

IN THE NAME OF ALLAH, THE COMPASSIONATE
THE MERCIFUL

In what sources the narration “ if Ali (peace be upon him) was not then Omar would be destroyed” has been mentioned?

THE BOARD OF IMAM ALI (PEACE BE UPON HIM)

A QUESTION BY; ALI KEKHA

RESPONSE

This statement which has been frequently said by the second Qaliph Omar Ibn Khatab in various occasions and cases pertaining to His Holiness the commander of the faithful (peace be upon him) and at first we are going to quote its proofs in the Shiite books and then we mention these cases from the Sunnite authentic sources in order to be acceptable for the Sunnites as well

“ if Ali was not...” in the Shiite sources

“ if Ali was not...” in the Sunnite sources

The stories of mentioning of this point by Omar

1 . قال أحمد ابن زهير حدثنا عبيد الله بن عمر القواريري حدثنا مؤمل بن إسماعيل حدثنا سفيان الثوري عن يحيى بن سعيد عن سعيد بن المسيب قال كان عمر يتعوذ بالله من معضلة ليس لها أبو الحسن وقال في المجنونة التي أمر برجمها وفي التي وضعت لسنة أشهر فأراد عمر رجمها فؤال له على إن الله تعالى يقول وحملة وفصاله ثلاثون شهرا الحديث وقال له إن الله رفع القلم عن المجنون الحديث فكان عمر يقول **لولا على لهلك عمر.**

-Taghrib Al-Tahzib, Ibn Hajar, v 1 p 364

And about a crazy woman that Omar ordered to stone him to death and pertaining to a woman that her child was born 6 months and then Omar intended to stone her to death then His Holiness Ali (peace be upon him) said that; in fact Allah the Almighty states that; the pregnancy and lactation of a woman is 30 months and also said that; indeed Allah the Almighty has excluded the crazy one from religious duties then Omar said that; if Ali was not then Omar has been destroyed

THE PROOF OF THE NARRATION

Saeed Ibn Mosayeb (one of the narrators of Sahih Bokhari)

سعيد بن المسيب ... أحد العلماء الأثبات الفقهاء الكبار من كبار الثانية اتفقوا على أن مرسلاته أصح المراسيل وقال ابن المديني لا أعلم في التابعين أوسع علما منه.

-Taghrib Al-Tahzib, Ibn Hajar, v 1 p 364

Yahya Ibn Saeed (one of the narrators of Sahih Bokhari)

يحيى بن سعيد بن قيس بن عمرو ، الإمام أبو سعيد الأنصاري ، قاضي السفاح ، عن أنس ، وابن المسيب ، وعنه مالك ، والقطان ، **حافظ** **فقيه حجة** ، مات 143

-Al-Kashef Fi Marefat Min Lah Ravayat Fi Kotob Al-Sonat, Al-Zahabi, v 2 p 366

يحيى بن سعيد بن قيس الأنصاري المدني أبو سعيد القاضي ثقة ثبت ، من الخامسة مات سنة أربع وأربعين أو بعدها / ع .

-Taghrib Al-Tahzib, Ibn Hajar, v 2 p 303

3 Sofyan Thuri (one of the narrators of Sahih Bokhari)

وقال شعبة ، وسفيان بن عيينة ، وأبو عاصم النبيل ، ويحيى بن معين ، وغير واحد من العلماء : **سفيان أمير المؤمنين في الحديث** .

-Tahzib Al-Kamal, Al-Mazi, v 11 p 165

4, Mumel Ibn Esmaeil (one of the narrators of Sahih Bokhari)

مؤمل بن إسماعيل البصري العمري مولاهم ... قال أبو حاتم : **صدوق** شديد في السنة كثير الخطأ ... مات 206 . ت س ق .

-Al-Kashef Fi Marefat Min Lah Ravayat Fi Kotob Al-Sonat, Al-Zahabi, v 2 p 309

6, Ahmad Ibn Zohayr

احمد بن زهير بن حرب بن شداد ... **الحافظ الكبير** ابن الحافظ ... قال الخطيب كان ثقة عالما متقنا حافظا بصيرا بأيام الناس وأئمة الأدب .

