

Why did Fateme Zahra (peace be upon her) open the door in spite of the presence of Hazrat Ali (peace be upon him)?

The group of the opinions of the Shias

Doubt

How can we believe that Hazrat Fateme opened the door of house in spite of the presence of Imam Ali (peace be upon him) in the house? why didn't Hazrat Ali (peace be upon him) open the door?

Criticism and analysis

First: what can be understood from these narrations includes: Hazrat Fateme had sat around the entrance door and seeing Umar and his companions, he closed the door to them.

Deceased Ayashi in the book " interpretation", Sheikh Mofid in the book " Al-Ekhtesas" and ... have written

قال: قال عمر قوموا بنا إليه فقام أبو بكر وعمر وعثمان وخالد بن الوليد و المغيرة بن شعبة وأبو عبيدة بن الجراح وسالم مولى أبي حذيفة وقنفذ وقمت معهم فلما انتهينا إلى الباب فرأتهم فاطمة صلوات الله عليها أغلقت الباب في وجوههم وهي لا تشك أن لا يدخل عليها إلا باذنها، فضرب عمر الباب برجله فكسره، وكان من سعف، ثم دخلوا فأخرجوا عليا (عليه السلام) ملبياً....

Umar said " stand up in order to visit Ali. Then Abu Bakr, Umar, Usman, Khaled Ben Valid, Moghayere Ben Shoabe, Abu Ubeid Jarah, Salem Mola Abu Hazife, Ghanfaz, and I accompanied him. When we approached around the house, Fateme saw them; hence, she closed the door because she was sure that they would enter without permission. Umar broke the door that was made of the branches of dates. Then he entered the house and brought Ali out of house as they were ready to fight with him.

Al-Samarghandi Known as Al-Ayashi, Abi Al-Nazr Muhammad Ben Masud Ben Ayash Al-Salami (died in 320 hejira), Tafsir Al-Ayashi, v 2 p 67, Researched by: Al-Seyed Hashem Al-Rasuli Al-Mahalati, Published by: Al-Maktab al-Elmiye Al-Eslamiye, Tehran

Al-Sheikh Mofid, Muhammad Ben Muhammad Ben Al-Naman Ibn Al-Moalem
Abi Abdullah Al-Akbari, Al-Baghdadi (died in 413 hejira), Al-Ekhtesas, p 186,
Researched by: Ali Akbar Al-Ghafari, Al-Seyed Mahmud Al-Zarandi,
Published by: Dar Al-Mofid lel Tabaat va Al-Nashr Al-Tozi, Beirut, Second
Edition, 1414 hejira- 1993

Al-Majlesi, Muhammad Bagher (died in 1111 hejira), Bahar Al-Anvar, v 28 p
227, Researched by: Muhammad Al-Bagher Al-Behbudi, Published by: Vafa
Institute, Beirut, Lebanon, Second Edition, Al-Mosahahat, 1403- 1983

It has been narrated in the narration " Salim"

ثُمَّ أَقْبَلَ حَتَّى انْتَهَى إِلَى بَابِ عَلِيٍّ وَفَاطِمَةَ عَلَيْهِمَا السَّلَامَ قَاعِدَةً خَلْفَ الْبَابِ قَدْ عَصَبَتْ رَأْسَهَا
وَنَحَلَ جِسْمَهَا فِي وَقَاةِ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ فَأَقْبَلَ عُمَرُ حَتَّى ضَرَبَ الْبَابَ ثُمَّ نَادَى يَا ابْنَ أَبِي
طَالِبٍ [افْتَحِ الْبَابَ] فَقَالَتْ فَاطِمَةُ يَا عُمَرُ مَا لَنَا وَلَكَ لَا تَدْعُنَا وَمَا نَحْنُ فِيهِ قَالَ افْتَحِي الْبَابَ وَإِلَّا أُحْرَقْنَا
عَلَيْكُمْ فَقَالَتْ يَا عُمَرُ أَمَا تَتَّقِي اللَّهَ عَزَّ وَجَلَّ تَدْخُلُ عَلَى بَيْتِي وَتَهْجُمُ عَلَى دَارِي فَأَبَى أَنْ يَنْصَرِفَ ثُمَّ دَعَا
عُمَرُ بِالنَّارِ فَأَضْرَمَهَا فِي الْبَابِ فَأَحْرَقَ الْبَابَ.

