of being patient from the holy prophet of GOD until the day of the reappearance of their Qaem son Hojat Ibn Al-Hasan (peace be upon him) and unveil what they have done to his pure and sacred ancestors

THE DEBATE OF FAZZAL WITH ABU HANIFAH

Maybe one of the most subtle and as well as the most comprehensive comments pertaining to the subject in hand have been mentioned in the below debate and argument between Fazzal one of the pupils of Imam Sadeq's school of thought and Abu Hanifah and in which it has been referred to the unlawful buried places of Omar and Abu Bakr in the most amazing manner

وروي : أنه مر فضال بن الحسن بن فضال الكوفي بأبي حنيفة وهو في جمع كثير ، يملئ عليهم شيئا من فقهه وحديثه .
فقال - لصاحب كان معه - : والله لا أبرح حتى أخجل أبا حنيفة . فقال صاحبه الذي كان معه : إن أبا حنيفة ممن قد علت حاله ، وظهرت حجته .
قال : صه ! هل رأيت حجة ضال علت علي حجة مؤمن ؟ ! ثم دنا منه فسلم عليه ، فرد القوم السلام بأجمعهم .
فقال : يا أبا حنيفة أن أبا لي يقول : أن خير الناس بعد رسول الله علي بن أبي طالب عليه السلام ، وأنا أقول أبو بكر خير الناس وبعده عمر فما تقول أنت رحمك الله ؟
فأطرق مليا ثم رفع رأسه فقال : كفى بمكانهما من رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله كرما وفخرا ، أما علمت أنهما ضجيعاه في قبره ، فأبي حجة تريد أوضح من هذا ؟ فقال له فضال : إني قد قلت ذلك لأخي فقال : والله لئن كان الموضع لرسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله دونهما فقد ظلما بدفنهما في موضع ليس لهما حق فيه ، وإن كان الموضع لهما فوهباه لرسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله لقد أساءا وما أحسنا ، إذ رجعا في هبتهما ، ونسيا عهدهما .
فأطرق أبو حنيفة ساعة ثم قال له : لم يكن له ولا لهما خاصة ، ولكنهما نظرا في حق عايشة وحفصة فاستحقا الدفن في ذلك الموضع بحقوق ابنتيهما .
فقال له فضال : قد قلت له ذلك فقال : أنت تعلم أن النبي مات عن تسع نساء ، ونظرنا فإذا لكل واحدة منهن تسع الثمن ، ثم نظرنا في تسع الثمن فإذا هو

شبر في شبر ، فكيف يستحق الرجلان أكثر من ذلك ، وبعد فما بال عائشة وحفصة
ترثان رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله وفاطمة بنته تمنع الميراث ؟ !
فقال أبو حنيفة : يا قوم نحوه عني فإنه رافضي خبيث .

One day Fazzal Ibn Hasan Fazzal Kufi encountered to Abu Hanifah with one of his companions while too many men from his own pupils in Feqh an the narration were surrounded him and Fazzal said to his companion that I swear to GOD that I will not let him go unless I will go to him and cause him to feel shameful and his friend said to him that; you know Abu Hanifah and you are informed of his eminent and honorable scientific position and his ability in reasoning

Fazzal said ; be silent, have you ever seen that the false reasoning of a misled man can overcome and dominate the right reasoning of a faithful one? Then Fazzal went forward and said hello and the present people responded his greetings together and Fazzal turned to Abu Hanifah and said that; Allah may be pleased with you I have a brother that say; the best of the people after the holy prophet of GOD (peace and bless of GOD be upon him and his progeny) is Ali Ibn Abi Taleb (peace be upon him) but I say to him it is not true rather the best man after the holy prophet of GOD (peace and bless of GOD be upon him and his progeny) is Abu Bakr and after him is Omar so what is your opinion? Abu Hanifah thought for a while and then raised his head and said that; say to him it is sufficient for those two men pertaining to the dignity, honor and precedence of Abu Bakr and Omar who have been buried beside the tomb of the holy prophet of GOD (peace and bless of GOD be upon him and his progeny) while Ali Ibn Abi Taleb was buried hundreds of miles away from that in Najaf and is not it the clear mark and better reason of the superiority and precedence of those two over Ali?

Fazzal said that; I said to him the same point but in response he said to me that; I swear to GOD that if you set forth the buried place of them beside the tomb of the holy prophet of GOD to prove their precedence and dignity then I have to say that they have done injustice to the holy prophet of GOD (peace and bless of GOD be upon him and his progeny) as a result of their

buried place in which they have not had any right indeed, since if that place was belonged to Abu Bakr and Omar and they have granted that to the holy prophet of GOD as a gift then they have done an evil deed due to his buried place since they have took the gift which has been granted to His Holiness and possessed it again and this is in fact, a sort of breaking the promise and contract

Abu Hanifah once again became silent for a while and dropped his head and then said; say to your brother,

This place neither belong to those two nor to the holy prophet of GOD rather than with respect to the right of Hafasah and Ayesah they were buried there

Fazzal said to Abu Hanifah that I have said the same thing to my brother but in response he said that; you know that when the holy prophet of GOD (peace and bless of GOD be upon him and his progeny) passed away and te wives were not the owner of this house while each of those women received by inheritance only one eighth from this place thus only some centimeters of this house will be inherited to them now how these two women have usurped and occupied these additional places?

And from the other side what has happened that Fatima Zahra (peace be upon her) the daughter of the holy prophet of GOD (peace and bless of GOD be upon him and his progeny) does not inherit from his father? And Abu Bakr with this false excuse that the holy apostles of GOD do not leave any legacy he prevented Her Holiness Fatima Zahra (peace be upon her) from Fadak but Ayesah and Hafsah who were His Holiness' wives received by inheritance

Abu Hanifah said to his companions as he heard these comments that keep him away from me since he is a wicked Rafezi

-Al-Fosul Al-Mokhtar, Seyed Morteza, p 74, Kanz Al-Favaed, Abu Al-Fotuh Karajaki, p 135, Ehtejaj Tabarsi, v 2 p 149,

GOOD LUCK

THE BOARD OF ADDRESSING THE RELIGIOUS DOUBTS

THE RESEARCH INSTITUTE OF HIS HOLINESS IMAM OF THE AGE
(MAY GOD PRECIPITATE HIS BLESSING REAPPEARANCE)