-Lesan Al-Mizan , Ibn Hajar, v 1 p 174

Therefore this narration is an authentic saying according to the Sunnite Rejal rules

2 . ان رجلا اتى به إلى عمر كأن قال : في جوابهم لما سألوه كيف أصبحت قال : أصبحت أحب الفتنة ، وأكره الحق ، واصدق اليهود والنصارى ، وأمن بما لم أره وأقر بما لم يخلق ، فأرسل عمر إلى علي (ع) فلما جاء أخبره بما قال الرجل فقال : صدق قال الله تعالى : إنما أموالكم وأولادكم فتنة ، ويكره الحق يعني الموت ، قال الله تعالى وجائت سكرة الموت بالحق ، وصدق الي هود والنصارى قال الله تعالى : وقالت اليهود ليست النصارى على شيء وقالت النصارى ليست اليهود على شيء ، ويؤمن بما لم يره يعني الله ، ويقر بما لم يخلق يعني الساعة فقال عمر : **لولا علي لهلك عمر** .

One day a man came to Omar, and in response to this question which has been asked from him that how did you spend the night? he said that; I spent the night while I liked conspiracies and I disliked the truths and I accepted Jews and Christians and I believed in something which I have not seen that and I acknowledged to something which has not been created then Omar sent to His Holiness (peace be upon him) and when His Holiness came then he informed them of the comments have been mentioned by that man and said he is right since Allah the Almighty states that; indeed your children and property are temptation and he dislikes the truths namely death which is a fact since Allah the Almighty states that; and the difficulties of death really come and he admitted Jews and Christians and Allah the Almighty states that; and Jews say that Christians are nothing and Christians say that Jews are nothing and he believes in something who has not seen that namely Allah the Almighty and he acknowledges to something which has not been created namely Saah (the Judgment day) then Omar said that; if Ali was not then Omar has been destroyed

Qazi Azzad Al-Din Aji one of the Sunnite famous scholars in discourse science has quoted and admitted this narration in the book Kalami Movaqef in order to present the reasons of the scientific superiority of His Holiness Ali (peace be upon him) among the companions of the holy prophet of GOD (peace and bless of GOD be upon him and his progeny)

3 . وروى أن امرأة أتت بولد لستة أشهر من وقت النكاح في زمان عمر رضي الله عنه فهم عمر برجمها ، فقال علي رضي الله عنه لا سبيل لك عليها ، وتلا قوله تعالى : * (وحمله وفصاله ثلاثون شهرا) فقال عمر : **لولا علي لهلك عمر** .

It has been quoted that a woman gave birth to her child 6 months after his own marriage in the age of Omar and Omar ordered to stone her to death then His Holiness Ali (peace be upon him) stated that; you are not allowed to this and then His Holiness recited this holy verse that (the pregnancy and lactation will be 30 months) then Omar said that; if Ali was not then Omar has been destroyed

Kharazmi has mentioned the comment of Omar in a more complete manner after the quotation of this story

عجزت النساء أن تلدن مثل علي بن أبي طالب ، لولا علي لهلك عمر

The women are not able to give birth to a man like Ali Ibn Abi Taleb and if Ali was not then Omar has been destroyed

I take refuge to Allah the Almighty from any problem

In most of the cases the second Qaliph has used another statement which is interesting and he takes refuge to Allah the Almighty that a problem arises and His Holiness Ali (peace be upon him) was not present to solve the problem

Ibn Hojr Asqalani writes in the Fath Al-Bari that;

وفي كتاب النوادر للحميدي والطبقات لمحمد بن سعد من رواية سعيد بن المسيب قال كان عمر يتعوذ بالله من معضلة ليس لها أبو الحسن يعني علي بن أبي طالب
وقال أحمد بن زهير حدثنا أبي قال حدثنا ابن عيينة عن ابن جريح عن ابن أبي ملكية عن ابن عباس قال قال عمر علي أقضانا قال أحمد ابن زهير حدثنا عبيد الله بن عمر القواريري حدثنا مؤمل بن إسماعيل حدثنا سفيان الثوري عن يحيى بن سعيد عن سعيد بن المسيب قال كان عمر يتعوذ بالله من معضلة ليس لها أبو الحسن.

And also in the other sources such as;

GOOD LUCK

THE BOARD OF ADDRESSING THE RELIGIOUS DOUBTS

THE RESEARCH INSTITUTE OF HIS HOLINESS IMAM OF THE AGE

(MAY GOD PRECIPITATE HIS REAPPEARANCE)