Umar came around the house. Fateme had sat behind the door and had
covered her head and her body had become emaciated because of pain of losing
her father. Umar knocked the door and said " O' the son of Abu Taleb! Open the
door. Fateme bade "O' Umar! what is your job with us? Leave us alone with the
plight we are suffering from. Umar said " open the door; otherwise, I will fire it.
Fateme bade " aren't you afraid of God which enters our house?". Umar did not
come back and requested fire and put the fire in the front of the house and
burned it.

Al-Helali, Salim Ben Gheis (died in 80 hejira), Ketab Salim Ben Gheis, p 864,
Researched by: Muhammad Bagher Al-Ansari, Published by: Hadi Publication,
Qom, First Edition, 1405 hejira

Second: Hazrat Sedighe was sure that they would not enter the house without permission because the Quran recommends human not enter the house of others without permission

يَا أَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ ءَامَنُوا لَا تَدْخُلُوا بُيُوتًا غَيْرَ بُيُوتِكُمْ حَتَّى تَسْتَأْذِنُوا وَتُسَلِّمُوا عَلَىٰ أَهْلِهَا ذَٰلِكُمْ خَيْرٌ لَّكُمْ لَعَلَّكُمْ تَذَكَّرُونَ.
فَإِن لَّمْ تَجِدُوا فِيهَا أَحَدًا فَلَا تَدْخُلُوهَا حَتَّىٰ يُؤْذَنَ لَكُمْ وَإِن قِيلَ لَكُمُ ارْجِعُوا فَارْجِعُوا هُوَ أَزْكَىٰ لَكُمْ وَاللَّهُ بِمَا تَعْمَلُونَ عَلِيمٌ

Al-Nur/ 27, 28

O ye who believe! enter not houses other than your own, until ye have asked permission and saluted those in them: that is best for you, in order that ye may heed (what is seemly).

If ye find no one in the house, enter not until permission is given to you: if ye are asked to go back, go back: that makes for greater purity for yourselves: and Allah knows well all that ye do.

The house of Fateme better than the house of the prophets:

The house of the prophets has special respect which no one has right to enter without permission

يَا أَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ ءَامَنُوا لَا تَدْخُلُوا بُيُوتَ النَّبِيِّ إِلَّا أَنْ يُؤْذَنَ لَكُمْ

Al-Ahzab/ 53

O ye who believe! Enter not the Prophet's houses,- until leave is given you

There is no doubt that the house of Sedighe Tahere is considered the house of the prophet as it can be seen in the Sunni different interpretations according to the following sacred verse

فِي بُيُوتِ أَذْنِ اللَّهِ أَنْ تُرْفَعَ وَيُذْكَرَ فِيهَا اسْمُهُ يُسَبِّحُ لَهُ فِيهَا بِالْغُدُوِّ وَالْآصَالِ

Al-Nur/ 36

(Lit is such a Light) in houses, which Allah hath permitted to be raised to honor; for the celebration, in them, of His name: In them is He glorified in the mornings and in the evenings, (again and again)

Siuoti and others have narrated from Abu Bakr that the prophet (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) has narrated the house of Ali and Zahra (peace be upon him) is considered one of the most virtuous houses of the prophets.

وأخرج ابن مردويه عن أنس بن مالك وبريدة قال: قرأ رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم هذه الآية (في بيوت أذن الله أن ترفع) فقام إليه رجل فقال: أي بيوت هذه يا رسول الله قال: بيوت الأنبياء . فقام إليه أبو بكر فقال: يا رسول الله هذا البيت منها - البيت علي وفاطمة - قال: نعم من أفاضلها.

The messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) recited this verse; someone asked " what houses are these?" the prophet bade " the houses of the prophets".Abubakr asked " are the house of Ali and the house of Fatem those houses? " He bade " yes, they are the best ones".

