

# Did Umar Ben Al-Khatab wish to have the virtues of Amir Momenan (peace be upon him)?

The group of Imam Ali (peace be upon him)

This question has been come up by: Mehdi Shojaei

## Answer

Ahmad Ben Hanbel and other Sunni dignitaries have narrated this narration with different interpretations and different documents. In addition, the document of the narration of Ahmad Ben Hanbel and Tahavi is valid

1123 (978-) [1123] حَدَّثَنَا عَلِيُّ بْنُ طَيْفُورٍ، قَتْنَا فُتَيْبَةَ، نَا يَعْقُوبُ، عَنْ سُهَيْلِ بْنِ أَبِي صَالِحٍ،

عَنْ أَبِيهِ، أَنَّ عُمَرَ بْنَ الْخَطَّابِ، قَالَ:

«لَقَدْ أُوتِيَ عَلِيُّ بْنُ أَبِي طَالِبٍ ثَلَاثًا، لِأَنَّهُ أَكُونَ أُوتِيْتُهَا أَحَبُّ إِلَيَّ مِنْ إِعْطَاءِ حُمْرِ النَّعَمِ جَوَارُ

رَسُولِ اللَّهِ (ص) فِي الْمَسْجِدِ، وَالرَّايَةَ يَوْمَ خَيْبَرَ، وَالثَّلَاثَةَ نَسِيَهَا سُهَيْلٌ»

Umar Ben Khatab said " three advantages were attributed to Ali Ben Abi Taleb (peace be upon him); if I had such features, it would be better than having camels with red hair, being the vicinity of the prophet in the mosque and giving flag in the day of Khabir. But Sohei has forgotten the third one.

Al-Shibani, Abu Abdullah Ahmad IbnHanbal (died in 241 Hejira) Fazael Al-Sahabe v 2 p 659; researched by: D. Vasi Allah Muhammad Abbas; published by: Al-Resalat Institute; Beirut; First Edition; 1403 Hejira; 1983

Al-Tahavi Al-Hanafi, Abu Jafar Ahmad Ibn Muhammad IbnSalame (died in 321 Hejira) SharhMoshkel Al-Asar v 9 p 182-183; researched by: Shoeib Al-Arnwot; published by: Al-Resalat Institute; Lebanon; First Edition; 1408 Hejira; 1987

## Analyzing the document of the narration

### Ali Ben Tifur:

علي بن طيفور بن غالب أبو الحسن النسوي... وكان ثقة

Al-Baghdadi, Abubakr Ahmad Ibn Ali IbnSabet Al-Khatib (died in 463 Hejira)  
Tarikh Baghdad v 11 p 442; no 6344; Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie; Beirut

## Ghotaybe Ben Saeid Ben Jamil

From the narrators of Bokhari and Mosalam

قتيبة بن سعيد بن جميل بفتح الجيم بن طريف الثقفي أبو رجاء البغلاني ... ثقة ثبت من العاشرة

مات سنة أربعين عن تسعين سنة ع

Al-Asghalani Al-Shafei, Ahmad Ibn Ali IbnHajarAbulfazl (died in 852 Hejira)  
Taghrib Al-Tahzib v 1 p 454 no 5522; researched by: Muhammad Avame;  
published by: Dar Al-Rashid; Syria; First Edition; 1406 Hejira; 1986

## Yaghub Ben Abd Al-Rahman

From the narrators of Bokhari and Mosalam

يعقوب بن عبد الرحمن بن محمد بن عبد الله بن عبد القاري بتشديد التحتانية المدني نزيل

الإسكندرية حليف بني زهرة ثقة من الثامنة مات سنة إحدى وثمانين خ م د ت س

Taghrib Al-Tahzib v 1 p 608 no 7824

## Soheil Ben Zakvan

From the narrators of Bokhari and Mosalam

151 سهيل بن أبي صالح ذكوان السمان ع أحد العلماء الثقات وغيره أقوى منه وقد روى عنه

مالك قال البخاري سمعت عليا يقول كان قد مات له أخ فوجد عليه فنسي كثيرا من حديثه قال الحاكم قد

يجد المتبحر في الصنعة ما ذكره علي أخرجه مسلم في الأصول وفي الشواهد

Al-Zahabi Al-Shafei, Shams Al-Din Abu Abdullah Muhammad Ibn Ahmad Ibn  
Osman (died in 748 Hejira) ZekrAsma Min TakalamFihVaHovaMovasagh v 1 p

96; researched by: Muhammad Shakur Amrir Al-Mayadini ; published by: Maktabat Al-Menar; First Edition; 1406 Hejira

## Zakavan Abu Saleh

From the narrators of Bokhari and Mosalam

ذكوان أبو صالح السمان الزيات المدني ثقة ثبت وكان يجلب الزيت إلى الكوفة من الثالثة مات

سنة إحدى ومائة ع

Taghrib Al-Tahzib v 1 p 203 no 1841

Consequently, the document of this narration is valid and there is no fault in it.

It has been said in this narration that Soheil has forgotten the third virtue. However, this narration with another document has been narrated from him and it narrates the third virtue, the marriage of Amir Momenan (peace be upon him) with Sedighe Tahere (peace be upon her).

Tahavi has written in the book " the explanation of Moshkel Al-Asar"

(3047)- [ 3551 ] كَمَا قَدْ حَدَّثَنَا إِبْرَاهِيمُ بْنُ مَرْزُوقٍ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا رَوْحُ بْنُ أَسْلَمَ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ جَعْفَرٍ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا سُهَيْلُ بْنُ أَبِي صَالِحٍ، عَنْ أَبِيهِ، عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ، رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ، قَالَ: قَالَ عُمَرُ بْنُ الْخَطَّابِ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ: " لَقَدْ أُعْطِيَ عَلِيُّ بْنُ أَبِي طَالِبٍ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ خِصَالًا، لِأَنَّهُ يَكُونُ فِيَّ خِصْلَةً مِنْهَا أَحَبُّ إِلَيَّ مِنْ أَنْ أُعْطِيَ حُمْرَ النَّعَمِ ".