Al-Siuti, Abd Al-Rahman Ben Al-Kamal Jalal Al-Din (died in 911 hejira), Al-Dor Al-Manthur, v 6 p 203, Published by: Dar Al-Fekr, Beirut, 1993

Al-Thalabi Al-Neishaburi Abu Eshagh Ahmad Ben Muhammad Ben Ebrahim (died in 427 hejir), Al-Kashf Al-Bayan (died in 427 hejira- 1032), v 7 p 107, Researched by: Al-Emam Abi Muhammad Ben Ashur, Al-Astaz Nazir Al-Saedi, Published by: Dar Ehya Al-Torath Al-Arabi, Beirut, First Edition, 1422 hejira, 2002

Al-Thaalabi, Abd Al-Rahman Ben Muhammad Ben MakhluF (died in 875 hejira), Al-Javaher Al-Hesan Fi Tafsir Al-Quran, v 7 p 107, Published by: Al-Alami lel Matbuat Institute, Beirut

Al-Alusi Al-Baghdadi, Al-Alame Abi Al-Fazl Shahab Al-Din Al-Syed Mahmud (died in 1270 hejira), Ruh Al-Maani Fi Tafsir Al-Quran Al-Azim Al-Sabaa Al-Mathani, v 18 p 174, Published by: Dar Ehya Al-Torath Al-Arabi, Beirut

In addition, it was expected that seeing Hazrat Sedighe, the people shame and not object according to the situation of Hazrat Zahra (peace be upon her)

and the respect of the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) as some of them came back hearing the voice of Hazrat Sedighe.

قام عمر فمشى ومعه جماعة حتى أتوا باب فاطمة فدقوا الباب، فلما سمعت أصواتهم نادى بأعلى صوتها باكية: يا رسول الله ما ذا لقينا بعد أبي من ابن الخطاب وابن أبي قحافة! فلما سمع القوم صوتها وبكاءها انصرفوا باكين، فكادت قلوبهم تتصدع وأكبادهم تنفطر، وبقي عمر معه قوم.

Umar with some persons came toward the house of Fateme and knocked the door. Hearing the noise of the population, Fateme shouted loudly and with cry " O' I am suffering from some plights from the son of Khatab and the son of Abu Ghahafe after you. Hearing the cry of Fateme, a group pitied her and left there with cry. But Umar stayed there with another group.

Al-Dinvari, Abu Muhammad Abdullah Ben Moslem Ibn Ghotaibe (died in 276 hejira), Al-Emamat Al-Siyasat, v 1 p 16, Researched by: Khalil Al-Mansur, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut, 1418 hejira-1997, with Researched by: Shiri, v 1 p 37 and with Researched by: Zeini, v 1 p 24

Hence, seeing Umar and his companions, Hazrat Sedighe Tahere closed the door and stood around the door in the time of the invasion. He was not sure that they would invade the house with the presence of Imam Ali. The shameless invaders did not take care of respect of the house and the household. According the narration of Salman Farsi (may God be well pleased with him) " you did and you did not and you did not know what you did.

The wives of the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) and not opening the door for strangers

Analyzing the way of the prophet (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) about the discussed matter is the best reason to convict the persons that doubt because there different cases in the Shiite and Sunni books which the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) let his wives open the door to others (strangers).

a) Um Salame and opening the door for Imam Ali (peace be upon him)

عن علقمة عن عبد الله قال خرج رسول الله (صلى الله عليه وسلم) من بيت زينب بنت جحش وأتى بيت أم سلمة فكان يومها من رسول الله (صلى الله عليه وسلم) فلم يلبث أن جاء علي فدق الباب دقا خفيفا فانتبه النبي (صلى الله عليه وسلم) للدق وأنكرته أم سلمة فقال رسول الله (صلى الله عليه وسلم) قومي فافتحي له

The messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) left the house of Zeinab (the daughter of Jahesh) and entered the house of Um Salame. It was time for the prophet to go the house Um Salame on that day. The prophet was scarcely there; Ali knocked the door slowly. The messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) woke up and Um Salame did not answer. The prophet bade " get up and open the door...

Ibn Asaker Al-Dameshghi Al-Shafei, Abi Al-Ghasem Ali Ben Al-Hasan Ibn Habatollah Ben Abdullah (died in 571 hejira), Tarikh Medina Damascus va Zakara Fazloha Tasmiye Min Haleha Min Al-Amathel, v 42, p 470, Researched by: Moheb Al-din Abi Saeed Omar Ben Gharam Al-Omari, Published by: Dar Al-Fekr, Beirut, 1995

Al-Rafei Al-Ghazvini, Abd Al-Karim Ben Muhammad (died in 623 hejira), Al-Tadvin Fi Akhbar Ghazvin, v 1 p 89, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut, Researched by: Azizollah Al-Atari, 1987

b. Aeshe opened the door for Imam Ali (peace be upon him) according to the order of the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants):

وعن جعفر بن محمد الصادق عليه السلام عن أبيه عن آبائه عن علي عليه السلام قال : كنت أنا ورسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله في المسجد بعد أن صلى الفجر، ثم نهض ونهضت معه، وكان رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله إذا أراد أن يتجه إلى موضع أعلمني بذلك، وكان إذا أبطأ في ذلك الموضع صرت إليه لأعرف خبره، لأنه لا يتصابر قلبي على فراقه ساعة واحدة فقال لي : أنا متجه إلى بيت عائشة، فمضى صلى الله عليه وآله ومضيت إلى بيت فاطمة الزهراء عليها السلام فلم أزل مع الحسن والحسين فأنا وهي مسروران بهما، ثم إنني نهضت وسرت إلى باب عائشة، فطرقت الباب فقالت: من هذا؟ فقلت لها: أنا علي

فقلت: إن النبي راقد، فانصرفت، ثم قلت: النبي راقد وعائشة في الدار، فرجعت وطرقت الباب فقالت لي عائشة: من هذا؟ فقلت لها: أنا علي فقالت: إن النبي صلى الله عليه وآله على حاجة فانثنيتمستحييا من دق الباب، ووجدت في صدري ما لا أستطيع عليه صبورا، فرجعت مسرعا فدققت الباب دقا عنيفا، فقالت لي عائشة: من هذا؟ فقلت: أنا علي فسمعت رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله يقول: يا عائشة افتحي له الباب، ففتحت ودخلت....

I fulfilled the Morning Prayer with the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) and left the mosque with the prophet. He informed me of wherever he went and when he came back late, I looked for her so that I could know where he was because I could not tolerate being far from him. he bade " I am going the house of Aeshe. I went to Fateme and we were all happy with Hasan and Hussein. Then I went toward the house of Aeshe and knocked the door. She said " who are you?" I said " this is Ali". She said " the prophet is resting". I went and come back and knocked the door again. She said " who are you?" I said " this is Ali". She said "the prophet is doing something". I could not tolerate being far from the prophet. I knocked the door for the third time. Aeshe said " who are you?" I said " this is Ali". I heard that the messenger of God bade " O' Aeshe! Open the door". Aeshe opened the door and I entered.

Al-Tabarsi, Abi Mansur Ahmad Ben Ali Ben Abi Taleb (died in 548 hejira), Al-Ehtejaj, v 1 p 292, 293, Researched by: Al-Seyed Muhammad Bagher Al-Khorasan, Published by: Dar Al-Naman lel Tabaat va Al-Nashr, Al-Najaf Al-Ashraf, 1386- 1966

Al-Majlesi, Muhammad Bagher (died in 1111 hejira), Bahar Al-Anvar, v 38 p 348, Researched by: Muhammad Al-Bagher Al-Behbudi, Published by: Vafa Institute, Beirut, Lebanon, Second Edition, Al-Mosahahat, 1403- 1983

Whatever was said was a narration from the Shiite books and a narration from Sunni books that were mentioned as examples. Although the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) was at home, he let his

wives open the door for strangers. This demonstrates that this action (opening door for strangers) will be accepted following religious rules.

Aeshe and Umar sat at a cloth table.

According to the narration with valid document, the Sunni scientists have narrated in most of their books that the messengers of God let Umar sit at the same cloth table with him and Aeshe and even they have narrated " when they ate food from the same bowl, the hand of Aeshe touched the hand of Umar. Ibn Abi Shibe in the book " Al-Mosnef", Bokhari in the book " Adab Al-Mofrad", Ibn Abi Hatam and Ibn Kasir in the book " interpretation" and ...

عن مجاهد قال مر عمر برسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم وهو وعائشة وهما يأكلان حيسا فدعا
فوضع يده مع أيديهما فأصابت يده يد عائشة فقال أوه لو أطاع في هذه ووصواحبها ما رأتهن أعين.