قَالُوا: وَمَا هُنَّ يَا أَمِيرَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ؟ قَالَ: " تَزَوَّجَ فَاطِمَةَ ابْنَةَ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ (ص) وَسَكَنَاهُ الْمَسْجِدَ مَعَ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ (ص) يَحِلُّ لَهُ فِيهِ مَا يَحِلُّ لِرَسُولِ اللَّهِ (ص) وَالرَّأْيَةُ يَوْمَ خَيْبَرَ ".

قَالَ أَبُو جَعْفَرٍ: وَعَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ جَعْفَرٍ الَّذِي عَادَ إِلَيْهِ هَذَا الْحَدِيثُ، إِنَّهُ يَكُونُ هُوَ الْمَخْرَمِيُّ، فَهُوَ مِمَّنْ يُحْمَدُ فِي حَدِيثِهِ، وَإِنَّهُ يَكُونُ هُوَ ابْنُ نَجِيحٍ أَبُو عَلِيٍّ ابْنُ الْمَدِينِيِّ، فَإِنَّ حَدِيثَهُ لَيْسَ كَحَدِيثِ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ جَعْفَرٍ الْمَخْرَمِيِّ، وَلَكِنَّهُ لَيْسَ بِسَاقِطٍ، قَدْ حَدَّثَ النَّاسُ عَنْهُ، وَأَحَدٌ مِنْ حَدَّثَ عَنْهُ ابْنُهُ، وَهُوَ إِمَامُ أَهْلِ الْحَدِيثِ.

Abu Harire has narrated from Umar Ben Khatab that he said " Abi Ben Abi Taleb has some advantages which if I had one of them, it would be better than having camels with red hair." they asked " what are these?" Umar said " marrying the daughter of the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) , residing with the messenger of God in the mosque, being pure of whatever was pure for the messenger of God( peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) and giving flag to the hand of Hazrat Ali ( peace be upon him).

Abu Jafar (writer) said " Abdullah Ben Jafari that has been mentioned in the document of the narration is one of parsons that has been praised in narrating the narration if he is Abdullah Ben Jafar Mokharami. However, if Abdullah Ben Jafar Ben Najih is the same Ali Ben Madyani, even although his hadith is not as valuable as the hadith of Abdullah Ben Jafar Mokharami, his narration will be abolished. The people have narrated a narration from him. one of them is his son that is one of leaders of Hadith narrators.

Al-Tahavi, Abu Jafar Ahmad Ibn Muhammad IbnSalame (died in 321 Hejira) SharhMoshkel Al-Asar v 9 p 182 hadith no 3551; researched by: Shoaib Al-Arnout; published by: Al-Resalat Institute; Lebanon; Beirut; First Edition; 1408 Hejira; 1987

After narrating this narration, Hakem Neishaburi has said

هذا حديث صحيح الإسناد ولم يخرجاه.

This narration is valid, but Bokhari and Mosalam have not narrated it.

Al-Hakim Al-Neishaburi, Muhammad Ibn Abdullah Abu Abdullah (died in 405 Hejira) Al-MostadarkAla Al-Sahihein v 3 p 135 hadith no 4632; researched by: MostafaAbd Al-Ghader Ata; published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie; Beirut; First Edition; 1411 Hejira; 1990

Jalal Al-Din Souti in the book " Tarikh Al-Kholafa" and Ibn Hajar Heisami in the book " Al-Savaegh Al-Mahraghe" have written

واخرج أبو يعلى عن أبي هريرة قال قال عمر بن الخطاب لقد أعطى على ثلاث خصال لأن

تكون لي خصلة منها أحب إلي من أن أعطى حمر النعم فسئل وما هن قال تزوجه ابنته فاطمة وسكناه

المسجد لا يحل لي فيه ما يحل له والراية يوم خيبر

وروى أحمد بسند صحيح عن ابن عمر نحوه.

Abu Yala has narrated from Abu Harire that Umar Ben Khatab said " three advantages have been attributed to Imam Ali (peace be upon him) which if I had one of them, it would be better than having camels with red hair. He was asked what it is. he answered " the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) had him marry his daughter, Fateme and he sheltered him in the mosque although it was not accepted for him to live in the mosque and it is not accepted for me to live in the mosque as well and he gave him the flag on the day of Khabir.

Ahmad has narrated this narration with valid document from Abdullah Ben Umar differently.

Al-Souti, Jalal Al-Din Abulfazl Abd Al-Rahman Ibn Abi Bakr (died in 911 Hejira) Tarikh Al-Kholafa v 1 p 172; researched by: Muhammad Mohe Al-Din Abd Al-Hamid; published by: Matba Al-Saadt; Egypt; First Edition; 1371 Hejira; 1952

Al-Heisami, Abu Al-Abbas Ahmad Ibn Muhammad Ibn Ali Ibn Hajar (died in 973 Hejira) Al-Savaegh Al-Mohreghe Ala Ahl Al-Rafz Al-Zalal Al-Zendeghe v 2 p 373; researched by: Abd Al-Rahman Ibn Abi Abdullah Al-Turkey; Kamel Muhammad Al-Kharat; published by: Al-Resalat Institute; Lebanon; First Edition; 1417 Hejira; 1997

Good luck

The group in charge of answering doubts

Centre research of Hazrat Valiasr