The messenger of God and Aeshe were eating food. Umar entered and the prophet invited him to eat food with them. Umar came and put his hand in the middle of food dish. His hand touched the hand of Aeshe. He said " if you had obeyed me about the veil of your wives, no eye (strangers) would have seen them".

Ibn Abi Sheibe Al-Kufi, Abubakr Abdullah Ben Muhammad (died in 235 hejira), Al-Ketab Al-Mosnef Fi Al-Ahadith Al-Athar, v 6 p 358, Researched by: Kamal Yusef Al-Haot, Published by: Maktab Al-Roshd, Al-Riyadh, First Edition, 1409 hejira

Ibn Abi Hatam Al-Razi, Abd Al-Rahman Ben Muhammad Ben Edris, Tafsir Ibn Abi Hatam, v 10 p 3148, Researched by: Asad Muhammad Al-Tayeb, Published by: Al-Maktab Al-Asriye, Seida

Al-Bokhari Al-Jaafi, Muhammad Ben Esmaeel Abu Abdullah (died in 256 hejira), Al-Adab Al-Mofrad, v 1 p 362, Researched by: Muhammad Foad Abd Al-Baghi, Published by: Dar Al-Bashaer, Al-Eslamiye, Beirut, Third Edition, 1409 hejira- 1989

Al-Mazi, Yusef Ben Al-Zaki Abd Al-Rahman Abu Al-Hajaj (died in 742 hejira), Tahzib Al-Kamal, v 29, p 138, Researched by: D. Bashar Ovad Maruf, Published by: Resalat Institute, Beirut, First Edition, 1400 hejira- 1980

Al-Gharashi Al-Dameshghi, Esmaeel ben Omar Ben Kathir Abu Al-Feda (died in 774 hejira), Tafsir Al-Quran Al-Azim, v 3 p 506, Published by: Dar Al-Fekr, Beirut, 1401 hejira

Al-Asghalani Al-Shafei, Ahmad Ben Ali Ben Hajar Abu Al-Fazl (died in 852 hejira), Fatah Al-Bari Sharh Sahih Bokhari, v 8 p 531, Researched by: Moheb Al-Din Al-Khatib, Published by: Dar Al-Marefat, Beirut

After narrating this narration, Heithami says

رواه الطبراني في الأوسط ورجاله رجال الصحيح غير موسى بن أبي كثير وهو ثقة.

Tabarani has narrated this narration in the book " Osat". All of its narrators are the narrators of the book Sahih Bokhari apart from Musa Ben Kasir that is reliable.

Al-Heithami, Ali Ben Abibakr (died in 807 hejira), Majma Al-Zavaed Manba Al-Favaed, v 7 p 93, Published by: Dar Al-Riyan bel Torath/ Dar Al-Kotob Al-Arabi, Cairo, Beirut, 1407 hejira

Siuoti has said

وأخرج الطبراني بسند صحيح عن عائشة قالت كنت أكل مع النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم في قعب فمر عمر فدعاه فأكل فأصابته أصبعه أصبعي فقال أوه لو أطاع فيكن ما رأته عين.

Tabarani has narrated with valid document that Aeshe said " the messenger of God and I eat food at the same plate". Umar passed by there and the messenger of God invited him. When he was eating, his finger touched my finger. Umar said " if he had obeyed me about you, no eye (strangers) would have seen you".

Al-Siuti, Jalal Al-Din Abd Al-Rahman Ben Abibakr (died in 911 hejira), Le Bab Al-Noghul Fi Asbab Al-Nozul, v 1 p 178, Published by: Dar Ehya Al-Olum, Beirut

Since sitting with strangers at the same cloth table and eating food from the same plate will not have any faults for the wife of the messenger of God, being behind the door by the daughter of the prophet will not have any faults for the daughter of the prophet as well.

Conclusion

First, Sedighe Shahide did not go behind the door, but she stood around the door. Seeing Umar and his companions, she went into the house and closed the door. Hence, Hazrat Zahra (peace be upon her) had not gone behind the door which such problem happens;

Second, even if this matter had been true and the prophet had not gone to behind the door, this doubt would be removed because this event happened for the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) and the prophet ordered his wives to open the door.

Good luck

The group in the charge of answering the doubts

Research centre of Hazrat Valiasr